From: <u>Carter Baker</u>

To: Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission)

Cc: michael.lindseth@comcast.net; Murphy, Kathleen (Council Member)

Subject: 3707 Richland Avenue Demolition Request Date: Sunday, June 13, 2021 5:03:07 PM

Attention: This email originated from a source external to Metro Government. Please exercise caution when opening any attachments or links from external sources.

Robin Zeigler and the Metro Historic Zoning Commission:

I have lived for over fifty years at 3708 Richland Avenue, across from the subject house. If it must be taken down, I am requesting that the Historic Zoning Commission require that it be rebuilt so the facade has the same appearance that it does now. 3707 is a conforming house and it appears that your staff is recommending this.

In past years, the Commission has required this of at least three other houses: 3720 and 3726 Richland, and 3725 Central. I am requesting that you add 3707 to this list which will continue to maintain the historic character of the Richland-West End Neighborhood.

Thank you,

Carter G. Baker 3708 Richland Avenue From: Alexander, Sean (Historical Commission)
To: Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission)
Subject: FW: Regarding 2618 Barton Ave
Date: Thursday, June 10, 2021 10:50:44 AM

Public Comment in support of this item on the Consent Agenda.

Thanks,

-Sean

Sean Alexander

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission

tel: (615) 862-7970 ext. 79775

This electronic message transmission contains information from the Metropolitan Historical Commission and/or the Metropolitan Historical Zoning Commission of the Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County, Tennessee, which may be confidential or privileged. The information is intended to be for the use of the individual or entity named above. If you are not the intended recipient, be aware that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the contents of this information is prohibited.

From: Heather Wills <heatherwillsrn@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, June 10, 2021 10:35 AM

To: Alexander, Sean (Historical Commission) <Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov>;

blaine@bonadiesarchitect.com **Subject:** Regarding 2618 Barton Ave

Attention: This email originated from a source external to Metro Government. Please exercise caution when opening any attachments or links from external sources.

Dear Sean

I received an email today regarding a request for a 2-6' setback on the left side of 2618 Barton Ave. I am the next door neighbor (2700 Barton Ave) and would be the most impacted by any change to the house.

I have no concerns regarding this request. I spoke with Mr. Blaine Bonadies who is the architect for the project. He answered all my questions and I am satisfied the request will have no bearing on how we live in our home.

Sincerely

Heather Wills

PS Due to work commitments, I am unable to attend the meeting scheduled June 16 at 2 PM.

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

From: <u>Baldock, Melissa (Historical Commission)</u>

To: Andy Shookhoff

Cc: <u>Debbie kidwell; Eva Sochorova; Stewart Clifton; Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission)</u>
Subject: RE: Supplemental Comments in Opposition to Proposed Plan for 2415 Oakland Avenue

Date: Monday, June 14, 2021 5:11:30 PM

Thank you for your comments. We will send them to the Commissioners in advance of the hearing.

Melissa Baldock
Historic Preservationist
Metro Historic Zoning Commission
melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
615-862-7970

Sign up to receive our agendas.

Permit Tracker: provides access to applications, staff recommendations and permits

For general guidance on a variety of issues of interest to owners of old buildings, visit OldHouseFair.org

Have a general Metro question but don't know where to start? Try Hub Nashville.

From: Andy Shookhoff <andy.shookhoff@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, June 14, 2021 5:09 PM

To: Baldock, Melissa (Historical Commission) < Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov>

Cc: Debbie kidwell <kidwellfamily@comcast.net>; Eva Sochorova <eva.sochorova@gmail.com>;

Stewart Clifton <stewart@stewartclifton.com>

Subject: Supplemental Comments in Opposition to Proposed Plan for 2415 Oakland Avenue

Attention: This email originated from a source external to Metro Government. Please exercise caution when opening any attachments or links from external sources.

Ms. Baldock:

Please provide the attached memo to the Commission for their consideration when they review the proposed plan for 2415 Oakland Avenue which is on the agenda for June 16.

My wife and I, and Ms. Kidwell will be out of town on Wednesday. However, Stewart Clifton will be appearing on our behalf at the Commission meeting.

Thank you for your kind assistance in bringing both this memo and our previous written comments to the attention of the Commission.

Andy Shookhoff

To: Commission Members

From: Andy Shookhoff, Eva Sochorova, and Debbie Kidwell

Re: Supplement to previous comments in opposition to proposed plan for 2415 Oakland Avenue

We respectfully request that this Commission deny the Proposed Plan for 2415 Oakland Avenue because it would illegally alter the historical configuration of this three-house subdivision, including by destroying the curb cut for the shared driveway, as well as the shared driveway, which is protected by an express recorded easement, and that had served all three properties for the 43 years that any of us have lived there and that appears to have served previous owners going as far back as 1937.

The HZC should consider the historical configuration of this three-house subdivision. These three houses, 2413 Oakland Ave., 2415 Oakland Ave., and 1700 Beechwood Ave., sit on a piece of property that, on this block of Oakland Ave., would typically only accommodate two houses (as reflected by the other houses on the block, the lots for which run from Oakland Ave. to the alley).

Before approving a plan for 2415 Oakland that would significantly alter the long-standing configuration and the functions served by that configuration, the Commission should consider any adverse impacts that the plan would have on the two significantly older houses at 2413 Oakland Ave. and 1700 Beechwood Ave.

The HZC staff report, in recommending approval of the elimination of the current curb cut in favor of a new curb cut, does not consider the historically shared driveway that begins at that curb cut and dead-ends at the northwest corner of 2413 Oakland Ave. Nor does it consider the existence of an express easement that has protected the driveway since 1937. Since the easement was recorded, the driveway has served all three houses. This vitally important context is missing from the staff's report and must be considered.

Moving the curb cut, and therefore destroying the shared driveway, not only interferes with the legally protected interest of the neighboring landowners but serves as a significant change in the historical configuration and function of the three-house subdivision.

The historical configuration of this three-house subdivision is also relevant to the request for an exemption from the normal setback requirements to allow for a larger house than could otherwise be built on the lot.

The rationale for requiring certain minimum setbacks to keep a certain distance between houses and prevent overcrowding. This reasoning is especially strong in this case because these three houses are already situated on a lot that would typically hold two.

The HZC staff report states that, because the lot is smaller than surrounding lots, the setback requirements should be altered for this lot along both the rear and Beechwood Ave. sides. However, the report fails to consider the effect the setback changes will have on the neighboring lots. Because the lot is smaller, there is all the more reason to protect against overcrowding.

For instance, the proposal would include a porch on the rear end of the lot that would be only 10' from the property line, rather than the typical 20'. Not only does this violate the driveway easement, but it also sits far closer to both neighboring lots, changing the historical nature of this three-house subdivision.

We understand the desire to build a larger house than is currently sits on the property. However, any such house should conform to the existing neighborhood, and be built without removing the long-standing shared driveway and altering the setbacks, thus changing the historical nature of this three-house subdivision.

For these reasons, we urge the Commission to deny the plan and encourage the parties to seek a mutually satisfactory resolution.

From: Lou Ann Brown

To: Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission)

Subject: 3707 Richland Ave

Date: Tuesday, June 15, 2021 10:02:39 AM

Attention: This email originated from a source external to Metro Government. Please exercise caution when opening any attachments or links from external sources.

Robin-

My husband Gary and live at 3726 Richland Avenue, a home we were allowed to tear down and rebuild in exacting detail under the permission and supervision of the Metro Historic Zoning commission. We request that the property at 3707 Richland be held to the same strict standard that ours was. We well remember the frustration—and expense—involved in such a project, but we knew what we were getting into when we bought, just as everyone should.

Thank you for your work, and for listening to our request.

Sincerely,

Lou Ann Brown 615-948-2014

Sent from my iPhone

From: Cynthia Hicks

To: Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission)

Cc: Cash, Thomas (Council Member); Hoffman, Paul (Historical Commission); Baldock, Melissa (Historical

Commission); Mark Lopez; Gill Geldreich; Al Cocke

Subject: Re: 1710 Linden

Date: Tuesday, June 15, 2021 8:55:53 AM

Attachments: SR 1512 Dallas.pdf

Attention: This email originated from a source external to Metro Government. Please exercise caution when opening any attachments or links from external sources.

Hello all,

I have added BHN President, Gill Geldreich, and Vice President, Mark Lopez to this thread, as well as Linden Ave neighbor and Steering Committee member, Al Cocke.

Robin, thank you for discussing the situation at 1710 Linden Avenue with me last week, as well as other affected properties in our neighborhood and beyond. I appreciate your team's efforts to keep developers and builders within compliance of our Conservation Overlay with very strong recommendations should these codes be violated, as exhibited in the recommendations for the property at 1512 Dallas (attached) which suffered a similar fate.

After our discussion, I had a long chat with C.J. Sabia, the builder of this renovation. He expressed remorse concerning the events leading to the near destruction of 1710 Linden, citing a catastrophic miscommunication between his project manager and the construction team at the site. He indicated that he plans to "throw himself to the mercy of the commission" today at the hearing, understanding that what occurred is a clear violation of our Conservation Overlay. I had planned to attend the meeting today, but will not be there due to my work schedule. Though I do not speak as an official of Belmont-Hillsboro Neighbors, I support the recommendations of the Metro Historic Zoning staff.

Thank you, again, for all you do for our community!

My best to you,

CJ

Cynthia J. Hicks

(c) 615.347.0421

On May 20, 2021, at 2:59 PM, Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission) < Robin.Zeigler@nashville.gov> wrote:

I have requested a Stop-Work-Order. We will handle this similar to 1512 Dallas, which means they will need to go before the Commission in June. We will recommend disapproval of demolition because it was a historic building; however, recognizing it is all but gone, will recommend that the original building be reconstructed. We will recommend that the permit for the addition be rescinded until the original building is reconstructed and reviewed by the Commission. Attached is the 1512 Dallas staff recommendation for reference. This may be a situation where the neighborhood will want to comment.

Robin

Robin Zeigler
Historic Zoning Administrator
Metro Historic Zoning Commission
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, TN 37201
615-862-7970
www.nashville.gov

FIND INFORMATION

Sign up to receive our agendas.

Permit Tracker: provides access to applications, staff recommendations and permits For general guidance on a variety of issues of interest to owners of old buildings, visit OldHouseFair.org

Have a general Metro guestion but don't know where to start? Try Hub Nashville.

From: Cash, Thomas (Council Member) < <u>Tom.Cash@nashville.gov</u>>

Sent: Thursday, May 20, 2021 12:45 PM

To: Cynthia Hicks <<u>cjhicks@mac.com</u>>; Zeigler, Robin (Historical Commission)

<<u>Robin.Zeigler@nashville.gov</u>>; Baldock, Melissa (Historical Commission)

< Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov >

Subject: Re: 1710 Linden

Geez- was there no permitting at all? Keep me in the loop.

Thanks
Tom Cash
Councilman, District 18

Get Outlook for iOS

From: Cynthia Hicks <cjhicks@mac.com> Sent: Thursday, May 20, 2021 12:35 PM **To:** Cash, Thomas (Council Member) Subject: Fwd: 1710 Linden Hey Tom... See below. Another developer tearing down our houses here in BHN... CJ Cynthia Hicks 615.347.0421 Sent from my iPhone. Begin forwarded message: **From:** Cynthia Hicks <<u>cjhicks@mac.com</u>> **Date:** May 20, 2021 at 12:27:11 PM CDT To: melissa.baldock@nashvill.gov **Cc:** Robin Zeigler < <u>Robin.Zeigler@nashville.gov</u>>, Gill Geldreich <gillrobert@gmail.com> Subject: 1710 Linden Hi Melissa, The property at 1710 Linden Avenue 37212 is in trouble. The attached photos were taken at noon today. This appears to be a clear violation of our conservation overlay in the Belmont Hillsboro Neighborhood. I hope you can stop further destruction of this house. Thanks! CJ Hicks 615.347.0421 BHN <image001.jpg> <image002.jpg> Cynthia Hicks 615.347.0421

Sent from my iPhone.