

JOHN COOPER
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park
3000 Granny White Pike
Nashville, Tennessee 37204
Telephone: (615) 862-7970

STAFF RECOMMENDATION
1807 Woodland Street
April 21, 2021

Application: Violation—Partial Demolition and Addition
District: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Council District: 06
Base Zoning: R6
Map and Parcel Number: 08310031100
Applicant: Shari Wells
Project Lead: Paul Hoffman; paul.hoffman@nashville.gov

<p>Description of Project: The historic porch roof of this contributing building has been inappropriately altered without permit.</p> <p>Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the new construction, finding that the project does not meet Sections II.10. a. and b. for additions and III.B.1 for Demolition in the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Staff recommends that the applicant submit to-scale drawings indicating major measurements and materials to replicate the original porch configuration within sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision and to restore the original form within an additional thirty (30) days.</p>	<p>Attachments A: Photographs</p>
---	---

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

II. New Construction and Additions

10. Additions to Existing Buildings

- a. New additions to existing buildings should be kept to a minimum and should be compatible in scale, materials, and texture; additions should not be visually jarring or contrasting.
- b. Additions should not be made to the public facades of existing buildings. Additions may be located to the rear of existing buildings in ways which do not disturb the public facades.

III.B. Demolition

1. Demolition is not appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense.

2. Demolition is appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district;
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or
- c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 (Historic Zoning Regulations), Metropolitan Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance.

Background: 1807 Woodland Street is a contributing building c. 1900 in the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Metro Codes issued residential rehab permit 2020026406 in September 2020 for 1807 Woodland Street for the following scope of work: “Replacement of following items including but not limited to: roof, siding, windows, flooring, cabinets, drywall, electrical, plumbing, tile, doors/trim, windows, landscaping, etc.” MHZC staff signed off *Ignore* on the building permit application, as no work was described that would require a Preservation Permit. In March 2021, staff observed that the front porch of the home had been altered. The original shed roof was changed to a front-facing open-frame gable. Although the Commission would not review the replacement of roofing material, as noted in the Codes permit’s scope of work, the removal of historic features and new

construction are both reviewed. The steps and railing have also been replaced but those are not actions that the Commission reviews.



Figures 1 & 2. Google street views of the house from 2019.

Analysis and Findings:



Figure 3: 1807 Woodland St in a 2021 social media post. Figure 4: The house in 1986.

Demolition: The original shed roof over the porch was removed, which is partial demolition. Section III.B.1.a states that demolition is not appropriate if a building or portion of a building is of such architectural or historical interest or value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest. The porch roof form was a character-defining features of the historic building. Staff finds that the historic porch roof contributed to the architectural and historical character and significance of the district, and that its demolition meets section III.B.a for inappropriate demolition.

New Roof form: Historic photographs as early as 1969 do not indicate any alteration of the original shed porch roof during the life of the building.



Figure 5: 1807 Woodland St c. 1969.

The house is a of a folk Victorian style and the addition is an open-framed, contemporary craftsman style that is much taller than the historic shed roof form. There is no evidence this building ever had any craftsman-style features. The new porch does not meet section II. 10.a for additions as it is not compatible in scale to the historic porch form and it is visually contrasting due to the mix of styles.

Generally, additions should be at the rear of buildings and this new porch roof was added to the front of the building. The project does not meet section II.10. b for additions as it is located on the front of the building.

In summary, the addition of the front-facing gable required the removal of a character defining feature of this historic building, thereby meeting section III.B.1.a for inappropriate demolition and the addition of a new front porch does not meet section II.10.a and b for additions.

Recommendation:

Staff recommends disapproval of the new construction, finding that the project does not meet Sections II.10. a. and b. for additions and III.B.1 for Demolition in the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Staff recommends that the applicant submit to-scale drawings indicating major measurements and materials to replicate the original porch configuration within sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision and to restore the original form within an additional thirty (30) days.

PHOTOGRAPHS



April 2021



April 2021



1985 photo