JOHN COOPER MAYOR



ELE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission Sunnyside in Sevier Park 3000 Granny White Pike Nashville, Tennessee 37204 Telephone: (615) 862-7970

STAFF RECOMMENDATION 512 Fairfax Avenue May 19, 2021

Application: Demolition; New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding **District:** Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay **Council District:** 18 Base Zoning: RS7.5 Map and Parcel Number: 10410018800 Applicant: Van Pond, Jr. Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.sajid@nashville.gov

Description of Project: Application is to demolish a non- contributing house and to construct infill and an outbuilding.Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:	Attachments A: Photographs B: Site Plan C: Elevations
1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;	
2. The front setback shall be consistent with the buildings to either side, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;	
3. The front dormers shall set in 2' from the wall below;	
4. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of the brick, roof color, windows, doors, driveway, and walkway prior to purchase and installation; and,	
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).	
With these conditions, staff finds that the project meets Section II.B of the <i>Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation District: Handbook and Design Guidelines.</i>	

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

II.B. GUIDELINES

a. Height

The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), and main roof(s) of a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with those of surrounding historic buildings.

b. Scale

- The size of a new building and its mass in relation to open spaces shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.
- Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material.

c. Setback and Rhythm of Spacing

- The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained. Generally, a dominant rhythm along a street is established by uniform lot and building width. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm.
- The Commission has the ability to determine appropriate building setbacks and extend height limitations of the required underlying base zoning for new construction, additions and accessory structures (ordinance no. 17.40.410).

Appropriate setbacks will be determined based on:

- The existing setback of the contributing primary buildings and accessory structures found in the immediate vicinity;
- Setbacks of like structures historically found on the site as determined by historic maps, site plans or photographs;
- · Shape of lot;
- Alley access or lack thereof;
- · Proximity of adjoining structures; and
- · Property lines.

Appropriate height limitations will be based on:

- · Heights of historic buildings in the immediate vicinity
- \cdot Existing or planned slope and grade

In most cases, an infill duplex should be one building, as seen historically in order to maintain the rhythm of the street. Detached infill duplexes may be appropriate in the following instances:

- There is not enough square footage to legally subdivide the lot but there is enough frontage and width to the lot to accommodate two single-family dwellings in a manner that meets the design guidelines;
- · The second unit follows the requirements of a Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit; or
- An existing non-historic building sits so far back on the lot that a building may be constructed in front of it in a manner that meets the rhythm of the street and the established setbacks.

d. Materials, Texture, Details, and Material Color

- The materials, texture, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Vinyl and aluminum siding are not appropriate.
- T-1-11- type building panels, "permastone", E.F.I.S. and other artificial siding materials are generally not appropriate. However, pre-cast stone and cement fiberboard siding are approvable cladding materials for new construction; but pre-cast stone should be of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district; and cement fiberboard siding, when used for lapped siding, should be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal. The reveal for lap siding should not exceed 5". Larger reveals may be possible but should not exceed 8" and shall have mitered corners.
- Shingle siding should exhibit a straight-line course pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7").

Four inch (4") nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner. Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.

Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing.

When different materials are used, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines. Clapboard sided chimneys are generally not appropriate. Masonry or stucco is appropriate. Texture and tooling of mortar on new construction should be similar to historic examples.

Asphalt shingle is an appropriate roof material for most buildings. Generally, roofing should not have strong simulated shadows in the granule colors which results in a rough, pitted appearance; faux shadow lines; strongly variegated colors; colors that are too light (e.g.: tan, white, light green); wavy or deep color/texture used to simulate split shake shingles or slate; excessive flared form in the shingle tabs; uneven or sculpted bottom edges that emphasize tab width or edges, unless matching the original roof.

Generally primary entrances should have full to half-lite doors. Faux leaded-glass is inappropriate.

e. Roof Shape

- The roof(s) of a new building shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the roof shape, orientation, and pitch of surrounding historic buildings.
- Roof pitches should be similar to the pitches found in the district. Historic roofs are generally between 6/12 and 12/12.

Roof pitches for porch roofs are typically less steep, approximately in the 3-4/12 range. Generally, two-story residential buildings have hipped roofs.

Generally, dormers should be located on the roof. Wall dormers are not typical in the historic context and accentuate height so they should be used minimally and generally only on secondary facades. When they are appropriate they should be no wider than the typical window openings and should not project beyond the main wall.

f. Orientation

The orientation of a new building's front facade shall be visually consistent with surrounding historic buildings.

Porches

- *New buildings should incorporate at least one front street-related porch that is accessible from the front street.*
- Side porches or porte cocheres may also be appropriate as a secondary entrance, but the primary entrance should address the front.
- Front porches generally should be a minimum of 6' deep, have porch racks that are 1'-3' tall and have posts that include bases and capitals.

Parking areas and Driveways Generally, curb cuts should not be added.

Where a new driveway is appropriate it should be two concrete strips with a central grassy median. Shared driveways should be a single lane, not just two driveways next to each other. Sometimes this may be accomplished with a single lane curb cut that widens to a double lane deeper into the lot.

Duplexes

- Infill duplexes shall have one or two doors facing the street, as seen on historic duplexes. In the case of corner lots, an entrance facing the side street is possible as long as it is designed to look like a secondary entrance.
- In the case of duplexes, vehicular access for both units should be from the alley, where an alley exists. A new shared curb cut may be added, if no alley and no driveway exists, but the driveway should be no more than 12' wide from the street to the rear of the home. Driveways should use concrete strips where they are typical of the historic context. Front yard parking or driveways which end at the front of the house are not consistent with the character of the historic neighborhoods.

Multi-unit Developments

- For multi-unit developments, interior dwellings should be subordinate to those that front the street. Subordinate generally means the width and height of the buildings are less than the primary building(s) that faces the street.
- For multi-unit developments, direct pedestrian connections should be made between the street and any interior units. The entrances to those pedestrian connections generally should be wider than the typical spacing between buildings along the street.

g. Proportion and Rhythm of Openings

- The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.
- Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district.
- In most cases, every 8-13 horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least 4 square feet. More leniencies can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls.
- Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1.
- Windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor.
- Single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.
- Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows and vents on non-masonry buildings. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.
- Brick molding is required around doors, windows and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.

h. Outbuildings

(Although the MHZC does not review use itself there are additional ordinance requirements for buildings that are or have a Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (DADU) required by ordinance 17.16.030 that are reviewed by the MHZC. This information is provided for informational purposes only and does not replace ordinance 17.16.030.)

1) A new garage or storage building should reflect the character of the period of the house to which the outbuilding will be related. The outbuilding should be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with

surrounding historic outbuildings in terms of height, scale, roof shape, materials, texture, and details.

Outbuildings: Height & Scale

On lots less than 10,000 square feet, the footprint of a DADU or outbuilding shall not exceed seven hundred fifty square feet or fifty percent of the first floor area of the principal structure, whichever is less.
On lots 10,000 square feet or greater, the footprint of a DADU or outbuilding shall not exceed one thousand square feet.

• The DADU or outbuilding shall maintain a proportional mass, size, and height to ensure it is not taller or wider than the principal structure on the lot. The DADU or outbuilding height shall not exceed the height of the principal structure, with a maximum eave height of 10' for one-story DADU's or outbuildings and 17' for two-story DADUs or outbuildings. The roof ridge height of the DADU or outbuilding must be less than the principal building and shall not exceed 25' feet in height.

Outbuildings: Character, Materials and Details

• Historically, outbuildings were either very utilitarian in character, or (particularly with more extravagant houses) they repeated the roof forms and architectural details of the houses to which they related. Generally, either approach is appropriate for new outbuildings. DADUs or out buildings located on corner lots should have similar architectural characteristics, including roof form and pitch, to the existing principal structure.

 \cdot DADUs or outbuildings with a second story shall enclose the stairs interior to the structure and properly fire rate them per the applicable life safety standards found in the code editions adopted by the Metropolitan Government of Nashville.

Outbuildings: Roof

 \cdot Roof slopes on simple, utilitarian buildings do not have to match the roof slopes of the main structure, but generally should maintain at least a 4/12 pitch.

• The DADU or outbuilding may have dormers that relate to the style and proportion of windows on the DADU and shall be subordinate to the roof slope by covering no more than fifty percent of the roof plane and should sit back from the exterior wall by 2'.

Outbuildings: Windows and Doors

• Publicly visible windows should be appropriate to the style of the house.

· Double-hung windows are generally twice as tall as they are wide and of the single-light sash variety.

 \cdot Publicly visible pedestrian doors must either be appropriate for the style of house to which the outbuilding relates or be flat with no panels.

 \cdot Metal overhead doors are acceptable on garages when they are simple and devoid of overly decorative elements typical on high-style wooden doors. Decorative raised panels on publicly visible garage doors are generally not appropriate.

 \cdot For street-facing facades, garages with more than one-bay should have multiple single doors rather than one large door to accommodate more than one bay.

Outbuildings: Siding and Trim

· Brick, weatherboard, and board-and-batten are typical siding materials.

• Exterior siding may match the existing contributing building's original siding; otherwise, siding should be wood or smooth cement-fiberboard lap siding with a maximum exposure of five inches (5"), wood or smooth cement-fiberboard board-and-batten or masonry.

• Four inch (4" nominal) corner-boards are required at the face of each exposed corner.

· Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.

• Four inch (4" nominal) casings are required around doors, windows, and vents within clapboard walls. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.

Brick molding is required around doors, windows, and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry clad buildings.

2) Outbuildings should be situated on a lot as is historically typical for surrounding historic buildings.

Generally new garages should be placed close to the alley, at the rear of the lot, or in the original location of an historic accessory structure.

Lots without rear alleys may have garages located closer to the primary structure. The appropriate location is one that matches the neighborhood or can be documented by historic maps.

Generally, attached garages are not appropriate; however, instances where they may be are:

- \cdot Where they are a typical feature of the neighborhood; or
- When the location of the attached garage is in the general location of an historic accessory building, the new garage is located in the basement level, and the vehicular access is on the rear elevation.

Setbacks & Site Requirements.

• To reflect the character of historic outbuildings, new outbuildings for duplexes should not exceed the requirements for outbuildings for the entire lot and should not be doubled. The most appropriate configurations would be two 1-bay buildings with or without parking pads for additional spaces or one 2-bay building.

• A DADU or outbuilding may only be located behind the principal structure in the established rear yard. The DADU or outbuilding is to be subordinate to the principal structure and therefore should be placed to the rear of the lot.

 \cdot There should be a minimum separation of 20' between the principal structure and the DADU or outbuilding.

At least one side setback a DADU or outbuilding on an interior lot, should generally be similar to the principle dwelling but no closer than 3' from each property line. The rear setback may up to 3' from the rear property line. For corner lots, the DADU or outbuilding should match the context of homes on the street. If there is no context, the street setback should be a minimum of 10'.

Driveway Access.

On lots with no alley access, the lot shall have no more than one curb-cut from any public street for driveway access to the principal structure as well as the detached accessory dwelling or outbuilding.
On lots with alley access, any additional access shall be from the alley and no new curb cuts shall be provided from public streets.

Parking accessed from any public street shall be limited to one driveway for the lot with a maximum width of twelve feet.

Additional Requirements for DADUs from Ordinance 17.16.030. See requirements for outbuildings for additional requirements.

• *The lot area on which a DADU is placed shall comply with Table 17.12.020A.*

• The DADU may not exceed the maximums outlined previously for outbuildings.

 \cdot No additional accessory structure shall exceed two hundred square feet when there is a DADU on the lot.

Density.

 \cdot A DADU is not allowed if the maximum number of dwelling units permitted for the lot has been met. *Ownership.*

 \cdot No more than one DADU shall be permitted on a single lot in conjunction with the principal structure.

• *The DADU cannot be divided from the property ownership of the principal dwelling.*

 \cdot The DADU shall be owned by the same person as the principal structure and one of the two dwellings shall be owner-occupied.

 \cdot Prior to the issuance of a permit, an instrument shall be prepared and recorded with the register's office covenanting that the DADU is being established accessory to a principal structure and may only be used under the conditions listed here.

Bulk and Massing.

• The living space of a DADU shall not exceed seven hundred square feet.

i. Utilities

- Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street.
- Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the mid point of the structure. Power lines should be placed underground if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.

j. Public Spaces

- Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture and other work undertaken in public spaces by any individual, group or agency shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the character of the district.
- Generally, mailboxes should be attached to the front wall of the house or a porch post. In most cases, street-side mailboxes are inappropriate.

k: Multi-unit Detached Developments/ Cottage Developments

- Multi-unit detached developments or "cottage" developments are only appropriate where the Planning Commission has determined that the community plan allows for the density requested and the design guidelines for "new construction" can be met.
- The buildings facing the street must follow all the design guidelines for new construction. The interior units need not meet the design guidelines for setbacks and rhythm of spacing on the street.
- Interior dwellings should be subordinate to those that front the street. Subordinate generally means the width and height of the buildings are less than the primary building(s) that face the street.

Interior dwellings should be "tucked-in" behind the buildings facing the street.

Direct pedestrian connections should be made between the street and any interior units. The entrances to those pedestrian connections generally should be wider than the typical spacing between buildings along the street.

Attached garages are only appropriate for rear units along the alley.

2. ADDITIONS

a. Generally, an addition should be situated at the rear of a building in such a way that it will not disturb either front or side facades. To distinguish between the historic structure and an addition, it is desirable to set the addition in from the building side wall or for the addition to have a different exterior cladding. Additions normally not recommended on historic structures may be appropriate for nonhistoric structures in Hillsboro-West End. Front or side alterations to non-historic buildings that increase habitable space or change exterior height should be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the adjacent historic buildings.

Placement

Additions should be located at the rear of an existing structure.

Connections to additions should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

Generally, one-story rear additions should inset one foot, for each story, from the side wall. Additions should be physically distinguished from the historic building and generally fit within the shadow line of the existing building.

Additions that tie into the existing roof should be at least 6" off the existing ridge.

In order to assure than an addition has achieved proper scale, the addition should:

• No matter its use, an addition should not be larger than the existing house, not including non-historic additions, in order to achieve compatibility in scale. This will allow for the retention of small and medium size homes in the neighborhood. The diversity of housing type and size is a character

defining feature of the historic districts.

- Additions which are essentially a house-behind-a-house with a long narrow connector are not appropriate, as the form does not exist historically. Short or minimal connections that do not require the removal of the entire back wall of a historic building are preferred.
- Additions should generally be shorter and thinner than the existing building. Exceptions may be made when unusual constraints make these parameters unreasonable, such as:
- An extreme grade change
- · Atypical lot parcel shape or size
- In these cases, an addition may rise above <u>or</u> extend wider than the existing building; however, generally the addition should not higher <u>and</u> extend wider.

When an addition needs to be taller:

Whenever possible, additions should not be taller than the historic building; however, when a taller addition is the only option, additions to single story structures may rise as high as 4' above the shadow line of the existing building at a distance of 40' from the front edge of the existing building. In this instance, the side walls and roof of the addition must set in as is typical for all additions. The portion of the roof that can be seen should have a hipped, side gable or clipped gable roof to help decrease the visual mass of the addition.

When an addition needs to be wider:

Rear additions that are wider than an existing historic building may be appropriate when the building is narrower than 30' or shifted to one side of the lot. In these instances, a structural alcove or channel must separate the existing building from the new addition. The structural alcove should sit in a minimum of 1' and be at least twice as long as it is deep.

In addition, a rear addition that is wider should not wrap the rear corner.

Ridge raises

Ridge raises are most appropriate for one-story, side-gable buildings, (without clipped gables) and that require more finished height in the attic. The purpose of a ridge raise is to allow for conditioned space in the attic and to discourage large rear or side additions. The raised portion must sit in a minimum of 2' from each side wall and can be raised no more than 2' of total vertical height within the same plane as the front roof slope.

Sunrooms

Metal framed sunrooms, as a modern interpretation of early green houses, are appropriate if they are mostly glass or use appropriate cladding material for the district, are located at the rear in a minimally visible location, are minimally attached to the existing structure, and follow all other design guidelines for additions.

Foundation

Foundation walls should set in from the existing foundation at the back edge of the existing structure by one foot for each story or half story. Exception: When an addition is a small one-room deep (12' deep or less) addition that spans the width of the structure, and the existing structure is masonry with the addition to be wood (or appropriate substitute siding). The change in material from masonry to wood allows for a minimum of a four inch (4") inset.

Foundation height should match or be lower than the existing structure.

Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is generally accomplished with a change in materials.

Roof

The height of the addition's roof and eaves must be less than or equal to the existing structure. Visually evident roof slopes should match the roof slopes of the existing structure, and roof planes should set in accordingly for rear additions.

Skylights should not be located on the front-facing slope of the roof. Skylights should be flat (no bubble

lenses) with a low profile (no more than six inches tall) and only be installed behind the midpoint of the building).

Rear & Side Dormers

- Dormer additions are appropriate for some historic buildings as they are a traditional way of adding ventilation and light to upper stories.
- The addition of a dormer that would require the removal of historic features such as an existing dormer, chimneys, cupolas or decorative feature is not appropriate.
- Rear dormers should be inset from the side walls of the building by a minimum of two feet. The top of a rear dormer may attach just below the ridge of the main roof or lower.
- Side dormers should be compatible with the scale and design of the building. Generally, this can be accomplished with the following:
- \cdot New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on the building.
- New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on another historic building that is similar in style and massing.
- The number of dormers and their location and size should be appropriate to the style and design of the building. Sometimes dormer locations relate to the openings below. The symmetry or lack of symmetry within a building design should be used as a guide when placing dormers.
- · Dormers should not be added to secondary roof planes.
- \cdot Eave depth on a dormer should not exceed the eave depth on the main roof.
- *The roof form of the dormer should match the roof form of the building or be appropriate for the style.*
- *The roof pitch of the dormer should generally match the roof pitch of the building.*
- The ridge of a side dormer should be at least 2' below the ridge of the existing building; the cheeks should be inset at least 2' from the wall below or adjacent valley; and the front wall of the gable should setback a minimum of 2' from the wall below. (These minimum insets will likely be greater than 2' when following the guidelines for appropriate scale.)
- Dormers should generally be fully glazed and aprons below the window should be minimal.
- The exterior material cladding of side dormers should match the primary or secondary material of the main building.

Side Additions

b. When a lot width exceeds 60 feet or the standard lot width on the block, it may be appropriate to add a side addition to a historic structure. The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.

The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure (at or beyond the midpoint of the building) and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.

- Side additions should be narrower than half of the historic building width and exhibit a height of at least 2' shorter than the historic building.
- To deemphasize a side addition, the roofing form should generally be a hip or side-gable roof form.

c. The creation of an addition through enclosure of a front porch is not appropriate. The creation of an addition through the enclosure of a side porch may be appropriate if the addition is constructed in such a way that original form and openings on the porch remain visible and undisturbed.

Side porch additions may be appropriate for corner building lots or lots more than 60' wide.

d. Contemporary designs for additions to existing properties are not discouraged when such additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material; and when such design is compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

e. A new addition should be constructed in such a manner that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.

- Connections should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.
- f. Additions should follow the guidelines for new construction.

III.B.1 Demolition is Not Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense.

III.B.2 Demolition is Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district;
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or
- c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 D of the historic zoning ordinance.

Background: The structure at 512 Fairfax Avenue is a one-story, brick house that was constructed c. 1953 (Figure 1). The house is a legally non-conforming duplex.

Analysis and Findings: The applicant proposes to demolish the existing house and to construct infill and an outbuilding.

<u>Demolition</u>: The house located at 512 Fairfax Avenue is a one-story, brick minimal traditional that was constructed c. 1953 (Figure 1). Given the later date of construction as well as the style, form, and detailing of the house, which are inconsistent with the predominant surrounding historic character, staff finds that the house does not contribute to the historic character of the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Staff therefore finds that the structure does not contribute to the architectural and historical character and significance of the district and that its demolition meets Section III.B.2 for appropriate demolition and does not meet Section III.B.1 for inappropriate demolition.



Figure 1. 512 Fairfax Avenue, May 2021.

<u>Height & Scale</u>: The proposed new structure has a one and one-half story form with Tudor detailing similar to historic houses on the 500 block of Fairfax Avenue. The house has a maximum roof height of approximately twenty-eight feet (28') from grade at the front, with a maximum eave height of approximately fourteen (14') above the floor level and a maximum foundation height of approximately two feet, four inches (2'-4") that varies with the cross-slope on the site. The historic context includes predominantly oneand-one-half-story houses, ranging from twenty-four feet (24') to thirty feet (30') tall from grade. The structure gains an additional story in the rear due to a drop in grade, but the additional height does not impact the scale of the house as experienced from the street. This condition is typical of houses on similarly sloped lots nearby. Staff finds the one and one-half story form and height of the proposed building is compatible with the context.

The new building is fifty-one feet, four inches (51'-4") wide at the front. Nearby houses range between forty-five feet (45') and fifty-two feet (52') wide. Staff finds the width of

the proposed house to be appropriate as it falls within the range of historic buildings on this block of Fairfax Avenue.

Staff finds that the height and width of the infill are compatible with the surrounding historic context and that the project meets Section II.B.1.a.and b.

<u>Setback & Rhythm of Spacing</u>: The infill is proposed to be located with its front edge approximately forty feet (40') from the front of the property line, which is compatible with the front setbacks of the historic houses at 512 and 516 Fairfax Avenue. The house is shifted to the right on the lot to accommodate a driveway as there is no alley access to the site. The project meets all base zoning setbacks with side setbacks of approximately sixteen feet (16') on the left and five feet (5') on the right side. The infill is located approximately fifty-six feet (56') from the rear property line. Staff finds the rhythm of spacing between the infill and the adjacent buildings to be consistent with the established pattern on the street.

With a condition that the front setback is verified with an inspection prior to the start of construction, staff finds that the setbacks of the infill are consistent with those of surrounding historic houses nearby and meets section II.B.1.c. of the design guidelines.

	Proposed	Color/Texture/ Make/Manufac turer	Approved Previously or Typical of Neighborhood	Requires Additional Review
Foundation	CMU	Split face	Yes	
Primary Cladding	Brick	Selection Needs Approval	Yes	Х
Secondary Cladding	Board-and- batten	Smooth	Yes	
Tertiary Cladding	Cementitious fiberlap siding	Smooth, 5" reveal	Yes	
Trim	Wood	Painted	Yes	
Front Porch Floor	Concrete	Sandblasted	Yes	
Front Porch Stairs	Concrete	Sandblasted	Yes	
Side Porch Floor	Concrete	Sandblasted	Yes	
Side Porch Stairs	Concrete	Sandblasted	Yes	
Side/Rear	Steel	Powder coated	Yes	

Materials:

Railings				
Primary	Fiberglass	Color Needs		Х
Roofing	architectural	Approval		
_	shingles			
Secondary	Metal	Standing Seam;	Yes	Х
Roofing		Color Needs		
_		Approval		
Chimney	Brick	Selection Needs	Yes	Х
		Approval		
Windows	Clad wood	Selection Needs		Х
	windows; SDL	Approval		
Principle	Wood; SDL	Selection Needs		Х
Entrance		Approval		
Doors				
Side/Rear	Fiberglass; SDL	Selection Needs		Х
Doors		Approval		
Driveway	Not indicated	Needs Final	Unknown	X
		Approval		
Walkway	Not indicated	Needs Final	Unknown	X
		Approval		

Staff finds that the proposal meets Section II.B.1.d. of the guidelines, with the condition that staff approval the final selections of the materials for the brick, roof color, windows, doors, driveway, and walkway prior to purchase and installation.

<u>Roof Form</u>: The primary roof form of the infill is a cross-gable form with a projecting front gable and clipped side gables, all with a 14/12 pitch. The front elevation incorporates two front dormers – a hipped dormer with a 6/12 pitch and a gabled dormer with a 14/12 pitch. Staff recommends that both dormers set in two feet (2') from the wall below in order to meet the design guidelines. The rear of the infill includes twin gables with side shed dormers as well as single-story bays that are situated behind the side clipped gable form. The primary roof pitch beyond the side clipped gables is 14/12 except for the side dormers which have a 10/12 pitch. The side dormers are not set in two feet (2') from the wall below, but staff finds that they can be appropriate as they are set in three feet (3') from the side walls of the house.

Staff finds that the roofs of the proposed infill are compatible with the surrounding context and meet Section II.B.1.e. of the design guidelines.

<u>Orientation</u>: The infill has a recessed front entrance that is oriented to Fairfax Avenue and is consistent with that of surrounding houses along Fairfax Avenue. A concrete walkway connects the building to the sidewalk at the front of the lot.

Staff finds the orientation of the proposed new building is compatible with the surrounding context and to meet section II.B.1.f. of the design guidelines.

<u>Proportion and Rhythm of Openings</u>: The windows on the front and sides of the proposed infill are all generally twice as tall as they are wide, consistent with the proportions of openings on historic houses nearby. There are no large expanses of wall space without a window or door opening.

Staff finds the project's proportion and rhythm of openings is compatible with the surrounding historic context, which meets Section II.B.1.g. of the design guidelines.

<u>Appurtenances & Utilities:</u> The proposal includes a walkway from the front of the building to the sidewalk at the front of the lot, which are common features in the neighborhood. The location of the HVAC and other utilities was not indicated in the proposal.

Staff asks that the HVAC be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house to meet section II.B.1.h. of the design guidelines.

<u>Outbuilding</u>: The proposal also includes a detached outbuilding at the rear of the lot. The outbuilding is not indicated as being a detached accessory dwelling unit. The lot has an area of approximately eleven thousand, three hundred, ninety-four square feet (11,394 sq. ft.).

Massing/Planning:

	Maximum footprint for an outbuilding on a lot greater than 10,000 sq. ft.	Proposed footprint
Max. Square Footage	1000 sq. ft.	935 sq. ft.

	Potential 2-Story Outbuilding	Proposed Outbuilding
Ridge Height	25'	23'-2"
Eave Height	10'	7'-4" – 12'-2"

The outbuilding has a ridge height of twenty-three feet, two inches (23'-2") with eave heights that vary from seven feet, four inches (7'-4") to twelve feet, two inches (12'-2"). The taller eaves correspond with gabled components on the front and rear elevations. The Commission has approved taller eaves on outbuildings when those components are accents rather than primary eaves that push the scale of the outbuilding to two stories. Staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets that criteria given the prevalence of eaves that are less than ten feet (10') tall in the overall design. Staff finds that the application meets Section II.B.1.h.i.1. of the design guidelines for height and scale.

Materials:

	Proposed	Color/Texture/ Make/	Approved Previously or	Requires Additional
		Manufacturer	Typical	Review
Foundation	CMU	Split-face	Yes	
Primary	Brick	Selection Needs	Yes	Х
Cladding		Approval		
Secondary	Board-and-	Smooth	Yes	
Cladding	batten			
Trim	Wood		Yes	
Roofing	Fiberglass	Selection Needs	Yes	Х
	architectural	Approval		
	shingles			
Windows	Clad wood;	Selection Needs	Yes	Х
	SDL	Approval		
Pedestrian	Fiberglass;	Selection Needs	Yes	Х
Doors	SDL	Approval		
Garage	Insulated steel		Yes	
Door				

With a condition that the brick, roof color, windows, and doors are approved prior to purchase and installation, Staff finds that the project meets Section II.B.1.h.i.1. for new construction-materials on outbuildings.

Roof Form:

Proposed Element	Proposed Form	Typical or Appropriate?
Primary Form	Cross-gabled	Yes
Primary Roof Slope	14/12 and 9/12	Yes

The proposed outbuilding will have a cross-gabled roof with pitches similar to the proposed infill. Staff finds that the roof forms of the proposed outbuilding meets Section II.B.1.h.i.1. of the design guidelines for roof form.

Site Planning & Setbacks:

	MINIMUM	PROPOSED
Building located towards rear of lot	-	Yes
Space between principal building and garage	20'	20'
Rear setback	5'	5'

Left side setback	5'	25'
Right side setback	5'	17'
How is the building accessed?	-	Driveway

Staff finds that the location and setbacks for the proposed outbuilding will be appropriate and that the proposal meets Section II.B.1.h.i.2. of the design guidelines.

Recommendation: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
- 2. The front setback shall be consistent with the buildings to either side, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
- 3. The front dormers shall set in 2' from the wall below;
- 4. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of the brick, roof color, windows, doors, driveway, and walkway prior to purchase and installation; and,
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).

With these conditions, staff finds that the project meets Section II.B of the *Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation District: Handbook and Design Guidelines*.

Context Photos



510 Fairfax Avenue – Contributing house located to the left of the subject property.



516 Fairfax Avenue – Contributing house located to the right of the subject property.



518 Fairfax Avenue – Contributing house



511 Fairfax Avenue – Contributing house located across the street



513 Fairfax Avenue – Contributing house located across the street

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

5 I 2 FAIRFAX AVENUE

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

l 6 April 202 I Revised For MHZC Staff Comments - 11 May 2021

512 FAIRFAX AVENUE conceptual designs 16 April 2021 Revised: 11 May 2021



VAN POND ARCHITECT 2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville, Tennessee 37204

vanpondarchitect.com



EXISTING SITE SURVEY

RAX AVENUE C Λ NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

504 FAIRFAX

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

copyright 2021 VPA, pllc.



510 FAIRFAX

Ē

506 FAIRFAX



518 FAIRFAX

CONCEPTUAL STREET ELEVATION

512 FAIRFAX PROPOSED

516 FAIRFAX

520 FAIRFAX



520 FAIRFAX



VAN POND ARCHITECT 2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville, Tennessee 37204

FAIRAX AVENUE

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

copyright 2021 VPA, pllc.

C

FAIRFAX LANE



AREA CALCULATIONS

SED MAIN RESIDENCE FOOTPRINT AREA (GSF):	2,660 S.F.
SED DETACHED ACCESSORY STRUCTURE FOOTPRINT AREA (GSF):	992 S.F.
OOTPRINT AREA (GSF):	3,652 S.F.
ING COVERAGE CALCULATIONS:	
OT AREA:	11,461 S.F.
ABLE BUILDING COVERAGE FOR RS7.5 DISTRICTS	
DSON COUNTY: 45% (11,461 S.F. X 0.45)	5,157 S.F.
ROPOSED BUILDING COVERAGE (G.S.F.)	3.652 S.F. (71%)



CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS Revised: 11 May 202

FAIRAX AVENUE

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

2

5

copyright 2021 VPA, pllc.

CONCEPTUAL SOUTH STREET ELEVATION



STANDING SEAM METAL ROOFING

CLAD-WOOD WINDOW W/ LOW-E INSULATED GLAZING + SIMULATED LITES

- ARCHSTONE LIMESTONE COMPOSITE WINDOW AND DOOR SURROUND

30-YEAR FIBERGLASS ARCHITECTURAL SHINGLES

PRE-FINISHED ALUMIN OGEE GUTTERS + DOV

WOOD ENTRY DOOR

BRICK VENEER

RICK SOLDIER ARCH

INSULATED FIBERGLASS DOOR W/ LOW-E INSULATED GLAZING + SIMULATED LITES

4" T. CUT LIMESTONE CAP

SAND-BLASTED CONCRETE STEPS - COORDINATE W/ GRADE

SPLIT-FACED CMU FOUNATION WALL



VAN POND ARCHITECT 2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville,Tennessee 37204



FAIRAX AVENUE 2 5 NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

Revised: 11 May 202 copyright 2021 VPA, pllc.

A NEW RESIDENCE AT





CONCEPTUAL NORTH REAR ELEVATION





VAN POND ARCHITECT 2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville,Tennessee 37204



CONCEPTUAL EAST SIDE ELEVATION

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

5 1 2 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION FRANCE RAL A V E N U E

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

Revised: 11 May 202 copyright 2021 VPA, pllc.



VAN POND ARCHITECT 2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville, Tennessee 37204



FAIRAX AVENUE 2 5 NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212

FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

Revised: 11 May 202 copyright 2021 | VPA, pllc.



CONCEPTUAL WEST SIDE ELEVATION



2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville,Tennessee 37204



FAIRAX AVENUE 5 2 NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37212 FOR JK CONSTRUCTION

A NEW RESIDENCE AT

CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS

Revised: 11 May 202 copyright 2021 | VPA, pllc.



CONCEPTUAL ACCESSORY STRUCTURE SOUTH ELEVATION

CONCEPTUAL ACCESSORY STRUCTURE NORTH ELEVATION



VAN POND ARCHITECT 2929 Sidco Drive Suite 105 Nashville,Tennessee 37204

