JOHN COOPER MAYOR



ELE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission Sunnyside in Sevier Park 3000 Granny White Pike Nashville, Tennessee 37204 Telephone: (615) 862-7970

STAFF RECOMMENDATION 1500 Holly Street July 21, 2021

Application: New Construction – Infill District: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay **Council District:** 06 Base Zoning: R6 Map and Parcel Number: 083090478.00 Applicant: Kim Kennedy, Bootstrap Architecture & Construction Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill and a detached outbuilding.Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:	Attachments A: Photographs B: Site Plan C: Elevations
 The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field; 	
2. Staff shall approve the final siding, the metal roofing, the trim material, the porch floor and steps, the porch post and railing, the rear steps, the walkway material and all doors and windows prior to purchase and installation; and,	
3. Four inch (4") nominal corner boards shall be provided at the face of each exposed corner;	
4. A base and capital shall be added to the front porch column;	
 Utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s); 	
finding that the project meets Sections IV and V of the <i>Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Design Guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th-Century Districts: Part I.</i>	

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

IV. MATERIALS, TEXTURE, DETAILS & MATERIAL COLOR

Please see "Partial Demolition" for replacement siding.

- A. Specific materials are italicized so that the list can be revised as more materials become available and as the quality and workability of existing materials improves. Materials listed are to provide general guidance to applicants based on the Commission's past decisions. Applicants are always welcome to propose new materials not listed as "appropriate" or repropose materials listed as "inappropriate."
- B. The texture, details, and dimensions of new materials for replacement or new construction shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Replacement materials should mimic historic materials in texture, dimensions, and workability. Materials that create a false version of a historic material are not appropriate. For instance, a "wood-grain" fiber-cement lap siding creates a texture that did not exist historically, as wood cladding historically had a smooth finish.
 - 1. Paint color and roof color are not reviewed. The inherent color, texture and dimensions of masonry is reviewed. *It is recommended that if multiple colors are used for a roof that they be used to create a pattern, as seen historically, rather than creating a "speckled" or random design.*

2. INAPPROPRIATE materials include:

Foundations

- · Stone veneer without mortar
- · Smooth concrete block without a parge coating

<u>Cladding</u>

- · Synthetic sidings such as vinyl, aluminum, permastone and E.F.IS.
- *T-1-11- type building panels*
- · Stud wall lumber
- · Embossed wood grain
- · Unpainted or unstained wood

Chimneys

- · Fiber cement panels
- \cdot Lap siding

<u>Roofing</u>

- \cdot Corrugated metal
- · Snap-lock standing seam metal with big seams
- · Metal made to look like a traditional materials such as wood shingles, slate or clay/terra cotta

<u>Windows</u>

 \cdot Brass cames on leaded or stained glass windows.

3. APPROPRIATE materials include:

Foundations

· Continuous or piers of pre-cast stone, split-face concrete block, parge coated concrete block, or brick as long as the

primary cladding is not the same material as the foundation

• Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material at the floor line.

<u>Cladding</u>

- Smooth-finished cement fiberboard or smooth-finished wood lap sidings are both appropriate. The siding should be not be stamped or embossed and the reveal should not exceed 7". Wider reveals may be appropriate if a wider reveal meets the immediate historic context and if the building is only one-story with mitered corners rather than a corner board, to be in keeping with typical conditions of historic wide siding reveals.
- · Shingle siding is only appropriate as an accent material, an upper level, or a feature such as a bay.
- Fiber-cement or wood panels, board-and-batten, and half-timbering are only appropriate as accent materials such as cladding for a bay, a gable field or an upper level.
- When different cladding materials are used on one building, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines.
- Masonry cladding should have the color, dimensions, textures, and mortar tooling of like historic examples.
- Four inch (4") nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner \cdot of a frame building, unless the lap siding is mittered.
- All wood, or materials to substitute for wood, should be milled and painted, with the exception of shingles which could be painted or stained.

Chimneys

· Masonry or stucco is appropriate for chimneys.

<u>Roofing</u>

- Asphalt and architectural shingles, slate and slate substitutes, and metal are appropriate roofing materials. Clay tile, or clay tile substitutes may be appropriate in areas where this a common historic roofing material.
- · Clay tile ridges are appropriate.
- · Types of appropriate metal roofing include 5-V, low-profile snap-lock, rolled standing seam

Trim & Architectural Features

- · All wood or materials to substitute for wood should be milled and painted.
- · *Composite materials are appropriate for trim and decking*
- C. Windows with single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.
- D. Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows, and vents on non-masonry buildings. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Paired and ribbons of multiple single– or double-hung windows should have a four inch to six inch (4" to 6") mullion in between each window.
- E. Brick moulding is required around doors, windows, and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.

V. NEW CONSTRUCTION-INFILL

A. MASSING & SCALE

1. The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), walls, and ridges, and the width of a new building should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings of the same building type and on same the block face. Where there are block faces with little historic context, the adjoining blocks may be used.

B. FORM

- 1. The most appropriate building and roof forms for new construction are ones that are similar to historic buildings on the block face and buildings that are typical for the overall district. Considerations are the general form and orientation of the main massing of the building and roof pitches, shape, and orientation.
- 2. In most areas, residential roof pitches of the main form of a building are between 6/12 -12/12. Porches generally had lower pitches or were flat. In some rare cases, flat roof forms may be appropriate. In those instances, the flat roof should not include additional construction such as railings, coverings like pergolas and tents, or stair/elevator towers.
- 3. Dormers should be fully located on the roof; wall dormers and recessed dormers are generally not appropriate on the front and side facades, as they are not common or not found historically in most districts. The dimensions and forms of dormers visible from the street should be compatible with dormers found historically in the district. Generally, this can be accomplished with the following:
 - a. The number of dormers and their location and size should be appropriate to the style and design of the building. Often the width of roof dormers relate to the openings below. The symmetry, or lack of symmetry within a building's design, should be used as a guide when placing dormers.
 - b. Dormers should not be located on secondary roof planes.
 - c. Eave depth on a dormer should match main roof form's eave depth or be less.
 - d. The roof form of the dormer should match the main roof form of the building or be appropriate for the style.
 - e. The roof pitch of the dormer should generally match the roof pitch of the main roof form of the building.
 - f. The side walls of the dormer should be inset at least two feet (2') from the side walls of the building or adjacent valley. A dormer wall should not connect with the side of a gable.
 - g. The front wall of the dormer should be setback a minimum of two feet (2') from the wall below. (These minimum insets will likely be greater than two feet (2') when following the guidelines for appropriate scale.)
 - h. Dormers should generally be fully glazed and aprons below the window should be minimal.
 - i. The exterior material cladding of side dormers should match the primary or secondary material of the main building.
- 4. New buildings should have a primary entrance oriented towards (facing) the street. In most districts, a primary entrance is defined by a projecting or recessed porch. If the historic context supports such, decorative entrances, hoods above entrances, covered stoops, and vestibule entrances could be appropriate substitutions for a porch.
 - a. Generally, porches should be a minimum of six feet deep (6') with a visible porch beam that is 18"-36" in height and with posts that include bases and capitals.
- 5. Porte-cocheres are only appropriate where they are typical of historic forms found in the district and should only be added to new buildings that have a similar form to those that historically had porte-cocheres.

- 6. Some properties are zoned for two residential units on one lot. On such lots that meet all the qualifications for two units, the two units should be fully attached, with a single mass (in what looks like one building) with one or two front doors and meet all the requirements for infill. Detached infill duplexes may be appropriate in the following instances:
 - a. The second unit follows the design guidelines for an outbuilding.
 - b. There is not enough square footage to legally subdivide the lot, but there is enough street frontage and depth to the lot to accommodate two single-family dwellings in a manner that meets the design guidelines and historic context and is more appropriate for the context than a single building.
 - c. The lot has double frontage and is deep enough to accommodate two buildings and associated parking in a manner that meets the design guidelines and historic context.
 - d. An existing, non-contributing building sits so far back on the lot that a building may be constructed in front of it in a manner that better meets the design guidelines than existing conditions. It is not appropriate to add a new house in front a contributing house.
- 7. Building types generally should be consistent with the types in the immediate vicinity, no matter the actual use or zoning of the site. For instance, a lot zoned commercially but located within an area of residential building types should be similar in form to the residential building types in the immediate vicinity.
- 8. Roof decks are not appropriate on the front or side of infill but may be appro-priate on the rear if the deck is surrounded on all sides by an appropriately-pitched roof.

C. SITING, SETBACK , ORIENTATION & RHYTHM OF SPACING

- 1. In most residential districts, lots had a primary building facing the street. Any additional buildings on the lot were typically secondary structures that were subordinate in size to the primary building and located in the rear yard. New development should follow this pattern.
- 2. The setback from front- and side-yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained.
- 3. There should be a minimum of 20' between primary buildings and outbuildings.
- 4. The Commission has the ability to determine appropriate building setbacks of the required underlying base zoning for new construction, additions, and accessory structures (ordinance no. 17.40.410).
 - a. Front setbacks generally should be the average between the historic front setbacks established on either side of the proposed infill. If the lot has non-contributing or vacant lots on either side, the front setbacks of nearby a. historic buildings may be considered.
 - b. Side setbacks should maintain the dominant rhythm along a street established by building widths and spaces between buildings. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm even when lots are subdivided.
 - c. Rear setbacks are determined based on a combination of bulk standards and an appropriately-scaled building for the district.

- d. When a building is unable to meet bulk standard setback requirements, appropriate setbacks will be determined based on:
- · The existing setback of the contributing primary buildings and accessory structures found in the immediate vicinity
- · Setbacks of like structures historically found on the site as determined by historic maps, site plans, or photographs
- \cdot Shape of lot
- · Alley access or lack thereof
- · Proximity of adjoining structures
- · Property lines
- \cdot Easements
- · The extent of and the number of protrusions beyond the footprint such as bays/oriels, balconies and roof overhangs
- 5. Parking pads and outbuildings should be located at the rear of the lot.
- 6. Vehicular storage, such as garages and carports, shall not be a part of a new primary building with a residential form unless lot constraints prevent a detached outbuilding or unless the attached garage can be fully located at the basement level and accessed from the rear or side, inset a minimum of four feet from the main side wall of the house.
- 7. Driveways from the street are appropriate if there is an existing curb-cut or if the lot lacks an alley. When a driveway is appropriate, it should not exceed twelve feet in width and should extend to at least the rear of the building.
- 8. New buildings should be connected to the street with an uncovered walkway from the porch/entrance to the street/sidewalk/curb.
- 9. New infill buildings should be oriented to (facing) the shortest street-facing side of a lot.
- 10. In the case of duplexes on a corner lot, entrances or porches that face the rear or sides should look like secondary entrances and porches, even if the entry/porch serves as the primary entrance to one of the units.
- 11. Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street. Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the midpoint of the structure. It is recommended that power lines should be placed underground, if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.
- 12. Where sidewalk-accessed mailboxes are rare, new mailboxes should be placed on the front wall of the building or a porch post.
- 13. Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture, and other work undertaken in public spaces (Metro owned and public right-of-ways) by any individual, group or agency, shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the historic character of the district.

D. PROPORTION & RHYTHM OF OPENINGS

- 1. The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.
- 2. Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district. In most cases, every eight to thirteen horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least four square feet. More leniency can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls. Wide openings for sliding glass doors or roll-up doors are not appropriate on the front half of a building and a street-facing side.

3. Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1, where double-hung windows are a typical feature of the neighborhood. Generally, windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor, if not the same height.

LS: DESIGN GUIDELINES

A. NEW CONSTRUCTION-INFILL

- 1. Infill construction on the 1400 -1600 blocks of Boscobel Street may be up to two-stories.
- 2. Infill construction on the 1400 -1600 blocks of Boscobel Street may have flat roofs or roofs with a minimal slope.

Background: The historic house that was located at 1500 Holly Street was badly damaged in the March 3, 2020 tornado. The building sat, with a tree on the roof for nearly a year, unsecured. A new owner purchased the property in February 2021. This owner planned to stabilize and restore the house and had the tree removal scheduled. Before this work could take place, a second storm in March of 2021 blew remnants of the second story onto the neighboring property, further damaging the structure and creating a true life-safety issue. See figures 1 & 2. Staff issued an emergency demolition permit on March 29, 2021. This is an application for the new construction of infill, including a single family home on this corner lot in the Lockeland-Springs East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. The plans indicate a future DADU, but that is not a part of this application.



Figure 1. Condition of 1500 Holly Street after the March 2021 storm



Figure 2. Side and rear elevations after the March 2021 storm

Analysis and Findings:

Height & Scale:

The subject lot is fifty feet wide by one-hundred-sixty feet deep (50'x160'). Historic houses in the immediate vicinity nearly all sit on lots of the same size. These houses range in width from around thirty-one to around thirty-seven feet (\sim 31'- \sim 37') wide. The applicant is proposing a width of thirty-three feet (33'), which staff finds to be appropriate here.

The two blocks of Holly Street impacted by this site have a significant slope across the street-frontage. Exact height measurements varying depending on where they are taken, but the historic houses in the immediate block face have heights ranging from about twenty-one to about twenty-eight feet ($\sim 21' - \sim 28'$). The proposed infill sits on a particularly steep lot and measures about twenty-seven feet, six inches ($\sim 27'6''$) at the front, from average grade. The applicant has provided a streetscape showing the two houses uphill from the infill which shows how the massing will fit into the streetscape. See Figure 3.



Figure 3. Streetscape. Dotted line shows prior version, applicant has reduced the height to better meet the context. 1504 Holly was destroyed by the tornado, but is indicative of the historic streetscape.

To further illustrate the impact on the context, the applicant provided a cross-section of Holly Street, showing how this house compares to the historic house immediately across the street at 1501 Holly. This is particularly valuable, as these two houses sit on similarly sloped lots, falling in grade quickly toward 15th Street. See Figure 4.



Figure 4. Cross section of Holly Street with the infill on the left and the existing historic house it will face on the right.

Staff finds that the proposed infill is appropriate and meets section V.A. for massing and scale.

<u>Form:</u> The form of this infill reads like a historic house with a lower, appropriately scaled addition at the rear. The primary massing of the proposed infill is one-and-a-half stories tall with a side-gabled form. A lower side gabled portion at the rear is joined via a front-rear gabled connector.

The side gabled forms both have a 10.5/12 slope, which is appropriate to the context. The primary gable has no eave overhang (which corresponds to the contributing house across the street at 1501 Holly Street), and includes a shed dormer on the front elevation that is inset by the required two feet (2') from the wall below. A second shed dormer is located on the rear elevation and is stacked above the primary massing rear wall, which is appropriate in this location. Both dormers are inset a minimum of two feet (2') from the sidewalls and have no eave overhang, matching the primary roof form. The lower gabled



form in the rear does include an eave overhang. The front porch is recessed under the roof and is partialwidth. The porch is about seven feet, six inches (7'6") deep. There is a visible porch beam under the projecting overhang that is about two feet (2') high. A single column at the corner supports the porch. It has no base or capital, which is typically required and should be added.

Figure 5. Rendering of the front corner.

The proposed infill meets Section V.B. for form.

Siting, Setback, Orientation and Rhythm of Spacing: The right-side setback is five feet (5') from the interior side property line. The left-side setback is ten feet (10') from the street-side property line. Both these conditions meet the base zoning and the historic context. The front setback is proposed to be about twenty-four feet (24') from the front property line. This aligns the front wall and the front of the partial-width recessed porch with the porch of the historic house next door.

The infill is oriented toward Holly Street. The front door faces the side street, opening onto the partial width recessed front porch. This is a common historic configuration and is appropriate to this context. The site plan indicates a walkway from the front door to the sidewalk. The site plan also indicates a future outbuilding. While the outbuilding is not a part of this application, the site plan illustrates that there is sufficient space on the lot to site such a structure in the future and maintain all required setbacks, including the twenty-foot (20') distance between the house and the outbuilding.

Staff finds that the project meets section V.C.

	Proposed	Color/Texture/ Make/Manufact	Approved Previously or Typical of	Requires Additional Review
		urei	Neighborhood	Keview
Foundation	Concrete Block	Split Face	Yes	
Cladding	4" horizontal siding	Unknown	Yes	Х
Secondary Cladding	Vertical siding	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Primary Roofing	Architectural Shingles	Unknown	Yes	
Secondary Roofing	Metal	Unknown	Yes	Х
Trim	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Sun Shade	Wood	Unknown	No	
Front Porch floor/steps	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Front Porch Post	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Front Porch Railing	Unknown	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Rear steps	Not indicated	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Windows	Not indicated	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Principle Entrance	Full light	Unknown	Unknown	X
Rear door	Full light	Unknown	Unknown	Х
Walkway	Not indicated	Unknown	Unknown	X

The plans indicate both horizontal and vertical siding, but are not clear on the specific materials: wood, fiber cement or metal are all suggested. Wood and fiber cement are routinely approved and staff finds that vertical siding is appropriate as an accent material on the rear portion of the structure and on the porch. If the applicant would like to use metal siding, this should be reviewed and approved by staff prior to purchase and installation.

Four inch (4") corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner. The porch post does not show a base or capital, which is typically required. Additionally, the west elevation shows windows filling the side gable field with a wooden sun shade applied. This is not a historic feature, but staff finds it appropriate to the modern design of this structure.

With the inclusion of corner boards, the addition of a base and capital to the porch column and final staff review and approval of the siding, the metal roofing, the trim

Materials:

material, the porch floor and steps, the porch post and railing, the rear steps, the walkway material and all doors and windows, staff finds that the project meets section IV for materials.

<u>Proportion and Rhythm of Openings</u>: There are no large expanses of wall space without a window or door opening. The windows are all generally twice as tall as they are wide, thereby meeting the historic proportions of openings. There are two horizonal windows which staff finds appropriate in this instance as they are accent windows and not the primary window form. Staff finds the project's proportion and rhythm of openings to meet Section V.D.



Figure 6. Side elevation facing 15th Street

<u>Appurtenances & Utilities:</u> The location of the HVAC was indicated well back from the front wall, along the side interior elevation, which is appropriate. Utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within five feet (5') of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within five feet (5') of the rear corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).

<u>Outbuilding</u>: The site plan and renderings indicate a future outbuilding on the site, but it is not being reviewed as a part of this application.

Recommendation: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
- 2. Staff shall approve the final siding, the metal roofing, the trim material, the porch floor and steps, the porch post and railing, the rear steps, the walkway material and all doors and windows prior to purchase and installation; and,
- 3. Four inch (4") nominal corner boards shall be provided at the face of each exposed corner;
- 4. A base and capital shall be added to the front porch column;
- 5. Utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s);

finding that the project meets Sections IV and V of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Design Guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th-Century Districts: Part I.



CONTEXT PHOTOGRAPHS

1502 Holly Street, to the immediate left of the site



1506 Holly Street – recently reconstructed post-tornado damage



1508 Holly Street, up the hill on the same side of the street



1510 Holly Street, up the hill on the same side of the street



1518 Holly Street, up the hill on the same side of the street



1416 & 1418 Holly Street. Looking uphill toward 1500 Holly. Site is just beyond the white car



1415, 1417, 1419 Holly Street (#1419 was constructed in 2013) – Across Holly and 15th, caddy-corner, down the hill



Directly across Holly Street, looking uphill. 1501 Holly at the corner.



1511 and 1513 Holly Street, across the street and uphill



1515 Holly Street, across the street and uphill





1500 HOLLY ST

PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09 PROJECT #20.043

SITE PLAN **HO.1**





1500 HOLLY ST

PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09 PROJECT #20.043

COPYRIGHT - THESE DOCUMENTS ARE THE PROPERTY OF BOOTSTRAP. THEY HAVE BEEN PREPARED SPECIFICALLY FOR THE PROJECT NAMED HEREIN. THEY ARE NOT SUITABLE FOR USE ON OTHER PROJECTS OR IN OTHER LOCATIONS WITHOUT THE APPROVAL AND PARTICIPATION OF BOOTSTRAP. REPRODUCTION IS PROHIBITED.





MATERIAL SYMBOLS



ASPHALT SHINGLES



METAL ROOFING



4" HORIZONTAL SIDING



VERTICAL SIDING - WOOD, FIBER CEMENT OR METAL



SPLIT FACE CMU

1500 HOLLY ST



PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09

PROJECT #20.043

ELEVATIONS

H2.0













MATERIAL SYMBOLS



ASPHALT SHINGLES



METAL ROOFING



4" HORIZONTAL SIDING



VERTICAL SIDING - WOOD, FIBER CEMENT OR METAL



SPLIT FACE CMU

1500 HOLLY ST

PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09 PROJECT #20.043

ELEVATIONS

H2.1





1500 HOLLY ST

PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09

PROJECT #20.043

PERSPECTIVES

H3.0





1500 HOLLY ST

PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09 PROJECT #20.043

PERSPECTIVES

H3.1



DASHED LINE



1500 HOLLY ST

PRESERVATION PERMIT SET

2021 JULY 09 PROJECT #20.043

CONTEXT

