Comments on December 8, 2016 Planning Commission agenda items, received December 7-8

Item 2, Green Hills-Midtown Community Plan Amendment/Music Row Detailed Design Plan

From: Grant Mullins [mailto:gcmull@gmail.com]
Sent: Wednesday, December 07, 2016 3:32 PM

To: Planning Staff

Subject: Community Group Notice

I wanted to give written notice that I am requesting 5 minutes to speak on Agenda Item G2 (2016CP-010-003), the Music Row Detail Design Plan, as a representative of Historic Nashville, Inc.

Best,

Grant Mullins

Items 10a/b, Chadwell Retreat/1497 Chadwell Drive (letter from CM Nancy VanReece follows)



METROPOLITAN COUNCIL

Member of Council

Nancy VanReece Councilwoman, District 8

209 Marlin Court • Madison, Tennessee 37115 615.576.0488

December 8, 2016

Chairman Greg Adkins and Members of the Commission Metropolitan Planning Commission Metro Office Building 800 Second Avenue, South Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

Due to out-of-town travel, I will be unable to attend today's Planning Commission meeting.

I attended an HOA Meeting with Chadwell Retreat property owners and all issues were addressed and the approval of these items was secured by vote. There were only two abstentions, otherwise unanimous approval.

With that, it has my approval as well. Listed below are the proposals:

10 a. 2004P-032-001 On Consent: Yes CHADWELL RETREAT Public Hearing: Open Council District 08 (Nancy VanReece) Staff Reviewer: Karimeh Sharp A request to amend a Planned Unit Development Overlay for property located at 1497 Chadwell Drive (9.98 acres), approximately 400 feet southeast of Port Drive, zoned Multi-Family Residential (RM4), to permit the addition of 13 multi-family residential units for a maximum of 49 residential units within the overlay, requested by Dale & Associates, applicant; O.I.C. Chadwell Retreat Townhomes, owners. Staff Recommendation: Approve with conditions and disapprove without all conditions subject to the approval of the associated zone change, and disapprove if the associated zone change is not approved. 7 12/2/2016 3:23 PM

10 b. 2016Z-131PR-001 On Consent: Yes Council District 08 (Nancy VanReece) Public Hearing: Open Staff Reviewer: Karimeh Sharp A request to rezone from RM4 to RM6 zoning for property located at 1497 Chadwell Drive, approximately 400 feet southeast of Port Drive (9.98 acres), requested by Dale & Associates, applicant; O.I.C. Chadwell Retreat Townhomes, owners. Staff Recommendation: Approve.

Your support of these proposals will be greatly appreciated.

Sincerely,

Nancy VanReece

Councilwoman, District 8

Item 12, Titles 15/17 of the Metropolitan Code of Laws pertaining to the Department of Water and Sewer Services

(letter from CM Sheri Weiner follows)



METROPOLITAN COUNCIL

Member of Council

Office: 615/862-6780 Fax: 615/862-6784

Sheri Weiner

District 22 Metro Councilwoman

417 W. F. Rust Court • Nashville, TN 37221 615.347.7544

December 8, 2016

Chairman Greg Adkins and Members of the Commission **Metropolitan Planning Commission** Metro Office Building 800 Second Avenue, South Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

Dear Chairman Adkins and Members of the Commission,

As I am unable to attend this Thursday's Planning Commission meeting, please accept this letter of support for case #2016Z-022TX-001 (Council Ordinance BL 2016-513), which is a request to amend Title 17, Zoning Code, pertaining to Stormwater Standards in Sections 17.28 and 17.36.

As noted in the staff report, this proposed amendment seeks to reverse an unintended consequence pertaining to required buffers on previously developed properties. The changes in this proposed legislation will eliminate conflicts between Title 17 and Title 15 of the Metro Code and also keep Metro Stormwater regulations consistent with TDEC regulations. I ask for your support of this amendment to help clarify regulations as they pertain to development within the floodplain.

Thank you for your consideration and thank you for your service.

Sincerely,

Sheri Weiner

District 22 Councilmember

Item 13, Short-Term Rental Services

From: laurarost@comcast.net [mailto:laurarost@comcast.net]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 11:57 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Please vote against the Short Term Rental bill

Good afternoon. I'm Laura Rost. I live at 4604 Villa Green Dr., Nashville, 37215. That's near Shy's Hill, for any of my fellow Battle of Nashville history buffs.

I first started hearing stories of short term rentals in Nashville a little over two years ago, but it didn't reach a real crescendo until this past year, when one made itself known very loudly in our neighborhood.

The timing is important to me because 4 years ago I was asked to serve on the Community Engagement Committee for Nashville Next. I was really honored when I was chosen. I enjoyed my involvement through the CEC monthly meetings, as well as the many public meetings and charrettes I helped with, at churches, libraries, shopping areas, etc..

I bring this up because at no time during those meetings did we ever discuss, either among ourselves or with the public, short term rentals. We did, however, receive lots of feedback from many, many Nashvillians what they wanted from their city. We heard varying opinions about the state of Nashville's infrastructure, development along central arteries, downtown development, big civic projects. But while opinions about those items varied, what didn't vary was a theme of the desire to keep the feeling of neighborhoods intact. No one was seeking a sprawl or creep of commercial areas – Nashville residents made it clear they wanted to keep their neighborhoods neighborly.

I never heard one person stand up and say, or leave a comment on a map, that they wish they lived next door to a mini-hotel, which is what investor-owned, non-owner occupied, whole house rentals are. You can try to call them a residential use but semantics don't solve the problems they cause. Even if the house isn't a so-called "party house", it is still not desirable to its neighbors, because it can't be justifiably called a residential use if 12 different people show up every weekend, or week, and none of them are the homeowner. That's just common sense – THAT is a commercial use. And it doesn't belong in a residentially-zoned neighborhood.

And so I urge you to vote against the ordinance before you today, as is,or amend it to prohibit these investor-owned, non-owner-occupied rentals in Nashville zoning districts zoned R or RS. That's the action that's most consistent with Nashville

Next, and to do otherwise is to have wasted the time of all of us – Community Engagement Committee members and all the many, many Nashvillians who participated at one of the meetings alike. Please respect your own plan and do not approve the ordinance as it currently stands.

Thank you so much for your time.

Laura Alderman Rost 4604 Villa Green Dr. Nashville, TN 37215

Laura Rost

laurarost@comcast.net

From: Carol Lecian [mailto:cal8946@hotmail.com] Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 12:01 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: BL2016-492

Ladies and Gentlemen:

I am writing this email because I am unable to attend today's hearing in person, but I wanted to have my comments of record. I strongly urge the members of this Planning Commission to oppose BL 2016-492. While BL 2016-492 is an attempt to right a wrong, in its present form, it falls short of accomplishing that task.

As you are aware, Judge Jones declared the ordinance on Short Term Rentals (STRs) "unconstitutionally vague". The fact that we have an opportunity to revisit this matter and make adjustments should be considered a golden opportunity to correct the mistakes already made, as well as take heed of the precedents being set in cities and communities around the world.

First and foremost, I urge the Planning Commission to abolish the categorization of Types 2 and 3 STRs, which are predominately investor-owned and unsupervised rentals) in any residential (R and RS) zoned districts. Allowing such establishments in a residential district shifts the use of the property from residential to commercial, without taking the necessary steps to rezone the property. While it may be argued that a homeowner has the right to do with his property as he wishes, that is true to a point -- the point being that residential zoned properties have stipulations and restrictions that prevent an individual from operating a commercial establishment in the midst of a residential neighborhood. The allowance of Types 2 and 3 STRs in residential zoned districts usurps those very regulations that are in place to protect our neighborhoods and an individual's quality of life.

The NashvilleNext plan, which "seeks to create sustainable communities that support a high quality of life" does not have provisos for STRs, and my reading of that statement suggests that STRs never were a part of the plan.

I implore the members of this Planning Commission to continue in the manner in which NashvilleNext was intended, and to look at studies and precedents set by other cities before rushing into a decision that may have grave implications for the City of Nashville.

Respectfully submitted,

Carol Lecian

1228 Donelson Avenue

Old Hickory, TN 37138

216-571-8108 (M)

From: Evelyn Gammon [mailto:evelyn.gammon@icloud.com]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 11:49 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: BL2016-492 - OPPOSED to Type 2 STR's in R & RS zoned districts!

VOTE NO on BL2016-492!

Type 2 Short Term Rentals should NEVER be allowed in R & RS zoned neighborhoods.

These ARE commercial entities encroaching on residentially zoned neighborhoods!

They are very disruptive to neighborhoods.

They put investors interests first over homeowners in what should be residential ONLY neighborhoods.

These MINI-HOTELS have no business in residential neighborhoods. The affect our safety, and piece of mind in our own homes.

No one wants to live near one. The affect our property values as well.

There is no clear way to police violations in a timely manor.

Please consider homeowners rights to live in totally residential areas. Don't let these Mini-HOTELS operate in our neighborhoods.

Evelyn Gammon

615-917-0490

Evelyn.gammon@icloud.com

187 Thistle Ln

Hermitage, TN. 37076

From: Tom Cash [mailto:tcash101@aol.com] **Sent:** Thursday, December 08, 2016 11:43 AM

To: Planning Commissioners **Subject:** BL2016-492

I have reservations about BL2016-492; an improved bill would further limit or disallow type 2 STRPs in R and RS zones.

I supported the 2014 STRP bill as a way to get hold of a phenomenon that was growing without oversight and contradicting defined land use policies. I know of and agree with the original intent for the legislation. But over a year out, I've seen evidence it isn't working for non-owner occupied STRPs due to lack of oversight and enforcement.

I've heard from both people who have lived near some with no issues and some with nightmare stories of loud, late night partying with police and Codes enforcement doing little to nothing to resolve the issues. I'm increasingly wondering if allowing non- owner occupied STRPs in residential zones can work.

When the property is no one's home, but consistently used for short term lodging, it goes against the underlying land use for the property, and has given some residential neighborhoods a commercial feel with added traffic, lodgers who have little to no accountability to the residential use of the area. When a

resident occupies the property full time, someone there is vested in the residential nature of the area; it

might allow for a homeowner to be able to better afford a home.

Further, I've spoken to young couples wanting a new home, scouring listings, only to have the property

scooped up for ST investment purposes. We have an obligation to protect housing stock for existing and

on-the-way Nashvillians; indeed, neighborhoods have been asked to

make sacrifices for the growth of our city, to infill and increase density. Pulling up to 3% of housing for

commercial use, when we have a need for more homes, complicates our mission and ability to provide

sufficient affordable housing.

Now, I do think it's great that we are finding new business models and rethinking economic institutions.

I hope visitors to Nashville have a variety of locally-owned options for lodging, transportation. In the

same vein, I hope Nashvillians open many great local restaurants and clubs for locals and visitors to

frequent.

But I expect these businesses to be in commercial or mixed use zones, where, logically and historically,

they belong.

Tom Cash

3104 Acklen Avenue

37212

From: Carol Norton [mailto:c.norton@comcast.net]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 11:29 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: BL2016-492

RE: BL2016-492

To: Planning Commission

From: Carol Norton

801 Boscobel St; 37206

For three years I was a member of the Nashville Next Community Enhancement Committee. Plans for neighborhood growth NEVER included the introduction of Type 2 and 3 Short Term Rentals.

STR's have introduced a zoning change and category that was never included in the present Zoning Code—and it was done without public input from homeowners and residents of our neighborhoods. That disturbs me.

STR Type 2 and 3 absolutely inserts a commercial use into residential zoning. Our neighborhoods have been turned into strips of mini-hotels, block after block.

Furthermore, there is no real mechanism for enforcement. Does Codes do it? They have no staff to do so except in response to neighbors' complaints. Public works? The same. There is NO mechanism for enforcement. Do Airbnb and the other "home stay" businesses share with you who they have registered? "No" to that also. There is absolutely no way for Metro to verify this information. So how many permit fees are you missing out on without it? I know of about a dozen, at least, in my neighborhood alone.

When I have long time neighbors who are pulling up stakes and moving away from the neighborhood we've worked so hard, for so many years, to preserve—because of the interference of STR's, it's time for the City to make a dramatic change. A band-aid approach won't do it.

I'm hopeful the Mayor's Consultant will include those changes, as other cities have done. They have waked up and realized Airbnb and the like are decimating our neighborhoods. I want to have real neighbors—not weekend ones.

I sincerely hope you do not endorse STR Type 2 and 3, for the sake of our neighborhoods.

From: Nora Liggett [mailto:Nora.Liggett@wallerlaw.com]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 11:19 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: opposition to Type 2 short term rentals in R and RS zoned districts

Dear Planning Commission:

I understand that you will be discussing BL2016-492 at your meeting today. I am writing to encourage you to prohibit type 2 (non-owner occupied) short term rentals in R and RS zoned districts. There is one on my street that is a bachelorette and bachelor party house. It operates in flagrant disregard of the current ordinance, advertising on its site that it has five bedrooms and containing reviews stating that they had 20 and 22 guys there for a bachelor party. The parties are loud, go late into the night, and feature lots of drunken guys and girls shouting obscenities. I've also been treated to the spectacle of seeing golf cart taxis with the driver speeding and weaving down the big hill in front of my house to make the drunken bachelorettes squeal. It's gotten so bad that I won't let my children play in their own front yard.

I urge you to prohibit investor owned short term rentals in residential neighborhoods.

Thanks for your consideration.

Regards,

Nora L. Liggett

2805 Belcourt Avenue

Nashville, TN 37212

From: Bobbie Forrest [mailto:bforrest47@bellsouth.net]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 11:05 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: BL2016-492 - OPPOSED to Type 2 STR's in R & RS zoned districts!

Importance: High

VOTE NO on BL2016-492!

Type 2 Short Term Rentals should NEVER be allowed in R & RS zoned neighborhoods.

These ARE commercial entities encroaching on residentially zoned neighborhoods!

Bobbie Forrest

101 Thistle Lane

Hermitage, TN 37076

bforrest47@bellsouth.net

615-889-5047

From: Plummer, Kathryn C [mailto:kathryn.plummer@Vanderbilt.Edu]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 10:59 AM

To: Planning Commissioners **Cc:** Plummer, Kathryn C

Subject: mini hotels are flirting with disaster, unregulated

December 8, 2016

Dear Metro Planning Commission:

I write to voice my opposition of Type 2 STRs. As commercial businesses operating in our neighborhoods, I ask that you recommend to the Metro Council the removal of these STRs from R and RS districts.

The quality of life in many Nashville residential communities has eroded because of Type 2 STR proliferation. The many large groups of transient people moving in and out of STRs threaten our ability as parents and neighbors to provide safe, secure and peaceful environments for our children and ourselves. *These investor non-owner occupied mini hotels have NO on site managers, front desk people and security guards.* The codes departments cannot keep up (nor respond on weekends when many of the disturbances occur) and our police have serious crime emergencies to attend to throughout the city. Neighbors with their complaints are left helplessly frustrated.

Neighborhood disruption aside, the safety for the transients living in these unregulated Type 2 STRs should be a <u>grave</u> concern for our government. These mini hotels are flirting with disaster since many do not meet the federal standards of the <u>HMFSA (Hotel and Motel Fire Safety Act)</u>. Who is inspecting Airbnbs and the like for sprinkler systems and smoke and carbon monoxide detectors? We know codes in

most cities cannot keep up with the many kinds of housing conditions...one only has to look at last week's tragic Oakland, California fire that took 36 lives. Codes had not inspected that building for 30 years.

I never dreamed when my husband and I bought our Green Hills home 29 years ago that "<u>transient hotels</u>" would be allowed in the neighborhood. Type 2 short-term rentals negatively affect the availability and prices for affordable housing, negatively impact home values and disrupt the safety of neighborhoods. Please be progressive and strong and help our neighborhoods remain residential.

Thank you for your dedicated service to Nashville.

Kathryn Plummer

3416 Benham Avenue

Nashville, TN 37215

Kathryn Plummer

Professor of Viola

Blair School of Music, Vanderbilt University

http://blair.vanderbilt.edu/departments/string.php

http://www.kathrynplummer.com

From: John Stern [mailto:jstern@comcast.net]
Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 10:41 AM

To: Sloan, Doug (Planning)
Cc: Logan, Carrie (Planning)

Subject: Material for Commissioner's

Dear Mr. Sloan,

Please help us by incorporating, somewhere near the top of the information on the STRP bill, a copy of the two documents that the Nashville Neighborhood Alliance produced last month.		
If you have any problems please feel free to contact me by phone.		
In addition this will be my notice of intent to speak on behalf of our organization this afternoon.		
Thank you and best regards,		
John Stern		
John Stern		
President		
Nashville Neighborhood Alliance, Inc.		
Post Office Box 22057		
Nashville, TN 37202-2057		
615-885-3234		
615-889-3100		

(two attachments follow)

History of STRs in Nashville



In 2015, with little public input and even less public awareness, the Metro Council adopted an ordinance to allow short-term rental properties in both residential and non-residential zoned districts.

This ordinance was the most intrusive commercialization into Nashville's residential neighborhoods allowed since zoning was first adopted in the 1930's. Nashville's STR ordinance was drafted so favorably towards operators that the STR industry now holds it out as model legislation.

In a little more than a year, between 3,000 and 4,000 STRs, both legal and non-legal, have sprung up in Nashville as real estate investors and homeowners have learned they can generate significantly greater income from STRs than traditional long-term rentals.

A lack of meaningful Codes enforcement, high occupancy limits, and blatant disregard of the regulations by many STR operators have had a negative impact on many adjacent homeowners.

"Party houses" for bachelor and bachelorette parties have generated loud noises, late nights, trash issues, and parking problems. In effect, "mini-hotels" have developed in our residential neighborhoods.

What are STRPs

According to the Metropolitan Code "short term rental property (STRP)" means a residential dwelling unit containing not more than four sleeping rooms that is used and/or advertised for rent for transient occupancy by guests for less than 30 days with a maximum occupancy of two individuals per sleeping room up to a maximum of 12 occupants.

Short Term Rental Properties (STRP) are simply residential homes, townhomes, condos and other housing structures that are being rented on a short term basis to people who are unknown to the neighborhood.

The major difference between STRPs and traditional long-term rental properties is that STRPs rent for less than 30 days and there is a higher occupancy limit of two per sleeping room up to a maximum of 12 occupants for STRPs. Long-term rental units have a limit of three non-related occupants per unit.

There Are Three Types of STRP's.

Type 1 – Owner-Occupied STRP is a single family, duplex, or multifamily where the owner occupies the unit or is associated with an owner occupied principal residence.

Type 2 - Not Owner-Occupied STRP is a single family, duplex, or grandfathered multifamily triplex or quadplex in residential zoned districts where the owner does not occupy the property or a principal residence associated with the property. We refer to these as "investor-owned STRs".

Type 3 -Not Owner-Occupied Multifamily STRPs are multifamily apartments and condominiums.

The Nashville Neighborhood Alliance Responds

The Nashville Neighborhood Alliance is against any commercial intrusion into residential neighborhoods. We believe STRs *are* a commercialization of our residential neighborhoods. At worst, they have had such a negative impact on adjacent residents to result in those individuals selling their homes. In concentration, they are changing the very nature and fabric of our neighborhoods, destabilizing communities, pitting neighbor against neighbor.

Since STRs rent primarily to out-of-town tourists, they reduce the supply of long-term rental units, thereby increasing rental rates, and reducing affordable housing options for Nashville residents.

As a result, the Nashville Neighborhood Alliance has formed a Committee on Short Term Rentals. Our group has come together to educate the community on the negative impact of STRs and to have a significant and meaningful impact on limiting the commercialization of our neighborhoods by these "mini-hotels" in residential communities.

Our strategy is simple: we are making an honest assessment of the effect Short Term Rental Properties (STRPs) have on the fabric of the neighborhoods they occupy. Then we are informing neighborhoods of our findings and supporting those members of the Metropolitan Council who wish to help us keep neighborhoods peaceful, safe and whole.

What is Our Position on STRs?

- We support the elimination of Type 2 and Type 3 STRs in residentially zoned neighborhoods.
- We support reducing the occupancy level of Type 1 STRs to make it consistent with long term rentals.
- We support meaningful regulations to prevent STRs from negatively impacting adjacent homeowners.
- We support meaningful and consequential enforcement of STR ordinances by the Codes and Police Departments including the need for additional staff.

We Need Your Help to Do This!

First, we need you to join our Committee. It will help you get further briefed on the rise of STRP's in Nashville and what is happening on this issue.

Second, we ask that you recruit your friends and neighbors to join.

Third, we need you to send messages to the Metro Council and Office of the Mayor supporting our findings on legislative, enforcement and mitigation efforts.

The bottom line is this – We want you to be a part of saving the residential character of our community.

If these "mini-hotels" haven't shown up in your neighborhood yet, they will. Please join us.



For more information contact:

John Stern jstern@comcast.net

John Summers johnsummers@comcast.net





November 11, 2016

Mayor Megan Barry 100 Metro Historic Courthouse Nashville, TN 37201

Vice-Mayor David Briley and Members of the Metro Council Metropolitan Council Office Metro Historic Courthouse One Public Square, Suite 204 P. O. Box 196300 Nashville, TN 37219-630

Dear Mayor Barry, Vice-Mayor Briley, and Metro Council Member,

Historically there has always been a clear distinction in Nashville between residential and commercial zoning. Even before the current ordinance was enacted, neighborhood activists were warning about the unintended consequences of allowing "short term rentals" or STRs to operate in our residential neighborhoods. After a little more than a year in effect, we now have a clearer picture of STRs. And it's not pretty.

- There has been no meaningful enforcement of the STR ordinance. Less than half of the estimated 4,000 STRs in Nashville are operating legally, with the required permits. When next door neighbors have turned violators into the Codes Department, penalties have been waived and permits approved.
- Many next-door residents have found themselves subjected to late night bachelor and bachelorette parties, loud music, drunkenness, foul language, and guests throwing up in their yards, even nudity. Cars block homeowners' driveways. Trash is left all over the property afterwards for days.
- When the Metro Police are called, their efforts to tone down the party are often only temporary. Once they leave the party resumes. Metro Police want to enforce noise and parking issues, so no one is enforcing the occupancy limits of two per "sleeping room" plus four to a maximum of 12 occupants.
- Codes does not have a single inspector to work on the weekends or nights so there is no meaningful limit in occupants. What new staff was added in this budget year was to only process applications.
- STRs are impacting our neighborhoods in other ways. They are reducing the availability and affordability of rental housing. It's a simple function of supply and demand economics. STRs rent to out of town tourists, not to Nashvillians. So those 4,000 housing units are not available to long-term renters here in Nashville. That means the supply of long term rental units is reduced by the number of STRs, driving up the cost of long-term rent, adding to the larger existing problem of housing affordability in Nashville.

 Why? It's simple. You can make more money renting as a STR than as long-term rental given the higher occupancy levels allowed for STRs, up to twelve occupants.

- STR's are also impacting housing availability for home owners. Approximately half of the STRs are operated by non-owner occupying investors. These investors are competing with couples trying to purchase homes in our neighborhoods, limiting availability and driving up prices.
- STRs are also changing the very fabric of our neighborhoods. In some neighborhoods, there are street blocks where a large percentage of the homes are STRs which are left mostly vacant during the week with tourists arriving on the weekend to party hard in Nashville.
- STRs change the very nature of a neighborhood. They are less stable, more transitory. You don't know your neighbors. You always have strangers next door. There are safety concerns. The visitors don't participate in our schools, our churches, and our community.

Some Nashville homeowners have been so negatively impacted, so frustrated at the lack of meaningful enforcement by Metro agencies, they have literally given up, sold their homes, and moved.

The problems with STRs are not unique to Nashville. A number of cities and states across the U.S., even cities from around the world are limiting and in some cases eliminating STRs. Airbnb is being sued for discriminatory practices. A number of U.S. Senators are calling for a fuller examination.

There is also the problem that STRs are heavily concentrated in a few Council districts. Most Nashvillians do not realize they could have one of these 12-occupant "mini-hotels" moving in next to them, until the parties start happening every weekend.

Judge Kelvin Jones' ruling that Nashville's STR ordinance is unconstitutional now gives our community the opportunity to re-evaluate its entire STR policy, since in effect the ruling places us back to square one.

The Nashville Neighborhood Alliance has been committed to protecting our residential neighborhoods from unwarranted commercialization since the mid-1980s. STRs should not negatively impact adjacent residential homeowners.

We would respectfully ask to be part of the discussions as changes to the STR ordinance are being considered in light of the Court's ruling.

Thank you for your time and consideration in this matter.

Sincerely,

John Stern

President, Nashville Neighborhood Alliance, Inc.

jstern@comcast.net

John Summers

Chair, NNA STR Committee

johnsummers@comcast.net

From: marthachild [mailto:marthachild@bellsouth.net]

Sent: Thursday, December 08, 2016 10:12 AM

To: Planning Commissioners; Council Members; Mayor (Mayor's Office); Pulley, Russ (Council Member);

Henderson, Angie (Council Member); Johnson, Mina (Council Member)

Subject:

I am president of the Georgetown Homeowners Association. Georgetown is a community located in Green Hills and has 240 units. Our board opposes short term rentals and opposes 2016Z-023TX-001 and 2016Z-023TX-001/BL 2016-492.

Martha Child

From: Royce Monk [mailto:rmonk6@comcast.net] **Sent:** Thursday, December 08, 2016 9:14 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Cc: Council Members

Subject: Opposition to Bill 2016Z-023TX-001

Dear Planning Commissioners,

I oppose this Bill as written since nothing has been done to protect our communities where we live. No consideration has been given in recognizing these short term rentals as commercial businesses in Residential neighborhoods. Property owners are making houses into their businesses. The supply of long-term residential housing, which the city needs, has suffered as corporate STR property owners tap into the more lucrative tourist market. We want our neighborhoods protected from overbuilding, as well as becoming hotel districts which happens when developers know homes can be rented short-term on web platforms like

AirBnB. Residential neighborhoods want to be communities. Please do not make it easier for us to be part of a tourist attraction!

Ms. Royce W. Monk

37215

615-292-7147

From: Ginger Byrn [mailto:gbyrn@comcast.net] **Sent:** Thursday, December 08, 2016 12:08 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Bill 2016Z-023TX-001 Short-Term Rentals

Dear Planning Commissioners,

Please do not vote to approve bill 2016Z-023TX-001.

Non-owner occupied STRs should not be allowed in residential neighborhoods (R and RS zoned). Zoning codes keep hotels out of residential neighborhoods. STRs are hotels - commercial businesses, and Metro should not allow any residence to become a hotel/STR. There are so many problems with non-owner occupied STRs, such as drunkenness during parties, loud music, lewd behavior outside the home. In addition, the supply of long-term residential housing has suffered with property owners and developers choosing to rent homes short-term and run commercial businesses in residential neighborhoods.

Instead of re-wording some of the definitions and moving everything from Title 6 of the Metro Code (Business Licenses and Regulations) and into Title 17 (Zoning), Metro should be reevaluating STRs and the problems they cause in our neighborhoods and remove STRs from R and RS zoned areas.

Thank you.

Virginia Byrn

4323 Lealand Lane, Nashville

From: Paul & Julia Miller [mailto:juliapaulmiller@bellsouth.net]

Sent: Wednesday, December 07, 2016 10:51 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Short-term rentals in R & RS zones

Dear Commissioners,

I urge you to oppose bill **2016Z-023TX-001.** I do not want short-term rentals in our neighborhood.

Sincerely,

Paul A. Miller

1720 Temple Avenue, Nashville, TN 37215 (615) 297-4856 juliapaulmiller@bellsouth.net

From: A Hols [mailto:ddkeig@comcast.net] Sent: Wednesday, December 07, 2016 10:39 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: AirBomb

As home owners living at 720 Estes Road, we do NOT want AirBomb rentals in our neighborhood. Please vote against them.

Thank you,

Elizabeth Holshouser

Sent from my iPhone

From: Mike Ireland [mailto:mjireland@yahoo.com]
Sent: Wednesday, December 07, 2016 9:43 PM
Too Planning Commission and Committee Marchane Marchane

To: Planning Commissioners; Council Members; Mayor (Mayor's Office); Pulley, Russ (Council Member);

Henderson, Angie (Council Member)

Subject: Countywide Bill, 2016Z-023TX-001

Dear All:

Please consider voting against this bill, as it does not seem to reverse the conditions that currently allow STRs (including AirBnBs) to operate in our neighborhoods. I do not care to have STRs and AirBnBs in our West Meade neighborhood and would like to see a bill put in place that prevents such a business from being set up.

Thank you for what you do.

Best,

Mike Ireland

972 Davidson Drive

(West Meade)

Nashville, TN 37205

From: Lisa Swart [mailto:lisaswart11@gmail.com] **Sent:** Wednesday, December 07, 2016 9:10 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: No STRs

Dear Planning Commissioners,

I live at 972 Davidson Drive, and I would like to voice my opposition to allowing STRs, particularly Type 2 and 3 (2016Z-023TX-001), in residential areas. This bill will have a major impact on our neighbourhoods. I am particularly concerned about the safety aspect, having strangers coming and going at all hours next door. We have beautiful, quiet neighbourhoods, and STRs become commercial enterprises that compromise community, the soul of Nashville. At previous planning committee meetings, it has been reiterated time and again about the long-term housing shortage in Nashville - this bill will only make matters worse. Additionally, it will cause more traffic and congestion within residential areas.

Thank you for your time, and I hope that this bill gets thrown out, as we continue to safeguard our residential neighbourhoods from commercialisation, and decay.

Lisa Swart

From: M Stroop [mailto:mcstroop@gmail.com] **Sent:** Wednesday, December 07, 2016 8:30 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Input for your Dec. 8 Meeting

From: M'Lissa Stroop

(letter follows)

Dear Planning Commission Members,

Please ban STR2's from R zones: I would like to feel like I'm living in a residential neighborhood again. I used to, but now have an out-of-country investor-owned short term rental next door. We have an adjacent driveway and our kitchen doors face each other. This really is my only neighbor because we live on a hill with wooded lots (partly for conservation purposes). I miss having neighbors!

Here is a partial rundown of how my life has changed since the residents moved away and nobody lives in the house next door:

BEFORE THE STR2

AFTER THE STR BUSINESS BEGAN

Neighbors who took me to ER $\&$ checked up on me when I returned home	Nameless self-absorbed transient vacationers next door
Exchanging holiday gifts with neighbors	Groups of hotel guests exchanging loud celebratory "WOO HOO's"!!!!
Families choosing to live in the neighborhood participating in local activities	Drunks choosing to make loud derogatory remarks about Tennesseans
Enjoying my yard while my neighbors do the same	Having to lock myself inside and stay at the other end of the house because of rowdy strangers next to my driveway
Neighbors helping me with yard work, lifting heavy things, etc	Revolving door at the house next to mine of unknown people being a nuisance where neighbors used to live
Calling police once in 12 years about a party that spilled into the street	Repeated calls in the last year to police about hotel guests out of control $% \left\{ 1,2,\ldots ,n\right\}$
Time & money spent on yard improvements	Time & money spent on privacy shrubs and 8' tall fence
Illegal STR1 supervised by neighbors	Mini-hotel with unsupervised transient occupants who are strangers
Sounds of children playing during the day	Sounds of partiers yelling, dozens of car doors being slammed
No significant litter in neighborhood	Litter blowing onto my yard and overflowing trash cans for days
Neighbor dogs barking "Hello" from behind their fences	Drunken strangers barking at my dog: there's one every week
Talking to neighbors about weeds, weather	Having to put up "No Smoking" signs during the recent drought
Occasional parties on week-ends next door with muffled noise	Loud partying voices with vulgar language floating over the shrubs assaulting my ears weekly
Occasional door-to-door salesman during daylight	Hotel guests mistakenly coming to my back door during the night
Never hearing gunfire	Gunshots from the mini-hotel on several occasions
Feeling secure in my peaceful home	Feeling scared in my own home

My home is located 2 miles from the closest commercially zoned property and I wish to return to that status. I didn't choose to live next door to an amateur hotel. I'd rather the house next door was a professional hotel because there would be regulations to protect me and my property. There would at least be a landscaping buffer, plenty of parking for hotel guests, a front desk manager and security, regular employees that I would recognize; and sometimes maybe even a free breakfast buffet for me!!!

Please keep neighbors in neighborhoods and don't allow commercial activity to ruin it for Nashville residents!

Sincerely, M'Lissa Stroop 4615 Shys Hill Road **From:** Bonnie Bashor [mailto:bonnie.s.bashor@gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, December 07, 2016 3:19 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: investor-owned non-owner occupied STRs.

Dear Commissioners:

I am writing in opposition to ordinance 2016Z-023TX-001/BL2016-492 as it is currently drafted. Investor-owned, non-owner occupied short-term rentals are clearly businesses operating as mini-hotels, but without the rules, regulations, and safe-guards that are in place for hotels and bed-and-breakfasts.

In 2011, I looked all over Nashville for a place to live in my retirement. When I found Hope Gardens in the Phillips-Jackson Redevelopment District, I knew that I was home. I went to several neighborhood parties and other events and fell in love with the neighborhood and the friendly neighbors. I bought a lot, hired an architect and contractor, and built a house to live in the rest of my life. We designed and built the house to fit into the neighborhood as if it had always been there. We followed all the MDHA Hope Gardens Design Guidelines.

The MDHA guidelines specify that Hope Gardens is to have single family homes, except for areas on the perimeter and a very small area on 10th Avenue North. Since moving here in 2012, I have known that this is the place for me. I know, by name, most of the people living here. We do things together, we help each other, we have neighborhood parties for adults, children, and families. We are a very diverse community in terms of race, economics, and education. We like it that way, and we work with MDHA to try to have affordable housing here.

That began to change when short-term rentals were allowed in residential neighborhoods. I have investor-owned short-term rentals across the street, next door, and 6 others within about 300 feet of my home. The neighborhood itself has between 5% to 10% of the homes operated as STRs (some permitted, some not). This is changing the character of the neighborhood, causing unrealistic housing cost increases due to investors out bidding people who just want to live here. This is turn is drastically decreasing the amount of affordable housing.

Please follow the land use plans and policies in place. They are good plans that would work if all Metropolitan Nashville followed those plans. Nashville needs to eliminate these investor-owned, non-owner occupied short-term rentals from residential areas. They are businesses that are destroying the fabric of good neighborhoods and eliminating affordable housing options for Nashvillians.

Bonnie S Bashor

902A Locklayer St. 37208

Items 19a/b, Platinum Storage Brentwood/PUD Cancellation

(letter follows)

114 Hearthstone Manor Circle Brentwood, Tennessee 37027 MASHVILLE & DAVIDSON COUNTY

DEC 8 2016

METROPOLITAN PLANNING DEPARTMENT

December 4, 2016

YTMUOL

Planning Department Metro Office P.O. Box 196300 Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

METILLE - LEAN PLANNING DEPARTMENT

ð 2016

To the members of the planning commission and Robert Swope,

In regard to case 2016SP-090-001: My home and other adjoining or nearby property owners know that their property values are dependent on local developments. The original zoning for this land was for professional or residential use. Our home values will be affected to the negative by this proposed commercial zoning change to a storage facility.

As of today the single professional business east of Cloverland/ Seven Springs and Edmondson Pike is a day care center. I request that the council fulfill the original zoning promise.

I regret that I will be in Oregon the date of the hearing. Please add my concerns with those in attendance.

Cordially, Manon Haan

Marion Haan

Item 22, Cleveland Street/N 2nd Street Rezoning

From: Cory [mailto:coryrip@hotmail.com] **Sent:** Wednesday, December 07, 2016 3:08 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Please Disapprove 2016SP-098-001

Dear Metro Planning Commissioners,

I am writing in disapproval of 2016SP-098-001. While I am currently chair of the Cleveland Park Neighborhood Association, I am writing to you as merely a concerned resident. I have been involved in this matter since it was introduced in September and have heard from a lot of concerned neighbors.

It is my understanding that the two residents who wish to change their zoning live at 910 and 912 North 2nd Street. These two properties are clearly in the T4-Neighborhood Maintenance potion of our neighborhood plan, which is intended to preserve the general character of the existing urban neighborhood. I feel that allowing two family housing is clearly going against what is intended. Our neighborhood is already experiencing a lot of growth and density in the areas that are T4- Neighborhood Evolving, and I would like to keep this growth and density along our main corridors, not in the middle of our neighborhoods. We have also asked Councilman Davis to leave out the other properties whose owners are not actively trying to change their zoning. Councilman Davis stated that he would change the SP to only include the two properties at 910 and 912 North 2nd, which has not happened to my knowledge.

Neighbors have not had dedicated meetings to review this plan, even though we have asked this of Councilman Davis multiple times. Instead he insisted that this conversation take place at our regularly held monthly meetings, which have had a decline in attendance lately. Since the bill was filed, Councilman Davis has briefly spoken on behalf of the homeowners at our monthly meetings, but the residents at 910 and 912 North 2nd have never attended. One of the homeowners' daughter attended the November meeting and mentioned row housing, which really frightened the neighbors, though Brandon at planning reassured me that would need an amendment to the SP. No definite plans have been presented, and there has been no opportunity for feedback from our community.

A lot of neighbors expressed that there is confusion between the homeowners, our Councilman, and the neighborhood.

Thank you for your time,

Cory Ripmaster

Chair-Elect, Cleveland Park Neighborhood Association

Item 25, West Trinity Lane rezoning

From: Mike Peden [mailto:mike.peden@gmail.com] **Sent:** Thursday, December 08, 2016 6:41 AM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Support 2016Z-134PR-001

Hello - my house is located at 2621 Old Buena Vista Road, and I received the Notice of Public Hearing about Case 2016Z-134PR-001

I cannot attend the meeting tomorrow, but I would like to state my support for this rezoning.

I believe Mr. Potter is one of the most responsible developers in Nashville, and our neighborhood is lucky that he has chosen to work in our area. I have spoken with my surrounding neighbors, as well as many others in the community, and they support this project also.

Thanks for sending me the notification about this rezoning, and thank you for your service on the Planning Commission.

Best Regards

Mike Peden

2621 Old Buena Vista Road

Nashville 37218