

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items **Received through July 12, 2019**

ITEM 10a: 2019SP-046-001 – Skyline East

From: kevin caldwell [mailto:kac437@icloud.com]

Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2019 3:06 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Case 2019SP-046-001 Skyline East

All,

I am totally opposed to this rezoning and building project as it will displace so many children from the McFerrin Park neighborhood. So many little people attend Caldwell elementary from those apartments. They will be displaced with possibly no where else to go given Nashville's shortage of low income housing. Along with that, is the excess of people it would bring in. More traffic, congestion....etc. We don't need this in our neighborhood.

Kevin Caldwell

221 Treutland Ave.

Nashville, TN. 37207

ITEM 21: 2019NHL-001-001—JUST PIZZA

From: susan presnell [mailto:susan.presnell@hotmail.com]

Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2019 12:37 PM

To: Planning Staff

Subject: 44th Avenue property (328 44th avenue north)

To the Metro Planning Committee,

As long time residents of Sylvan Park and members of the Sylvan Park Neighborhood Association, we would like to express our opposition to the commercial use of the property at 328 44th Avenue North. We are asking you to support the current conservation overlay that this property falls under. As it is already unclear how the current developments of Madison Mill/Sylvan Supply as well as the planned hotel/retail development on Murphy Road will affect the traffic, ambiance, and safety of our neighborhood, we feel it is imperative to uphold the conservation overlay that so many of us long term residents were in favor of by denying commercial zoning to the property in question.

Thank you for your time and attention.

Aaron and Susan Presnell

4103 Utah avenue

Nashville, 37209

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items Received through July 12, 2019

From: Mark McEver [mailto:mark@fastmail.net]
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2019 6:29 PM
To: Planning Staff
Subject: 328 44th Ave Rezoning/Overlay

I would like to voice my support of a commercial use for this building. Even though it's zoned residential, the building's design and historical use is commercial. From my perspective, disallowing commercial use create incentives for it to either remain underutilized as it has been for decades, or to be converted it into a residence (which seems in conflict with the spirit of the conservation overlay). I would understand if it were a larger lot with more parking like a church, but I would think it's size significantly limits potential neighborhood impact.

Thanks for listening,
Mark McEver
4200 Dakota Ave

ITEM 28: 2019DTC-018-001—HOTEL INDIGO EXPANSION

From: courtland <cumberland.terrace@gmail.com>
Subject: Metro planning commission case number 2019 etc-018-001
Date: June 3, 2019 at 11:18:15 AM CDT
To: freddie.oconnell@nashville.gov

Freddie,

I am contacting you today as a voter and resident of your district downtown nashville. I actually live on 2nd ave n and i used to live on printers alley before they build out the dream hotel and simply destroyed printers alley vibe.

there is a request from the indigo hotel to build 15 stories on 3rd on top of a national register property.

we are absolutely against this and want you to be aware that every resident in the original town of nashville is against it. We all are living in this area because it is a small neighborhood with buildings that are human size.

not only does it doubles the maximum height for a construction in this district but it put every building at risk in the historic district to make room to high rises. there are many many areas in the downtown core that are available for high rise structure with the zoning and restrictions in place to help the developers put a deal together and develop those area. like sorb, gulch mid town... etc...

please please please do not vote for this request.

they purchased a building to expand and now they are forcing the issue on the residents and the government. if this is accepted it will trickel down into a disappearance of the historic district. we don't want this to become an other Vegas or even worse a Reno.

I am a fierce advocate of a city identity and this would be an awful choice to let them build out. please help conserve what makes nashville great.

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items

Received through July 12, 2019

We will be at the public hearing but i wanted to touch base with you as my representative.

i would like to hear back from you on this matter when you can. you can also call me on my cell below

Best Regards

Jennifer Willoughby

931-220-9230

ITEMS FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS

BL 2019-1633

From: G. Renshaw [mailto:grenshaw55@gmail.com]

Sent: Friday, June 28, 2019 10:11 AM

To: Kempf, Lucy (Planning); Planning Commissioners

Subject: A lesson in unintended consequences of land use policies with no limits

Dear Ms. Kempf and Planning Commissioners:

I want to thank you for supporting the Planning staff's recommendation and approving BL 2019-1633.

Here's what I learned from last night's testimony regarding this bill:

- **Metro's policy of awarding an unlimited number of NOO STR permits created a development incentive and property investment scheme:**
- Developers are constructing properties specifically for STR use, designed with smaller kitchens and closets and layouts for vacationers.
- They sell these to property investors, who then hire management companies to run the properties as vacation rentals.

Here's what still troubles me: While this "unintended consequence" of issuing an unlimited number of NOO STR permits in multi-family housing obviously registered with all of you, it didn't seem to trouble some of you quite enough. Several commissioners advocated changes to this bill aimed at keeping land speculators whole.

Only one-I believe Commissioner Haynes-mentioned the fact that short-term rental permits are issued only for a single year and can be revoked at any time, and that an investment scheme based on a one-year permit that can be revoked at any time is inherently extremely risky.

I hope this bill is not watered down to favor property speculators over sound land use policy that protects the livability of Nashville neighborhoods.

I particularly appreciated Councilman Withers' compelling testimony about a troubling trend: Neighborhoods rejecting projects with RM-20 zoning expressly BECAUSE they permit STRs, and neighbors don't want frat-house complexes adjacent to them. which has increased the use of SP zones that exclude STRs as a permitted use.

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items Received through July 12, 2019

The result has been a particular bad unintended consequence: At a time when we need more housing and more affordable housing, it's been harder to get neighborhoods willing and able to accept greater density to support multifamily zoning.

I was frankly stunned at how explicit one developer was in describing how he was designing new construction specifically for STR use, to the extent that the properties he is building wouldn't be attractive to actual Nashville residents.

Exactly what about "R" zoning don't these developers understand? Our STR ordinance was clearly never intended to foster commercial development in residential zones.

I hope his testimony had the unintended consequence (for him and the STR industry) of impressing you, our land use policy makers, with just exactly how badly STRs have undermined residential neighborhoods and the residential market in Nashville. I hope you will continue to support this bill and, if called on, ensure the protections it affords to residential zoning remain intact.

Again, I am really grateful that you approved this bill with a unanimous vote.

Thanks and regards -

Grace

Grace Renshaw

220 Mockingbird Rd, 37205, and 1607A Douglas Ave., 37206

Nashville, TN

615-322-4594

grenshaw55@gmail.com

From: Rick Puncochar [mailto:rickpuncochar@bellsouth.net]

Sent: Wednesday, June 26, 2019 7:43 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: Support for BL-2019-1633

My name is Rick Puncochar and I live at 818 Porter Rd,37206

I support this bill that limits new NOO STR's

I really thought the state over reached by permanently allowing NOO STR's in residential neighborhoods, overriding the 3 yr phase out passed in 2018 by Metro Nashville.

Thank you

Rick Puncochar

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items **Received through July 12, 2019**

From: Nancy Eads [mailto:neads@ortalekelley.com]

Sent: Monday, July 1, 2019 8:04 AM

To: Cooper, John (Council Member); Mendes, Bob (Council Member); Gilmore, Erica (Council Member); Hurt, Sharon (Council Member); O'Connell, Freddie (Council Member); Henderson, Angie (Council Member); Allen, Burkley (Council Member); Planning Commissioners

Cc: Paul Buchanan

Subject: BL2019-1633 - short term rental bill

Please see the attached letter from Paul Buchanan.

SEE ATTACHMENT ON FOLLOWING PAGE

BL2019-1416

From: Nancy Tomlinson [mailto:outlook_4EEC85B0F2689570@outlook.com]

Sent: Saturday, June 29, 2019 1:00 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: I SUPPORT BL1416 - I SUPPORT TREES IN NASHVILLE, please support it too.

Nancy Tomlinson
1128 Davidson Rd.
Nashville 37205

From: Roger Tomlinson [mailto:roger.dadtom1@gmail.com]

Sent: Saturday, June 29, 2019 1:07 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: I SUPPORT BL1416 - I SUPPORT TREES IN NASHVILLE

Roger Tomlinson
1128 Davidson Road
Nashville 37205

Please, support this bill. Our trees are very important.

From: Amy Garten [mailto:garten.amy@gmail.com]

Sent: Saturday, June 29, 2019 3:17 PM

To: Planning Commissioners

Subject: I SUPPORT BL1416 - I SUPPORT TREES IN NASHVILLE

Council people of Nashville,

Please record my support for BL1416 for more trees in NASHVILLE. I support

1. Increases tree density factor for commercial and multifamily properties to a factor of 22.
2. Introduces the concept of a new class of trees called "*Heritage Trees*" and incentives for saving them during development.

June 28, 2019

Mayor David Briley
Nashville Metropolitan Courthouse
1 Public Square, Suite 100
Nashville, TN 37201

Angie Emery Henderson, Council Member
District 34
Metropolitan Council Office
One Public Square, Suite 204
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, TN 37219-6300

Freddie O'Connell, Council Member
District 19
Metropolitan Council Office
One Public Square, Suite 204
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, TN 37219-6300

John Cooper, At Large Council Member
500 Church Street, Suite 440
Nashville, TN 37219

Erica Gilmore, At Large Council Member
P.O. Box 22277
Nashville, TN 37202-2277

Bob Mendes, At Large Council Member
Metropolitan Council Office
One Public Square, Suite 204
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, TN 37219-6300

Sharon Hurt, At Large Council Member
Metropolitan Council Office
One Public Square, Suite 204
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, TN 37219-6300

Burkley Allen
Burkley.allen@nashville.gov

Planning.Commissioners@nashville.gov

Dear Esteemed Representatives:

I write in opposition to the pending short term rental Bill, BL2019-1633 revising Type 3 STR permits.

I write on behalf of Riverfront Condominiums where my wife and I own 4 short term rental properties.

This was a blighted slum-like building that was formerly Section 8 housing. It was in disrepair, dilapidated, and clearly on its way to being torn down.

Only by converting to a short term rental facility was the property revitalized and saved. There are 145 units and 130 of them are short term rentals. This is clearly a commercial area, highlighted by the revitalization of the Stockyard property with new commercial enterprises and luxury apartments.

June 28, 2019

Page 2

I appreciate and actually applaud the legislature's efforts at curtailing short term rentals by non-owner-occupied investors in truly suburban areas. However, this bill "throws the baby out with the bathwater." The Riverfront Condominiums are clearly a success story based upon conversion to short term rentals. The current bill, as written, is too restrictive by eliminating "RM" zoning designation from areas where a STR permit is allowed. If signed into law, it will destroy vast property rights. It is ill-conceived in its broad application and harmful to investors who have revitalized the property at great expense and pay very significant taxes for the privilege of operating.

This property will never be returned to "affordable housing" which I understand is one of the guiding principles of the pending legislation. If signed into law, the exact opposite will occur. This property will fall into disrepair, be sold, and luxury apartments will take their place.

Please reconsider this bill, particularly as it impacts multi-unit dwellings that are not zoned "RM."

Very truly yours,



Paul M. Buchanan

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items Received through July 12, 2019

3. Incentives to preserve existing mature trees versus replacing them.
4. Incentives to install canopy-producing street trees with commercial and multifamily properties by allowing street trees to count towards tree density factor

Amy Garten
1633 Arthur Ave
37208
District 21

From: Patricia Wallace [mailto:patwwallace@comcast.net]
Sent: Sunday, June 30, 2019 9:40 PM
To: Planning Commissioners
Subject: I SUPPORT BL1416 - I SUPPORT TREES IN NASHVILLE

Patricia W. Wallace 105 Leake Ave. #61. 37205

From: Barbra Deck [mailto:67bdeck@gmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2019 12:40 PM
To: Planning Commissioners; Council Members
Subject: I SUPPORT BL1416 - I SUPPORT TREES IN NASHVILLE

Barbra A. Deck, 802 Boscobel St, Nashville, TN 37206

Dear Planning Commissioners and Council Members,

I support BL2018-1416 (the Tree Bill) for many reasons, not the least being - We need trees which take CO2 out of the air and release O2, make it much cooler in the summer

and are beautiful (example Sugar Maples and Flowering Dogwoods).

(Just try to find a parking space under one of the few trees at a Kroger, a mall, or any paved parking lot. All the spaces are taken.

I am a native Tennessean and have lived in the Nashville area most of my adult life. Please let the people of Davidson County make the rules - not contractors, investors, etc.

WE need to take control! You should represent US.

Sincerely,
Barbra Deck

From: Wilma McDonald [mailto:wmcDonald_pges@yahoo.com]
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2019 1:42 PM
To: Planning Commissioners; Council Members
Subject: BL2018-1416 (The Tree Bill)

Wilma McDonald, 3818 West End Ave., Nashville, TN 37205

Comments on July 18, 2019 MPC Agenda Items **Received through July 12, 2019**

Dear Planning Commissioners and Council Members,

I support BL2018-1416 (the Tree Bill) for many reasons. We need trees which take CO₂ out of the air and release O₂, which make it much cooler in the summer. Trees (Sugar Maples and flowering Dogwoods) add beauty to our surroundings and give homes to the birds. Having trees in the parking lots of malls and businesses do provide cooler places for a person to park their vehicle. I have lived in Nashville for three years and have enjoyed being in a residential section that has trees and seems to be protective of those trees. Please let the people of Davidson County make the rules - not contractors, investors, etc. WE need to take control! You should represent US.

Sincerely,
Wilma McDonald