

MINUTES

METROPOLITAN EMPLOYEE BENEFIT BOARD

May 3, 2016

The Metropolitan Employee Benefit Board met for their regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, May 3, 2016 in the Sonny West Conference Room, Howard Office Building, 700 2nd Avenue North, Nashville, Tennessee, at approximately 9:30 a.m.

Benefit Board members: Chair: Edna J. Jones; Vice Chair: Christine Bradley; Members: *Stephanie Bailey, Charles D. Clariday, Sr., G. Thomas Curtis, **Veronica T. Frazier, B.R. Hall, Sr., Jerry Hall, and W. Todd Henry.

Member Talia Lomax-O'dneal was unable to be present.

Others present: Christina Hickey, Metro Human Resources, Nicki Eke, Attorney, Metro Legal Department and Dr. Matthew Hine, Civil Service Medical Examiner.

A. MINUTES: Chair Edna Jones called the meeting to order and said the first order of business was to determine if there were any amendments, corrections or questions of the minutes from the last regular meeting held on April 5, 2016. With one correction, nothing further was noted and Christine Bradley moved for approval. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

*Denotes the arrival of Stephanie Bailey.

B. APPEAL ANNOUNCEMENT:

Christina Hickey announced the process and timeframe for appealing a decision made by this Board.

C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)

The terms of the approval or extension of the items listed in the motions are specifically stated in these minutes.

Dr. Matthew Hine, Civil Service Medical Examiner, and Claire Cobb, CSME Assistant, reviewed the disability pensions with the Board.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval of the disability pension new requests, items 2, 4, 5 and 6, for the length of time as recommended and case management services where noted.

**Denotes the arrival of Veronica Frazier.

Doug Clariday moved for approval of the recommendation to approve the disability pension new requests, items 2, 4, 5 and 6, for the length of time as recommended and case management services where noted. Stephanie Bailey seconded and the Board approved with Veronica Frazier abstaining.

The individual was present for item 1.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval of the disability pension new request, item 1 for the length of time as recommended. Stephanie Bailey moved for approval of the recommendation to approve the disability pension new request, item 1, for the length of time as recommended. Christine Bradley seconded.

The individual addressed the Board regarding the request for a disability pension.

A vote was taken on the motion to approve the disability pension new request, item 1 and was approved without objection.

The individual was present for item 3.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval of the disability pension new request, item 3, as a medical disability pension for the length of time as recommended. Stephanie Bailey moved for approval of the recommendation to approve the disability pension new request, item 3, as a medical disability

C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)

pension for the length of time as recommended. Tom Curtis seconded and the Board approved without objection.

On item 7, the individual was present and had additional medical information for the Board's review.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 7 he recommends denial of the request for a disability pension as the medical records do not adequately support the request. Stephanie Bailey moved for approval of the recommendation on item 7 to deny the request for a disability pension. Tom Curtis seconded.

The individual was present and addressed the Board regarding the request.

There was some discussion of the individual's current medications, job duties and being able to do his job.

Dr. Matthew Hine reviewed the medical record with the Board and noted that the individual's condition is very well controlled.

A vote was taken on the motion to deny the disability pension new request, item 7 and was approved with Veronica Frazier, Christine Bradley, Jerry Hall, Tom Curtis and Stephanie Bailey in favor and Todd Henry, Doug Clariday, B.R. Hall opposing and Edna Jones abstaining.

On the reexaminations, Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval for continuing the disability pension reexaminations, items 10, 12 and 14 for the length of time as recommended. Jerry Hall moved for approval of the recommendation to continue the disability pension reexaminations, items 10, 12 and 14 for the length of time as recommended. Veronica Frazier seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 9, he recommends continuing the disability pension for the length of time as recommended with vocational case management for a return to work. Christine Bradley moved for approval of the recommendation on item 9 to continue the disability pension for the length of time as recommended with vocational case management. Tom Curtis seconded and the Board approved with Stephanie Bailey opposing.

On item 13, Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends continuing the disability pension without stipulation of scheduled reexamination. Doug Clariday moved for approval of the recommendation on item 13 to continue the disability pension without stipulation of scheduled reexamination. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved with Stephanie Bailey opposing.

Clair Cobb distributed some additional medical information related to item 8.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 8 he recommends continuing the disability pension for the length of time as recommended with a peer review to determine whether or not the condition is work related or medical in nature. Jerry Hall moved for approval of the recommendation to continue the disability pension reexamination item 8 for the length of time as recommended with a peer review. Todd Henry seconded the Board approved with Stephanie Bailey and Tom Curtis opposing.

Additional medical information was presented related to item 11.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that after review of the additional medical information on item 11 he recommends continuing the disability pension without stipulation of scheduled reexamination. Jerry Hall moved for approval of the recommendation to continue the disability pension reexamination item 11 without stipulation of scheduled reexamination. Stephanie Bailey seconded the Board approved without objection.

Dr. William Hine reported to the Board that on items 15 he requests a deferral for one month pending the results of an evaluation ordered by the Board. Christine Bradley moved for approval of the request to defer item 15 for one month. Tom Curtis seconded and the Board approved without objection.

On item 16, Dr. William Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval of return to work with restrictions.

C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)

Phillip Jones, Public Works, stated that they cannot accommodate the restrictions based on the requirements for the position.

After some discussion regarding the skill set of the individual and vocational case management, Jerry Hall moved to continue the disability pension with reexamination in six months. Todd Henry seconded and the Board approved with B.R. Hall opposing.

At this time, Stephanie Bailey stated that she wants her vote to be recorded as opposing on item 10.

Dr. William Hine reported to the Board that on item 17, he recommends that the individual be removed from the return to work list and the disability pension continued for the length of time as recommended.

The individual was present and addressed the Board regarding his ability to return to work in his position.

Christi James, Police Department, was present.

There was some discussion regarding the individual's actual medical condition and diagnosis.

Dr. William Hine reviewed the medical record and discussed possibly having another functional assessment.

After some discussion of the individual returning to work in another position, Nicki Eke, Legal Department stated that legally if he is no longer able to perform the duties of a police officer, he would remain on a pension unless he voluntarily elects to be placed in a non-sworn position.

B.R. Hall moved for approval of the recommendation on item 17, that the individual be removed from the return to work list and the disability pension be continued for the length of time as recommended. Doug Clariday seconded and the Board approved with Stephanie Bailey opposing and Todd Henry abstaining.

NEW REQUESTS:

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Board Action Taken
1.	Charles H. Douglas, Jr.	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for four months, (September 2016), with re-exam at that time.
2.	Tracey L. Fortner	Fire	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for six months, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.
3.	Robert W. Howse	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	In Line of Duty/ Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved as a medical disability pension for three months, (August 2016), with re-exam at that time.
4.	Kristian B. Murphy	Fire	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for seven months, (December 2016), with re-exam at that time.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)
 (continued)**

NEW REQUESTS:

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Board Action Taken
5.	Troy S. Turner	General Services	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for six months, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.
6.	Charlene M. Woods	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for three months, (August 2016), with re-exam at that time.
7.	Kevin D. Steele	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was denied.

REEXAMINATIONS:

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
8.	Deborah A. Berryhill	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for two months, (July 2016), with re-exam at that time.
9.	Dorothy E. Cox	General Hospital	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for three months, (August 2016), with re-exam at that time.
10.	Richard T. Foley, III	Police	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for six months, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.
11.	Leon H. Greif	Fire	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued without stipulation of scheduled re-exam at that time.
12.	Jerry L. Jamison	Water	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for six months, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.
13.	Mark A. Kroeger	Fire	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued without stipulation of scheduled re-exam.
14.	James R. Shumate	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for two months, (July 2016), with re-exam at that time.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)
 (continued)**

REEXAMINATIONS:

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
15.	Julie A. Sloan	Fire	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was deferred/continued for one month, (June 2016), with re-exam at that time.

RETURN TO WORK:

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
16.	Paul B. Sparkman	Public Works	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this return to work request was approved.

OTHER:

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
17.	Bryan A. Doersam	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, the individual was removed from the return to work list and the disability pension was continued for one year, (May 2017), with re-exam at that time.

SOCIAL SECURITY REFERRALS:

Claire Cobb reported to the Board that the CSME concurs with the case management recommendations on the Social Security referrals.

Christine Bradley moved for approval of the referrals. Veronica Frazier seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Item	Name	Department	Review Originated From	Case Management Recommendation for Referral	CSME Recommendation for Referral	Comments
1	Addleman, Lisa K.	Police	Pension Approval	Yes	Yes	CI meets SSDI guidelines
2	Nelson, Larry	Water	Pension Approval	Yes	Yes	CI meets SSDI guidelines
3	Thomas, Vernon D., Jr.	Public Works	Pension Approval	Yes	Yes	Evaluation

Christina Hickey reported to the Board that at the March 2016 meeting, the Board returned disability pensioner Deborah (Martin) Williams to work. She stated that this employee has requested for the Board to reconsider their March 2016 decision. She also stated that this coincides with Benefit Board item 1.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)
 (continued)**

The disability pensioner was present.

Todd Henry moved for reconsideration of the return to work. B.R. Hall seconded and the motion for reconsideration failed with Jerry Hall, Todd Henry, Doug Clariday and B.R. Hall in favor and Christine Bradley, Veronica Frazier, Tom Curtis, Stephanie Bailey and Edna Jones opposing.

RECONSIDERATION(S):

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
1.	Deborah D. Williams	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	Medical	No action was taken on this item.

D. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)

Doug Clariday moved for approval of the pensions. B.R. Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Service

Employee	Department	Classification	Plan A/B	Application Date	Estimated Effective Date
Mary I. Richardson	MNPS	Bus Driver	B	03/28/2016	05/27/2016
Sylvia Cagle	MNPS	Secretary/Clerk	B	03/31/2016	06/02/2016
Michael Shreeve	Police	Police Sergeant	B	03/31/2016	05/14/2016
Helena Nightingale	MNPS	Ed Asst	B	03/31/2016	04/21/2016
James Stackhouse *	Police	Police Officer II	B	03/31/2016	05/01/2016
Gary Birdwell	Fire	Fire Captain	B	03/31/2016	04/15/2016
Jeffrey Burnette	Police	Police Officer 2	B	03/31/2016	06/01/2016
Kirk Roncskevitz	Police	Police Officer 2	B	03/31/2016	05/26/2016
Rita Bundy *	MNPS	Ed Asst	B	03/29/2016	06/01/2016
David R. Lewis	ITS	Info Systems Advisor 1	B	04/05/2016	04/05/2016
Deborah Webster	Police	Police Officer II	B	04/07/2016	05/01/2016
Kevin Shearon	Police	Sergeant	B	04/07/2016	05/02/2016
William Keeter	Police	Sergeant	B	04/07/2016	05/03/2016
Gene Graves	Water	Info Sstems App Analyst 3	B	04/07/2016	06/04/2016
Ibiba Okpara	Library	Library Manager 1	B	04/07/2016	06/01/2016
Sally Roberts	MNPS	Asst-School General	B	04/07/2016	05/27/2016
Donna Randolph	MNPS	MGr-Food Svc IV	B	04/07/2016	05/27/2016
Tim Wallace *	Fire	Fire Fighter 3	B	04/06/2016	05/01/2016
Jamie Smith	Parks	Recreation Leader	B	04/04/2016	04/16/2016
Robbie Chandler *	Assessor's Office	Appraiser 2	B	04/05/2016	02/01/2016
Robert P. White	Fire	Fire Engineer	B	04/13/2016	04/16/2016
Charles Hughes	Criminal Ct Clerk	Deputy Crim Ct. Clerk 5	B	04/06/2016	03/29/2016
Alma Mullins	MNPS	Asst-Food Svc	B	04/14/2016	05/27/2016
Manuel Fonseca	Fire	Asst Fire Chief	B	04/14/2016	06/01/2016
Dorothy Gooch	MNPS	Asst-Food Service	B	04/14/2016	05/27/2016
Deborah Thomas	MNPS	Bus Monitor	B	04/14/2016	05/27/2016
Linda Roberts	Library	Library Mgr 2	B	04/14/2016	06/30/2016
Rachel Brannon	Gen Hospital	Mgr, Clinic Operations	B	04/14/2016	05/01/2016
Carolyn Holmes	MNPS	Asst-Food Service	B	04/14/2016	05/26/2016
Judy McGuire	MNPS	Ex Ed Job Coach	B	04/12/2016	04/09/2016
Andrei E. Lee *	Gen Sessions Ct	Gen Sessions Judge	B	04/18/2016	05/01/2013
Leslie Howell	Fire	Paramedic 2	B	04/19/2016	04/23/2016

D. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)

Service (continued)

Employee	Department	Classification	Plan A/B	Application Date	Estimated Effective Date
Kathleen Talley	Public Defender	Legal Secretary 2	B	04/20/2016	06/01/2016
Billy Fryer	MNPS	Bus Driver	B	04/21/2016	04/30/2016
Dennis Bobel Sr.	Fire	Fire Fighter 3	B	04/21/2016	04/30/2016
Michael D. Wilkerson	Fire	Captain	B	04/21/2016	05/28/2016
John Lingley	Water	Indust Electronics Tech 2	B	04/21/2016	05/06/2016
Milton Rucker *	Parks	Recreation Leader	B	04/21/2016	06/01/2016

Disability to service

Employee	Department	Plan A/B	Effective Date of Conversion
James Lockridge	MNPS	B	03/01/2016
Almita Wells	MNPS	B	04/01/2016
David J Williams	Police	B	04/01/2016
Paul Graves	General Services	B	04/01/2016
Claudia Crockett	MNPS	B	04/01/2016
Ned Poarch	Fire	B	04/01/2016
Johnny Hatcher	State Trial Court	B	04/01/2016

Options Elected

Employee	Department	Pension Type	Plan A/B	Effective Date	Option	DROP Election
Moorehead, Reece J	Library	Service	B	3/12/2016	Normal	
Grimes, Judith L	Health	Early Service	B	3/5/2016	C	
Jones, John D	Public Works	Early Service	B	3/8/2016		
Cox, Jacqueline Y	MNPS	Early Service	B	3/2/2016		
Durham, Steve	Water	Service	B	3/19/2016	Normal	3 Yr
Nichols, Patricia	Circuit Court	Service	B	3/12/2016	F	3 Yr
Working, Nancy	MNPS	Service	B	3/4/2016	E	
Engle, Joseph	Public Defender	Service	B	3/5/2016	A	
Richardson, William	Parks	Service	B	2/26/2016	E	
Lain, Charles	Public Works	Service	B	3/5/2016	F	3 Yr
Gannon Sr, Randall W	Water	Early Service	B	3/12/2016	F	
Stewart, Peggy	MNPS	Service	B	3/4/2016	Normal	
Dozier Jr, Norman	State Fair	Service	B	3/1/2016	F	
Towles, Maxine	MNPS	Service	B	3/22/2016	D	3 YR
Jenkins, Thomas	MNPS	Service	B	3/19/2016	F	2 YR
Norton, Robert	MNPD	Service	B	3/17/2016	E	2 YR
Fondern, Michael	MNPS	Service	B	3/1/2016	A	
Tillery, Rose	General Hospital	Early Service	B	3/25/2016	Normal	
Scott, Donna	MNP	Early Service	B	3/16/2016	Normal	
Ballenger, Linda	Health	Service	B	3/19/2016	D	
Adefala, Lois	MNPS	Early Service	B	3/17/2016	Normal	
Cleek, William	MNPD	Service	B	4/1/2016	E	
Wilson, Lucy	Health	Service	B	4/1/2016	Normal	
Pemberton, Gregory	MNPD	Service	B	4/1/2016	E	2 YR
Prather, Carolyn	MNPS	Early Service	B	3/16/2016	Normal	
Walling, Debra L	Assessor's Office	Early Service	B	3/26/2016	Normal	
Dobson, Nancy	County Clerk	Early Service	B	3/10/2016	Normal	
Grantham, Linda	MNPS	Service	B	10/1/2015	Normal	

D. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)

Options Elected (continued)

Employee	Department	Pension Type	Plan A/B	Effective Date	Option	DROP Election
Lockridge, Deborah	MNPS	Service	B	4/1/2016	Normal	
Taylor, Jacqueline	MNPS	Service	B	4/2/2016	D	
Rader, CherylN	MNPS	Service	B	3/16/2016	Normal	
Clark, Phillip N	Police	Service	B	3/1/2016	Normal	

Key Codes	
Options	Drop Elections
Normal Form - life annuity, no payments guaranteed	1 - 1 year drop
Option A - Joint and 100% to Survivor	2 - 2 year drop
Option B - Joint and 50% to Survivor	3 - 3 year drop
Option C - Level Social Security option	
Option D - Life Income, 120 payments guaranteed	
Option E - Joint and 100% to Survivor with popup	
Option F - Joint and 50% to Survivor with popup	

Survivor

Employee Name	Department	Survivor Name	Plan Membership	Effective Date
George R. Johnson	Fire	Marie Johnson	B	04/01/2016
Curtis Glasgow Jr.	Fire	Mary Glasgow	B	04/02/2016
Joe D. Martin	Police	Patricia Martin	A	03/24/2016
Melvin J. Bess	Parks	Kathleen Bess	A	04/01/2016
Johnny F. Petty	Fire	Shirley Petty	B	04/07/2016
James H. Scott	Public Works	Leota Scott	B	04/13/2016
Roger D. Moore	Water	Judy Moore	B	04/06/2016
Kay E. Martineau	BOE	Lori Martineau	B	04/14/2016
Ronald G. Coursey	ITS	Alicia Coursey	B	03/22/2016
Brenda Nightingale	BOE	Tiffany Miller	B	04/15/2016
Robert V. Milligan	Police	Joyce Milligan	B	04/16/2016

BENEFIT BOARD ITEMS

The Human Resources staff submitted the following for the Board's consideration and appropriate action:

1. Reconsideration on return to work.

No action was taken on this item.

2. Cost of living adjustments for closed plans.

Christina Hickey reported to the Board that this cost of living adjustment is pursuant to Resolution No. RS2001-659 and applies to the plans referenced in Section 2 of the resolution – the former City of Nashville Pension Plan and the former Davidson County Pension Plan. She stated that this increase is built into the Metro Code and cannot be adjusted without a change to the Code. Ms. Hickey stated that as a result of the 0.85% increase in the Consumer Price Index, a cost of living adjustment increase of 1.00% should be granted to retirees eligible to receive a cost of living increase under the closed plans beginning July 1, 2016.

B.R. Hall moved for approval of a cost of living adjustment increase of 1.00% to retirees eligible to receive a cost of living increase under the closed plans beginning July 1, 2016. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

3. Medical plan rates.

Christina Hickey reported to the Board that at the April Study Session, Bryan, Pendleton, Swats & McAllister (BPS&M) presented information on the medical plan rates for 2017. She stated that information is being presented today for the Board's review and approval.

David Shaub and Leah Sardiga, BPS&M, were present.

David Shaub stated that at the Study Session the plans, loss ratio, and claims experience were discussed in detail and reviewed the plan rate history for the last five years. He reviewed the preliminary rate increases with the Board (8.7% for Blue Cross Blue Shield and 14.8% for Cigna) and the excess funds in the reserves. He also reviewed rate increase scenarios and the recommended rate increases of 9.1 % for Blue Cross and 15.7% for Cigna.

There was some discussion regarding the rate increase scenarios and using the reserves to buy down the rate increases.

B.R. Hall moved to buy down the rates using \$10 million (Blue Cross to a 4% increase and Cigna to a 10% increase).

Doug Clariday seconded.

There was discussion of using \$10.7 or \$10.3 million to buy down the rates and concerns with utilizing all of the funds at one time.

Stephanie Bailey called for the question which closes off any further debate.

Christina Hickey restated the motion to use the \$10.3 million to buy down the rate increase for Blue Cross to 4% and Cigna to 10%.

A vote was taken on the motion to buy down the rates for a four percent rate increase for BCBS and a ten percent rate increase for CCF with the remainder of the recommended increases to be made up from the medical fund excess of approximately \$10.3 million and the Board approved with Jerry Hall, Edna Jones, Todd Henry, Doug Clariday and B.R. Hall in favor and Veronica Frazier, Christine Bradley, Tom Curtis and Stephanie Bailey opposing.

4. Correspondence:

- a. Utilization report from Blue Cross Blue Shield.
- b. Utilization report from CIGNA.

Items 4.-a. and 4.-b. were for information only.

5. Reports for your information:

- a. Return to work.
- b. Repayment of pension contributions.
- c. Denial log from Alternative Service Concepts.
- d. Benefit Board budget reports.

Items 5.-a. through

6. Late item(s):

Items to be listed under this section will be reported at the meeting.

With nothing further presented, the meeting adjourned at 10:50 a.m.

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

Veronica T. Frazier, Director
Human Resources

Edna J. Jones, Chair
Employee Benefit Board