

## **MINUTES**

### **METROPOLITAN EMPLOYEE BENEFIT BOARD**

**October 4, 2016**

The Metropolitan Employee Benefit Board met for their regularly scheduled meeting on Tuesday, October 4, 2016 in the Sonny West Conference Room, Howard Office Building, 700 2nd Avenue North, Nashville, Tennessee, at approximately 9:30 a.m.

Benefit Board members: Chair: Edna J. Jones; Vice Chair: Christine Bradley; Members: Stephanie Bailey, Charles D. Clariday, Sr., G. Thomas Curtis, B.R. Hall, Sr., Jerry Hall, W. Todd Henry and Talia Lomax-O'dneal.

Member John P. Kennedy was unable to be present.

Others present: Christina Hickey, Metro Human Resources, Nicki Eke, Attorney, Metro Legal Department and Dr. Matthew Hine, Civil Service Medical Examiner.

**A. MINUTES:** Chair Edna Jones called the meeting to order and said the first order of business was to determine if there were any amendments, corrections or questions of the minutes from the last regular meeting held on September 6, 2016. With no corrections, nothing further was noted and Christine Bradley moved for approval. Doug Clariday seconded and the Board approved without objection.

#### **B. APPEAL ANNOUNCEMENT:**

Christina Hickey announced the process and timeframe for appealing a decision made by this Board.

#### **C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)**

The terms of the approval or extension of the items listed in the motions are specifically stated in these minutes.

Dr. Matthew Hine, Civil Service Medical Examiner, (CSME), and Claire Cobb, CSME Assistant, reviewed the disability pensions with the Board.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval of the disability pension new requests, items 1 through 5, for the length of time as recommended. Tom Curtis moved for approval of the recommendation to approve the disability pension new requests, items 1 through 5 for the length of time as recommended. Todd Henry seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that he recommends approval for continuing the disability pension reexaminations, items 6 through 16 for the length of time as recommended, with case management services/evaluations where noted. Stephanie Bailey moved for approval of the recommendation to continue the disability pension reexaminations, items 6 through 16 for the length of time as recommended with case management services/evaluations where noted. Tom Curtis seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on items 17 through 19, he requests a deferral for one month. Christine Bradley moved for approval of the request to defer items 17 through 19 for one month. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 20 he recommends approval of return to work.

Harold Finch, Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools, (MNPS), was present.

Dr. Matthew Hine reviewed his recommendation of return to work and the restrictions. He also stated that if accommodation is not possible, he recommends continuing the disability pension for one year.

Harold Finch, MNPS, stated that they can not accommodate the restrictions for his current position.

Dr. Matthew Hine stated that he would then recommend continuing the disability pension for one year.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)**

B.R. Hall moved for approval of the recommendation on item 20 to continue the disability pension for one year. Doug Clariday seconded.

After some discussion regarding the prognosis of the individual, review in less than one year and other positions at MNPS that the individual may be able to do, it was suggested that vocational case management be assigned and if vocational case management is assigned the review be after the initial vocational assessment has been performed.

The maker of the motion was not in agreement with changing the length of time for review, but was willing to add vocational case management to the motion.

There was also some discussion regarding the individual's course of treatment and what happens when the individual does not follow up with recommended treatment.

Nicki Eke, Legal Department, informed the Board that if an individual is required to participate in a rehabilitation program that will allow them to get better and if it is not covered by the medical insurance, then the Board will need to pay for that program.

After further discussion regarding the length of time recommended for review, a vote was taken on the motion on item 20 to continue the disability pension for one year with vocational case management and the Board approved with B.R. Hall, Doug Clariday, Todd Henry, Edna Jones and Jerry Hall in favor and Christine Bradley, Tom Curtis, Stephanie Bailey opposing and Talia Lomax-O'dneal abstaining.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 21 he recommends approval of return to work with restrictions if they can be accommodated. He stated that if the restrictions can not be accommodated he recommends continuing the disability pension for one year.

Harold Finch, MNPS, stated that they are able to facilitate a possible return to work in a different position and if not he will come back within the 60 days and recommend the individual be placed back on disability pension.

Todd Henry moved for approval of the recommendation of return to work on item 21. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 22 he recommends approval of return to work with restrictions.

There was not a representative from the Hospital Authority present.

Todd Henry moved for approval of the recommendation of return to work on item 22. Christine Bradley seconded and the Board approved with Talia Lomax-O'dneal abstaining.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 23 he recommends approval of return to work with restrictions. He stated that if the restrictions can not be accommodated he recommends vocational case management and continuing the disability pension for two months.

Byron Grizzle, Sheriff's Office, was present and stated that they can not accommodate the restrictions.

There was some discussion of the current position, placing the individual in another position and the individual's prognosis.

Jerry Hall moved for approval of the recommendation on item 23 to continue the disability pension for two months with vocational case management. Stephanie Bailey seconded.

After clarification of which recommendation is being voted on, Stephanie Bailey withdrew her second.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)**

B.R. Hall seconded the motion on item 23 to continue the disability pension for two months with vocational case management and was approved with Christine Bradley and Stephanie Bailey opposing and Talia Lomax-O'dneal abstaining.

There was some discussion of concerns with the individual's injury/condition.

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that on item 24 he received a request from the department requesting that the individual be placed back on a disability pension. He stated that the attempt to return the individual to work was not successful and recommends continuing the disability pension for one year.

Harold Finch, MNPS, stated that the return to work was not successful.

There was some discussion regarding the basis for the recommended review date, other medical conditions and prognosis and the choices regarding the disability pension.

B.R. Hall moved to continue item 24 without stipulation of scheduled re-exam. Doug Clariday seconded.

Nicki Eke, Legal Department, stated that when an individual is returned to work and they are unable to perform the duties due to the medical condition, they will need to be placed back on a pension and it is up to the Board to determine when to have a re-exam or review.

There was some discussion regarding the length of time, improvement of the condition(s), and case management.

There was also some discussion of what the Code/Charter states regarding bringing someone up for re-examination.

Claire Cobb informed the Board that the individual has had vocational case management, which showed poor potential for return to work in a different position.

A vote was taken on the motion to continue item 24 without stipulation of scheduled re-exam and was approved without objection.

**NEW REQUESTS:**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Department</b>	<b>In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability</b>	<b>Board Action Taken</b>
1.	Michael B. Butler	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for two years, (October 2018), with re-exam at that time.
2.	Michael G. Eby	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for eight months, (June 2017), with re-exam at that time.
3.	Mark Melman	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for four months, (February 2017), with re-exam at that time.
4.	Michael D. Thomas, Jr.	Parks	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved for one year, (October 2017), with re-exam at that time.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)**

**NEW REQUESTS: (continued)**

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Board Action Taken
5.	Jessie R. Woodard	Circuit Court Clerk	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension request was approved without stipulation of scheduled re-exam at that time.

**REEXAMINATIONS:**

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
6.	Lisa K. Addleman	Police	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for six months, (April 2017), with re-exam at that time.
7.	Beverly A. Anderson	Parks	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for two years, (October 2018), with re-exam at that time.
8.	Alonzo N. Giles	Juvenile Court	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued with case management for two months, (December 2016), with re-exam at that time.
9.	Jerry W. Jackson	General Services	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued without stipulation of scheduled re-exam at that time.
10.	Youza R. Khalaf	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for four months, (February 2017), with re-exam at that time.
11.	William A. McNeill, Jr.	Assessor of Property	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued with an independent psychological evaluation for two months, (December 2016), with re-exam at that time.
12.	Marion S. Reynolds	Metro Action Commission	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued with vocational case management for two months, (December 2016), with re-exam at that time.
13.	Michael G. Ryan, Jr.	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for seven months, (May 2017), with re-exam at that time.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)**

**REEXAMINATIONS: (continued)**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Department</b>	<b>In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability</b>	<b>Board Action Taken</b>
14.	Randy L. Smith	Library	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for two months, (December 2016), with re-exam at that time.
15.	Rebecca L. Taylor	Fire	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued without stipulation of scheduled re-exam at that time.
16.	Vernon D. Thomas, Jr.	Public Works	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for one year, (October 2017), with re-exam at that time.
17.	Christopher D. Allgood	Sheriff	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued/deferred for one month, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.
18.	Deborah A. Berryhill	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued/deferred for one month, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.
19.	Kimberly A. Towers	Police	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued/deferred for one month, (November 2016), with re-exam at that time.

**RETURN TO WORK:**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Department</b>	<b>In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>
20.	Jerry R. Hudgens	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for one year, (October 2017), with re-exam at that time.
21.	Lokman M. Rashid	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this individual was placed on the return to work list.
22.	Rhonda R. Sims	Knowles	Medical	As moved, seconded and approved, this individual was placed on the return to work list
23.	Christine J. Zetelski	Sheriff	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued for two months, (December 2016), with re-exam at that time.

**C. DISABILITY PENSIONS: (new requests, reexaminations, return to work and social security referrals)**

**OTHER:**

	Name	Department	In Line of Duty (IOD) or Medical Disability	Recommendation
24.	James R. Shumate	Metropolitan Nashville Public Schools	In Line of Duty	As moved, seconded and approved, this disability pension was continued without stipulation of scheduled re-exam at that time.

**SOCIAL SECURITY REFERRALS:**

Dr. Matthew Hine reported to the Board that the CSME concurs with the case management recommendations on the Social Security referrals.

Doug Clariday moved for approval of the referrals. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

Item	Name	Department	Review Originated From	Case Management Recommendation for Referral	CSME Recommendation for Referral	Comments
1	Sloan, Julie A.	Fire	Pension Approval	Yes	Yes	Early Intervention Services
2	Taylor, Rinona L.	Health	Pension Approval	Yes	Yes	Evaluation

**D. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)**

Christine Bradley moved for approval of the pensions. Jerry Hall seconded and the Board approved without objection.

**Service**

Employee	Department	Classification	Plan A/B	Application Date	Estimated Effective Date
Robert Pickard *	Sheriff	Pretrial Svcs Officer 2	B	09/14/2016	10/01/2016
Robert Williams	MNPS	SPEC - SUPPORT TECH DP	B	09/07/2016	10/04/2016
Martin Gonzalez	Police	Police Officer 2	B	08/31/2016	09/06/2016
Mary Thomas	MNPS	CLERK - LIBRARY	B	09/21/2016	10/01/2016
Ernest Cantrell Jr	State Trial Courts	Judicial Asst 1	B	09/07/2016	09/24/2016
Henry Shelton Jr	Sheriff	Correctional Officer 2	B	09/21/2016	10/01/2016
Susan Badgley	MNPS	LIAISON - NON-PUBLIC SCHOOLS	B	08/31/2016	09/07/2016
Suzanne Catignani	Assessor of Property	Appraiser 4	B	09/21/2016	09/15/2016
Michael Gray	Sheriff	Correctional Officer 1	B	09/14/2016	09/09/2016
Rita Cunningham	Sheriff	Sheriff Case Worker 2	B	09/14/2016	10/11/2016
Linda Belle	Health	Public Health Nurse 1	B	08/31/2016	10/01/2016
William Estes Jr	Police	Police Officer 2	B	09/07/2016	10/01/2016
Paul Sorace	Police	Police Officer 2	A	08/31/2016	09/16/2016
William Smith	Police	Police Sergeant	B	09/07/2016	10/26/2016
Danny Hale	Police	Police Sergeant	B	09/07/2016	09/21/2016
Tanuverne Ligon	Clerk and Master	Deputy Clerk & Master II	B	08/31/2016	10/01/2016
Shri Mishra	General Hospital	Metro Hospital Auth Employee	B	09/01/2016	08/26/2016
Caroline Thomas *	Assessor of Property	Cust Svc Rep 3	B	09/21/2016	10/01/2016
Charles Hyner *	Information Technology Service	Info Systems App Analyst 3	B	09/06/2016	12/01/2016
Cynthia Lyons *	Police	School Crossing Guard	B	08/24/2016	10/01/2016
Robert Boydston *	Finance	Finance Admin	B	09/02/2016	12/01/2016

\* Deferred Benefit

**D. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)**

**Disability to service**

Employee	Department	Plan A/B	Effective Date of Conversion
Melvin Breedlove	Public Works	B	09/01/2016
Eleanor Crews	Public Library	B	09/01/2016
Robert Scruggs	Public Works	B	09/01/2016

**Options Elected**

Employee	Department	Pension Type	Plan A/B	Effective Date	Option	Drop Election
Jacqueline Haga	Health	Service With Option	B	08/01/2016	Option D	
Billy Burton	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	08/04/2016	Normal	
Lonnie Dawkins	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	08/03/2016	Normal	

**Options Elected**

Employee	Department	Pension Type	Plan A/B	Effective Date	Option	Drop Election
Paul Matsen	MNPS	Service With Option	B	08/04/2016	Option A	
Jeffrey Wiser	Police	Service With Option	B	08/06/2016	Option E	
Glenda Taylor	Police	P&F Surv Option From Serv Pen	B	08/20/2016	Normal	3
Paulette Knowles	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	08/04/2016	Normal	
Lawrence Sloan Jr	Fire	P&F Service Pen With Option	B	08/09/2016	Option D	
Mary Mitchell	Public Library	Early Service With Option	B	09/09/2016	Option D	
James Mitchell	MNPS	Early Service With Option	B	08/23/2016	Option E	
Myrtle Clopton	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	08/20/2016	Normal	
Judy Marsh	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	07/01/2016	Normal	
Lynn Harbison	Health	Service Without Option	B	07/16/2016	Normal	1
Charles Settle Jr	Circuit Court Satellite	Service With Option	B	09/10/2016	Option D	
Aliceteen Greer	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	08/03/2016	Normal	
Brenda Hickman	MNPS	Service Without Option	B	08/03/2016	Normal	2
Michael York	MNPS	Early Service Without Option	B	08/13/2016	Normal	
Sharon Trent	Sheriff	Early Service With Option	B	08/11/2016	Option A	
Daniel Ogren	Police	P&F Service Pen With Option	B	08/14/2016	Option F	3
Felix Hills	Police	Service With Option	B	09/16/2016	Option E	
Michael Duncan	Juvenile Court	Early Service With Option	B	08/26/2016	Option F	
Kathleen Talley	Public Defender	Service With Option	B	08/19/2016	Option E	3
Trina Dotson	Sheriff	Early Service Without Option	B	08/01/2016	Normal	
Michael Turner	Fire	P&F Service Pen With Option	B	08/14/2016	Option A	3
Sharon Gilliam	Police	Service Without Option	B	08/18/2016	Normal	3
Michael Henning	General Services	Early Service With Option	B	08/13/2016	Option D	
Donna Draper	State Trial Courts	Survivor Option From Service	B	09/08/2016	Option B	
Alice Murphy	Police	Service Without Option	B	08/01/2016	Normal	3
Jeb Johnston	Police	P&F Service Pen With Option	B	07/13/2016	Option D	3
James Grady	Police	P&F Service Pen With Option	B	08/02/2016	Option E	2
Sarah Bruner	Police	P&F Service Pen Without Option	B	09/01/2016	Normal	
Shri Mishra	General Hospital	Service With Option	B	08/26/2016	Option A	
Bennie Nicholson	Health	Service With Option	B	04/01/2007	Option D	
David Byrne	State Trial Courts	Service Without Option	A	08/01/2016	Normal	
Bernard Hetherington	Sheriff	P&F Service Pen Without Option	B	05/01/2016	Normal	
Carole Miller	Health	Service Without Option	B	04/01/2013	Normal	
Michael McDonald	Election Commission	Service With Option	B	09/01/2016	Option E	

Key Codes	
Options	Drop Elections
Normal Form - life annuity, no payments guaranteed	1 - 1 year drop
Option A - Joint and 100% to Survivor	2 - 2 year drop
Option B - Joint and 50% to Survivor	3 - 3 year drop
Option C - Level Social Security option	
Option D - Life Income, 120 payments guaranteed	
Option E - Joint and 100% to Survivor with popup	
Option F - Joint and 50% to Survivor with popup	

**D. PENSIONS: (service, disability to service, options elected and survivor)**

**Survivor**

Employee	Department	Survivor Name	Plan A/B	Effective Date
Angela McClain	Health	Mark Williams	B	08/06/2016
Louis Caldwell Jr	MAC	Shirley Caldwell	A	09/02/2016
Joe Caruthers	Water	Pamela Caruthers	B	09/18/2016
Jack Norman Jr	State Trial Courts	Barbara Norman	B	08/29/2016
James Akin Jr	Health	Charlotte Akin	A	08/29/2016
Kenneth Simington	MNPS	Janice Simington	B	08/31/2016
Orbert Anderson	Police	Helen Anderson	C	09/11/2016
Ralph Barnes	Register of Deeds	Peggy Barnes	B	08/31/2016
Edwin Bullion	MNPS	Larry Bullion	B	09/08/2016
Nancy Cooper	Administrative	Reed Cooper	B	09/10/2016
Cornelius Jolley Jr	Police	Dorothy Jolley	A	08/28/2016
William Jackson Jr	MNPS	Tina Jackson	B	09/26/2016

**BENEFIT BOARD ITEMS**

The Human Resources staff submitted the following for the Board's consideration and appropriate action:

1. In Line of Duty Committee report.

Christina Hickey reported to the Board that the In Line of Duty Committee met on August 23, 2016 to deliberate on 9 IOD medical care requests. She stated that at the September Board, item 7, the IOD medical care request for the employee from the Police Department was deferred for vote until the October Board meeting. Ms. Hickey stated that the individual has requested a deferral.

Committee Chair Jerry Hall stated that the individual has requested a deferral and reminded the Board that there was no recommendation on this item due to lack of a motion. He also stated that if the Board chooses, we can vote on it or defer it.

After some discussion regarding tracking how many times an item is deferred, it was requested that it be added to the reporting.

Daphne Davis, attorney, was present and requested that this item be deferred to the November meeting. She also noted that she and her client are both available for that meeting.

Doug Clariday moved to defer item 7, the IOD medical care request for the employee from the Police Department, to the November Board meeting. Tom Curtis seconded.

There was some discussion regarding if any other information was needed regarding this case.

Vickie Hampton stated that there was no additional information requested by the Committee. She stated that based on the review the Committee could not make a decision.

There was some discussion regarding the individual's pre-employment physical and whether or not a waiver was requested.

There was also some discussion regarding the condition and when the individual was officially diagnosed.

A vote was taken on the motion to defer item 7, the IOD medical care request for the employee from the Police Department, and was approved with Stephanie Bailey opposing.

2. Cigna pharmacy benefit considerations.

Christina Hickey reported to the Board that at the September 2016 Study Session, information was presented by Deloitte regarding opportunities to increase savings in the Cigna plan. She reviewed the considerations with the



2. Cigna pharmacy benefit considerations. (continued)

Board: 1) the Cigna "90 Now" maintenance drug network. This change could be effective Jan 1, 2017 or Jan 1, 2018 if approved; and 2) to limit specialty days supply, this would align with the approach taken by Metro's Cigna plan for scripts filled at retail and Metro's PPO plan. This change could also become effective Jan 1, 2017 or Jan 1, 2018 if approved.

There was some discussion regarding the effects of either change and communicating this during annual enrollment.

HR staff indicated that if a change is made it can be communicated with the confirmation statements.

There was also some discussion of the short notice that the Board received regarding these changes.

Todd Henry moved that the changes be implemented in 2018. Christine Bradley seconded.

After the motion was restated Christine Bradley withdrew her second and the motion died due to lack of a second.

Christine Bradley moved to implement the changes effective 2017. Stephanie Bailey seconded.

After clarification of the motion to implement the 90 now maintenance drug network effective in 2017, a vote was taken on the motion and failed with Christine Bradley, Stephanie Bailey and Talia Lomax-O'dneal in favor and B.R. Hall, Doug Clariday, Todd Henry, Jerry Hall, Edna Jones opposing and Tom Curtis abstaining.

There was no action on the second consideration to limit specialty days supply.

3. Correspondence:

- a. Utilization report from Blue Cross Blue Shield.
- b. Utilization report from CIGNA.

Items 3.-a. and 3.-b. were for information only and no action was required.

4. Reports for your information:

- a. Return to work.
- b. Social Security approvals. (none to report)
- c. Refund of pension contributions. (none to report)
- d. Repayment of pension contributions.
- e. Denial log from Alternative Service Concepts.
- f. Benefit Board budget reports.
- g. Annual voluntary insurance reports.

Items 4.-a. and 4.-g. were for information only and no action was required.

5. Late item(s):

There were no late items reported at the meeting.

Christina Hickey noted that the October Study Session and the November Board meeting will be held at another location (Health Department) due to early voting.

There was some discussion regarding item 2, the Cigna pharmacy benefit considerations and what will happen to this item and the potential savings. It was also noted that it will not come back to the Board unless it is requested.

With nothing further presented, the meeting adjourned at 10:12 a.m.

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

---

**John P. Kennedy, Interim Director  
Human Resources**

---

**Edna J. Jones, Chair  
Employee Benefit Board**