



METROPOLITAN CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MINUTES

April 8, 2014

8:30 a.m.

Howard Office Building
Sonny West Room

700 2nd Avenue South and
Lindsley Avenue
Nashville, Tennessee 37210

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairman William H. Farmer; Vice-Chairman R. Steve Corbitt; C. Michael Allen; D. Billye Sanders and Jo Ann North.

OTHER MEMBERS PRESENT: Veronica T. Frazier, Director; Nicki Eke, Metro Legal Department Attorney

Chairman Farmer called the meeting to order and said the first order of business was to determine if there were any amendments, corrections or questions from the minutes of the last **Regular Meeting** of **March 11, 2014**.

Commissioner North approved the minutes. Second by Commissioner Allen and the Commission approved without objection.

Appeals Process: Nicki Eke read the memorandum pertaining to the Metropolitan Code of Laws 2.68.030 – pursuant to Ordinance BL2006-2050.

APPOINTMENTS
TERMINATIONS / PENSIONS
ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT
HUMAN RESOURCES ITEMS

PG. 2-4
PG. 5
PG. 6
PG. 6-8

APPOINTMENTS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>
<u>EMERGENCY COMMUNICATION CENTER</u>			
Doss, Amber D.	Emer Telecommunications Officer 1	New Hire	2/24/14
Eye, Victoria M.	Emer Telecommunications Officer 1	New Hire	2/24/14
Harmon, Tanya R.	Emer Telecommunications Officer 1	New Hire	2/24/14
Poindexter, Katie V.	Emer Telecommunications Officer 1	New Hire	2/24/14
Reese, Rachel C.	Emer Telecommunications Officer 1	New Hire	2/24/14
Searcy, Crystal L. A.	Emer Telecommunications Officer 1	New Hire	2/24/14

FIRE

Natali, Jaime L.	Human Resources Assistant 1	New Hire	3/16/14
*Boddie, Brittney J.	Info Systems App Analyst 2	Dept. Transfer / Transition – Civil Service	3/01/14

*Department Transfer from JIS (IS Applications Analyst 1, SR10) to Fire (IS Applications Analyst 2, SR11)

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SERVICE

Jackson, Debra J.	Information Systems Oper Analyst 3	Promotion	3/15/14
Holland, Codey L.	Information Systems Oper Tech 2	Promotion	3/15/14

PARKS

Abdulla, Jafer M.	Custodian 1	New Hire	3/24/14
Merritt, Brennan J.	Maintenance & Repair Leader 1	Promotion	3/01/14
Wakefield, Jeffrey M.	Maintenance & Repair Leader 1	Promotion	3/07/14
Vanderpool, Terry J.	Maintenance & Repair Supervisor	Promotion	3/14/14
Flores-Mejia, Fernando	Maintenance & Repair Worker 2	Promotion	3/14/14
Song, Kenneth Kyung Ho	Maintenance & Repair Worker 3	New Hire	3/01/14
Claybrook, Florence C.	Program Coordinator	New Hire	3/01/14

POLICE

Jinnette, Mandy D.	Administrative Assistant	Promotion	3/01/14
Corcoran, Lou Anne	Crime Lab Evid Recv Supervisor	Promotion	3/01/14
Armstrong, Sarah R.	Crime Lab Forensic Scientist 2	New Hire	3/16/14
Dowell, Nicole M.	Crime Lab Forensic Technician	New Hire	3/16/14
Dyer, William K.	Police Captain	Promotion	3/01/14
Little, Terri L.	Police Lieutenant	Promotion	3/01/14
Melzoni Jr, Johnnie E.	Police Lieutenant	Promotion	3/01/14
*Baron, Michael A.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14
*Birch, Brian T.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14
*Brown, Paul W.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14
*Bryson, Tyler G.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14
*Collazo, Michael A.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14
*Croteau, Robert L.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14
*Crowe, William C.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	3/07/14

APPOINTMENTS

<u>Name</u>	<u>Classification</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Date</u>
<u>POLICE</u>			
*Cunningham, Victoria R.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Esqueda, Andy V.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Finnegan, Peter D.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Foster, Melvin J.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Frazier, Jarred A.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Hewitt, Steven G.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Hill, Ashton E.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Hollins, Joshua B.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Kidd, Jeremy R.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Knisley, Peter A.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Littles, Christopher W.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Luffman, Ethan B.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Luu, Ky T.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Massey, Wallis P.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*McBride, Terrance B.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Partin, Jacob T.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Stambaugh, Clyde J.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Stanford, Ryan A.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Stein, Paul M.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*White, Zachary L.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Williams, Blaze C.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
*Zwilling, Jared F.	Police Officer 1	Class Change	03/07/14
Wherry, Shatara D.	Police Operations Assistant 1	New Hire	03/16/14
Williams, Ronald G.	Police Operations Assistant 1	New Hire	03/16/14
Castro, Kayla N.	Police Operations Coordinator 1	Promotion	03/16/14
Martinez, Isaac M.	Police Operations Coordinator 1	Promotion	03/16/14
Hacker Jr, David M.	Police Sergeant	Promotion	03/01/14
Lara Jr, Carlos W.	Police Sergeant	Promotion	03/01/14

*Class Change from Police Officer Trainee to Police Officer 1

PUBLIC LIBRARY

Pierce, Amy N.	Circulation Assistant 1	New Hire	03/03/14
Russell, Jeffrey A.	Circulation Assistant 1	New Hire	03/03/14

PUBLIC WORKS

Gill, Victor V.	Engineer In Training	New Hire	03/01/14
Rowan, Andrew G.	Engineer In Training	New Hire	03/17/14
Gentry, Rickey	Equipment Operator 2	New Hire	03/17/14
Johns, Kevin W.	Equipment Operator 3	New Hire	03/17/14
Ewing, Terrence L.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	New Hire	03/18/14
Nolan, Darron D.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	Re-Hire	02/18/14
Woods, Brandan D.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	New Hire	03/18/14
*Ezell, Jeffrey C.	Recycling Coordinator	Class Change/Lateral	03/04/14
Baugh, Marquez J.	Sanitation Worker	New Hire	03/01/14

*Class Change from Program Specialist 3 (SR10) to Recycling Coordinator (SR10)

APPOINTMENTS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>
<u>SHERIFF</u>			
Alexander, Jobie L.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Allen, Edward N.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Carl, Brett A.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Dinaso, Christopher R.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Fields, Demetria Y.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
*Frost, Berlin A.	Correctional Officer 1	Transition - Civil Service	03/01/14
Goins, Sammy K. J.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Hensley, Seith E.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Holt, Terrence J.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Irvine, Jared W.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Joseph, Jason O.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Knowles, Donathan T.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Leibach, Benjamin J	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
MacEachron II, Michael A.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
McMahan, Justin B.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Pate, Christopher A.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Reeves, Amanda E.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Riley, Dominik R.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Romine, Cynthia L.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
^Themm, Jason J.	Correctional Officer 1	Demotion	02/28/14
Turner, Terrell D.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Vargas, Fabian A.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Vongsamphanh, Patrick D.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Wells, Kiesha L.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Werner, Ralf	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Willis Jr, Remond	Correctional Officer 1	Re-Hire	03/01/14
Zazworsky, David M.	Correctional Officer 1	New Hire	03/01/14
Gleaves, Derrick L.	Correctional Officer Sergeant	Promotion	03/23/14

*Transition to Civil Service from Security Officer (Non-Civil Service) to Correctional Officer

^Demotion from Correctional Officer 2 to Correctional Officer 1

WATER SERVICES

Boissiere, Anthanese W.	Compliance Inspector 2	Promotion	03/15/14
Clemons, Lawrence R.	Compliance Inspector 2	Promotion	03/15/14

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner North moved for approval of the appointments as listed. Commissioner Allen second and the Commission approved without objection.

TERMINATIONS/ PENSIONS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DEPARTMENT</u>	<u>DATE</u>
Kyle, Michael A.	Zoning Examiner	Pension	Codes Administration	
Leflouria Jr, Jesse J.	Emerg Medical Tech 2	Resignation	Fire	03/11/14
Adcox, Jesse Oliver	Fire Captain	Pension	Fire	02/21/14
McIntyre, Richard K.	Fire Captain	Pension	Fire	02/28/14
Jones, Kenneth A.	Fire Fighter 2	Pension	Fire	02/28/14
Soulliere, Randall T.	Fire Fighter 2	Resignation	Fire	03/03/14
Benningfield, Matthew T.	Automotive Mechanic	Resignation	General Services	02/28/14
Henry, Herman G.	Internal Auditor 2	Resignation	Internal Audit	03/07/14
Stephens, Marquis R.	Recreation Leader	Resignation	Parks	03/07/14
Adkerson, Carey J.	Police Officer 2	Dismissed	Police	03/05/14
Rowland, James G.	Police Officer 2	Resignation	Police	03/08/14
Harvey, Tamika R.	Circulation Assistant 1	Resignation	Public Library	03/07/14
Holt, Michael L.	Circulation Assistant 2	Resignation	Public Library	02/28/14
Howerton, Tracey L.	Library Associate 1	Resignation	Public Library	02/23/14
Sherrill, Margaret R.	Library Associate 2	Pension	Public Library	03/14/14
Wright, April L.	Library Associate 2	Resignation	Public Library	02/24/14
Johnson Jr, Gerald L.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	Resignation	Public Works	02/23/14
Medlen, Joshua A.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	Resignation	Public Works	02/18/14
Sargent, Christopher P.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	02/28/14
Smolik, Amanda M.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	03/06/14
Spence, Deestin T.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	03/07/14
Swain, Sevoy R.	Correctional Officer 1	Dismissed	Sheriff	02/21/14
Driver, Anthony B.	Customer Service Field Rep 2	Resignation	Water Services	02/28/14
Guy, Dorris T.	Customer Service Field Rep 2	Resignation	Water Services	02/28/14
Moore, Mark K.	Customer Service Field Rep 2	Resignation	Water Services	03/03/14
Cox, Kenneth W.	Treatment Plant Superintendent	Pension	Water Services	03/14/14
Gorrell, Harold W.	Treatment Plant Tech 2	Pension	Water Services	02/28/14
Cooper, Michael T.	Water Quality Analyst 2	Pension	Water Services	02/21/14

MOTION: *After some discussion, Commissioner North moved to accept the Termination/Pension report for dates and reasons stated. Seconded by Commissioner Allen and the Commission approved without objection.*

ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT

<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>DEPT</u>	<u>ON LIST</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>ESTABLISH/ABOLISH</u>
Librarian 2	Library	64	Open	03/05/14	E
Crime Lab Forensic Technician	Police	248	Open	03/07/14	E
Custodial Services Assistant Supervisor	Parks	2	Dept	03/07/14	E
Crime Lab Forensic Scientist 2-Toxicology Unit	Police	50	Open	03/07/14	E
Crime Lab Forensic Scientist 2-Drug ID Unit	Police	74	Open	03/07/14	E
Maintenance & Repair Supervisor	Parks	5	Open	03/10/14	E
IS Operations Technician 2	ITS	29	Open	03/11/14	E
Plans Examiner	Codes	31	Open	03/11/14	E
Correctional Officer 2	Sheriff's Office	3	Dept	03/12/14	A
Office Support Specialist 1	Library	172	Open	03/13/14	E
Recreation Leader	Parks	1	Open	03/13/14	E
Parks & Recreation Superintendent	Parks	59	Open	03/13/14	E
IS Applications Analyst 2	Fire	24	Open	03/14/14	E
Human Resources Assistant 1	Fire	306	Open	03/14/14	E
Industrial Mechanic 1	Water	22	Open	03/18/14	A

ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT

<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>DEPT</u>	<u>ON LIST</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>ESTABLISH/ABOLISH</u>
Custodian 1	Parks	92	Open	03/18/14	E
Police Security Guard 1	Police	133	Open	03/19/14	E
Human Resources Assistant Director	Human Resources	2	Dept	03/19/14	E
Program Coordinator	Parks	155	Open	03/24/14	A
Engineer 2	Water	20	Open	03/24/14	A
Office Support Specialist 2	Police	5	Dept	03/25/14	E
Finance Officer 2	Finance	79	Open	03/25/14	A
Program Coordinator	Library	37	Open	03/26/14	E
Radio Technician 2	General Services	1	Dept	03/28/14	E

MOTION: *After some discussion, Commissioner North moved to approve the register report. Seconded by Commissioner Allen and the Commission approved without objection.*

HUMAN RESOURCES

Human Resources Director Veronica T. Frazier, submits the following for the Commission's consideration and appropriate action:

(1: **Review Initial Order of Corey West, Police – 30 Day Suspension / Termination**

Officer Cory West was suspended 30 days and then Termination from his position at the Police Department effective April 17, 2012 for the following violations:

(1) General Order 09-03 Department and Personal Appearance; Section VII, Personal Behavior (C) Conduct Unbecoming an employee of the department; (2) Metropolitan Civil Service Rules – Section 6.7, Grounds for Disciplinary Action #11 – Violation of any written rules, policies, or procedures of the department in which the employee is employed; (3) Metropolitan Civil Service Rules; Section 6.7, Grounds for Disciplinary Action; #32 – Any Failure of good behavior which reflects discredit upon himself, the department, and/or the Metropolitan Government and (4) Metropolitan Civil Service Rules; Section 6.7, Grounds for Disciplinary Action; #33 – Conduct unbecoming an employee of the Metropolitan Government.

Officer West appealed his dismissal to the Commission and the case was assigned to Administrative Law Judge Anthony Adgent. Metro Attorney Jon Michael represented Metropolitan Government during the hearing. Attorney Kim Gilleland represented Officer West. The hearing was set originally on August 23, 2012 and again on April 1, 2013 and finally heard on July 2, 2013 by Judge Adgent. After carefully reviewing the case, Judge Adgent entered an **Initial Order on November 6, 2013 Upholding Metropolitan Governments disciplinary action for Suspension of 30 days and Termination.**

1st MOTION: *After hearing discussions of this matter and reviewing all information on the case, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to uphold the Initial Order that was submitted by Judge Anthony Adgent. The motion failed for a lack of a second.*

2nd MOTION: *Commissioner Allen moved to amend the Administrative Law Judge's Initial Order to a fifteen day (15) day suspension. Seconded by Commissioner North and the Commission approved with one abstention from Commissioner Sanders and one objection from Vice-Chairman Corbitt.*

(2: Review decision of appeal on Parks employee Pam DeSoto, regarding Administrative Leave granted as non-grievable.

Ms. DeSoto, Park Police Officer II from Parks and Recreation, submitted an appeal by her Attorney Ben M. Rose to Human Resources Director Veronica T. Frazier regarding a decision from Director Tommy Lynch of Parks citing the number of days of Administrative Leave granted was non-grievable.

Ms. DeSoto's Attorney Ben M. Rose noted the issue was whether Sgt. DeSoto should be afforded administrative pay pending results of a Departmental Hearing as similarly provided to regular police officers by the Metropolitan Police Department rules. The Parks Department allotted Ms. DeSoto 1 day over the maximum number of administrative Leave with pay days allowed by Civil Service rules.

Metro Attorney Josh Lee, Attorney Ben M. Rose for Ms. DeSoto, HR Manager Sonny Lyons and Director Tommy Lynch was present before the Commission to discuss this matter.

MOTION: *After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to deny the appeal and to uphold the department's decision that it is non-grievable. Seconded by Commissioner Sanders and the Commission approved without objection.*

Break – Five Minutes

(3: Deloitte Review of Compensation and Benefit Plans

Greg Stoskopf and Greg Drennan, Deloitte, presented key findings from the Compensation and Benefit Review. These included:

- "Metro compensation levels were assessed using **published survey data** based on a sample of 147 jobs covering approximately 4,000 employees and a **custom compensation and benefits survey** where Deloitte Consulting contacted 17 city and county governments including Metro to solicit participation in the custom survey"
- "Overall, base salaries are within a competitive range of +/- 10% of the market median based on **published survey data**"
 - "Overall, total cash compensation **falls within the competitive range**"
- "Overall, base salaries are within a competitive range of +/- 10% of the market median based on **custom survey data**"
- "Metro health and welfare, retirement, and leave benefits are, in total, over 20% more valuable than averages for peers and the broader public sector market for general employees; in addition, they are over 10% more valuable for public safety employees"
- "Overall, Metro's compensation and benefits package combined is **somewhat above competitive levels**"

Deloitte's report also outlined options for addressing both compensation and benefits to bring them more in line with market and leading practices. John Kennedy stated that HR would review the findings with departments, employee groups, and leadership and bring a pay plan proposal to the Commission at the May 2014 meeting. He also stated that additional study will be required to determine the best long term solution for addressing positions that were found to be below market.

This was for a report only.

(4: Human Resources Updates

There were no updates for this meeting.

(5: Communiqués from the public on pending hearings

ACTION: None

With nothing further, the regular meeting adjourned at 10:00 a.m.

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

**Ginger Hall, Assistant Director
Secretary to the Commission**

**William H. Farmer, Chairman
Civil Service Commission**