



METROPOLITAN CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MINUTES

May 12, 2015

8:30 a.m.

Howard Office Building
Sonny West Room

700 2nd Avenue South and
Lindsley Avenue
Nashville, Tennessee 37210

▪ **MEMBERS PRESENT:** Chairman William H. Farmer; Vice-Chairman Corbitt, D. Billye Sanders and Jo Ann North.

MEMBERS ABSENT: C. Michael Allen

OTHER MEMBERS PRESENT: Veronica T. Frazier, Director; Tom Cross, Assistant Director of Metro Legal Department

Chairman Farmer called the meeting to order and said the first order of business was to determine if there were any amendments, corrections or questions from the minutes of the last **Regular Meeting** of **April 14, 2015**. Commissioner North moved to accept the regular minutes. Seconded by Vice-Chairman Corbitt.

Appeals Process: Tom Cross read the memorandum pertaining to the Metropolitan Code of Laws 2.68.030 – pursuant to Ordinance BL2006-2050.

APPOINTMENTS
TERMINATIONS / PENSIONS
ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT
DEPARTMENTAL ITEM
HUMAN RESOURCES ITEMS

PG. 2-4
PG. 4
PG. 4-6
PG. 6
PG. 6-10

APPOINTMENTS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>
<u>FINANCE</u>			
Davis, Aaron Z.	Finance Officer 2	New Hire	03/30/15

FIRE

Belcher, Joshua T.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Bennett, Rebecca A.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Bracey, Jennifer N.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Fitzgerald, Shaunna M.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Fudge, Christopher A.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Grisham, Joshua D.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Hines, Jermaine M.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	Re-Hire	04/16/15
Johnson, Aaron M.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Morton, John C.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Mullican, Zachary F.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Romero, Robert C.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	Re-Hire	04/16/15
Summers, Tyler K.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Tidwell, Robert L.	Emergency Medical Tech 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Glenn, John E.	Fire Inspector 1	Promotion	04/01/15
Brinkerhoff, Weston J.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Buckner, Cory L.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Collier, Jeffrey B.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Cross, Joshua A.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Daniel, Corey P.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Dichiara II, Benjamin A.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Edwards Jr, James W.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Furlong, Theresa N.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Groves, Robert S.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Owens, Michael A.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Perry, Richard K.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Pinn, Madison R.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Pruitt, Justin S.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Roper, Taylor C.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Standing, Thomas L.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Stewart, Jessi E.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Ward, Jonathon R.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15
Williams, Stephen P.	Paramedic 1	New Hire	04/16/15

GENERAL SERVICES

*Saad III, John Phil	Compliance Inspector 3	Department Transfer/Class Change	04/13/15
Dillard, Stacey L.	Equipment Mechanic	New Hire	04/13/15
Eady, Preston B.	Equipment Mechanic	Re-Employment	04/13/15

*Department Transfer from Water (Engineering Tech 3, SR10) to General Services (Compliance Insp. 3, SR10)

APPOINTMENTS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>
<u>INTERNAL AUDIT</u>			
Henry, Laura M.	Internal Auditor 1	New Hire	04/06/15
Wen, Nan	Internal Auditor 1	New Hire	04/01/15

PARKS

Russell, Samuel H.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 3	Promotion	04/10/15
*Thomas, Mary C.	Recreation Leader	Transition - Civil Service	03/20/15

*Transition to Civil Service from Part Time status

POLICE

Davidson, Dawn L.	Administrative Assistant	Promotion	04/01/15
Lawrence, Shenika N.	Administrative Assistant	Promotion	04/04/15
Yazdani, Noelle B.	Administrative Assistant	Promotion	04/01/15
Kennington, David R.	Administrative Services Manager	Promotion	04/01/15
Savage, Deborah J.	Administrative Services Manager	Promotion	04/01/15
Ferrari, Amy L.	Administrative Services Officer 3	Promotion	04/01/15
Hedge, John C.	Administrative Services Officer 4	Promotion	04/01/15
Hooper, Julia E.	Crime Lab Forensic Supervisor	Promotion	04/04/15
Marsh, Lorita F.	Crime Lab Forensic Supervisor	Promotion	04/04/15
Koza, Casey L.	Crime Lab Forensic Technician	New Hire	04/01/15
*Flatt, Blenda Jane	Office Support Specialist 2	Class Change/Lateral	04/01/15
Morris Jr, Billy E.	Police Lieutenant	Promotion	04/01/15
Joiner, Ailee N.	Police Operations Assistant 1	New Hire	04/01/15

*Class Change from Police Operations Coordinator 2 (SR8) to Office Support Specialist 2 (SR8)

PUBLIC LIBRARY

Albader, Riyad	Custodian 1	New Hire	04/13/15
*Martin, Michelle D.	Custodian 1	Dept. Transfer / Transition – Civil Service	04/13/15
Betty, Kimberly A.	Library Associate 1	New Hire	04/13/15
Williams, Crishauna Y.	Library Associate 1	New Hire	03/30/15
Piper, Mary J	Library Manager 3	Promotion	03/30/15
Rodriguez, Stephanie S.	Library Manager 3	Promotion	03/30/15
Pierce, Amy N.	Office Support Specialist 2	Promotion	03/30/15
Johnson, Patrick D.	Program Specialist 1	New Hire	04/13/15

*Department Transfer from Metro Action Commission (Custodian) to Public Library (Custodian 1)

APPOINTMENTS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>
<u>PUBLIC WORKS</u>			
Healy, Edward M.	Maintenance & Repair Leader 1	Promotion	04/13/15
Harris, Chandler P.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	New Hire	04/14/15
McElhiney, Shawn K.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	New Hire	04/13/15

SHERIFF

Hope, Charles E.	Correctional Officer 2	Promotion	04/19/15
Jones, Jeremy S.	Correctional Officer 2	Promotion	04/19/15
Pallak, Nicholas J.	Correctional Officer 2	Promotion	04/19/15
Woodall, Stephen C.	Correctional Officer 2	Promotion	04/19/15
Thomas, Cassie M.	Correctional Officer Lt.	Promotion	03/25/15
Dial, Timothy J.	Correctional Officer Sergeant	Promotion	04/19/15
Johnson, Romona L.	Correctional Officer Sergeant	Promotion	04/19/15
True, Keith T.	Correctional Officer Sergeant	Promotion	04/19/15

SOCIAL SERVICES

*Foxy, Trumeko L.	Office Support Representative 2	Class Change/Lateral	04/01/15
*Fulson, Dorethia C.	Office Support Representative 2	Class Change/Lateral	04/01/15
*Jackman, Carolyn D.	Office Support Representative 2	Class Change/Lateral	04/01/15
*Pond, Catherine W.	Office Support Representative 2	Class Change/Lateral	04/01/15

*Class Change from Homemaker (SR5) to Office Support Rep 2 (SR5)

WATER SERVICES

Bowman, Logan A.	Engineer In Training	New Hire	03/28/15
*Thompson, Lloyd	Equipment Operator 2	Department Transfer/Promotion	03/28/15
Horbovetz, Aaron B.	Indust Electronics Tech 1	New Hire	03/28/15
^Osterhoudt, Jon S.	Indust Electronics Tech 1	Department Transfer/Promotion	04/11/15
Spears, Marvin W.	Indust Electronics Tech 1	New Hire	04/11/15
Shirley, Michael L.	Office Support Specialist 1	Promotion	04/11/15
Gannon Jr, Randall W.	Treatment Plant Shift Supervisor	Promotion	04/25/15
McDowell, Robert C.	Treatment Plant Shift Supervisor	Promotion	04/25/15
Wilee, Jamie E.	Treatment Plant Shift Supervisor	Promotion	04/25/15
Henning, Joshua M.	Water Maintenance Leader 2	Promotion	04/25/15
Tate, Ray	Water Maintenance Leader 2	Promotion	04/25/15
Young, Alan C.	Water Maintenance Leader 2	Promotion	04/25/15

*Department Transfer from Parks (M&R Worker 3, TG6) to Water (Equipment Oper. 2, TG7)

^Department Transfer from Public Works (Signal Tech 2, TG11) to Water (Industrial Electronics Tech 1, TG13)

MOTION: After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved for approval of the appointments as listed. Commissioner North second and the Commission approved without objection.

TERMINATIONS/ PENSIONS

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DEPARTMENT</u>	<u>DATE</u>
Person, Deborah L.	Application Tech 2	Resignation	Finance	04/20/15
Pothast, Maria K.	Emergency Medical Tech 2	Resignation	Fire	04/09/15
Stromatt, Mark E.	Fire Captain	Pension	Fire	04/14/15
Vaughn, David E.	Firefighter 3	Pension	Fire	04/10/15
Dyer, Brent N.	Paramedic 2	Resignation	Fire	03/31/15
Woodard, Phillip K.	Automotive Mechanic-Cert	Deceased	General Services	04/08/15
Roney, Nathaniel J.	Technical Specialist 2	Resignation	General Services	04/03/15
Acklin, Marcus J.	Info Systems App Tech 2	Resignation	ITS	04/24/15
Bailey, Susan M.	Info Systems Manager	Resignation	ITS	04/22/15
Anderson, Emily P.	Golf Course Assistant Manager	Pension	Parks	04/01/15
McLean, Ver-Sean D.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	Resignation	Parks	03/31/15
Newsome, David E.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	Resignation	Parks	04/22/15
Burnett, Anthony S.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 3	Resignation	Parks	04/16/15
Childress, Wesley W.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 3	Pension	Parks	04/02/15
Desoto, Pamela M.	Park Police Sergeant	Pension	Parks	04/16/15
Brinkley Jr, Garland	Recreation Leader	Resignation	Parks	04/23/15
Whittaker, Michael D.	Recreation Leader	Resignation	Parks	04/23/15
Zervas, Hannah E.	Recreation Leader	Resignation	Parks	04/07/15
Patterson Jr, James A.	Police Officer 2	Resignation	Police	04/06/15
Caruth, Jami E.	Police Operations Assistant 1	Resignation	Police	03/31/15
Seaton, Ashley K.	Police Operations Assistant 1	Resignation	Police	04/04/15
Quier, Jennifer R.	Librarian 1	Resignation	Public Library	04/23/15
Fach, Heather B.	Office Support Rep 3	Resignation	Public Library	04/09/15
McKay, Micah A.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 1	Resignation	Public Works	04/10/15
McMillan, Byron E.	Maintenance & Repair Worker 2	Pension	Public Works	04/10/15
Correa, Suzanne	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	04/06/15
Parker, Kasey K.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	04/13/15
Salazar, Ashley N.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	04/02/15
Turner, Terrell D.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	04/02/15
Mays, Montaez L.	Correctional Officer 2	Resignation	Sheriff	04/24/15
Petre III, James A.	Correctional Officer 2	Resignation	Sheriff	04/02/15
Charlton Jr, Robert L.	Customer Service Field Rep 3	Pension	Water Services	04/07/15
Overton, Jerome R.	Office Support Rep 3	Resignation	Water Services	04/03/15
Breedlove, Randy E.	Water Maintenance Leader 2	Deceased	Water Services	04/21/15

MOTION: *After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to accept the Termination/Pension report for dates and reasons stated. Seconded by Commissioner North and the Commission approved without objection.*

ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT

<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>DEPT</u>	<u>ON LIST</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>ESTABLISH/ABOLISH</u>
Administrative Assistant	Police	02	Dept	4/07/15	E
Administrative Services Officer 3	Police	01	Dept	4/07/15	E
Program Specialist 1	Library	72	Open	4/07/15	E
Crime Lab Forensic Supervisor	Police	2	Dept	4/08/15	E
Fire Inspector 1	Fire	79	Open	4/08/15	E
Paramedic 1	Fire	176	Open	4/09/15	E
Custodian 1	Library	118	Open	4/13/15	E
Emergency Medical Technician 1	Fire	294	Open	4/13/15	E
Correctional Officer Sergeant	Sheriff's Office	62	Dept	4/14/15	E
Administrative Assistant	Finance	246	Open	4/15/15	E

ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT

<u>CLASSIFICATION</u>	<u>DEPT</u>	<u>ON LIST</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>ESTABLISH/ABOLISH</u>	
Finance Officer 2	Finance	73	Open	4/17/15	E	
Police Operations Coordinator 2-Records	Police	3	Dept	4/20/15		A
Police Operations Coordinator 2-Chief's Office	Police	9	Dept	4/20/15	E	
Library Manager 2	Library	33	Open	4/23/15		A
Administrative Services Officer 4	Library	56	Open	4/23/15	E	
Special Assistant to the Director	Library	251	Open	4/24/15	E	
Equipment Operator 2	Water	21	Open	4/28/15		A
Human Resources Analyst 1	Police	3	Dept	4/28/15	E	
Water Maintenance Leader 2	Water	4	Open	4/28/15	E	
Crime Lab Forensic Scientist 1	Police	2	Dept	4/30/15	E	
Crime Lab Forensic Scientist 2	Police	2	Dept	4/30/15	E	
Correctional Officer 1	Sheriff's Office	14	Open	4/27/15	E	

MOTION: After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to approve the register report. Seconded by Commissioner North and the Commission approved without objection.

DEPARTMENTAL ITEM**ARTS COMMISSION**

(1: Arts Commission Director Jennifer Cole requested approval to Hire Above Midpoint Ms. Rebecca Berrios.

Director Cole said the Arts Commission is Hiring Above Midpoint Ms. Rebecca Berrios as Administrative Service Manager – Community Engagement. She will serve as departmental manager over the entire community program and funding portfolio. The programs are approximately 80% of the annual operating budget and requires special skills in the arts programming, financial/administration, supervision and public speaking / outreach and manage grants. Ms. Berrios has worked with the Arts Commission since 2011 and accepted supervisory duties along with budgetary work. She was selected for this position due to her existing work with the Arts Department and her experience in designing and the community arts program.

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner North moved to approve the above as submitted. Seconded by Vice-Chairman Corbitt and the Commission approved without objection.

HUMAN RESOURCES

Human Resources Director Veronica T. Frazier, submits the following for the Commission's consideration and appropriate action:

(2: Review Appeal of Medical Disqualification of Fire Applicant JG – Paramedic 1

RECAP: This matter went before the Commission in April but was deferred for one month in order for JG to obtain further medical information regarding his case. In the previous meeting it was noted he was disqualified as an applicant for Paramedic 1 due to his failure to pass a requested physical examination administered by Medical Examiner Susan Warner. Dr. Warner referred to NFPA 6.24.2 (3) and NFPA 6.23.2 (1) for a prescribed

medication. NFPA 6.23.2 (1) for history of the condition prescribed by his primary doctor. Although it seems the matter is controlled, the individual said the current medication was not necessary, but takes it for irritability. Dr. Warner did not recommend approval. The applicant spoke with the Commission about the matter at the previous meeting. It was pointed out by applicant JG that he had asked his doctor to contact Dr. Warner by phone to discuss his condition. Dr. Warner noted she would have preferred a written letter but never did to speak to his doctor.

Chairman Farmer noted there was some confusion from the last meeting about documentation signed by the office help rather than the doctor and some confusion from Dr. Warner about Applicant JG misstating some of his medical history. Discussion continued regarding JG's case with more medical documentation presented and reviewed. The Commission was afforded a letter from JG's primary physician to establish that he had been seen and that some testing had taken place. Due to the level of medication prescribed and taken by Applicant JG, it was of Dr. Warner's opinion the primary physician had not demonstrated the diagnostic criteria for diagnosis and that it would have been better for Applicant JG to see someone more qualified that could assess the psychological health portion.

Applicant JG's Attorney, Kerry Knox, was present at the meeting and was concerned with Dr. Warner's position that JG has anger issues. It was noted by Attorney Knox it was of the opinion of two physicians and most recent employer and former employer that Applicant JG was capable to perform the job of Paramedic. Dr. Warner said she was looking for some explanation from a psychiatric physician that could provide continued treatment and explain by a medical evaluation JG's condition for a specific medication he is presently taking.

1st MOTION: *After much discussion, Commissioner Sanders moved to table the waiver until Dr. Warner gets the information she is requesting in the letter of April 16, 2015. Second by Vice-Chairman Corbitt. However, there was a request to modify the first motion by Vice-Chairman Corbitt. Approved by Chairman Farmer.*

2nd MOTION: *Vice-Chairman Corbitt said if Commissioner Sanders would agree, move to defer the matter for one regular meeting to allow both parties to work this out. Commissioner Sanders made a second and agreed for the time line to iron out what is needed to satisfy Dr. Warner's request. Commissioner Sanders – Aye; Vice-Chairman Corbitt – Aye. Commission North – No. Chairman Farmer – No. The vote ended in a tie. 2 to 2.*

Chairman Farmer stated he believed there was enough information in this record to make a recommendation.

3rd MOTION: *Commissioner North moved to act on the matter today and approve the waiver. Seconded by Chairman Farmer. Commissioner North – Aye; Chairman Farmer – Aye; Vice-Chairman Corbitt – No; Commissioner Sanders – no. The vote was tied 2 to 2.*

4th MOTION: *Vice-Chairman Corbitt made the recommendation again by moving to defer this matter for one meeting and see if there is some information between the primary physician and other physicians and Dr. Warner to resolve this matter with understanding that this Commission isn't going to recommend or demand for JG to go see a mental health professional for approval. Seconded by Commissioner Sanders and the Commission approved without objection.*

(3: Review Order of Dismissal on Christine Olson, Police Department

Christina Olson, Administrative Services Officer 3 (ASO3), made an appeal by filing her grievance on December 3, 2014. The grievance was in response to a mandate from the Police Department to undergo a fitness for duty examination. The case was then assigned to Administrative Law Judge Rob Wilson to hear and was scheduled to take place on April 15, 2015. However, by March 18, 2015, Ms. Olson's employment with the Metro Police Department was terminated due to violating Departmental Rules and Regulations. The termination stated Ms. Olson had 15 days from the date of the letter, March 18, 2015, to file an appeal of her termination. Ms. Olson did not submit an appeal for the termination. On April 28, 2015, Administrative Law Judge Rob Wilson issued an Order of Dismissal granting the request by Metro Legal Department to dismiss the case.

Metro Attorney Cynthia Gross was present before the Commission to review and discuss the matter. Ms. Olson, who was duly notified, did not attend the meeting.

MOTION: *After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to approve the Order of Dismissal as submitted by Administrative Law Judge Rob Wilson. Seconded by Commissioner Sanders and the Commission approved without objection.*

(4 : Review Updated ALJ Hearing Calendar

Chairman Farmer thanked Ms. Sorrow and the Human Resources Department for the Administrative Hearing Calendar. The calendar provides a record of the hearings that have been or will take place through the Administrative Procedures Division (APD) at the State of Tennessee.

Chairman Farmer also charged the Metro Legal Department to continue to move the cases forward and complete each one as quickly as possible. He also asked that a copy of the calendar be forward to the Administrative Procedures Division for informational purposes.

ACTION: *This was for a Report Only*

(5: Human Resources Updates

ACTION: *None to Report*

(6: Pay Plan Discussion

Finance Director Rich Reibel and John Kennedy came before the Commission to discuss the pay plan and for the Commission to ask questions.

(A). There is a proposal for reducing compression. During the period when Metro wasn't able to grant increments, Police Officers, Firefighters and others were being hired and graduating from the academy and moving into Step 1. So, those who graduate in 2008 moved into Step 1. Those who graduated in 2009 went to Step 1, etc.,. There was four years' worth of employees at the same exact step and when the increments were available again, it was not orderly as it should have been so some individuals were passing others. The Commission addressed this by granting equity adjustments. As of 2014, there was a recommendation to review and see what changes could be made to address the problem. The first thing was to look at those who are hired in groups (Correctional Officers, EMT's, Fire Fighters, Paramedics and Police Officers). Because of the step pay structure, it is not easy to address. There were a number of alternatives, and what was proposed is to unstack these individuals by giving them an equivalent of an increment advance but staggered throughout the year so those who have waited the longest to get a step raise get the most benefit. Mr. Kennedy went on to say they had met with the FOP, Fire Fighters Association, SIEU, and the departments involved and were in agreement with the solution at this point.

(B) There was a letter received from Parks Director Tommy Lynch asking that the Park Rangers be reviewed. In 2012 an Audit was conducted by the HR Department on the salaries of Park Rangers /Park Police. HR recommended a salary grade for Park Police that was in the Public Safety Pay Plan. Metro Legal reviewed and said they could not be in the Public Safety Pay Plan because by Charter that is reserved for the employees of the Police and Fire Department. So eventually they got to the proposal to do the equivalent salary grade in SR by increasing the grades. In previous minutes, it appears that the Commission was sympathetic but changes in the pay scale are not appropriate in the middle of a budget year. The department requested to bump the current officers up and fit them into the pay scale when it opens again. Director Lynch is requesting that now, while the pay plan is open, could we implement the action of the Commission that was recommended in 2012. In 1986 there was a Charter referendum that separated the employees of Police and Fire into their own pay plan. Park Police are certified Law Enforcement Officers but have a limited jurisdiction. This will put these individuals closer to pay of Police employees but a little less.

This matter will be before the Commission for consideration at the last Special Called meeting on May 19th.

(C) When the Charter Amendment was passed in 1986 and the Police and Fire Pay Plan was created in 1987, we called it the Police and Fire Pay Plan. By 2001, Mercer was working with Human Resources and as part of the pay plan implementation the name of that plan was changed to Public Safety. This has caused some issues since, because many employees perform public safety functions, but cannot be paid under the Public Safety Pay Plan. For that reason, HR proposes to return to the name Police and Fire Pay Plan. This is just for a name change only.

Vice-Chairman Corbitt asked, and Mr. Kennedy confirmed that the proposed pay plan included a two and one half (2.5%) percent for all Metro employees. The pay plan also includes increments and Open Range. Commissioner Sanders said she appreciated all the hard work that has gone into the pay plan had a concern when we get to this point there is not enough time left before it goes to Council in order to make adjustments. She noted there was a concern with the two and one half (2.5%) percent across the board raise for those who are making \$100,000.00 and receiving a larger portion (\$2500.00) than the person who makes \$25,000.00 and receives a smaller increase (\$650.00). She suggested that some of the money used for across the board percentage increase for higher paid employees should be used to fund a higher percentage increase for lower paid. Most of the money is going to the higher paid employees. She also noted that there is compression throughout the pay structure that might be address by redistribution of available funds. Mr. Kennedy did not disagree but provided an explanation stating most of the higher paid employees are under the Open Range system and not on pay steps. A few years back before increments were frozen Open Range money was not available. So those employees were not receiving annual increases other than across the board when the lower paid employees continued to receive steps. During the recession, there were two years where the Commission granted bonuses in lieu of cost of living increases. Both of those bonuses were capped so that people at the lower level received the full impact of the bonuses and the upper pay scale was capped where upper range employees received a flat amount. When the pay plan was adjusted the first across the board increase after the recession, it was capped so that it was 4% for all the employees below SR12 and equivalent and SR13 and above was capped at two (2%) percent. Mr. Kennedy went on to say the upper range employees have been restricted and capped in their growth. It seems fairer this year to do an across the board increase since everyone suffered through a bad economy. The percentage is the same but not the dollars. The reason you do cost of living adjustments is to keep up with inflation. Chairman Farmer said if we did the two (2%) percent every year for everybody, in twenty years' time there would be an incredible gap between the highest paid and the lower paid.

Director Reibeiling said that if you lower the higher end to one (1%) percent or to whatever you wanted, the dollar amount saved is not going to have any appreciable impact on the rank and file because it's a much lower number than you have at the top. So there would not be a lot of money spread around. He went on further to say that they did as much as they could for as many as they could which was the concept behind this pay plan. Chairman Farmer asked how much effort would it take to look at this again saying one and one half (1.5%) percent for a certain number or three and one half (3.5%) percent for another. He asked the unions weighed in on this the concept of differential increase. Mr. Kennedy said that had not been discussed by him with anyone.

Chairman Farmer asked if there were any who wanted to speak on this matter. The following individuals came before the Commission to express their concerns on the pay plan:

Danny Hale, FOP
Ben Rodgers, Police Employee
Mark Naccarato, SEIU Local 205
Mark Young, Fire IFF– Local 140

Those listed above said the employees have made comments to the Union officials who passed those comments on to the Commission and asked them to consider keeping the two and one half (2.5%) percent as it has been presented. During his comment, Mr. Naccarato mentioned discussions about eliminating obsolete job titles.

Vice-Chairman Corbitt asked about the out dated job classifications. Mr. Kennedy said during the course of the pay plan review there were a number of positions identified that are no longer used. Mr. Kennedy some obsolete classification have been identified. If it's the Commission's will a list can be provided at the next meeting to show those classifications that will be deleted. Vice-Chairman Corbitt said that would be good.

ACTION: This was for a report only.

(7: Communiqués from the public on pending hearings

There were none.

ACTION: This was for a report only.

With nothing further, the regular meeting adjourned at 9:57 a.m.

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

**Veronica T. Frazier, Director
Secretary to the Commission**

**William H. Farmer, Chairman
Civil Service Commission**