

METROPOLITAN CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

MINUTES

April 9, 2019

8:30 a.m.

Howard Office Building Sonny West Room

700 2nd Avenue South Nashville, Tennessee 37210 **MEMBERS PRESENT**: Chairman William H. Farmer, Vice-Chairman R. Steve Corbitt, D. Billye Sanders, and Jo Ann North.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ethan Link

OTHER MEMBERS PRESENT: Shannon B. Hall, Metro Human Resources Director; Nicki Eke, Metro Legal Department Attorney

Chairman Farmer called the meeting to order and acknowledged the Union Representatives present for the FOP, IAFF, and SEIU. He then asked if there were any corrections or additions to the minutes of the last **Regular Meeting of March 12, 2019.** Commissioner Sanders requested to amend the minutes, seconded by Vice Chairman Corbitt, and the Commission approved by consent. Revisions were discussed, and then Chairman Farmer asked for a motion on the minutes. Commissioner Sanders moved to accept the regular minutes as amended. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

Appeals Process: Nicki Eke read the memorandum pertaining to the Metropolitan Code of Laws 2.68.030 – pursuant to Ordinance BL2006-2050.

APPOINTMENTS	PG. 2-4
TERMINATIONS / PENSIONS	PG. 4-5
ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT	PG. 5-6
DEPARTMENTAL ITEM	PG. 6
HUMAN RESOURCES ITEMS	PG. 6-9

APPOINTMENTS

NAME	CLASSIFICATION	TYPE	DATE	
EMERGENCY COMMUNICA	<u>TIONS</u>			
Howard, Autumn D. Moore, Norkeisha T.	Emer Telecomm Off 1 Emer Telecomm Off 4	Re-hire Re-Employment	03/16/19 03/26/19	
<u>FINANCE</u>				
Edwards, David A. McGuire, Sean P. Kawawa, Tadayoshi C.	Finance Admin Finance Asst Dir Management & Budget Analyst 2	Promotion Re-hire New Hire	03/11/19 02/27/19 03/18/19	
GENERAL SERVICES				
Emberton, Amber V. *Quinn, William J.	Admin Svcs Officer 3 General Services Assistant Dir	Promotion Department transfer/Promotic	03/11/19 n 03/18/19	
*Department Transfer from ITS (IS Division Mgr, OR10) to General Services (GS Asst Director, OR11)				

INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SERVICES

Hollis, Sheki J. Elliott, Steven B. *Ahmed, Momina E. Borja, Keith San Miguel	Information Sys App Anal 3 Information Sys Oper Anal 2 Information Sys Oper Analyst 1 Information Sys Oper Analyst 3	New Hire Promotion Transition - Civil Service Promotion	03/25/19 03/11/19 02/25/19 02/25/19
*Transition to CS from an NCS	S Position		
MUNICIPAL AUDITORIUM			
Harris, Donald G.	Admin Svcs Officer 2	New Hire	03/11/19
PARKS			
Doss, Demarkus A. Pittman, Barbara S.	Facilities Mgr Facilities Mgr	Promotion Promotion	03/08/19 03/08/19
Ernst, Michael D.	Maint & Repair Supv	Promotion	03/08/19
Hall, Kristen L. Nelson, Kristopher G.	Maintenance & Repair Worker Se Maintenance & Repair Worker Se	Promotion Promotion	03/08/19 03/08/19
			00/00/10
POLICE			
Beasley, Taylor Briana	Police Operations Asst 1	New Hire Re-hire	03/01/19 03/16/19
Bennett, Ashley Kristina *Coleman, Lawanna R.	Police Operations Coord 1 Professional Spec	Class Change/Lateral	03/16/19

*Class Change from Administrative Spec (ST11) to Professional Spec (OR4)

04/09/2019 - 3

APPOINTMENTS

NAME	CLASSIFICATION	TYPE	DATE
PUBLIC LIBRARY			
Johnson, Mark Wessels, Richard A. Gravert-Spitzer, Stephanie E.	Custodian Librarian 1 Office Support Rep 2	Re-hire Promotion New Hire	03/25/19 03/11/19 03/11/19
PUBLIC WORKS			
Dotye III, Christopher B. McGlother, Ronnie D. Nickens Jr, Steve D. Honeycutt, Jonathan A. York, Benjamin L. Beaty, David R.	Compliance Inspector 1 Compliance Inspector 1 Compliance Inspector 1 Engineer 3 Engineer 3 Maintenance & Repair Leader	Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion	03/11/19 03/11/19 03/11/19 02/25/19 02/25/19 03/11/19
<u>SHERIFF</u>			
*Adams, Katie M. *Adams, Toby W. *Amaniel, Feleg Y. *Atkins, Zachary T. *Beynon II, James H. *Bonds, Lasean M. *Busbin, Claudia R. *Clark, Andrew L. *Clark, Andrew L. *Cowins, Briana L. *Davis, Nicole E. *Diaz, Paul E. *Earls, Kenneth A. *Hines, Davinci M. *Jarosch, Nicholas J. *Jaffcoat, Cody J. *Laitis, Dylan J. *Ross, Jacob M. *Ross, Jacob M. *Ross, Jerrid A. *Ruluked, Alyson Hope *Stinnett, Deion K. *Wohrley Jr, David M. *Wright, Daniel R. Dale, Austin R.	Correctional Officer 1 Correctional Officer 1	Class Change Class Change	02/22/19 02/22/19
Dodson, Michael A. Gima, Gilbert J. D. McGrew, Breanna Nm Sturgeon Jr, Timothy E. Satterlee, Scott A.	Correctional Officer 2 Correctional Officer 2 Correctional Officer 2 Correctional Officer 2 Correctional Officer Sergeant	Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion	03/10/19 03/10/19 03/10/19 03/10/19 03/10/19 03/03/19

*Class Change from Correctional Officer Trainee to Correctional Officer 1

SOCIAL SERVICES

04/09/2019 - 4

APPOINTMENTS

NAME	CLASSIFICATION	TYPE	DATE
WATER SERVICES			
Plummer, Antonette M. Frye, Shannon R. *Ashford Jr, Walter P. Lockhart, Matthew I. Turner, Tracey C. Berry, Jamecia R. Catney, Chatique T. Ferguson, Jennifer L. Hunter, Jesse D. Lawrence, John R. Powell, Tarus B. Bates, Thomas J. Doss, Glen K. Blackwell Jr, Kevin D.	Admin Svcs Officer 4 Cust Svc Mgr Engineer 2 Envir Compliance Officer 1 Finance Officer 2 Office Support Rep 3 Office Support Rep 3 Office Support Rep 3 Treatment Plant Asst Mgr Treatment Plant Asst Mgr Treatment Plant Asst Mgr Treatment Plant Shift Supv Treatment Plant Supt Utility Compliance Inp 2	Promotion Promotion Class Change/Lateral New Hire Re-hire New Hire New Hire Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion Promotion	03/09/19 03/09/19 03/23/19 03/23/19 03/23/19 03/23/19 03/23/19 03/23/19 03/09/19 03/09/19 03/09/19 02/23/19 03/09/19 02/23/19

*Class Change from Admin Srvcs Mgr (OR 7) to Engineer 2 (OR7)

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner North moved for approval of the appointments as listed. Vice-Chairman Corbitt seconded, and the Commission approved without objection.

TERMINATIONS/ PENSIONS

NAME

CLASSIFICATION

DEPT

DATE

Coreno, Jesus R. Fortner, Charles A.	B
Kenderdine, Matthew G.	E
Weedman, Sara M.	Fi
Dobson, Will D.	Fi
Erdelyan, Michael W.	Fi Fi
Breedlove, Kenneth D.	
Stevens, Darryl G.	Fi Fi
Perry Jr, Walter E.	Fi
Young, Eileen E.	P
Fedor, Steven J.	
Luckado, Loretta	In
McPeak, Steven W. Brown, Brian G.	In
Warrick III, Henry C.	In
Talbot, Ann L.	C
Carroll, Nicholas	P
Dickall, Joshua W.	P
Downs, John M.	P
Fitzgerald, Eric F.	P
Helmintoller, Joseph F.	P
Johnson, Kevin P.	P
Maupin, Tyler G.	P
Neely Sr, John	P
Tolbert, Trevin J.	P
Desai, Amee Trushar	P
Wilbourn, Errikka S.	P
Sheffield, Robert S.	P
Jordan, Adrian D.	Ċ
	-

Beer Permit Inspector 1 Idg Inspector 2 mer Telecommunications Off 4 inance Officer 3 ire Captain ire Captain ire Engineer ire Engineer ire Fighter 3 ire Inspector 2 Paramedic 2 echnical Specialist 1 nformation Sys Oper Analyst 3 nformation Systems Advisor 1 nformation Systems Advisor 1 rime Laboratory Director Police Officer 2 Police Operations Asst 1 Police Operations Asst 1 olice Sergeant Circulation Asst 2

TYPE
Resignation
Pension
Resignation
Resignation
Pension
Resignation
Pension
Pension
Resignation
Pension
Resignation Pension
Resignation Resignation
Pension
Resignation
Resignation
Resignation
Pension
Resignation
. congriation

Beer Board	02/28/19
Codes Administration	03/13/19
DEC	03/14/19
Finance	03/01/19
Fire	02/18/19
Fire	03/04/19
Fire	02/27/19
Fire	03/12/19
Fire	02/26/19
Fire	02/28/19
Fire	03/14/19
General Services	03/15/19
ITS	03/22/19
ITS	03/05/19
ITS	03/20/19
Police	03/01/19
Police	02/27/19
Police	03/01/19
Police	03/05/19
Police	03/03/19
Police	02/28/19
Police	03/01/19
Police	03/01/19
Police	03/01/19
Police	02/28/19
Police	03/15/19
Police	02/22/19
Police	03/15/19
Public Library	02/28/19

TERMINATIONS/ PENSIONS

NAME	CLASSIFICATION	TYPE	DEPT	DATE
Garland, Leanne	Librarian 1	Pension	Public Library	03/22/19
Fisher, Elizabeth	Library Mgr 2	Pension	Public Library	03/01/19
Cremin, Bonnie E.	Office Support Rep 2	Resignation	Public Library	03/08/19
Gillson, Coty J.	Maintenance & Repair Worker	Resignation	Public Works	03/17/19
Morris, Justin L.	Maintenance & Repair Worker	Resignation	Public Works	03/01/19
Bodine III, Irving L.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	03/12/19
Brown, Jennifer E.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	02/26/19
Hamlet, John W.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	03/22/19
Robinson, Donavane N.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	03/01/19
Whitmore, Kristen M.	Correctional Officer 1	Resignation	Sheriff	03/08/19
Hoover, Amanda L.	Correctional Officer 2	Resignation	Sheriff	03/07/19
Fontaine, Michael W.	Customer Service Field Rep Sen	Pension	Water Services	03/22/19
Schutt, John L.	Indust Tech Master	Pension	Water Services	03/08/19
Mills, Timothy D.	Treatment Plant Tech 1	Resignation	Water Services	03/05/19
Sides, Nathan B.	Treatment Plant Tech 2	Resignation	Water Services	03/01/19
Williams, Marty R.	Utility Equipment Operator	Pension	Water Services	02/18/19
Dillard III, Joseph	Utility Maintenance Spec 2	Resignation	Water Services	02/28/19
Tisdale, Malcolm J.	Utility Maintenance Spec 2	Resignation	Water Services	03/22/19
Tate, Ray	Utility Maintenance Supv 1	Resignation	Water Services	03/01/19

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner North moved to accept the Termination/Pension report for the dates and reasons stated. Seconded by Vice-Chairman Corbitt, and the Commission approved without objection.

ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT

CLASSIFICATION	<u>DEPT</u>	<u>ON</u> LIST	<u>TYPE</u>	DATE	ESTABLISH/ ABOLISH
IS Communications Analyst 3 - Police/Video	Police	23	Open	03/01/19	E E
IS Advisor 1 - Police/Video Evidence Management	Police	33	Open	03/01/19	
Administrative Services Officer 2 - Events Coord	Mun Aud	76	Open	03/04/19	E E
Administrative Services Officer 4 - Home Buyout	Water	72	Open	03/05/19	
Accountant 2	Finance	42	Open	03/06/19	A
Office Support Specialist 2	Library	117	Open	03/06/19	A
Treatment Plant Superintendent	Water	1	Dept	03/06/19	E
Finance Manager - Accounts	Finance	4	Dept	03/07/19	E
Building Inspector 1	Codes	37	Cont	03/07/19	E
Engineering Technician Senior	PW	1	Dept	03/08/19	A
Emergency Telecommunications Officer 1	DEC	15	Cont	03/08/19	E
Administrative Services Officer 3 - eBid	Gen Serv	1	Dept	03/12/19	E
IS Advisor 1 - Linux Administrator	ITS	13	Open	03/15/19	Α
Customer Service Supervisor - Field Activities	Water	2	Dept	03/18/19	A
Application Technician 2 - Accounting	Parks	4	Metro Wide	03/18/19	E
IS Applications Technician 2	Police	24	Open	03/20/19	A
Facility Coordinator - Regional Recreation Center	Parks	27	Open	03/20/19	A
IS Advisor 2 - Database Administration Lead	ITS	1	Dept	03/21/19	E
Security Guard	Library	97	Open	03/21/19	E E
Admin Services Officer 4/Fiscal	Police	4	Dept	03/22/19	
Maintenance & Repair Supervisor - Signals/Signs	PW	7	Dept	03/22/19	E E
Correctional Officer Trainee	Sheriff	29	Cont	03/25/19	Е
Program Specialist 3	Soc Serv	120	Open	03/25/19	Е
IS Applications Analyst 3 - CityWorks	ITS	18	Open	03/25/19	E E
IS Applications Analyst 3 - Kronos	ITS	13	Öpen	03/25/19	Е
Police Officer Trainee	Police	57	Cont	03/27/19	E

ELIGIBILITY REGISTER REPORT

CLASSIFICATION	<u>DEPT</u>	ON LIST	<u>TYPE</u>	DATE	ESTABLISH/ ABOLISH
IS Manager - Police/IT	Police	4	Dept	03/27/19	Е
Industrial Electronics Technician 1	Water	13	Open	03/28/19	E
Police Operations Coordinator 2 - Youth Services	Police	5	Dept	03/28/19	E
IS Advisor 1 - Police/IT	Police	5	Dept	03/28/19	E
IS Media Analyst 3 - Police/IT	Police	4	Dept	03/28/19	E
Maintenance & Repair Worker	PW	180	Cont	03/28/19	E
Sanitation Worker	PW	231	Cont	03/29/19	E
Administrative Services Officer 3 - Meter Shop	PW	4	Dept	03/29/19	E

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner North moved to approve the register report. Seconded by Vice-Chairman Corbitt, and the Commission approved without objection.

DEPARTMENTAL ITEM

PUBLIC WORKS

(1: Director Mark Sturtevant requests an Open Range Increase for Engineer 3, Jeffrey Campbell

Public Works Human Resources Manager Charles Boddie and Human Resources Analyst Monica Anderson were present before the Commission to discuss the request.

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner Sanders moved to approve the request for an Open Range Increase. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

HUMAN RESOURCES

Human Resources Director, Shannon B. Hall, submits the following for the Commission's consideration and appropriate action:

(2: Review of Memorandum and Order Remanding Case to Civil Service Commission - Anthony Venable, Police Dismissal

Anthony Venable, his representation David Raybin, and Cyndi Gross, representing Metro Nashville Police Department, were present before the Commission to discuss the Initial Order.

ACTION: After some discussion, the Commission requested counsel each submit a proposed order along with a memorandum on adoption of the order by the Civil Service Commission. The proposed orders shall be submitted to the Civil Service Commission by May 6, 2019 to be reviewed at the May 14, 2019 Civil Service Commission Meeting.

(3: Metro Police Department employee, Sam Galluzzi, is requesting to extend his IOD time in accordance with Civil Service Rule 4.8 D Period of Compensation

Mr. Galuzzi and Human Resources Analyst Seth Waltenbaugh were present before the Commission to discuss the request.

MOTION: After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to approve the request to extend Mr. Galluzzi's IOD time until June 21, 2019. Seconded by Commissioner Sanders, and the Commission approved without objection.

(4: Pay Plan Adjustments for Fiscal Year 2020

Human Resources Assistant Director Mike Taylor and Human Resources Analyst Leslie Schuster were present before the Commission and discussed the Pay Plan Adjustments.

Later the Commission invited IAFF Representative Mark Young, FOP President James Smallwood, and SEIU Representative Mark Naccarato to come before them to speak on behalf of employees impacted by the proposed pay plan. The Unions confirmed having met, conferred, and provided input on the proposed pay plan with Human Resources. The IAFF stated an interest in Human Resources updating the list of comparable cities, that cost of living is a factor, and the belief they would see that approach going forward. The SEIU stated overall support for the efforts being made toward the E9-1-1 staff and achieving gender equity in clerical positions. They looked forward to seeing more progress on cost of living. Further stating anything Metro, the Civil Service Commission, and Council Members can do to lift up the people that work for the city to stay living in the city would be greatly appreciated. Ultimately, the SEIU supports the Mayor and Council adopting the pay plan and three percent COLA. The FOP stated appreciation for the three percent cost of living adjustment in the proposed pay plan and requested that, at some point, the three percent that was not fulfilled last year be fulfilled. The FOP was unable to support the proposed pay plan due to turnover concerns. The FOP stated salary adjustments have been made for starting positions, but not for other positions. The FOP stated a lack of support from the public and maintaining staff are local and national issues making the job more difficult; officers are being given more responsibilities and are not being paid a commensurate salary. The FOP also supports updating the list of comparable cities to ensure we are in line with market values so we may attract and maintain the best candidates.

Assistant Director Taylor stated Human Resources studied the surrounding counties and peer cities which supported the salary adjustments made for starting positions. The studies also show we are within market for the other positions.

Chairman Farmer asked for the factors of a peer city. Is it population, income level, economic growth, employment rate? Are peer cities reviewed each year? Are we considering removing some of them?

Assistant Director Taylor stated you are correct regarding the factors. In order to maintain consistency, peer cities are not reviewed annually, and we still consider the current ones peers based on size and population. We are a metropolitan form of government, but many of our peers are city/county, such as Atlanta/Fulton County and Memphis/Shelby County. We can add some of the cities recommended by Police and Fire and will bring the revised list to the Commission in the first of July.

Commissioner North stated an observation that all Metro employees are going to continue to get farther and farther behind when they don't get what they're promised. That's happened several times.

Chairman Farmer commended the Union Representatives on their lobbying efforts. The Commission is very supportive of fair and full pay for all Metro employees but does not control the budget. Union Representatives were encouraged to continue their obligatory efforts with the understanding that the Commission would, within their abilities, support those efforts.

ACTION: This was for a report only.

(5: Requesting approval to conduct a Benefit Board Election for General Government representative on May 23, 2019

Human Resources Analyst Seth Waltenbaugh was present before the Commission.

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner Sanders moved to approve the election to be held May 23, 2019. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

(6: Administrative Law Judge Hearing Calendar

The calendar refers to appeals submitted by Metro employees. As changes occur, updates are made each month in conjunction with the assigned Attorneys at Metro Legal. A copy is then forwarded to the State Administrative Procedures Division wherein the State provides a copy for each Judge to evaluate their case.

ACTION: This was for a report only.

(7: Human Resources Updates

March 12, Human Resources staff coordinated a Postsecondary Education Fair for Metro Employees at Lentz Health Center.

HR Director Hall shared an overview of efforts and progress in the establishment and recruitment process of the Community Oversight Board.

HR Director Hall highlighted a ceremony at Centennial Park on March 29, honoring children who lost their lives to violence in 2017 and 2018. The event was hosted by Metro Government along with You Have the Power, founded by Andrea Conte. Mayor David Briley, District Attorney Glenn Funk, and Police Chief Steve Anderson participated, along with Ms. Conte, and Human Resources Analyst Tam Gordon lent support to the effort.

ACTION: This was for a report only.

(8: Communiqués from the public on pending hearings

There were none.

-The meeting adjourned for a brief recess, and then resumed with the following items which were not aired on the Metro Nashville Network.-

(9: Appeal of Medical Disqualification: AB, Applicant for Fire Recruit

Applicant AB and Civil Service Medical Examiner Gill Wright were present before the Commission to discuss the appeal. The Civil Service Medical Examiner recommended approval of the appeal.

MOTION: After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to approve the request for a waiver. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

(10: Appeal of Medical Disgualification: BB, Applicant for Fire Recruit

Applicant BB and Civil Service Medical Examiner Gill Wright were present before the Commission to discuss the appeal. The Civil Service Medical Examiner recommended approval of the appeal.

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner Sanders moved to approve the request for a waiver. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

(11: Appeal of Medical Disqualification: JC, Applicant for Fire Recruit

Applicant JC and Civil Service Medical Examiner Gill Wright were present before the Commission to discuss the appeal. The Civil Service Medical Examiner recommended approval of the appeal.

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner Sanders moved to approve the request for a waiver. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

(12: Appeal of Medical Disqualification: WH, Applicant for Fire Recruit

Applicant WH, Fire Human Resources Manager Jamie Summers, and Civil Service Medical Examiner Gill Wright were present before the Commission to discuss the appeal. The Civil Service Medical Examiner recommended denial of the appeal.

MOTION: After some discussion, Commissioner North moved to deny the request for a waiver. Seconded by Commissioner Sanders, and the Commission approved without objection.

(13: Appeal of Medical Disqualification: SS, Applicant for Fire Recruit

Applicant SS and Civil Service Medical Examiner Gill Wright were present before the Commission to discuss the appeal. The Civil Service Medical Examiner recommended denial of the appeal.

MOTION: After some discussion and by consent, the Commission deferred the request for a waiver for one month.

(14: Appeal of Medical Disqualification: ZA, Applicant for Fire Recruit

Applicant ZA and Civil Service Medical Examiner Gill Wright were present before the Commission to discuss the appeal. The Civil Service Medical Examiner recommended approval of the appeal.

MOTION: After some discussion, Vice-Chairman Corbitt moved to approve the request for a waiver. Seconded by Commissioner North, and the Commission approved without objection.

With nothing further, the regular meeting adjourned at 10:38 a.m.

ATTEST:

APPROVED:

Shannon B. Hall, Director Secretary to the Commission William H. Farmer, Chairman Civil Service Commission