DAVID BRILEY MAYOR

METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT O

OVERNMENT OF NASHVIELE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

### METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) RECORD OF DECISION

July 17, 2019

MNPS Bransford Board Room, 2601 Bransford Av

2:00 p.m.

Menié Bell, Chair Cyril Stewart, Vice-Chair

LaDonna Boyd Kaitlyn Jones Leigh Fitts Elizabeth Mayhall Ben Mosley David Price Brian Tibbs

Tim Walker

Executive Director, Metro Historical Commission and Metro Historic Zoning Commission

**Robin Zeigler** Historic Zoning Administrator, Metro Historic Zoning Commission

> Metro Historic Zoning Commission 3000 Granny White Pike, Nashville, TN 37204 615-862-7970 615-862-7974, fax <u>www.nashville.gov/mhc</u> histlap1@nashville.gov

**Notice to Public** Please remember to turn off your cell phones.

The Metro Historical Commission does not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, age, religion, creed or disability in access to, or operation of its programs, services, activities or in its hiring or employment practices. **ADA inquiries should be forwarded to:** Paula Person, Metro Historical Commission ADA Compliance Coordinator, 3000 Granny White Pike, Nashville, TN 37204, (615) 862-7970. **Title VI inquiries should be forwarded to:** Ms. Shirley Sims-Saldana, Title VI Coordinator, Human Relations, 800 Second Avenue, South, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, Nashville, TN 37210, (615) 880-3391. **Contact Department of Human Resources for all employment related inquiries** at (615) 862-6640.

# **ABOUT THE COMMISSION**

The Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission (MHZC) is an architectural review board which reviews applications for work on properties that are within a Historic Overlay and makes recommendations to Metro Council on designation of Historic Overlays. Its nine volunteer members, appointed by the mayor and confirmed by Metro Council, include representatives from zoning districts, the Metropolitan Planning Commission, the Metropolitan Historical Commission; architect(s), and other citizens of Davidson County.

Agendas and Staff Reports can be viewed online at <u>http://www.nashville.gov/Historical-</u> <u>Commission/About/Historic-Zoning-Commission/Meeting-Information</u> the Friday before the meeting.

Meetings may be viewed live on Channel 3 or at an alternative time on Metro's YouTube channel.

# COMMUNICATING WITH THE COMMISSION

Because the MHZC is a quasi-judicial body members are not permitted to discuss specific cases outside of a public hearing. For more information about a case or to submit comments to the commission before the meeting, please send to MHZC staff at least one day prior to the meeting. Comments received the day of the meeting may not be received in time to be shared with the Commission. Only materials that further explain the project will be accepted at the meeting, please provide 11 copies. New or alternate designs will not be accepted at the meeting.

All meetings are open to the public and the public is invited to give testimony at the meetings. For advice on addressing the Commission, please see "How the Meeting Works" at the end of this agenda.

# AFTER THE MEETING

Decisions: The Commission generally meets the third Wednesday of each month. The decision on all cases before the Commission and minutes from the prior month, if ratified by the Commission, will be posted online the Friday after the meeting. All permits for work authorized by the MHZC must be obtained within 2 years of the date of the board's approval.

Appeal: Pursuant to the provisions of § 2.68.030 of the Metropolitan Code of Laws, the MHZC's decisions may be appealed to the Chancery Court of Davidson County or the Circuit Court of Davidson County via a statutory writ of certiorari. If you choose to appeal, you are advised to seek your own independent legal counsel to ensure that your appeal is filed in a timely manner and that all procedural requirements are met. You should also seek independent legal advice regarding the applicability of the writ of certiorari to the specific decision of the Historic Zoning Commission.

## METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) AGENDA

## July 17, 2019MNPS Bransford Board Room, 2601 Bransford Ave2:00 p.m.

## I. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC: Items on the agenda may be removed or moved at this time.

## II. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

## III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. June 19, 2019 DECISION: APPROVED

## IV. CONSENT AGENDA

**NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC:** Items on the Consent Agenda will be voted on at a single time. No individual public hearing will be held, nor will the Commission debate these items unless a member of the audience or the Commission requests that the item be removed from the Consent Agenda. Items pulled from the consent agenda will be heard at the end of the agenda.

## b. 1405 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction—Addition Council District: 06 Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, <u>melissa.baldock@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039071

### c. 3700 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination Council District: 24 Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, <u>melissa.baldock@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039090

## d. 1815 SWEETBRIAR AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding (DADU) Council District: 18 Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, <u>melissa.baldock@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039075 and T2019039084

## e. 1925 19TH AVE S

Application: New Construction--Addition; Partial Demolition Council District: 18 Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, <u>Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039505

## f. 2038 ELLIOTT AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition Council District: 17 Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov PermitID#: T2019039541

## g. 901 MERIDIAN ST

Application:Planning Commission Recommendation for SP RevisionCouncil District:05Overlay:Historic Landmark Zoning OverlayProject Lead:Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

## h. 320 44<sup>th</sup> AVE N

Application:Planning Commission Review Regarding a Neighborhood LandmarkCouncil District:24Overlay:Park & Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning OverlayProject Lead:Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

### i. 1222 VILLA PL

Application:New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback DeterminationCouncil District:17Overlay:Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning OverlayProject Lead:Sean Alexander, sean.alexander@nashville.govPermitID#:T2019040282 and T2019040283

# DECISION: ALL ITEMS ON CONSENT APPROVED WITH THEIR APPLICABLE CONDITIONS

## V. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

None

## VI. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS

The items below were deferred at a previous MHZC meeting at the request of the applicant.

## j. 1309 WOODLAND ST

Application:New Construction—Outbuilding/Detached Accessory Dwelling UnitCouncil District:06Overlay:Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning OverlayProject Lead:Melissa BaldockMelissa BaldockMelissa.Baldock@nashville.govPermitID#:T2019033833DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

## k. 300 BROADWAY

Application:Violation; Alterations-Exterior LightingCouncil District:19Overlay:Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning OverlayProject Lead:Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.govDEFERRED AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

## VII. PRELIMARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

## VIII. VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/ SHOW CAUSE

### I. 1207 DALLAS AVE

Application: Violation/Show Cause; New Construction--Addition and Outbuilding Council District: 18 Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Sean Alexander, <u>sean.alexander@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: 2018070250 DECISION: DEFERRED

### m. 1000 PARIS AVE

Application: Violation; New Construction--Addition Council District: 17 Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Sean Alexander, <u>sean.alexander@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: 20190040012 DEFERRED AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

# IX. MHZC ACTIONS

## n. 1823 5<sup>TH</sup> AVE N

Application: New Construction--Addition and Outbuildings; Partial Demolition Council District: 19 Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid <u>Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039524 and T2019039532 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

## o. 218 MOCKINGBIRD ROAD

Application: New Construction—Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (DADU); Setback determination
Council District: 24
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Paul Hoffman paul.hoffman@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019039587
DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS
p. 1606 16TH AVE S

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback determination Council District: 17 Overlay: South Music Row Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, <u>melissa.baldock@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039090 and T2019039294 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

### q. 2137 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill Council District: 18 Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov PermitID#: T2019039621 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

### r. 0 [1210] STRATFORD AVE

Application: New Construction--Infill and Outbuilding Council District: 07 Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Sean Alexander, <u>sean.alexander@nashville.gov</u> PermitID#: T2019039976 DEFERRED AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

## s. 712 FATHERLAND STREET

Application: New Construction; Detached Accessory Dwelling Structure Council District: 06 Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov PermitID#: T2019040213 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

## t. 1506 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction – Infill Council District: 06 Overlay: Lockeland Springs – East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov Permit ID#: T2019039619 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

## u. 1110 A MONTROSE AVE

Application: Demolition, New Construction; Infill Council District: 17 Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov PermitID#: T2019039622 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

#### v. 1112 A MONTROSE AVE

Application: Demolition, New Construction; Infill Council District: 17 Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov PermitID#: T2019039625 DECISION: APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

## X. OTHER BUSINESS

## a. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS & UPDATES

## **b.** ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

## HOW DOES THE MEETING WORK?

The Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission meeting is open to the public. Please turn off all cell-phones. Each case follows this format:

a. Staff will make a presentation about each project up for consideration and provide an analysis on how it does or does not meet the design guidelines.

b. The applicant will have the opportunity to present (up to **ten minutes**) and answer questions of the Commission. The applicant may reserve two minutes of the ten to rebut public comment.

c. The public will have **two minutes** each to comment on the application. Someone representing an organization may have **five minutes** if written notice is received no later than the day prior to the meeting day. Please state your name and address for the record before making your comments. Please be sure to direct all comments to the microphone so that they are a part of the official record.

d. The applicant has the option of responding to public comments, once all have been made, and if the full ten minutes was not used.

e. After all public comments, the Chair will close the "public hearing" which means there is no more opportunity for public or applicant comments, unless the Commission invites either back.

f. The Commission will make a decision which could be to approve, disapprove, or approve with conditions. The applicant may also request that a decision be postponed.

g. Appeals to decisions of the MHZC may be taken to a court of competent jurisdiction as provided for by law.

h. If the project is approved or approved with conditions, the applicant will receive a permit. If the project is disapproved, the applicant will receive a notice of decision. Any project may be revised and resubmitted for a new review. The exact same project disapproved may not be resubmitted for review.

i. A building permit may be necessary for the proposed project. Preservation Permits are not a substitute to a building permit. Contact Metro Department of Codes Administration, Howard School Building, 800 2nd Avenue South. (615) 862-6500 (615) 862-6514 fax.

# HINTS FOR PREPARING FOR THE MEETING

## If you are NOT the applicant:

• Copies of the staff recommendations are available online prior to the meeting.

• Comments on any agenda item can be mailed, hand-delivered, faxed, or emailed to the MHZC by the end of the day prior to the day of the meeting. Written comments can also be brought to the MHZC for distribution during the public hearing. Please provide 12 copies of any correspondence brought to the meeting. Mailing Address: MHZC, 3000 Granny White Pike, Nashville, TN 37204 Fax: (615) 862-7974 E-mail: historicalcommission@nashville.gov

• Anyone can speak before the Commission during a public hearing. Representatives of neighborhood groups or other organizations may speak for five minutes if written notice is received no later than the day prior to the meeting day. Councilmembers may speak at the beginning of the meeting, after an item is presented by staff, or during the public hearing on that Item, with no time limit.

## If you are the applicant:

• Copies of the staff recommendations are available online prior to the meeting. Review it and contact your project lead with any questions you may have.

• Applicants may speak for ten minutes, with the option of reserving two minutes for rebuttal after public comments are complete. The Commission will not review new information but you are welcome to bring items that further illustrate what is proposed such as photographs, models, or additional drawings. If you plan to make an electronic presentation, the presentation must be sent to the lead staff member listed on the agenda, at least the day before the meeting.