

JOHN COOPER
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

MINUTES April 22, 2020

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Bell, Vice-chair Stewart, Leigh Fitts, Kaitlyn Jones, Elizabeth Mayhall, Ben Mosley, David Price, Brian Tibbs

Zoning Staff: Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Alex Dickerson (legal counsel)

Applicants: Nathan Lyons, Kaitlyn Smous, Brian Layton, Marcia Truitt, Kara Jacobs, Edward Smith, Tony Giarratana, Natasha Corrieri

Councilmembers: Brett Witherse

Public: Paula Middlebrooks, Karin Kaladimos, Ann Butterworth

Chairperson Bell called the meeting to order at 2:00p.m. She explained that out of an abundance of caution, and pursuant to recommendations from federal, state and local health agencies regarding avoiding group gatherings due to the COVID-19 Coronavirus this meeting is a teleconference meeting. Advance public comments have been possible through email, mail, fax and voicemail and will be read or played at the time of their relevant case. We will also take comments via phone. The number is 629-255-1910. Please do not call until the project you wish to speak about is announced.

Chairperson Bell confirmed the commissioners in attendance.

Legal counsel, Mr. Dickerson, explained two additional motions needed for the virtual meeting.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved that the meeting agenda constitutes essential business of this body and meeting electronically is necessary to protect the health, safety, and welfare of Tennesseans in light of the COVID-19 outbreak. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Motion:

Commissioner Tibbs moved that any rules or procedures of MHZC that are in conflict with the Governor's executive order prohibiting electronic meetings are hereby suspended until such time as the executive order expires. Commissioner Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chairperson Bell read information regarding appeals and public comment.

I. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC: Items on the agenda may be removed or moved at this time.

Ms. Zeigler noted that the applicant for 1401 Roberts removed the item from the agenda, the applicant for 722 McFerrin requested deferral and staff recommends deferral of the design guideline consolidation project until the commission can meet again in-person.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

a. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR TWO MONTHS

b. 1236 RIVERWOOD DR

Application: New Construction--Addition
Council District: 07
Overlay: Eastdale Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020020519

c. 3621 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill and Outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020021030 and T2020021032

d. 107 LINDSLEY PARK DR

Application: New Construction--Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander sean.alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020021176

e. 2111 NATCHEZ TRACE (deferred from March)

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020013742

f. 2404 BLAIR BLVD (deferred from March)

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020013753

Ms. Sajid, staff member, read the items on consent. There were no requests to remove items from the consent agenda.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve all cases with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

III. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

g. 421 CHURCH STREET

Application: Historic Landmark
Council District: 19
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

Staff member, Melissa Baldock presented the case for Landmarking of 421 Church Street. Also known as the Cohen Building, 421 Church Street, was constructed in 1905, for Meyer and George Etta Cohen. The architect of record

was James Yeaman, best known for being the architect of the Holly Street Fire Hall. However, George Etta Cohen, an avid artist and art collector, likely had a hand in the design of the building as well, as a newspaper article from the time notes that she drew designs that Yeaman translated into architectural drawings.

The top two floors of the building were the home of Meyer and George Etta Cohen, while the ground floor was rented out as a storefront. Later in life, after Meyer's death, George Etta Cohen donated her estate, including 421 Church Street and her remarkable art collection, to Peabody College, which constructed the Cohen Memorial building with the donation.

The building's Neoclassical Revival style architecture is remarkably intact, and the building is significant for both its architecture and its connection to the Cohens.

The Cohen Building meets the National Register of Historic Places criteria A, B, and C. The Cohen building is therefore eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

As an eligible building, the property meets standard numbers 1, 2, 3, and 5 of 17.36.12. Staff suggests that the Metro Historic Zoning Commission recommend approval of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council and the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations. Staff finds that the building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and therefore meets the requirements of section 17.36.120.

Ms. Baldock explained that the applicant would not be presenting but is in full support of the designation, as is the councilmember.

Ms. Zeigler read into the records comments from Paula Middlebrooks, 239 5th Ave North:

I wanted to submit a comment regarding the proposed Historic Landmark Overlay to the Cohen Building (421 Church Street) as I will not be able to attend the public meeting.

I am in full support and favor of this designation. I live downtown near the Cohen Building and enjoy it's beauty nearly every day and am thrilled this designation is being pursued to support keeping the historical integrity of the building.

No other comments were received and there were no callers. The applicant stated prior to the meeting that they did not need to rebut public comment.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to recommend approval of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council, finding the building standard numbers 1, 2, 3, and 5 of 17.36.12; and approval of the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations. Commissioner Tibbs seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

[This item was re-heard at the end of the hearing. It was approved a second time.]

h. CONSOLIDATION OF NEIGHBORHOOD CONSERVATION ZONING OVERLAY

Deferred until the commission is able to meet in person.

IV. PRELIMINARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

i. 1716 GREENWOOD (deferred from March)

Application: Alterations; New Construction--Infill (Final SP Review)

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2020008160

Melissa Baldock, staff member, presented the case for 1716 Greenwood. 1716 Greenwood is the former Hobson Church site. The property includes two historic churches, connected by a non-historic connector; an historic brick bungalow; and two non-historic outbuildings.

In May 2015, MHZC approved a preliminary SP for alterations to the historic buildings and the construction of three infill houses facing Greenwood Avenue and seven infill houses located off of Chapel Avenue. The SP has been approved by Council and this is the final SP review of the final design features.

Alterations to the Hobson Church include partial demolition of some the foundation stone on the Chapel Avenue façade. On this facade, the applicant intends to reduce the level of the grade by about three feet (3') to create door openings out of existing window openings at the raised basement level.

They are also intending to combine the window openings to make them larger door opening. Staff finds the removal of this stone to be inappropriate. Although staff is supportive of elongating the existing windows to make them doors, staff recommends that the stone between the openings remain. Staff recommends that the applicant submit a more detailed drawing of the platform feature on the Chapel façade.

The 2015 SP allowed for three detached houses to be constructed in between the church and the bungalow and for seven detached houses to be constructed off of Chapel Avenue along a new road/driveway. These infill houses have height, scales, and setbacks that meet the SP and design guidelines, and the infills materials and design details also meet the design guidelines.

Staff recommends approval of the final SP plans with the conditions noted in the staff recommendation.

Nathan Lyons, the owner and developer, stated that he had worked with architect Blake Daniels on this project and that they were in agreement with the staff recommendations.

Ms. Zeigler read a letter of support for the project from Councilman Brett Withers, who was unable to attend the meeting.

I had meant to participate electronically in today's Metro Historic Zoning Commission meeting but unfortunately my work schedule will not permit that. I did want to write to the Commissioners to express my support for the staff recommendations for the 1716 Greenwood Ave proposal for the historic Hobson Methodist Church campus.

Before running for Metro Council I had served as the Eastwood Neighbors president for five years from 2010-2014. During that time we entertained three adaptive reuse proposals for this historic church campus. The first two proposals were rejected both by the neighborhood association as well as by the church congregation. We were then delighted to work with an East Nashville neighbor on a third proposal which is reflected in the version of the plans that are before the Commission today. Those plans were finalized through extensive community meetings in 2014 and were approved by the Metro Council in 2015 at around the same time that NashvilleNext was adopted.

While sometimes neighborhood groups are apprehensive about commercial uses in the middle of the neighborhood, the Eastwood neighbors felt that office uses would be low-impact and provide the best opportunities for respecting the historic interiors as well as exteriors of the two principal buildings and also expressed support for adding some light retail or coffee/food service options within walking distance of many neighbors' homes.

The original purchaser ultimately had to sell the property and the state of disrepair of the historic buildings became a renewed concern. We were again relieved when this applicant recently purchased the property and continued with those adaptive reuse plans that had already been vetted and enjoyed community support.

While some of the new-construction residential dwelling units are a little bit taller than what would typically be supported by the Eastwood neighborhood or approved by the Commission, the neighborhood felt at the time in 2014/2015 that having a smaller number of residential units would create the least impact on the community and we also recognized that this campus is quite large and these structures will stand at some distance apart from other historic homes in the neighborhood.

I support the staff recommendations for this proposal to ensure that finishing touches are of highest quality and respect these historic neighborhood landmark structures' integrity. Thank you for your consideration and for serving our county under the present circumstances.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved to approve the final SP plans with the following conditions:

- 1. The stone between the windows at the church's basement-level be retained and the width of these window remain unchanged;**
- 2. The applicant submit more information on the platform to be constructed on the right side of the church;**
- 3. Staff approve a stone sample for the foundation on the historic church, all windows and doors, the roof shingle colors, and brick samples prior to purchase and installation;**
- 4. Lap siding have a maximum reveal of five inches (5"); and**
- 5. Staff approve the location of mechanicals and utilities;**

finding that the project to meet the design guidelines for new construction in the Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

IV. VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/ SHOW CAUSE

j. 1315 GARTLAND AVE

Application: Show Cause; New Construction-Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Paul Hoffman paul.hoffman@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2019058323

Staff member Melissa Sajid presented the case. 1315 Gartland is a Show Cause hearing for a side dormer that was constructed differently than permitted. In September 2019, MHZC staff issued Preservation Permit 2019-058323 for construction of a rear addition and a side dormer on the building's west side. The dormer was approved with its ridge height and eave height in line with the existing dormer on that side.

As constructed, the dormer is taller than the historic dormer, a condition that is not present on this or similar historic houses. The inappropriate size of the dormer is accentuated due to its location on the historic roof form and its proximity to the historic dormer.

Staff recommends that the new dormer be reconstructed to match the dormer permitted by the original Preservation Permit, within sixty days (60) of the date of this hearing, or removed and the original roof repaired within sixty days (60) of the date of this hearing.

Kaitlyn Smous, architect for the project, said the lot is located on the corner of Gartland and 14th and is the primary home for the Corrieris. It has an existing non-historic small rear addition with unused attic space. The owners wanted to add space without adding footprint, preserving outdoor lot space, while keeping the historic integrity of the house intact. The architect and owners decided to renovate the first floor and add a new roofline over the rear of the house to take advantage of as much second-floor space as possible while maintaining the existing footprint of the home.

The attic was uninhabited and difficult to access while the architects were measuring) the home and they were not able to accurately measure the existing historic dormers. The architect used scaled objects from photos to try to determine the size of those dormers as accurately as possible. Because of this, the dormers were drawn approximately 10.5” too tall. Historic approved the new dormer because it was drawn to match the existing dormers. Once the team began construction on the new dormer, accurate field measurements revealed the 10.5” discrepancy. The Codes Inspector informed us that a shower needs a 7’-0” tall wall in order to pass Metro Codes.

As the floor plan demonstrates, every square foot is smartly allocated on the 2nd floor in order to not expand the home’s footprint. This dormer is the least intrusive and most hidden location for a shower.

This dormer as built still aligns with the exterior wall of the historic dormer and is the same width and form. It is smaller than the new dormers built at the rear of the house. It is also located on the West side of the house, or facing the house next door rather than 14th.

The owners are trying very hard to create a minimal impact on the historic house. They are reusing wood siding salvaged from the home, historic windows in both the first and second floor, interior wood casings, mouldings and interior doors, and supplementing with historic French doors from the Nashville Governor’s Mansion. Historic preservation has been a major consideration for the remodel of this primary residence for the Corrieris. The architect and clients have worked very hard and sacrificed ‘large’ spaces and sometimes easier answers to floor plan challenges by foregoing a potential addition. The clients chose to work within the parameters of the existing floor plan to get the space needed without adding any footprint to this beautiful home.

Determining that the dormer must be shorter means that the home cannot have a shower in this new master suite. The exterior impact is minimal while the interior impact is significant. Thank you for your time and contribution to preserving Nashville’s historic neighborhoods.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Jones stated that she understands the intent, but that the dormer was not constructed according to the plans and that she agreed with staff’s findings.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved that the new dormer be reconstructed to match the dormer permitted by the original Preservation Permit, within sixty days (60) of the date of this hearing, or be removed and the original roof repaired within sixty days (60) of the date of this hearing. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

[This case was re-heard at the end of the hearing. The final motion did not change.]

V. MHZC ACTIONS

k. 903 CARUTHERS (deferred from March)

Application: Demolition; New Construction--Infill and Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead:Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2020014972

Ms. Baldock explained the project is to demolish a non-contributing house and to construct a 2-story house with a 2-story DADU. With the conditions noted in the staff recommendation, Staff recommended approval.

The applicant, Brian Layton spoke to say that he agreed with the conditions outlined by staff and that he was available to the Commission to answer any questions.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

1. **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
2. **The front porch steps be concrete, stone, or wood;**
3. **Staff recommends approval of a masonry sample, the roof shingle color, the metal roof design and color, the front porch steps, walkway, and all windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;**
4. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.**

With these conditions, staff finds that the project meets Sections III. and V. of the Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay and 17.16.030.G., the DADU ordinance. Commissioner Tibbs seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

l. 1521 WOODLAND (deferred from March)

Application: New Construction--Infill and Outbuilding (DADU); Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2020013760 and T2020013766

Melissa Sajid, staff member, explained the application to construct one and one-half story infill and outbuilding on a vacant lot. The infill requires a side setback determination from twenty feet (20') to ten feet (10'), and the outbuilding requires a setback determination from twenty feet (20') to fourteen feet, six inches (14'-6"), both from the North 16th Street property line. The outbuilding will include a dwelling unit.

The proposed infill meets all of the design guidelines for infill including height and scale and setback and rhythm of spacing with the proposed setback determination on the side street. Here are the left side and rear elevations. The proposed DADU meets the design guidelines as well. Staff recommended approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding and setback determinations with the conditions outlined in the staff recommendation.

The applicant, Marcia Truitt, said that she was in agreement with the conditions outlined by staff.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Fitts reminded the Commission that this is a revision of a previously reviewed project. She thanked the applicant for the re-design and said that she found the new design to meet the guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Stewart moved to recommend approval with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
 2. **The front setback shall be consistent with the historic house at 1519 Woodland Street, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
 3. **Staff approve the final selections of the roof color, windows, doors, garage door, doors, garage door, walkway, and driveway material prior to purchase and installation;**
 4. **Staff approve brick and stone samples for color, dimensions, and texture prior to purchase and installation; and**
 5. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house;**
- finding that with these conditions the project meets II.B of the *Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation District: Handbook and Design Guidelines*. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

m. 922 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020020528

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the case for a second-story rear addition that will not increase the footprint. No other changes to the historic house are proposed with this application. The applicant requests to clad the addition in vinyl siding to match the existing material on the house. While the house currently has vinyl siding, this is not an historic material and is specifically not allowed by the design guidelines in Section III.D.1.a.

Since the siding on the house is not proposed to be replaced as a part of this project, the existing vinyl siding may remain; however, the materials for the proposed new construction must meet the design guidelines

As proposed, the addition will set in one foot (1') from the side wall, not the two feet (2') required for two-story additions by the design guidelines. The two foot (2') inset not only helps to identify the new construction from the historic house but also helps to mitigate the visual impact created by the potentially incompatible massing of a two-story eave on a house that is characterized by single-story eaves. Staff finds that an upper-level addition could be appropriate in this case as long as the addition is set in two feet (2') from the wall below per the design guidelines.

Also, there is a window on the left-side façade that appears to encroach into the roof plane of the historic house, which is not appropriate. Staff recommends shifting the window to left to avoid this scenario.

Kara Jacobs, owner, explained that the addition is needed for their growing family.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Price said that he understands the applicants desire for more space, but that the Commission needs to uphold the guidelines and be consistent in requiring the two foot (2') inset. He said that with a revision, they should be able to both meet the guidelines and get the space they need.

Motion:

Commissioner Price moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- 1. The addition shall be set in two feet (2') from the side wall;**
- 2. The cladding material for the addition shall meet the design guidelines; and**
- 3. The window on the left-side façade shall not encroach into the eave of the historic house;**

finding that with these conditions, the project meets Sections III and IV of the Waverly Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

n. 1401 ROBERTS AVE

Application: New Construction—DADU
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Paul Hoffman paul.hoffman@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020020850

Applicant requested deferral.

o. 722 MCFERRIN AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill
Council District: 05

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020021038

Applicant requested deferral.

p. 1008 B VILLA PL

Application: New Construction--Outbuilding; Setback Determination
Council District: 19
Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander sean.alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2020021174

Jenny Warren, staff member, presented the project for an outbuilding in the rear yard. The outbuilding is designed so that half can be built now for unit B's use and the other half later for unit A's use. The project meets the design guidelines with the exception of the side setback and the square footage which is proposed at 880 square feet; but according to the design guidelines is limited to 750 square feet. Staff recommends approval with the conditions noted in the staff recommendation.

Applicant Edward Smith spoke and was confused about staff's recommendations. Ms. Warren explained that the issues are the overall square footage and the side setbacks.

Robin Zeigler, read public comments from Karin Kalodimos, 907 Villa:

I am writing to oppose the construction of the outbuilding as proposed at 1008 B Villa Place. The size of the building and the reduced setbacks are inconsistent with the guidelines. The setbacks will likely cause problems for Codes making the possible pathway between properties narrow and may cause problems for the neighbor to the side. especially if they later decide to construct an outbuilding. I would support construction with the recommendations of the Historic staff. Thank you for your time.

Staff member Mr. Alexander clarified that constructing connected outbuildings is not an issue. The issue is that the overall square footage is too big and the setbacks from the side property lines are not sufficient.

Commissioner Jones said that she found this case to be cut and dry and that she supports the staff recommendation.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved to approve with the conditions that:

- 1. The total footprint of outbuildings shall not exceed seven hundred, fifty square feet (750 sq. ft.);**
- 2. The side setback shall be no less than five feet (5'), unless the building is reduced to seven hundred square feet (700 sq. ft.) or less, in which case the setback may be three feet (3'); and,**
- 3. All metal roof selection and color shall be administratively approved prior to construction;**

finding the proposal meets the Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.

Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

q. 916 ACKLEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@yahoo.com
PermitID#: T2020020890, T2020020895, T2020020900, T2020020908

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, presented the case for four infill houses at 916 Acklen. Staff finds that the four infills meet the design guidelines, except for the addition of some windows, which the applicant has already sent new drawings to address. Staff recommends approval with the conditions outlined in the staff report. The applicant has chosen not to present. He has stated that he is in support of the conditions.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the project with the conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 2. At least one window opening of at least four square feet (4 sq. ft.) be added to the right elevations of Houses B and D, near the midpoint or towards the rear;**
- 3. The change in materials on the two-story houses happen at the floor level;**
- 4. Staff approve the brick samples, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color and texture, and the walkway and driveway materials prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 5. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infills meet Section III. of the design guidelines.

Commissioner Jones seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Bell recognized Ms. Zeigler who explained that there were two cases early on the agenda where not everyone was able to speak, due to technical difficulties. She suggested that the Commission vote on whether to re-hear these cases.

Metro Legal counsel, Alex Dickerson encouraged the Commission to re-hear these two cases, so that the decisions could not later be called into question because people were unable to be heard.

Chair Bell asked if there was a motion to re-hear 421 Church Street.

Commissioner Mosley moved to re-hear 421 Church Street, Commissioner Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Bell announced that anyone wishing to speak on this case could call in now.

Tony Giarrantana confirmed that 421 Church Street is the correct address for the property and said that he was available for questions.

Staff confirmed that Ann Butterworth had called to say that although she had trouble getting through earlier to confirm the correct address, she did not need to speak now.

Commissioner Stewart thanked the owner for landmarking the property.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to recommend approval of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council, finding the building standard numbers 1, 2, 3, and 5 of 17.36.12; and approval of the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations. Commissioner seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Jones moved to re-hear the case for 1315 Gartland Avenue. Commissioner Fitts seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

The owner, Natasha Corrieri explained why her shower needed to be in the dormer and why the dormer had to be larger than initially designed.

There were no other requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Mosley asked clarifying questions regarding the Codes inspection.

Commissioner Price said that it seemed as if the problem was missed at the design stage.

Commissioner Jones said that she still agreed with staff and that the Commission does not review the interior layout and locations of showers.

Commissioner Fitts commented that especially next to a historic dormer, she cannot see approving this.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved that the new dormer be reconstructed to match the dormer permitted by the original Preservation Permit, within sixty days (60) of the date of this hearing, or removed and the original roof repaired within sixty days (60) of the date of this hearing. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chair Bell adjourned the hearing at 3:56pm.

RATIFIED BY COMMISSION ON 10/21/2020