

DAVID BRILEY
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

April 18, 2018

Commissioners Present: Chairman Tibbs, Vice-Chair Bell, LaDonna Boyd, Kaitlyn Jones, Ben Mosley, Ann Nielson, Cyril Stewart

Zoning Staff: Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Susan Jones (city attorney)

Applicants: Blaine Bonadies and Megan Peetz, Matt Schutz, Thomas Solinsky, Sandy Adams, Buck Snyder, Brad Sayer

Councilmembers: None

Public: None

Chairman Tibbs called the meeting to order at 2:04 p.m. He read aloud information about the public hearing, appeals and the consent agenda. *Commissioners Nielson and Boyd arrived at approximately 2:06 p.m.*

I. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Ms. Zeigler noted that 2224 Blair Boulevard was deferred at the request of the applicant, that 209 S 5th Street be moved to consent and that the revision to Rules of Order and Procedure be heard prior to the training. There were no requests from the public to speak to 209 S 5th Street. Ms Zeigler explained that the applicant has implemented the guidance previously given by the Commission and has addressed or agreed to address all conditions of the current staff report.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to accept revised agenda. Vice-Chair Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

After the motion, the applicant deferred 2804 Hawthorne.

I. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- a. March 21, 2018

Motion: Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

III. CONSENT AGENDA

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC: Items on the Consent Agenda will be voted on at a single time. No individual public hearing will be held, nor will the Commission debate these items unless a member of the audience or the Commission requests that the item be removed from the Consent Agenda. Items pulled from the consent agenda will be heard at the end of the agenda.

b. 1703 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New construction - Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Paul Hoffman Paul.Hoffman@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018018807

c. 3703 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction--Infill and Outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018018877

d. 1311 A 4TH AVE N

Application: Alteration; New construction - Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018019203

e. 1507 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New construction - Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018007656

i. 209 S 5TH ST

Application: New Construction--Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018018904

Paul Hoffman read the items proposed for the consent agenda. There were no requests to remove items from the consent agenda.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all items on consent with their applicable conditions including 209 S 5th Street. Commissioner Nielson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

V. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

f. 1722 VILLA PLACE

Application: Historic Bed and Breakfast Overlay
Council District: 17
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler

Staff member, Robin Zeigler, presented the case for a Historic Bed and Breakfast overlay for the Lookofsky-Primm House at 1722 Villa Place.

The property meets the zoning ordinance for being a historic building. It is significant for its architecture and so meets criterion c and for its association with a couple who were important players in Nashville’s Civil Rights

movement and the A.M.E. Church thereby meeting criterion b. The Primms and family members owned the property from 1955 to 2003. In 1956, Bishop Howard T. Primm joined twelve others from the Council of Bishops of the African Methodist Church in appealing to President Eisenhower to act against the persecution of African-American leaders in the Montgomery, AL bus boycotts. Edythe Primm established several child care centers and was an active member of the NAACP. She served as supervisor of the Womens' Missionary Society of the Fourth Episcopal District from 1968 until her death in 1975.

There are additional requirements for a Historic B&B that you don't typically review for other types of overlays, such as signage, and parking. To meet all of those requirements, Staff recommends the condition of submittal of a site plan so that Staff may review the location of parking and signage as well as information about the size and materials of signage and a certificate from the Fire Marshall.

In summary, Staff suggests that the MHZC recommend to Council approval of a Historic Bed and Breakfast overlay for 1722 Villa Place with the conditions that a site plan is provided to Staff so that the location of parking and signage may be reviewed, the sign shall only include the address or property owner's name, materials for the sign be provided for review, and that the applicant provide proof that the Fire Marshall has approved the structure for safety, finding the building meets section C.1.b and c of ordinance 17.36.120. Staff recommends that the design guidelines for the South Music Row neighborhood conservation zoning overlay be used to guide future exterior alterations, to be replaced in the future if a neighborhood conservation overlay is established for the Edgehill neighborhood with Edgehill's design guidelines.

The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve a recommendation for a Historic Bed and Breakfast overlay for 1722 Villa Place with the conditions that a site plan is provided to Staff so that the location of parking and signage may be reviewed, the sign shall only include the address or property owner's name, materials for the sign be provided for review, and that the applicant provide proof that the Fire Marshall has approved the structure for safety, finding the building meets section C.1.b and c of ordinance 17.36.120. The design guidelines for the South Music Row neighborhood conservation zoning overlay shall be used to guide future exterior alterations, to be replaced in the future if a neighborhood conservation overlay is established for the Edgehill neighborhood with Edgehill's design guidelines. Commissioner Boyd seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VI. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS

The items below were deferred at a previous MHZC meeting at the request of the applicant.

None.

VII. PRELIMINARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

None.

VIII. VIOLATIONS

None.

IX. MHZC ACTIONS

g. 2517 BLAIR BLVD

Application: New Construction--Addition (Outbuilding); Setback determination
Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018018897

Staff member Melissa Baldock presented the case for 2517 Blair Boulevard. 2517 Blair Boulevard is a circa 1932 brick bungalow that contributes to the historic character of the Hillsboro-West End neighborhood. On the lot is an existing garage. The date of construction of the existing outbuilding is not known, but it could be the same structure that appears in the circa 1932 Sanborn Map. The application is to construct a second story on top of the existing one-story outbuilding. The existing outbuilding is sixteen feet (16') tall, and the proposed addition would increase it by over eight feet (8') to be twenty-four feet, five inches (24'5") tall. It will also raise the eave height to fifteen feet, ten inches (15'10").

Staff has two concerns about increasing the height of the existing outbuilding. The first concern is that the existing outbuilding does not meet the base zoning setbacks. On the left side, the outbuilding is just one foot (1') from the side property line at its closest point. By contrast, base zoning and MHZC's guidelines require a five foot (5') side setback for an outbuilding of this size. No part of the left side of the outbuilding meets the five foot (5') base zoning setback. The structure does meet the three foot (3') rear setback. To summarize, base zoning and MHZC guidelines require a five foot (5') side setback, but the existing structure is between one foot (1') and two feet, eight inches (2'8") from the side property line. Staff finds that increasing the height of the outbuilding from one-story to two-stories and from approximately sixteen feet (16') tall to twenty-four feet, five inches (24'5") tall increases the non-conformity of the setbacks and is not appropriate.

Staff's second concern is that the two-story form and its ridge and eave heights are not subordinate to the historic house. The proposed addition to the existing outbuilding will create a two-story structure behind an existing one-and-half story historic house. As such, its ridge and eave heights are significantly taller than the historic house and do not meet the design guidelines. The ridge height of the house, from foundation line, is approximately twenty-two feet (22') and its eave height, from foundation line, is approximately ten feet (10'). The average eave height from grade is approximately twelve feet, six inches (12'6"). By contrast, the proposed addition to the outbuilding will have a ridge height of twenty-four feet, five inches (24'5") and an eave height of fifteen feet, ten inches (15'10"). The site does slope down from the front of the lot to the rear, but even taking the average eave of the house from grade, the eave height is taller on the outbuilding than on the historic house. Because the proposed eave and ridge heights of the outbuilding are taller than the eave and ridge heights of the historic house, staff finds that the outbuilding's height and scale do not meet Section II.B.1.h. of the design guidelines.

On lots where there is significant grade down, the Commission has not given outbuildings additional height because of the grade. To summarize, staff is recommending disapproval because the outbuilding does not meet the base zoning side setback and increasing its size increases the non-conformity, and because the height and scale of the outbuilding are larger than that of the existing historic house. Staff recommends disapproval of the addition to the outbuilding, finding that its height, scale, and setback do not meet Section II.B.h. of the Hillsboro – West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines

Blaine Bonadies, architect for the project, said that the outbuilding is in character with other buildings in the neighborhood. He explained that the building exists and that adding a 2nd story will not cause harm to the district. The neighbor has no concerns about the project, according to Mr. Bonadies. The grade drops six feet (6') in the back so the outbuilding will not be taller than the house. The second floor has an eight foot (8') ceiling height.

Megan Peetz, owner of the property, explained that they needed the building in order to make conference calls and love the walkability of the neighborhood.

Commissioner Jones said that she didn't believe that there are any 2-story outbuildings in the area and the principal house is only 1-story. Two stories doesn't meet the context and would be too close to the property line.

Commission Nielson noted that the building, in its current state, doesn't meet code.

Vice-chair Bell said the two-story form was not subordinate to the principal dwelling.

Commissioner Mosley said the project does not meet the design guidelines because proportionally the outbuilding is not subordinate to the house.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved to disapprove the project finding that its height, scale, and setback do not meet Section II.B.h. of the Hillsboro – West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Nielson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

h. 1300 ELMWOOD AVE

Application: New construction - outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2018018805

Staff member, Jenny Warren, presented the case for an outbuilding at 1300 Elmwood. 1300 Elmwood Avenue is a one and a half story bungalow constructed around 1930. The house contributes to the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. The applicant is proposing a one and a half story garage in the rear yard, near the alley. The proposal meets the design guidelines for location, set backs, square footage, ridge height, roof form, design standards and known materials. The only issue with the design is that the eave heights are too tall. For a one story outbuilding such as this, the guidelines state that the eaves can be a maximum of ten feet (10') high (they are required to be lower if the primary structure has lower eaves). In this case, the eave heights on the house are approximately thirteen feet (13'), so the eave heights on the outbuilding could be as high as ten feet (10'). They are proposed at about twelve feet, eight inches (12' 8").

There are no unusual site constraints or grade issues on this property that would necessitate an exception to the ten foot (10') rule. In fact, since 2015 this Commission has approved two prior outbuildings designed for this site, both of which meet the ten foot (10') eave requirement. The applicant has stated correctly that there are other outbuildings in the immediate vicinity that have been approved by the Commission with taller eave heights. The one immediately next door at 1302 Elmwood was approved in 2007 and the one at 2402 Belmont was approved, with twelve feet, six inch (12'6") eave heights, three years ago, in 2015. In the last few years, the Commission has made a conscious effort to be consistent with its decisions regarding outbuildings and to hold them all to the guidelines unless there is a compelling site-specific reason to make an exception. Staff does not find such a reason in this case, and so, per previous direction from this Commission, we are recommending disapproval.

Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed outbuilding, finding that it does not meet Section II.B.i of the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines due to eave height.

Matt Schutz, architect for the project, explained that they matched the historic home and met all the design guidelines. It is shorter than other buildings that have been approved. The design guidelines provide for creative solutions for the benefit of preservation. In proposing this outbuilding design, he is trying to gain square footage while avoiding demolition by addition. He showed large photographs and drawings which were not left with the Commission.

Thomas Solinsky, property owner, said that the proposal is appropriate because they have the tallest building on the block. They tweaked the design of another project that was approved.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioners Mosley, Boyd and Stewart said that the proposal is subordinate to the residence. Vice-chairman Bell and Commissioner Jones said that they want to remain consistent in their decision making. Other projects that have been approved were approved by a different board and they need to be consistent. Commissioner Jones also concurred that the building is subordinate to the existing house and does not harm the historic character of the neighborhood.

Commissioner Mosley noted that the proposed dormer is the same orientation as the house, which helps to minimize the size of the proposal. The push is at the knee wall and he would feel better about it if you were bearing at the top of the first level and it would be more in keeping if the slope were increased. That is not a reason to disapprove it but those are small details that can cause an outbuilding not to be subordinate to the house. The reference point is historic buildings in the district not other outbuildings that might have been approved.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the project with the condition that staff approve materials and details and location of mechanicals. Commissioner Boyd seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

i. 209 S 5TH ST

Application: New Construction--Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018018904

Item was reviewed on the consent agenda.

j. 1507 SHELBY AVE

Application: New Construction--Infill and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018018857

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, presented the case for 1507 Shelby Avenue. 1507 Shelby Avenue is a circa 1950s house that does not contribute to the historic character of the Lockeland Springs neighborhood. MHZC staff issued an administrative permit to demolish the structure earlier this month. The application is to construct a duplex infill and an outbuilding. The infill and outbuilding meet all base zoning setbacks. The front setback will approximate the location of the existing house, which is appropriate. The infill's two-story form, height of twenty-nine feet (29'), and width meet the historic context, where there are other two-story structures of similar heights and widths. The roof slope is 5/12, and the design guidelines require a minimum roof slope of 6/12. Staff recommends that the primary roof slope be increased to 6/12 without increasing the overall height of the structure. The known materials have been approved by the Commission in the past. The garage's height, scale, materials, roof form, and setbacks all meet the design guidelines.

Staff recommends approval of the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. The roof slope be at least 6/12, and the height of the structure remain no taller than twenty-nine feet (29');
3. The front doors be at least half glass, and staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors for buildings prior to purchase and installation;
4. Staff approve a brick sample;
5. Staff approve the materials of the rear porch floor, columns, and steps; and
6. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Sandy Adams, designer for the project, asked questions about making changes to the form, height and design of front door.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Jones and Chairman Tibbs expressed that 29' of height should be the maximum. Vice-chairman Bell added that because the building is two-stories there is already more massing than most of the buildings on the street. Commissioner Mosley agreed with staff that a field check of the foundation height is needed and to give some guidance, no more than 2 blocks should be exposed on the high-side of the building. He also stated that 5/12 slope isn't likely to be a perceptible difference from the condition of a 6/12 slope and it will still be in character with historic roof slopes.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley move to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field and should be no more than approximately two blocks on high side of the building;**
 - 2. The roof slope be at least 5/12, and the height of the structure remain no taller than twenty-nine feet (29');**
 - 3. The front doors be at least half glass, and staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors for both buildings prior to purchase and installation;**
 - 4. Staff approve a brick sample;**
 - 5. Staff approve the materials of the rear porch floor, columns, and steps; and**
 - 6. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house;**
- finding that it meets Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Boyd seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

k. 1503 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New construction - Addition; Partial demolition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2018018908

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the case for 1503 Gartland. The house at 1503 Gartland Ave was constructed circa 1930 and contributes to the character of the Lockeland Springs-East End NCZO. The meets the design guidelines for height, scale, setbacks and rhythm of spacing, materials, and roof shape but does not meet the design guidelines for proportion and rhythm of openings. The application includes a rear addition and side dormer additions on the historic house. The addition is located at the rear of the historic house and is inset appropriately.

The design guidelines allow side dormer additions that are compatible with the scale and design of the building. The side dormers are set in two feet (2') from the wall below as required and incorporate a hipped roof form similar to that of the primary roof form. The rear addition is not taller or wider than the historic house.

Staff recommends that the side dormer addition on the right side façade incorporate additional glazing to fill the dormer, which will help minimize the perceived width of the dormer. Filling the dormer with glazing is consistent with previous decisions by the Commission with regard to dormers.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Staff approve the final details of roof color and trim, and dimensions and materials of windows, doors, rear porch floor, rear porch steps, and rear porch prior to purchase and installation;**
- 2. The dormer on the right side façade of the historic house shall incorporate additional glazing; and**
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.**

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed project meets Sections II.B. and III.B.2. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Lynn Taylor, designer for the project, provided measurements for the dormer that is the subject of condition 2 and she provided photographs of other buildings in the district. She explained that it was designed the way it is to accommodate a bath.

Ms. Zeigler explained that the recommendation for the dormer glazing was based on direction given to staff by the Commission.

Commissioner Jones stated that she understood the request for the additional glazing; however, because the amount of area without glazing is balanced and minimal and the location is at the midpoint of the house, it is appropriate. Vice-chairman Bell agreed that its location allowed for a little leeway.

Ms. Taylor explained that the HVAC will not be moved.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve of the project with the following condition:

- 1. Staff approve the final details of roof color and trim, and dimensions and materials of windows, doors, rear porch floor, rear porch steps, and rear porch prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that the proposed project meets Sections II.B. and III.B.2. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice-chairman Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

I. 2219 WHITE AVE

Application: New construction - Infill

Council District: 17

Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead:Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2018018922

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the case for 2219 White Avenue. This is a request to construct a new two-family residence at 2219 White Ave. The house on the lot was built circa 1963 and does not contribute to the historic character of the Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Earlier this month, staff issued an administrative permit to demolish the non-contributing structure. The lot appears to have a slight cross slope along the front of the property that is not reflected on the plans. Staff recommends that the elevations reflect this prior to issuance of the preservation permit.

The plan meets the design guidelines for height, scale, setbacks and rhythm of spacing, orientation, and materials but does not meet the design guidelines for roof form and proportion and rhythm of openings. As proposed, the infill is oriented to White Ave with parking from the alley. The site plan shows covered parking off the alley, but a detached garage is not proposed at this time.

The infill is 2 stories. Historic homes in the immediate area are primarily 1.5 – 2 stories. Staff finds the height and scale of the proposed infill to be appropriate for the historic context. Cladding materials for the house include board and batten, hardie board, and brick, and the foundation will be split face concrete block.

The duplex is oriented towards White Avenue with two doorways facing the street. The doorway for the right unit reads as the primary entrance as it is accessed via the front porch. The left unit is accessed via a recessed door that is setback thirteen feet (13') from the front wall of the house and will appear to have more of a stoop. The partial width front porch is approximately ten feet (10') deep, which meets the design guidelines. The front porch roof continues the full width of the house at the front and extends six feet (6') over a patio that appears to be at grade while the front porch is three feet (3') tall, which is typical of the finished floor height of historic houses in the area. Staff recommends that this portion of the front porch roof be removed as this is not seen historically.

The windows on the right side façade are generally twice as tall as they are wide. However, there is an eleven foot (11') expanse of wall near the front that does not include a window or door opening. The design guidelines require an opening every eight to thirteen feet (8'-13'). Staff recommends incorporating an opening within this wall space since it is near the front of the house and will be visible from the street.

While the right side façade incorporates a side gable roof form, it also includes a large portion of flat roof. Here is the roof plan with the flat roof outlined in red. The design guidelines state that "roof pitches should be similar to the pitches found in the district" and that "historic roofs are generally between 6/12 and 12/12." While the Commission has approved some lower pitches, those cases have usually been for shed porch or dormer roofs or connectors for additions on historic homes, which are smaller areas of flat roofing than proposed with this project. Staff finds that the 0.5/12 proposed roof pitch does not meet Section III.B.e. and recommends that the infill meets this guideline.

Staff recommends that the plan incorporate four inch (4") nominal casings around all windows and doors within clapboard walls, four inch (4") nominal corner boards at the face of each exposed corner, and four to six inch (4"-6") mullions between paired windows to meet the design guidelines. Ms. Sajid showed context photos of historic houses on this block of White Ave, including 2223 White Ave, which is located to the left of the site at the corner of White and Bradford Ave, and 2216 and 2218 White Ave, which are located across the street. All are contributing.

In conclusion, Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. A front elevation reflecting the slight cross-slope on the property shall be submitted prior to issuance of the preservation permit;
3. The portion of the porch roof covering the at-grade patio shall be removed;
4. The roof form at the rear of the infill shall meet Section III.B.2.e;
5. An additional window or door opening shall be incorporated on the right side façade near the front;
6. Staff approve the materials for the masonry, trim, porch floors, porch steps, porch posts, railings, windows, doors, driveway, and walkway prior to purchase and installation;
7. Staff approve the color and texture of the shingle roof and the metal roof;
8. Four inch (4") nominal wood casings are required around doors, windows and vents within clapboard walls;
9. Four inch (4") nominal wood corner-boards are required at the face of each exposed corner;
10. Paired windows shall have four to six inch (4" – 6") mullions between them; and
11. The HVAC units be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.

With these conditions, staff finds that the project meets Sections III.B.2. of the Woodland in Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.

Buck Snyder, 2308 White Avenue, explained that they have revised the roof to eliminate the flat roof section, which will be a cross gable running behind the side gable.

Mr. Snyder attempted to hand out the revised drawing. Legal counsel, Susan Jones, read the commission their rules for accepting new information. Ms. Zeigler reviewed the drawing and stated that it was not substantively different; however, the Commission declined to see the revision.

Commissioner Mosley expressed his thoughts that flat roof could be appropriate because it is not an occupied space with a railing. He explained that he has seen less desirable outcomes and he doesn't feel like the proposal is out of character for the district. The sloped roof may not be a better solution.

Commissioner Stewart stated that there are opportunities for the architect to design a sloped roof. The side elevation with a flat roof will look like a commercial form.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**

2. A front elevation reflecting the slight cross-slope on the property shall be submitted prior to issuance of the preservation permit;
3. The portion of the porch roof covering the at-grade patio shall be removed;
4. The roof form at the rear of the infill shall meet Section III.B.2.e;
5. An additional window or door opening shall be incorporated on the right side façade near the front;
6. Staff approve the materials for the masonry, trim, porch floors, porch steps, porch posts, railings, windows, doors, driveway, and walkway prior to purchase and installation;
7. Staff approve the color and texture of the shingle roof and the metal roof;
8. Four (4) inch (nominal) wood casings are required around doors, windows and vents within clapboard walls;
9. Four inch (nominal) wood corner-boards are required at the face of each exposed corner;
10. Paired windows shall have four to six inch (4" – 6") mullions between; and
11. The HVAC units be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house; finding that with these conditions, the project meets Sections III.B.2. of the Woodland in Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Nielson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

m. 2224 BLAIR BLVD

Application: New construction - Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2018018809

Applicant deferred.

n. 2804 HAWTHORNE

Application: New construction - Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2018019601

The applicant requested a deferral at the beginning of the meeting. The project was not discussed.

o. 402 B N 17TH ST

Application: New construction - Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2018018924

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the case for 402 B North 17th Street. This is a request to construct a new single-family residence at 402-B North 17th Street. The lot is currently vacant. The plan meets the design guidelines for height, scale, setbacks and rhythm of spacing, orientation, materials, and roof shape but does not meet the design guidelines for proportion and rhythm of openings. As proposed, the infill is oriented to North 17th Street with parking from the alley. The site plan shows a carport pad off the alley, but a carport is not proposed at this time. While staff finds that the depth of the infill could be appropriate in this case, staff has advised the applicant that the depth could present a challenge for any future outbuilding given the required rear setback and separation between the house and outbuilding.

The infill is 1.5 stories. Historic homes in the immediate area are primarily 1 – 1.5 stories. Staff finds the height and scale of the proposed infill to be appropriate for the historic context. The house will be clad in fiberboard lap siding with a board and batten accent in the side gable fields. The foundation will be split face concrete block. Not all of

the windows on the infill are twice as tall as they are wide, which is typical of the historic proportion of openings. While some smaller, square window openings may be appropriate on the sides near the rear or on the rear of the infill, staff finds that the infill incorporates too many smaller, square windows where they will likely be visible.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic house, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. Staff approve the roofing material and color, trim, porch floor and steps, porch posts, porch railing, windows, doors, driveway material, and walkway material prior to purchase and installation;
3. The proportion of openings on the right side façade be revised to meet Section II.B.7.; and
4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Brad Sayer with Four Square Design Studio, LLC, explained how they have addressed many of the conditions and he asked to keep the small windows on the right side, top floor, at the rear of the home on the right side and at the rear of the home on the left side.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Mosley expressed concerns about the rhythm of window spacing and the number of square windows. Commissioner Jones said that the two at the top of the house, being more visible, need to meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Stewart noted that there are ways to cover windows to provide privacy while maintaining the appropriate window proportion.

Commissioner Nielson expressed her concern about making too many exceptions to the design guidelines and setting a precedent that is straying from the design guidelines. Vice-chairman Bell agreed.

Motion:

Commissioner Neilson moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic house, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
 2. **Staff approve the roofing material and color, trim, porch floor and steps, porch posts, porch railing, windows, doors, driveway material, and walkway material prior to purchase and installation;**
 3. **The proportion of openings on the right side façade be revised to meet Section II.B.7.; and**
 4. **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house.**
- finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice-chairman Bell seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

X. OTHER BUSINESS

q. RULES OF ORDER REVISION

Ex-parte communications and site visits

Staff recommends adding two sections to your Rules of Order. One is to clarify ex-parte communications, which are discussions between a commissioner and anyone other than staff—shall not take place. The second is to set up some parameters for site visits beyond just driving by, if needed. Because you only review exterior work this will not likely be necessary but could be useful for economic hardship cases. Staff recommends approval of the language noted in the staff report and the draft Rules.

Commissioner Neilson noted that reviews of interiors of proposed demolitions have been useful in the past.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the two changes to the Rules of Order. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

p. CLG TRAINING

Secretary of Interior Standards-Justin Heskew, Tennessee Historical Commission
Behind-the-Scenes of the Permitting Process-Robin Zeigler

Ms. Zeigler explained that Justin Heskew, from the Tennessee State Historical Commission has been rescheduled to next month and she provided training on the permitting process.

XI. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS & UPDATES

r. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

RATIFIED BY COMMISSION ON 5/16/18