

DAVID BRILEY
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES September 19, 2018

Commissioners Present: Chair Menie Bell, Vice Chair Cyril Stewart, LaDonna Boyd, Kaitlyn Jones, Elizabeth Mayhall, David Price

Zoning Staff: Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Susan Jones (metro legal counsel)

Applicants: Tyler LeMarinel

Councilmembers: None

Public:

Chairman Bell called the meeting to order at 2:01 p.m.

Chairman Bell read information about the amount of time people have to speak, the process of the consent agenda and the process for appeals.

I. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Ms Zeigler informed the Commission that 2020 10th Avenue South, application for demolition, was deferred at the request of the applicant.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

II. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

None present.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- a. August 15, 2018

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA

- b. 3800 PRINCETON AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056335

c. 1503 CLAYTON AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056369

d. 604 RUSSELL ST

Application: Signage
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056665

e. 2601 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056856 and T2018056867

f. 2121 BLAIR BLVD

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander, sean.alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056935

g. 604 MADISON STREET

Application: Infill
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056978

h. 3530 RICHLAND AVENUE

Application: Infill; Setback determination
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
Permit ID#: T2018056965

i. 1005 PARIS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback determination
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056881 and T2018056891

j. 2503 ESSEX PLACE

Application: New construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Paul Hoffman, paul.hoffman@nashville.gov
Permit ID#: T2018056797

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve all consent agenda items with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

V. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

None

VI. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS

The items below were deferred at a previous MHZC meeting at the request of the applicant.

k. 2020 10th AVE S

Application: Demolition
Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018039146

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

VII. PRELIMINARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

None.

VIII. VIOLATIONS

None.

IX. MHZC ACTIONS

I. 1512 A DALLAS AVENUE

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander, sean.alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2018056990

Staff member, Sean Alexander, presented the case for an addition at 1512 Dallas Ave. The application is to enlarge an historic house at 1512 Dallas Avenue, sometimes listed as 1512 A Dallas Avenue, with a ridge raise and rear addition.

The ridge raise will be done like many others that have been approved, the front roof slope will be extended up and to the rear, increasing the height by two feet, with the eaves and two feet of the existing roof ridge on each side left intact. From this new ridge, the rear addition will tie in and go back with a cross-gabled form.

On the first story, the walls of the rear addition will be stepped in two feet from the sides of the house, go back a ways, then step back out two feet to align with the sides of the house.

Similarly, the upper story is stepped in, goes back, then steps back out.

While it may be appropriate for a one story addition to match the width of an historic house or in some cases to even be wider after stepping in and going back, staff finds that the scale of the proposed addition is not appropriate because it's a two story addition behind a one story house. While this is the case for both sides of the addition, it is particularly so on the left of west side because not only does the addition have the height of the ridge raise, it matches the width on a non-original bay. It's actually taller and wider than the original structure.

The visibility on the east or right side is less than the west, but it will still read as a two story addition to a one story house.

The materials are parged concrete foundation, cement-fiber siding, and asphalt shingle roof – these are common and appropriate for additions. Staff would ask to approve the window and door selections prior to installation.

While the ridge raise and first story insets of the addition are appropriate, Staff finds the scale of the upper story is not subordinate to the original house.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition with the following conditions:

1. The width of the upper story shall be reduced to sit two feet (2') inside the silhouette of the historic house; and
2. Staff shall approve the roof color; and
3. Staff shall approve the window and door selections.

With these conditions, staff finds that the addition meets Section II.B of the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay: Handbook and Design Guidelines.

Commissioner Boyd arrived at 2:07pm during the staff presentation.

Tyler LeMarinel, architect for the project, explained the reasons for the massing of the addition. He felt that they could meet the two foot condition but not the gable section as that would create structural issues. The lot is shallower and shorter than other typical lots in the district so any insets will require them to use up more of the rear yard.

Commissioners and staff discussed the design of the addition and the existing building to provide clarification to the condition and the applicant's comments.

Commissioner Jones stated that the architect made a good effort to make the addition narrow and it remains subordinate to the historic building. Commissioner Stewart said the two-story nature of the addition is what makes it pop out. The non-historic side bay shouldn't be counted towards determining the historic width of the home, in terms of determining the appropriate width of the addition. Commissioner Price expressed concern about the large addition.

Motion:

Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed addition with the following conditions:

1. **The width of the upper story shall be reduced to sit two feet (2') inside the silhouette of the historic house;**
2. **Staff shall approve the roof color; and**
3. **Staff shall approve the window and door selections;**

finding that the addition meets Section II.B of the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay: Handbook and Design Guidelines. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

X. OTHER BUSINESS

m. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS & UPDATES

n. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

o. CLG Training

Staff member, Robin Zeigler, presented required CLG training.

The meeting adjourned at 2:35pm.

COMMISSION RATIFIED MINUTES ON 10/17/18