

**Metropolitan Board of Health of Nashville and Davidson County
Special Personnel Committee for Evaluation of Director William Paul, MD, MPH
Minutes of Meeting 6/20/16**

Present: Chairman Sam Felker, Carol Etherington, Dr. Henry Foster, Jr. and Francisca Guzman

1. The purpose of the meeting was to plan the evaluation of Dr. William Paul. The Committee first reviewed the background of Dr. Paul's employment in 2007, the prior evaluation we conducted and the timing of the upcoming evaluation. Here are the key dates:

Dr. Paul was hired in 2007 for a 5-year term.

June 26, 2012, his contract was renewed for another 5-year term.

In the Fall of 2014, the BOH conducted an extensive evaluation of Dr. Paul, with the assistance of Veronica Frazier at Metro HR Department.

In February, 2015, the BOH presented its written evaluation to Dr. Paul.

April, 2015--Dr. Paul provided a written Improvement Plan. Hired a personal coach and consultant.

April, 2016--Dr. Paul provided the BOH an update to his Improvement Plan.

Contract provides the evaluation process must start by February 1, 2017.

June 30, 2017--contract terminates.

2. The Committee next discussed the structure and content of the last evaluation, which had two components: (a) a written self-evaluation by Dr. Paul with an interview; and (b) an extensive confidential survey.

The survey was conducted using REDCap software. There were four questions, and the respondents chose "Poor/Unacceptable" or "Needs Improvement" or "Good/Acceptable". There was also an opportunity for written explanations of the answers. We surveyed the Management Team (12 members with 10 respondents), the Leadership Team (14 members with 7 respondents), Employee Group (30 members with 4 respondents), and Community Partners (10 members and 1 respondent). The questions were:

1. What do you consider to be some of Dr. Paul's strengths in shaping outcomes and advancing the mission of the Health Department?
2. Where are some areas where you would like to see Dr. Paul improve his performance as Director of Health?
3. Do you consider Dr. Paul's overall leadership of the Health Department to be effective or not? (For example, comment on his leadership style and his effectiveness as a communicator. Is he good at delegation? Does he inspire confidence?) Please explain.

4. Do you have additional comments or feedback regarding Dr. Paul's performance as Director of the Health Department? (For example: Are there behaviors, activities or practices you would like to see Dr. Paul start, stop or continue?).

In general, Dr. Paul scored high marks on his knowledge of public health as well as his skills in promoting community-wide health initiatives and collaboration/engagement. However, he scored low on style of leadership and communication skills.

3. The Committee next considered the structure and timing of the upcoming evaluation. By unanimous vote, the Committee decided the following:

1. We want to use a similar format: a confidential survey using REDCap software. Depending on the responses, we may also conduct individual or group interviews of the Executive Leadership Team.
2. We identified potential participants/survey targets, including:
 - (a) Bureau Chiefs (Shoana Anderson, Muriel Hodgson-Vargas, Sanmi Areola, Peter Fontaine, and Tina Lester);
 - (b) Other key MHD managers (Brian Todd, Tom Sharp, Angie Thompson, Tracy Buck, Jim Diamond, Lauren Bluestone, Celia Larson, and Leslie Robeson);
 - (c) Community partners (Dr. John Dreyzehner, Commissioner of the Tennessee Department of Health, Dr. Frieda Outlaw of the Healthy Nashville Leadership Council, Ted Cornelius of YMCA; Dr. Consuelo Wilkins or Carol Westlake of the Safety Net Consortium, Melissa Jaggars of Alignment Nashville, Katina Beard of Matthew Walker Community Health Center, Mary Bufwack of United Neighborhood Health Services, Dr. Rhonda Switzer of Interfaith Dental and Tony Majors of Metro Nashville Public Schools);
 - (d) Board of Health members;
 - (e) Random sampling of MDH staff; and
4. Dr. Paul will perform a written self-evaluation and our Committee will interview him.
5. The Survey will come directly from the BOH this time. Community partners will also receive a letter from Chairman Felker, in order to increase their participation (it was very low last time).
6. For the Survey content, we decided to use the format of our last written evaluation but re-word the questions to make them more suitable for the survey format. Here are the questions:

Does Dr. Paul demonstrate knowledge and competence in the field of public health? (current on issues affecting public health needs in Nashville; understands the mission of MDH and its programs; employs data-driven techniques in addressing public health needs in the community; stays current on developments and trends in public health from local, national and regional perspectives).

Is Dr. Paul effective in shaping the outcomes and advancing the mission and strategic plan of the MHD? (familiar with MHD strategic plan and leads effectively to accomplish its goals; effective in

marshalling assets and resources available to achieve MHD strategic plan and goals; collaborates effectively with community partners in order to leverage limited resources; good working relationship with key constituents including Mayor's office and Metro Council).

Does Dr. Paul demonstrate effective leadership skills in directing and managing the work of the MDH? (effective in motivating and managing MDH's senior leadership and program directors; manages conflict within and outside the department appropriately; effective in delegating and supervising work of other MDH managers; exhibits leadership skills to key constituents outside the department; makes a good impression as representative of MDH; assumes leadership role in the community and advocates for issues important to MDH; sets expectations of senior managers and holds them accountable).

Is Dr. Paul an effective communicator to managers and staff in MDH, to key constituents and community partners and to the Metro Board of Health? (keeps senior management apprised of expectations and communicates effectively regarding success and areas that need improvement; communicates effectively with community partners and key constituents; keeps the BOH apprised of important developments and seeks their guidance on significant issues; effectively communicates with and motivates employees in the department).

Does Dr. Paul emphasize teamwork, collaboration, fairness and transparency in order to boost employee morale and contribute to making MDH a desirable place to work? (intentional about making MDH employees feel they are treated fairly and respected for their contributions to the department; builds trust with employees and senior management through words and actions; before making decisions gathers input from others and effectively communicates basis for decisions; makes others feel they are heard and their input is received and valued).

7. For each question, we will ask the respondents to choose: 1. "Excellent/Outstanding" 2. "Good/Competent" 3. "Poor/Needs Improvement". There will be a place for comments, and respondents can choose not to respond because there is an insufficient basis to evaluate.
8. Once the Survey is finalized at our next meeting, we will move promptly to execute the evaluation plan. The results will be provided to the entire Board of Health along with a written evaluation prepared by this Committee. Dr. Paul will have an opportunity to respond in writing and in a review session with the Board of Health.
9. At the conclusion of the evaluation, the Board of Health will then address the renewal of Dr. Paul's contract.
10. The meeting was adjourned and the Committee will next meet prior to the BOH meeting on 7/7/16.

Respectfully Submitted,

Samuel L. Felker, J.D.
Board Chair