

**Special Bombing Review Commission
November 2021 Meeting
Howard Office Building, 700 2nd Avenue South
Sonny West Conference Room
Nashville, Tennessee 37210**

November 30, 2021

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Chairman Paul Summers

Vice Chair Jamie Hollin

Secretary Margie Quin

Andres Martinez

Darrell Talbert

Brenda Sanderson

Captain Leshuan Oliver

Mario Avilla

Metro Legal Cindy Gross

ABSENT: CM Jennifer Gamble

1. Call to order and welcome at 10:00 am CT - Chairman Paul Summers
 - WELCOME TO GUESTS FROM AT&T AND AOC
2. Invocation by Brenda Sanderson
3. Pledge of allegiance led by Chairman Paul Summers
4. Approval of agenda – Members moved by CM Hollin, seconded by CM Sanderson - approved
5. Approval of minutes of October 2021 meeting – Members Moved by Talbert, seconded by Sanderson
6. Welcome and introduction of guests - Chairman Summers
7. Reports from the leadership of various committee/working groups
 - Public Safety: asking MNPD to December meeting.
 - Response Committee – the first draft on Lessons Learned will be submitting the final product to the Commission
8. Introduction of representatives of the Tennessee Administrative Office of the Courts (AOC)
 - Michelle Long Deputy Director AOC – introducing two speakers: spoke of the wide-reaching effect of the bombing on businesses and daily operations by the AOC;
 - Role is to ensure that the courts are available to the public, but the bombing resulted in the AOC's inability to deliver that mandate;

- Mr. Brandon Bowers – IT Director for the AOC
- Mr. Buddy Stockwell – TLAP program

9. Presentation by AOC

- Mr. Bowers: presented from slide deck – attached to this agenda as **exhibit 1**;
 - Network connectivity, phone connectivity and elevator phone lines; unable to access the resources for approximately two days – speaking of Davidson County courts, Supreme Court;
 - Had been preparing to operate outside a physical building because of the pandemic, this made work inside the building impossible;
 - Some of the technology was 80 years old. All of the underground systems went offline – moisture in the underground lines created failure point;
 - Resolution: systems were restored within 2 days – phone issues restored within 3 days, but there was intermittent connectivity;
 - Potts lines were out. To mitigate this in the future, may be going to a Cloud solution; network is now in the Cloud, but phones may go to VOIP.
 - Redundant systems for phone and Cloud through Cloud provider as well as VOIP phone systems;
 - Primary is Comcast, secondary through AT&T. Not tied to STS – are a stand-alone. All 164 sites have been upgraded – T1 sites, so speeds are updated and increased throughout the state.
- Mr. Stockwell: because of the physical damage of their offices inside the Washington Square building, they are still working remotely;
 - January 6th was the first time they were able to access the building.
 - Glass permeated the building;
 - Additional supports to support the structure were added by January 18th;
 - Some offices were gutted;
 - Construction took much longer to get underway;
 - Today, there is still scaffolding and supports inside the building.
 - Because of the age of the building, they had to re-mortar the bricks on the exterior.
 - The age of the building required all custom replacements – added time to the reconstruction. Immediate need was to get the phones working so service could continue.
- Deputy Director Long advised the AOC has increased access since the bombing incident. Access through technology increased, building access is not controlled by the AOC to some extent.

10. Introduction of and presentation by representatives of AT & T Tennessee

- Tennessee President Joelle Phillips AT&T – expressed gratitude to Nashville in the aftermath of the disaster; worked immediately with the Governor’s Office, NES, etc.. The community relationships were critical and important to the things they were able to do well.
 - The building is a “Central Office” and contains switching and electronics, which gets calls or data to the destination intended;

- Thousands of such buildings, but not all created equal;
- Central offices are “intersections”, some bigger than others;
- Nashville’s Central Office had a more regional impact because of its location;
- The buildings are designed to withstand disasters, tornados, floods, etc..
- Central Offices are routinely surviving disasters;
- This office withstood the bombing but the commercial power interface was damaged.
- The equipment is able to operate for several hours until commercial power is restored as long as battery is switched to generator power.
 - Battery power lasts approximately five hours and then needs to be switched to generator power;
 - FBI would not let A&T in to move equipment from battery to generator;
 - It was more than 12 hours before they could get into the equipment and switch the power source.
- Looking to change disaster protocols from battery power to generator power;
- Had to punch a hole through the back of the building and sit the generators outside to switch power;
- Looking at new and different ways to switch power sources as a result of challenges from the Christmas Day Bombing.
- Location became an issue – The central office has to remain in the middle for efficiency – in contrast to a remote data or antennae farm.
- Worked with policy makers to see if a move would be advantageous – expense and disruption by reengineering the central station – would cost some \$600,000,000.00 to move central station.
- Service disruption:
 - AT&T provides 911 services through contracts with the state;
 - Technology associated with 911: routing, address and location; cellular telephone access;
 - Some 911 service was disrupted, not all services were disabled;
 - TECB tasked Steve Martini to undertake an analysis of the impact of the bombing;
 - They delivered a report in May to the TECB.
 - Reiterated TBI Assistant Director Richard Littlehale’s point of weighing the cost and needs of diversity of services;
 - Redundancy: a same system; carrier diverse; geographically diverse redundancy;
 - Geographic diversity is underway spearheaded by AT&T;
 - Some services need to be in the same location to eliminate latency;
 - Rebuilding: initial idea was to build back the same building and structure;
 - Was a \$60 million incident for AT&T
- Some design changes will make them less vulnerable;
- Lighting will be done by city; will utilize historic façade;
- Grateful for the city’s care of the construction site;
- Hope to finish construction by the end of 2022; will depend on how much the city wants to do underneath the street.

11. Questions and answers

- Captain Oliver – what is the precedence
 - A: working with FBI and SEC to see if new protocols can be developed so that they can restore service and not destroy evidence;

- Issue of first impression, team from AT&T hadn't done that kind of work before – increase battery window – increase from 5 hours to 12 or 24 hours – battery technology changing;
- Placing calls is as essential as the 911 center receiving calls
- Vice Chair Hollin asked for a general timeline
 - A: President will follow up with a timeline.
- Quin: harden the target:
 - A: Prepare the building to withstand all types of activity; lighting and other things to make the exterior more soft;
 - Will construct the building to look more like the other buildings around them – so they will blend in better; hope that there will be a net benefit to the disaster.
- Chair: asked about motive
 - A: viewed it as outside their expertise, working with the FBI; the employees really struggled and asked why would someone do this to them.

12. Set date of next meeting (last Tuesday on the month)

Date to be determined.

13. Adjourn - Chairman Summers – 11:40 a.m.

Approved: _____
Paul G. Summers, Chairman