

JOHN COOPER  
MAYOR



# METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

## METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)

### MINUTES December 15, 2021

**Commissioners Present:** Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Leigh Fitts, Mina Johnson, Kaitlyn Jones, Elizabeth Mayhall, David Price

**Zoning Staff:** Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Ann Mikkelsen (legal counsel)

**Applicants:** Pablo David, Martin Wieck, Matt Schutz, Jeff Cassella, and Keri Adams, Cheyenne Smith, Celeste Patterson and David Bailey

**Councilmembers:** None

**Public:** Savannah Knies, CHP fieldwork coordinator

Chair Bell called the meeting to order at 2:03 p.m.

Chair Bell read information about the procedures for the meeting and process for appealing a decision.

#### I. MHZC BUSINESS

##### A. ADOPTION OF NOVEMBER 15 AND 17, 2021 MINUTES

**Motion:** Commissioner Jones moved to approve the minutes for November 15 and 17 as presented. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

##### B. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Ms. Zeigler provided the following potential revisions to the agenda:

- L: Historic Tax Abatement deferred
- N. 312 Broadway deferred
- O. 116 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave S removed
- P. 1406 Eastland removed
- Q. 2217 Lindell requesting deferral
- R. 200 Broadway
- J: request to be removed from consent

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Price moved to accept the revised agenda. Commissioner Johnson seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

[Vice-chair Stewart arrived at 2:06 pm.]

##### C. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

No councilmembers were present.

## II. CONSENT AGENDA

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the items on the consent agenda. As notice to the public, she explained that items on the consent agenda will be voted on at a single time.

### D. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

#### E. 3712 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition and Outbuilding  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov  
Permit ID#: T2021075957 and T2021075962

#### F. 2400 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction--Outbuilding  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov  
Permit ID#: T2021075983

#### G. 900 N14TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination; Partial Demolition  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov  
Permit ID#: T2021076292

#### H. 4609 PARK AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition; Setback Determination  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov  
Permit ID#: T2021076295

#### I. 2926 WESTMORELAND DR

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Partial Demolition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov  
Permit ID#: T202107785 and T202107786

#### ~~J. 416 JEFFERSON ST~~

~~Application: New Construction—Infill  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov  
Permit ID#: T2021071364~~

There were no requests from the public to remove additional items from the consent agenda.

#### Motion:

**Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve all items on consent with the applicable conditions and with the exception of 416 Jefferson Street. Commission Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

### III. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

#### K. 2208 ELLISTON PL

Council District: 21

Overlay: Historic Landmark

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, [robin.zeigler@nashville.gov](mailto:robin.zeigler@nashville.gov)

Ms. Zeigler explained that the owners, with the support of Councilmember Taylor, request a Historic Landmark designation for the Exit/Inn at 2208 Elliston Place. There are two buildings on this parcel, but it is only the Exit/Inn building that is being Landmarked. The building is in the process of being listed in the National Register of Historic Places. She introduced Savannah Knies, fieldwork coordinator for the Center for Historic Preservation at MTSU to provide a summary of the Center's work on a National Register of Historic Places nomination for the property.

Staff suggests that the Metro Historic Zoning Commission recommend approval of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council and the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations. Staff finds that the building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and therefore meets the requirements of section 17.36.120. for a landmark overlay.

Pablo David of AJ Capitol, property owner, stated their desire to preserve the building and the Landmark designation.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

#### **Motion:**

**Vice-chair Stewart moved to recommend approval of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council and the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations; finding, that the building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and therefore meets the requirements of section 17.36.120. for a landmark overlay. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

[Commissioner Mayhall arrived at 2:25 pm.]

#### L. HISTORIC TAX ABATEMENT PROGRAM REVISIONS

Council District: All

Overlay: All

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, [robin.zeigler@nashville.gov](mailto:robin.zeigler@nashville.gov)

Deferred

### IV. PRELIMINARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

#### M. 945 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: Revision to SP

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

Permit ID#: 2018076833

Staff Member Jenny Warren presented the case. In 2018 the Commission approved an SP for the site at 945 S Douglas. Nineteen houses were approved with specific heights, number of stories, and widths for each. The SP was

approved by Planning and then by Council. The applicant has been returning to the MHZC for final approval of each individual house design. To date, the Commission has approved Units 1-7. These are all street-facing units.

The applicant originally proposed the massings seen here for the interior units, #10-19. These units were identified as Type 3 buildings and were noted as being '2 stories', although the forms appear to be two and a half stories. MHZC recommended approval of the Type 3 buildings as proposed, finding that the proposed massing met section III(A)(1) for "new construction-height." When council approved the SP, the final language stated that "Maximum overall height is 2 stories in thirty-five feet (35')".

The applicant presented a design for the first interior unit to staff in March of 2021. In consulting with Planning staff, Historic Zoning Commission staff learned that Planning will not approve ANY occupiable space beyond a second story, due to the "2 story" language proposed by the applicant and approved by Council. While MHZC defines a half-story as a story that is fully under roof, often identified by dormers, skylights or windows in a gable field, the code does not have a definition for a half story and thus Planning considers any occupiable space on the third level to create a three-story structure.

In response to staff feedback, the applicant has provided a revised draft of a sample interior unit. These more fully developed elevations are shown as a courtesy to the Commission, to present a clearer picture of what the final design might look like. At this time, staff is not making a recommendation on the proposal shown here, rather is only addressing the number of stories for the Type 3 buildings.

Staff recommends to Council, approval of the Type 3 form originally presented in Part I of the SP review (interior units, Units 10-19). Historical Commission staff describes this building type as a two and a half story form, defining a half-story as one where there is usable space fully under the roof – often identified by dormers, skylights or windows in a gable field. Staff finds that the proposed SP revision meets section III for new construction of the Waverly-Belmont design guidelines in place in 2018.

If the SP is approved by Council, the applicant will be required to return to the Commission with additional applications, including full plans complete with design details for review of materials; windows and doors; proportion and rhythm of openings; porches and stoops, fences and walls, appurtenances and utility locations; and the overall detailing of the proposal and to meet all other requirements of the SP.

Martin Wieck, architect for the project, reiterated that they are not requesting changes to what was previously approved.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to recommend to Council approval of the Type 3 form originally presented in Part I of the SP review (interior units, Units 10-19); finding the proposed SP revision meets section III for new construction of the Waverly-Belmont design guidelines in place in 2018, when the SP was initially reviewed. If the SP is approved by Council, the applicant will be required to return to the Commission with additional applications, including full plans complete with design details for review of materials; windows and doors; proportion and rhythm of openings; porches and stoops, fences and walls, appurtenances and utility locations; and the overall detailing of the proposal and to meet all other requirements of the SP. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

## **A. VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/SHOW CAUSE**

### **N. 312 BROADWAY**

Application: Violation

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

**O. 1163<sup>RD</sup> AVE S**

Application: Alteration--Violation  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov  
PermitID#: 2021006693

Removed from a genda.

**P. 1406 EASTLAND AVE**

Application: Addition--Violation  
Council District: 06  
District: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov  
PermitID#: 2021012298

Removed from a genda.

**VI. MHZC ACTIONS**

**Q. 2217 LINDELL AVE**

Application: Economic Hardship  
Council District: 17  
Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov  
PermitID#: T2021077180

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

**R. 200 BROADWAY**

Application: New Construction--Addition; Signage  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov  
PermitID#: T2021076673

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

**S. 1308 FORREST AVE**

Application: New Construction--Addition & Outbuilding  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov  
PermitID#: T2021076234 & T2021077548

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the case. This is an application for an addition at 1308 Forrest. The applicant has asked to defer the outbuilding for revisions, so we will just be looking at the addition today.

Staff finds that the addition meets the guidelines. It is neither taller nor wider than the historic house and has the appropriate insets. It meets the setback requirements as well. The design has a modern aesthetic and detailing that

are both differentiated from the historic house, yet compatible. A glass curtain wall is proposed at the basement level where the addition connects to the historic house.

An attached garage is proposed at the basement level, accessed from the rear – this meets the guidelines. You can see on the rear elevation that there is an elevated deck connecting the house and the formerly proposed outbuilding. The deck and outbuilding are both no longer a part of this application.

In conclusion, Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition with the following conditions:

1. The partial demolition shall be accomplished manually. The applicant shall submit a demo/shoring plan prior to permitting, and there shall be an inspection after shoring; and
2. Staff shall review and approve the final materials, including the foundation material, the siding materials, the final glass curtain walls, the trim material, all windows and doors, and the deck materials; and
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.
4. ~~The deck connecting the addition and outbuilding shall be lowered to grade OR the outbuilding shall be removed;~~

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Matt Schutz, designer for the project, passed out a handout and a 3D model. He explained the project and the factors that drove the design.

Vice-Chair Stewart and Commissioner Jones both stated that they thought the project was differentiated and compatible. Commissioner Johnson agreed and thanked the applicant for removing the outbuilding from consideration as that was the part of the project she was struggling with.

#### **Motion:**

**Commissioner Fitts moved to approve the proposed addition with the following conditions:**

1. **The partial demolition shall be accomplished manually. The applicant shall submit a demo/shoring plan prior to permitting, and there shall be an inspection after shoring; and**
2. **Staff shall review and approve the final materials, including the foundation material, the siding materials, the final glass curtain walls, the trim material, all windows and doors, and the deck materials; and**
3. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

#### **T. 1401 HOLLY ST**

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

Permit ID#: T2021077192

Staff member Joseph Rose presented the case. The application is to construct a rear and side addition to the historic house at 1401 Holly Street. The house at 1401 Holly Street is a circa 1915 contributing home in the Lockeland Springs-East End Conservation Zoning Overlay. There is a historic house and a non-historic commercial building at 1401 Holly Street. These buildings, along with another historic house at 1405 Holly Street share a single owner, and together the three buildings and the common space between them form a campus for the Holly Street Day Care center. The historic home at 1401 Holly Street was directly impacted by the March 2020 tornado and suffered damage. Since the tornado, Holly Street Daycare has been actively engaged with architects and engineers to determine the appropriate next steps for the structure. A Metro combination sewer easement bisects the property and

limits options for a lternative new construction. The applicant previously requested demolition but deferred prior to the Commission’s review.

The project includes replacing an existing rear addition, adding dormers, adding a side addition and lifting the house. Although some of these actions are not direct fits with the design guidelines, staff found them to be appropriate because of the constraints on the property with a diagonal utility easement, storm damage, rehab requirements based on the existing use, significant grade changes, size of the lot, and structural concerns.

Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a scope of work outlining the method for partial demo, lifting the building, creating a new foundation, replacing the building, and securing the building during interior demolition is provided for review;
2. Staff approve all material selections for foundation, cladding, roofing, windows, doors, porch elements, trim, and site elements prior to purchase and installation; and,
3. The location of utility meters and mechanicals shall be reviewed prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s) if located anywhere forward of the midpoint of the house.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Jeff Cassella, architect for the project, explained that there are numerous challenges that drove the current design. Keri Adams, owner’s representative, thanked staff for their help.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Vice-chair Stewart thought the design was a good solution for the site constraints. Commissioner Fitts said she was glad to see that the request for demolition was not pursued and that she understands the need for the current request because of the constraints. Commissioner Price agreed. Commissioner Jones noted that they received a letter of support from the councilmember.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Jones moved to approve the project with the following conditions:**

1. **Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a scope of work outlining the method for partial demo, lifting the building, creating a new foundation, replacing the building, and securing the building during interior demolition is provided for review;**
2. **Staff approve all material selections for foundation, cladding, roofing, windows, doors, porch elements, trim, and site elements prior to purchase and installation; and,**
3. **The location of utility meters and mechanicals shall be reviewed prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s) if located anywhere forward of the midpoint of the house;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**U. 1914 RUSSELL ST**

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

Permit ID#: T2021076023

Staff member Melissa Baldock presented the project at 1914 Shelby Avenue, which was a circa 1947 minimal traditional house. Staff finds that the house’s date of construction, materials, and form do not contribute to the historic character of the Lockeland Spring-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. MHZC staff issued an administrative permit for the house’s demolition in November 2021.

The project meets all base zoning setbacks. The front setback is drawn as a approximately fifty feet (50') from the street. However, because a survey has not yet been finished, the front setbacks of the two houses on either side of the infill are not known. Staff recommends that the infill's front setback be the average of the setbacks on either side of it and that the preservation permit not be issued until the site plan shows the neighboring setbacks. The infill is a one and one-half story building with a maximum height of twenty-four feet, eleven inches (24'11") from grade. Staff finds this meets the historic context which has houses ranging in height between nineteen and twenty-eight feet (19'-28') tall from grade. The house will be thirty-three feet, four inches (33'4") wide, which also meets the historic context.

Staff recommends a approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The preservation permit not be issued until the applicant has submitted a site plan showing the front setbacks of the houses on either side and the infill's front setback being halfway in between the two;
3. All masonry samples, all windows and doors, the pathway material; and the roofing color are approved prior to purchase and installation; and,
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup> Century Districts.

Applicant Cheyenne Smith stated that he agreed with the staff recommendation and was available for questions.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

#### **Motion:**

**Commissioner Price moved to approve the project with the following conditions:**

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The preservation permit not be issued until the applicant has submitted a site plan showing the front setbacks of the houses on either side and the infill's front setback being halfway in between the two;**
- 3. All masonry samples, all windows and doors, the pathway material; and the roofing color are approved prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

#### **V. 1203 LILLIAN ST**

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

Permit ID#: T2021076400

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the case. This is an application for infill at 1203 Lillian Street. This block has no historic context. The applicant for this project has designed several similar infill houses on this block that have been constructed over the last several years. The existing house is non-contributing and will be demolished.

The applicant has provided a streetscape that shows the other recently constructed infill houses along this block-face. The subject house is at the far right. It is consistent with previous approvals and the immediate context in terms of number of stories, width, height, roof form, dormers, orientation, setbacks, parking and rhythm of openings.



The consolidated guidelines state that generally porch columns on infill should have bases and capitals, so staff recommends that capitals be added. An open carport is proposed for the rear, on the first level. Staff finds this to be appropriate in this instance, because the lot is very short at only one hundred feet (100') deep. The Commission approved this same attached carport feature for the other infill houses in this immediate vicinity.

In conclusion, Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finish floor height shall be consistent with adjacent houses, to be verified by MHZC Staff in the field;
2. Staff shall review and approve materials prior to purchase and installation, including porch post material, the windows and doors and the driveway and walkway materials;
3. Capitals shall be added to the porch posts;
4. A concrete walkway shall be added from the front porch to the street or driveway; and,
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

**Motion:**

**Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:**

- 1. The finish floor height shall be consistent with adjacent houses, to be verified by MHZC Staff in the field;**
- 2. Staff shall review and approve materials prior to purchase and installation, including porch post material, the windows and doors and the driveway and walkway materials;**
- 3. Capitals shall be added to the porch posts;**
- 4. A concrete walkway shall be added from the front porch to the street or driveway; and,**
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**W. 1919 HOLLY ST**

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov

Permit ID#: T2021076297

Staff member Sean Alexander presented the case. The lot at 1919 Holly Street is currently vacant, the house that stood there previously was destroyed by the tornado on March 3<sup>rd</sup> 2020.

The proposed new house will be one and one-half stories, with a side-gabled form. It will be twenty-nine feet (29') tall from front grade to the tallest point, and thirty-four feet (34') wide at the front with a bay adding two feet (2') on the right side.

The materials will be cement-fiber clapboard, cement-fiber and wood trim, with brick accents and an asphalt shingle roof.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill construction with the conditions that

1. The front setback matches the historic context of the block, to be verified by a staking inspection prior to construction;
2. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the nearby historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
4. The selections for brick, front porch roofing, windows, and doors are reviewed prior to installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Fitts moved to approve the proposed infill with the conditions that:**

- 1. The front setback matches the historic context of the block, to be verified by a staking inspection prior to construction;**
  - 2. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the nearby historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
  - 3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
  - 4. The selections for brick, front porch roofing, windows, and doors are reviewed prior to installation.**
- finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**J. 416 JEFFERSON ST**

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov

Permit ID#: T2021071364

This block, currently vacant, is bounded by Jefferson Street on the south and Madison Street on the north and between 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue North and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue North on the east and west, respectively.

The Metro Historic Zoning Commission reviewed a proposal to construct a mixed-use development covering the entire block at the November 2021 meeting.

The previous application was approved with the condition that the height of the two three-story components was reduced and that the applicant was to seek support from the neighbors.

In the proposal submitted in November, components 2 and 3 were both a full three-stories with flat roofs, thirty-nine feet (39') tall from the floor level to the top of the parapet. Components 2 and 3 are in the East Development Zone of the overlay, in which buildings of their type are permitted to be one or two stories and up to thirty feet (30') tall for flat-roofed buildings.

In the revised design, the massing has been broken up by stepping the three-story mass back ten feet (10') from Madison Street and two feet, eight inches (2'8") from the numbered Avenues, leaving the building with two-story facades at the corner. The wall of the two-story facades will be twenty-six feet (26') tall from the floor level to the parapet, with a three-foot (3') tall railing above, creating an uncovered roof deck at the front. The parapet height of the three-story facades will be thirty-seven feet (37').

The applicant met with the neighborhood representatives and has received their support, which is indicated in the attached letter.

Staff recommends approval of the revised scale and massing of components 2 and 3 of proposed infill with the conditions that:

1. The commercial entrances for the storefronts on Components 2 and 3 and the location of stairwells not be approved with Part I to allow discussion regarding the design guideline requirements when the project returns for Part 2 review;

2. If the Planning Commission approves the SP, the applicant will return to the Historic Zoning Commission for review of materials, material color and texture, windows and doors, proportion and rhythm of openings, porches, entries and stoops, fences and walls, rooftop decks, balconies, and pergolas, stair tower locations and detailing, appurtenances and utility locations, and the overall detailing of the proposal.

With these conditions, staff finds the scale and massing of the project meet the design guidelines for new construction in the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Celeste Patterson, president of HG Hill, and David Bailey, architect for the project, explained that they met with Councilmember O'Connell and the neighborhood were in support of the proposed revision, as well as MDHA. Bailey passed out additional drawings and explained the compromise proposed.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Jones and Vice-chair Stewart disclosed that they saw Jimmy Granberry at an event where Mr. Granberry, owner, said he was excited about the project but there was no discussion.

Multiple commissioners praised the compromise.

**Motion:**

**Commissioner Fitts moved to approve the revised scale and massing of components 2 and 3 of proposed infill with the conditions that:**

1. **The commercial entrances for the storefronts on Components 2 and 3 and the location of stairwells not be approved with Part I to allow discussion regarding the design guideline requirements when the project returns for Part 2 review;**
2. **If the Planning Commission approves the SP, the applicant will return to the Historic Zoning Commission for review of materials, material color and texture, windows and doors, proportion and rhythm of openings, porches, entries and stoops, fences and walls, rooftop decks, balconies, and pergolas, stair tower locations and detailing, appurtenances and utility locations, and the overall detailing of the proposal;**

**finding that with these conditions, the scale and massing of the project meet the design guidelines for new construction in the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**VII. OTHER BUSINESS**

Please note meeting location changes for 2022. The following meetings will take place in the Bransford Conference Room at 2602 Bransford Ave (entrance and parking off Berry Road): April 20, July 20, October 19.

**OTHER BUSINESS**

Meeting adjourned at 3:07 p.m.