

JOHN COOPER
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)

MINUTES

February 17, 2021

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Bell, Vice-chair Stewart, Leigh Fitts, Mina Johnson, Kaitlyn Jones, Elizabeth Mayhall, Ben Mosley, David Price, Dr. Lee Williams

Zoning Staff: Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Alex Dickerson (legal counsel)

Applicants: Martin Wieck, Jeff Zeitlin, Cheyenne Smith, Rachel Hayes, Paul Boulifard, Margaret Scott, Robert Thompson, Trevor Hanus, Dana Linge, AJ Hanus, Craig Kennedy, Mitch Hodge, Luther Galyon, Jeff Hammer, Quinta Martin, Rob Benshoof, Jeff Steele, John Rodgers, Douglas Schenkel, Hunter Conley

Councilmembers: Kyonzte Toombs

Public: John Hawkins

Chairperson Bell called the meeting to order at 2:07 p.m. She explained that out of an abundance of caution, and pursuant to recommendations from federal, state, and local health agencies regarding avoiding group gatherings due to the COVID-19 Coronavirus this meeting is a teleconference meeting. Advance public comments have been possible through email, mail, and voicemail and will be read or played at the time of their relevant case. We will also take comments via phone. The number is 629-255-1911. Please do not call until the project you wish to speak about is announced.

Chair Bell took a roll call to confirm attendance.

Chairperson Bell explained that the Commission must vote on the record that the COVID-19 pandemic requires us to hold a telephonic meeting as permitted under the Governor's Executive Order number 60.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved that the meeting agenda constitutes essential business of this body and meeting electronically is necessary to protect the health, safety, and welfare of Tennesseans in light of the COVID-19 outbreak. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Chairperson Bell read information regarding appeals and the process for the public hearings.

Chairperson Bell asked if there were any proposed changes to the agenda. Ms. Zeigler said asked that the consolidation project be deferred until March for a public hearing, with the decision to be to be on the April agenda. 201 N 11th has asked to defer and staff requests that 1501 Fatherland be moved to the end of the agenda.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to revise the agenda by deferring the design guideline consolidation project until March and April, deferring 201 N 11th and moving 1501 Fatherland to the end of the agenda. Commissioner Jones seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

I. ADOPTION OF MINUTES

a. January 20, 2021

MOTION:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to ratify the minutes for January 20, 2021. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

II. CONSENT AGENDA

Staff member Melissa Sajid read the consent agenda.

b. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

c. 312 S 11TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021000120

d. 1806 SHELBY AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006429

e. 2509 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006450

f. 1707 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006543

g. 1913 SHELBY AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006547

h. 1410 DALLAS AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006587

i. 3618 MEADOWBROOK AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006600

j. 117 WINDSOR DR

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 23
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006688

k. 407 GREENWAY AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006692

l. 116 3RD AVE S

Application: Alteration—Storefront; Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006693

m. 1822 5TH AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:2020041272

n. 1223 VILLA PL

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021000227

o. 1209 ELMWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Partial Demolition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006628 and T2021006633

p. 1239 PLYMOUTH AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 7
Overlay: Eastdale Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006625

Motion:

Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve all consent agenda items with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

III. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

q. CONSOLIDATION OF NEIGHBORHOOD CONSERVATION ZONING OVERLAY

Request to defer.

r. HAYNES HEIGHTS NEIGHBORHOOD CONSERVATION ZONING OVERLAY

Ms. Zeigler presented the staff recommendation for Haynes Heights. This is a request for a Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay for the Haynes Heights neighborhood. Developed by and for African Americans during the Jim Crow era, the Haynes Heights neighborhood was populated by doctors, lawyers, and educators, among others. Haynes Heights allowed members of the Black community the type of neighborhood that they envisioned for themselves and their families, one that was not available to them in established neighborhoods of segregated Nashville. There is more information on the history of the neighborhood in the design guidelines. Thank you to Victoria Hensley and the Center for Historic Preservation at MTSU for putting that together for us.

The Haynes Heights neighborhood remains intact and largely unchanged. Many of the homes are contributing resources to the National Register eligible district, with very few demolitions, new construction, or major alterations. The lots still include large, front yards and there have been minimal subdivisions of property. The values and goals of early residents to create their own family-oriented, middle- to upper-class oasis in a world of segregation and racism remains embodied in the physical layout and architecture of this neighborhood.

Based on that history, staff finds the proposal meets criteria 1 and 3 of section 17.36.120. We also find that the draft design guidelines meet the Secretary of Interior Standards. Anticipating that the consolidated guidelines will be approved in April, we created a new set of consolidated

guidelines to accommodate the very different architecture and development of later mid-century developments such as this one. If the consolidation does not pass, this set of design guidelines can just be reformatted to be for Haynes Heights only, without changing the guidelines themselves.

Councilmember Toombs spoke in support of the project. The neighborhood means a lot to the community and to the neighbors in the neighborhood. She wants to help protect this neighborhood from development.

Quinta Martin, president of the neighborhood association, spoke in favor of the proposal. She described the founding and evolution of the neighborhood. The neighborhood has worked on this project for three years. She stated that 99% of the residents are in favor of the overlay.

Ms. Zeigler noted that fifteen (15) letters of support and one in opposition were received prior to the meeting.

Commissioner Williams noted the importance of the neighborhood and commended the neighborhood for their work in pursuit of the overlay.

Commissioner Jones asked about the percentage of houses that are contributing. Ms. Zeigler said she did not have the exact number, but it was very high, probably among the highest of the overlays.

Commissioner Johnson, Vice-chairman Stewart and Commissioner Price also commended the neighborhood for their work. Commissioner Price also noted that it is the first mid-century overlay.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to recommend approval of the Haynes Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay, finding the area to meet criteria 1 and 3 of section 17.36.120 and to adopt the design guidelines proposed for the new district and finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

IV. PRELIMINARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

s. 945 S DOUGLAS AVE – UNIT 1

Application: New Construction Infill

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021001040

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the staff recommendation. In 2018 the Commission approved an SP for the site at 945 S Douglas. Nineteen houses are planned for the development.

The Commission approved specific ridge and eave heights and widths for each unit, and recommended approval to the Planning Commission. The SP was approved. Now the applicant will return to this Commission for final design approval of each unit. Today, they are presenting units #1 - #3.

Unit #1 sits at the corner of the development and will be one of the largest houses here. It was approved to be two stories tall with a thirty-five-foot (35') ridge and nineteen-foot, eight-inch (19'8") eaves. The width could be forty feet (40'). The proposed structure meets these parameters for massing.

Staff finds that the proposal is appropriate in terms of height, massing, materials, and roof form. It is consistent with the site plan approved for the SP.

Staff's only issue is the turret, which is a high-style Victorian element which staff finds to be inappropriate to the context.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the proposed house with the conditions that the turret be removed, that staff shall approve materials and that the utility locations be approved. The applicant is here and would like to speak.

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. The turret element shall be removed;
2. Staff shall review and approve the roof color, porch roof, brick, doors, garage doors, windows and walkway material prior to purchase and installation; and,
3. The HVAC shall be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within five feet (5') of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within five feet (5') of the rear corner,

finding that the proposed infill meets the conditions of the part I SP approval for massing and Section III of the Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines.

Martin Wieck, architect for the project, said they were pleased with the recommendation with the exception of the removal of the turret. Their understanding of Part I of the SP was to bring variety to the project. Turrets are prominent in Edgefield, according to Mr. Wieck, but not limited to Edgefield or high-style homes. He presented images of homes in other neighborhoods with turrets. They should be able to bring in the context of the neighborhoods around them. In addition, they might have existed in this neighborhood previously.

Commissioner Mosley asked if there would "flourishes" on other lots of the development. Mr. Wieck said that unit 8 would be similar and that other buildings would have "flourishes" to ensure variety. Commissioner Mosley said he was open to the arguments made for allowing for the turret.

Commission Johnson asked about the height of the turret. Ms. Warren clarified that the height of the turret is just under the maximum height allowed.

In answer to Commissioner Mosley's question, Ms. Warren explained that the turret pushes the design into a high style that is not seen in the neighborhood. Commissioner Mosley expressed his concern with construction and adding pieces and parts onto the new buildings.

Commissioner Fitts said that applicant made a compelling argument for the design to be a distinguishing feature.

Commissioner Jones agreed with the other commissioners and the fact that the commission requested a variety of looks she is struggling with using context from another neighborhood.

Vice-chairman Stewart said that the context includes a wide variety of homes from a variety of time periods including from the period that this one suggests. The developer is trying to do something that relates to the neighborhood and the turret is not overstated to call undue attention to it. In addition, it will provide the diversity requested.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve with the following conditions:

- 1. Staff shall review and approve the roof color, porch roof, brick, doors, garage doors, windows and walkway material prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within five feet (5') of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within five feet (5') of the rear corner,**

finding that the proposed infill meets the conditions of the part I SP approval for massing and Section III of the Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

t. 945 S DOUGLAS AVE – UNIT 2

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006667

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the staff recommendation. Now we will look at Unit #2, right next door. This unit was approved at one-and-a-half stories with a maximum ridge height of thirty-two feet (32'), eave height of twelve feet (12') and a width of thirty-four feet (34'). The proposed height is several feet lower at about twenty-nine feet, six inches (29'6"). Staff finds that the proposal is appropriate in terms of height, massing, materials, and roof form. It is consistent with the site plan approved for the SP.

Staff's only issue is the use of wall dormers on the side elevations. The design guidelines for Waverly-Belmont only allow wall dormers on rear elevations. The Commission has been consistent in requiring that side dormers have a two foot (2') inset from the wall below.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the proposed house with the condition that the dormers be inset two feet (2'), that staff shall approve materials and that the utility locations be approved. The applicant is here and would like to speak.

Applicant Martin Wieck pointed out a historic house at 824 S Douglas Street that has wall dormers, as precedence for them in this neighborhood. He indicated that they would like to use them to introduce some variety to this design and do not intend to use them widely throughout the project.

Vice-Chair Stewart said that he supported the recommendation for the dormers as that is consistent with what has been requested of other projects.

In answer to Commissioner Price's question, the dormer request was based on exterior design as the interior space had not yet been planned. Commissioner Price agreed with Vice-Chair Stewart.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

- 1. The two (2) wall dormers shall be inset by two feet (2');**
- 2. Staff shall review and approve a brick sample, roofing color, doors, garage doors and walkway material prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 3. The HVAC shall be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within five feet (5') of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within five feet (5') of the rear corner,**

finding that the proposed infill meets the conditions of the part I SP approval for massing and Section III of the Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

u. 945 S DOUGLAS AVE – UNIT 3

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006671

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the staff recommendation. Next is Unit #3. Like Unit #2, this unit was approved at one-and-a-half stories with a maximum ridge height of thirty-two feet (32') and an eave height of twelve feet (12'). The width here was approved at forty feet (40'). Please note the clipped gables on the main roof form. The wrong elevation was included in the body of your report: the gables will be clipped as indicated here and in the set of plans that were attached to the report.

The proposed height meets all of the parameters. Staff finds that the proposal is appropriate in terms of height, massing, materials, and roof form. It is consistent with the site plan approved for the SP, and there are no design issues.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the proposed house with standard conditions as seen here.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Staff shall review and approve the cladding, roofing color, bracket material, doors, garage doors and walkway material prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within five feet (5') of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within five feet (5') of the rear corner,**

finding that the proposed infill meets the conditions of the part I SP approval for massing and Section III of the Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

V. VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/ SHOW CAUSE

None.

VI. MHZC ACTIONS

~~v. 0 N 11TH ST (201 N 11TH ST)
Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006689~~

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

w. 150 WINDSOR DR
Application: Demolition; New Construction—Infill
Council District: 23
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021006235 and T2021006242

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, presented the case for 150 Windsor Drive, which was constructed in 1954. In 2017, MHZC determined after a survey of the neighborhood that the existing house on the lot is non-contributing because its ranch form does not meet the predominate historic house form in the Belle Meade Links Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Also, in 2017, MHZC approved adding a one-half story addition on top of the ranch, which was akin to constructing infill on the lot because the overall height, scale, roof form, and style of the house would have changed. That addition was never built. This application is for a different infill design from what was approved in 2017. The application is to demolish the existing structure and construct infill.

The proposed infill meets all base zoning setbacks, and its front setback meets the context.

The applicant proposes an attached garage, with the garage doors facing the right side of the lot. The design guidelines state that attached garages can be appropriate when they are a typical feature of the neighborhood. Staff found in looking at the 1957 Sanborn map that there were several houses in the overlay that had attached garages, although many of these were front-facing, one-bay garages that have since been filled in to be conditioned space. Belle Meade Links developed later than many other of the conservation overlays in Nashville, with many houses dating from the 1930s and 1940s when automobile ownership was more common, which is why many houses had attached garages.

In this case, staff finds that the proposed attached garage meets the design guidelines because there were several historic attached garages in the conservation overlay and because the garage doors face the side, not the front, and are pushed towards the back of the house where they will be less visible.

The proposed infill will be one-and-a-half stories and twenty-seven feet (27') tall from grade, which meets the context. The infill will have a total width of sixty-two feet, four inches (62'4"); the main form of the house is forty-four feet (44') wide, with the remaining eighteen feet, four inches (18'4") being recessed and shorter in height. Staff finds this width to be appropriate because the lot is ninety-four feet (94') wide and this width is similar to historic houses on similar sized lots in the district.

Staff finds that the infill's roof forms, materials, and orientation all meet the design guidelines.

Staff recommends approval of the infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent houses, to be inspected by MHZC staff;
2. Staff approve a masonry sample, roof shingle color, and all windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;
3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house; and,
4. Utility meters be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within 5' of the rear corner.

With these conditions, Staff finds that the proposed demolition and infill meet Sections II.B. and III.B of the design guidelines for the Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Mr. Steele, applicant, said he was available for questions.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent houses, to be inspected by MHZC staff;**
- 2. Staff approve a masonry sample, roof shingle color, and all windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;**
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house; and,**
- 4. Utility meters be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within 5' of the rear corner;**

finding that with these conditions, Staff finds that the proposed demolition and infill meet Sections II.B. and III.B of the design guidelines for the Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

x. 407 S 10TH ST

Application: New Construction - Infill & Outbuildings

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021005448

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the staff recommendation. The existing house at 407 S 10th Street does not contribute to the historic character of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Staff issued a demolition permit for the structure administratively. The Commission approved new 2-story duplex infill structures on either side of this house last year. The applicant is proposing to construct the same design that was approved next door at #405 S 10th Street here.

South 10th Street marks the western boundary of the overlay. The subject lot is on the east side of 10th Street, between Fatherland Street and Shelby Avenue. As you can see, the entire east side of this block consists of non-contributing ranch houses. And across the street, in the Edgefield Historic Preservation Overlay, the buildings are also non-contributing. There is no historic context on this block. In 2019, the Commission approved duplex infill on this same block, at #307.

The massing is identical to what was approved before. Because this exact plan has been approved right next door, staff suggests that the applicant differentiate the design of this second

structure by changing some of the materials. The applicant has indicated a willingness to work with staff by changing the secondary cladding material and by altering the design/materials of the front porches.

The side elevations are again identical to what was approved before. The application includes two modest one-story garages at the rear, which meet the guidelines.

In conclusion, Staff recommends approval of the application with the conditions on the screen and in your report.

Doug Schenkle, applicant, said he agreed with all the conditions. There were no requests from the public to speak

Motion:

Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve with the following conditions:

- 1. Staff shall review and approve the cladding, roofing color, bracket material, doors, garage doors and walkway material prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located on the rear façade, or on a side façade beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within five feet (5') of the front corner or on the rear or rear-side within five feet (5') of the rear corner;**

finding that the proposed infill meets the conditions of the part I SP approval for massing and Section III of the Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

y. 1016 15TH AVE S

Application: New Construction - Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 19

Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2021006593 and T2021006605

Staff member Jenny Warren presented the staff recommendation. The existing house at 1016 15th Ave South does not contribute to the Edgehill NCZO. Staff has issued a demolition permit administratively. The application is to construct a new single-family house and a DADU.

The historic context features houses that range in height from 19-37ft. The proposed house is appropriate in height at about 28ft. The eave and foundation heights are also appropriate.

The widths of the historic two-story houses range from about twenty-eight feet (28') to about thirty-three feet (33'). This two-story house is proposed to be just under thirty-seven feet (37') wide. While some one or one-and-a-half story houses are this wide, none of the two-stories are. Staff is concerned that a two-story house this wide will have an overall massing that exceeds anything in the context. As such, staff recommends that the width of the house be reduced to be no more than thirty-two to thirty-three feet (32'-33') wide. The additional width also impacts the appropriate rhythm of spacing, which narrowing the house would also correct.

The front setback is appropriate, as are the materials, roof form and orientation. A walkway should be added from the front porch to the sidewalk. The application includes a DADU, which meets all the guidelines.

In conclusion, Staff recommends approval of the application with the conditions on the screen and in your report.

Mitch Hodge, architect for the project, described the project and the reasons for the design. The width is based on the fact that the plan of the main massing is only one-room deep and changes the design from a Federal to a Foursquare design. Most homes are much deeper than what they are proposing.

Commissioner Johnson asked clarifying questions. Ms. Warren clarified details about the massing of the historic context. Commissioner Fitts said she understood what the applicant was trying to achieve but considering the guidelines and context, the house is too wide for a two-story form.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The width of the main house shall be reduced to a maximum of thirty-two to thirty-three feet (32' – 33') wide – a redesign may need to return to the Commission, at the discretion of staff;**
- 2. A walkway from the door to the sidewalk shall be added to the site plan;**
- 3. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 4. Staff shall review and approve the materials for both house and outbuilding, prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s);**

finding that with these conditions, the project meets the *Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay: Handbook and Design Guidelines*. Commissioner Fitts Seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

z. 1417 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2021006638 and T2021006648

Ms. Baldock presented the staff recommendation for 1417 Russell Street. 1417 Russell was a c. 1920 one-story folk Victorian house. The house was significantly damaged in the March 3, 2020 tornado. In October 2020, MHZC staff issued an emergency demolition permit. Applicant proposes to construct infill and an outbuilding on the lot.

The proposed infill and outbuilding meet all base zoning setbacks. The front setback meets the historic context. The proposed infill will be thirty feet, ten inches (30'10") wide at the front and thirty-five feet (35') further back. While these widths are wider than the historic house next door at 1415 B Russell Street, they are in keeping with historic houses in the wider historic context along Holly Street and further east and west along Russell Street

Staff further finds the width to be appropriate because the house is a true one-story house, so the overall massing is scaled to meet the wider historic context. Even though there is a front dormer, there is no upstairs space in the house. The infill will have a ridge height of approximately twenty-three feet eight inches (23'8") from grade at the front, which meets the context.

The infill's roof form, materials, and orientation all meet the design guidelines. There are a lot of non-contributing houses in the immediate vicinity

Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. A front walkway be added from Russell Street to the front porch;
3. The front door be at least half glass;
4. Staff approve a masonry sample, all windows and doors, and roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and,
5. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets Section II.B. of the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

John Hawkins, 1415 B Russel St., explained that he lives next door and he is concerned about the massing being wider and taller than his house and the previous house, and casting a shadow on his home. He added that there are no two-story garages with a room above in the context.

Commissioner Price said that although he is sensitive to the neighbor, he finds that the massing meets the wider context. Vice-Chairman and Commissioner Johnson agreed.

Motion:

Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
2. **A front walkway be added from Russell Street to the front porch;**
3. **The front door be at least half glass;**
4. **Staff approve a masonry sample, all windows and doors, and roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and,**

5. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s);
finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets Section II.B. of the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Fitts Seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

aa. 1812 HOLLY ST

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006690

Staff member Sean Alexander presented the staff recommendation for 1812 Holly Street. An historic house at 1812 Holly Street was destroyed by the tornado on March 3rd, and a demolition permit was subsequently issued. This is a proposal to construct a new one and one-half story house replacing the one that was demolished, and to build a DADU at the rear of the lot.

As outlined in the written version of the Staff Recommendation, the proposal meets the design guidelines. Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the conditions outlined in the staff recommendation.

Applicant Hunter Conley with Michael Ward Architects thanked staff for their assistance and said that he was available for any questions.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve proposed infill and outbuilding at 1812 Holly Street with conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 2. The front setback shall be consistent with the setbacks of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 3. The window and door selections shall be approved by MHZC Staff;**
- 4. The roof color and masonry selections shall be approved by MHZC Staff;**
- 5. The driveway shall be extended to continue along the full-length of the house; and,**
- 6. The utility connections and HVAC units shall be located behind the midpoint of the building on a non-street facing façade;**

finding that with those conditions, the project meets the design guidelines for the Lockeland Springs East-End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

bb. 1830 5th Ave N

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 19

Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2021006620 and T2021006624

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the staff recommendation for 1830 5th Ave N.

Last month the commission approved demolition of the historic house at 1830 5th Ave N, finding that it met the criteria for economic hardship. This month, we have the application for duplex infill and two single-story outbuildings. The infill and outbuildings meet all setbacks except for the street setback from Coffee Street. The application includes a setback determination to reduce the ten foot (10') street setback from Coffee Street to nine feet (9') for the infill and five feet, six inches (5'6") for an outbuilding. Staff finds both setbacks to be appropriate for the historic context and similar to setback determinations approved by the commission for nearby corner lots.

The proposed infill meets all the design guidelines and is appropriate for the historic context. The infill is two stories and includes a wraparound porch as well as a side porch on the Coffee Street side.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval with conditions as outlined in the staff recommendation.

Jeff Zeitlin said he had no further comment and was available for questions.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 2. The front setback shall be verified by MHZC staff in the field after staking;**
- 3. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of roof color, windows, doors, trim, porch elements, driveway material, and garage doors prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s);**

finding that with these conditions, staff finds that the project meets Section III of the *Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation District: Handbook and Design Guidelines*.

Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

v. 1501 FATHERLAND ST

Application: Demo
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler Robin.Zeigler@nashville.gov

Alex Dickerson, MHZC's legal counsel, explained the court's decision. Commissioner Price asked about the ability to appeal.

Motion:

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve demolition, pursuant to the order of the court. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

vi. OTHER BUSINESS

Meeting adjourned at 4:12 p.m.