

# METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue, Nashville, TN 37204 615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

### METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)

# MINUTES April 20, 2022

Commissioners Present: Chair Bell, Leigh Fitts, Mina Johnson, Ben Mosley, David Price, Cyril Stewart

Zoning Staff: Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin

Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Ann Mikkelsen (legal counsel)

Applicants: John Rankin, Paul John Boulifard, John Root, Casey Riley, Manuel Zeitlin, Virginia Payne, Duane

Cuthbertson

**Councilmembers:** Brett Withers

Public: None

Chair Bell called the meeting to order at 2:09 p.m.

Chair Bell read information about the procedures for the meeting and process for appealing a decision.

# I. ADOPTION OF MARCH 15 AND 16 MINUTES

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### II. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

## III. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

- 18. 708 Monroe-move to consent
- 19. 2708 Fairfax--deferred
- 28. 200 Broadway—deferred
- 29. 322 Broadway-move to end of agenda

Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## IV. DEFERRED/ REMOVED

None.

### V. CONSENT AGENDA

### A. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

### 1. 407 LOCKLAND DR

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022492

#### 2. 1907 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022528

### 3. 3804 CENTRALAVE

Application: New Construction--Outbuilding

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022021959

### 4. 1004 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction--Outbuilding/Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022125

## 5. 912 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction -- Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022242

## 6. 4310 UTAH AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead:Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022066

## 7. 408 BROADWAY

Application: Signage Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022294

### 8. 2200 LINDELLAVE

Application: New Construction--Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 17

Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022299

### 9. 1829 4TH AVE N

Application: New Construction--Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 19

Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean. Alexander@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022360 and T2022022361

#### 10. 110 BLACKBURN AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 23

Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean. Alexander @nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022363 and T2022022365

#### 11. 1407 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean. Alexander @nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022354

## 12. 2000 19TH AVE SOUTH

Application: New Construction -- Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022332

## 13. 2112 19TH AVE S

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022247

## 14. 716 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction--Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022314

### 15. 1821 4TH AVE N

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022459

<u>Motion</u>: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve all items on consent, including 708 Monroe, approved with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### VI. RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

### 16. 5797 MT VIEW RD

Application: Designation of Historic Landmark

Council District: 32

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

<u>Description of Project</u>: Property owner, Cara Berkeley, is requesting a Historic Landmark for 5797 Mt. View Road, adoption of the existing Historic Landmark design guidelines for this property; and a comment to Planning Commission regarding a Neighborhood Landmark.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff suggests that the Metro Historic Zoning Commission recommend approval of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council; confirm the site's eligibility for a Neighborhood Landmark as a historic building; and recommends the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations. Staff finds that the building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and therefore meets the requirements of section 17.36.120. for a Historic Landmark Overlay.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

<u>Motion</u>: Commission Stewart moved to approve a recommendation of the historic landmark to the Planning Commission and Metro Council; confirm the site's eligibility for a Neighborhood Landmark as a historic building; and the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark Design Guidelines to apply to exterior alterations; finding that the building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places and therefore meets the requirements of section 17.36.120. for a Historic Landmark Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## VII. VIOLATIONS & SHOW CAUSE REQUESTS

#### **17. 313 BROADWAY**

Application: New Construction-- Addition/Violation

Council District: 19

District: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

Description of Project: T1-11 was installed over an opening in an existing structure without a permit.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends removal and replacement of the siding with a material that meets the design guidelines within sixty (60) days of the Commission's decision, finding that the current solution does not meet Sections II(B), II(I) and III(G)(3) of the guidelines.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

<u>Motion</u>: Commissioner Price moved to require removal and replacement of the siding with a material that meets the design guidelines within sixty (60) days of the Commission's decision, finding that the current solution does not meet Sections II(B), II(I) and III(G)(3) of the guidelines. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

### 18. 708 MONROE

Application: New Construction--Addition/Violation, Setback Determination, and Mural

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

<u>Description of Project</u>: Three additions were installed without a permit. The applicant requests to keep them with some alterations. Two walls with murals were added for a temporary event and are now requested to remain permanently.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the already constructed additions with the recently added panels/murals, setback determination, and the proposed changes finding they meet sections III(E)(5)(e-g) and III(E)(5)(a-b) of the guidelines for materials, Section III(E)(12)(c) for exterior lighting, Sections V(1)(a-c) of the guidelines for design, Section V(2) of the guidelines for height and massing, Section V(3)(a) of the guidelines for signage placement, Section II(E)(2) for setbacks and section VI of the design guidelines for signage.

Decision: Approved on the consent agenda with applicable conditions.

### 19. 2708 FAIRFAX

Application: New Construction--Addition/Violation

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

<u>Description of Project</u>: Three skylights were installed on the front roof plane without a permit.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends that the skylights be removed within sixty (60) days of the Commission's decision finding that they do not meet Section II(B)(2)(a) of the guidelines for roof additions.

Decision: Deferred at the request of the owner's legal counsel.

## 20. 2410 9<sup>TH</sup> AVE S

Violation: Demolition Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2021069982

<u>Description of Project</u>: The house was fully demolished without permits.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends approval of full demolition of the house at 2410 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue South, finding that demolition meets section III(A) and III(B) as the necessary demolition required to repair the building would have resulted in a non-contributing building and because the applicant plans to reconstruct the house using the previously approved plans.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: John Rankin, owner, presented. He passed around an example of the termite damaged framing. There were no requests from the public to speak.

<u>Motion</u>: Commissioner Price moved to approve full demolition of the house at 2410 9<sup>th</sup> Avenue South, finding that demolition meets section III(A) and III(B) as the necessary demolition required to repair the building would have resulted in a non-contributing building and because the applicant plans to reconstruct the house using the previously approved plans. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

#### VIII. MHZC ACTIONS

#### 21. 1051 PETWAY AVE

Application: Economic Hardship

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022619

<u>Description of Project</u>: The applicant requests demolition of a contributing building, arguing for economic hardship.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends approval of full demolition of the house at 1051 Petway Avenue, finding that demolition meets section III.B (2)(b) as the necessary demolition required to repair the building will result in a non-contributing building and the project meets section III.B (2)(a) as repairs are not possible in a manner that retain what is left of the historic building.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: Paul John Boulifard, designer for the project, presented. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve full demolition of the house at 1051 Petway Avenue, finding that demolition meets section III.B (2)(b) as the necessary demolition required to repair the building will result in a non-contributing building and the project meets section III.B (2)(a) as repairs are not possible in a manner that retain what is left of the historic building. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

### 22. 1051 PETWAY AVE

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022695

<u>Description of Project</u>: Applicant proposes to construct an infill that is similar in design to the house previously on the lot and the addition that MHZC approved in March 2021.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends approval of the project with conditions if demolition of the building is approved and disapproval if demolition is disapproved. If approved, staff recommends the conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The foundation concrete block be split face;
- 3. The front dormer be inset at least two feet (2') from the wall below;
- 4. The columns on both front-facing porches have caps and bases;
- 5. A walkway be added from the sidewalk to the porch of the rear residential unit;
- 6. Staff approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, the material and color of the porch roof, and the walkway and driveway materials prior to purchase and installation,
- 7. Staff approve the location of all utility meters and HVAC units prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: Paul John Boulifard, designer for the project, presented. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve with the conditions that:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The foundation concrete block be split face;
- 3. The front dormer be inset at least two feet (2') from the wall below;
- 4. The columns on both front-facing porches have caps and bases;
- 5. A walkway be added from the sidewalk to the porch of the rear residential unit;
- 6. Staff approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, the material and color of the porch roof, and the walkway and driveway materials prior to purchase and installation,
- 7. Staff approve the location of all utility meters and HVAC units prior to purchase and installation; finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

### 23. 1109 PETWAY AVE

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph. Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022631

<u>Description of Project</u>: The application is to construct a two-story duplex on the vacant lot at 1109 Petway Avenue.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed duplex infill, finding that the project does not meet section V(A)(1) for form nor V(C)(4)b for rhythm along street of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: John Root, architect for the project presented and handed out additional images. Councilmember Withers spoke in support of the project.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. All materials are approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 3. The siding not exceed the maximum of 7"; and,
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding the project meets the design guidelines for infill and because of the unique context. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Johnson in opposition.

#### 24. 618 NOCTURNE DR

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 02

Overlay: Haynes Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

Description of Project: Applicant proposes infill construction on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the project, finding that it does meet Sections V(A) for Massing and Scale, V(B) for Form, and V(C) for Siting, Setbacks, Orientation, and Rhythm of Spacing.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

<u>Motion</u>: Commissioner Fitts moved to disapprove the project, finding that it does not meet Sections V(A) for Massing and Scale, V(B) for Form, and V(C) for Siting, Setbacks, Orientation, and Rhythm of Spacing. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 25. 1312 CALVIN AVE

Application: New Construction--Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022122

<u>Description of Project</u>: Applicant proposes a rear addition, partial demolition, and side dormers.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The windows on the right façade of the historic house remain unaltered;

- 2. Staff approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and all masonry prior to purchase and installation; and
- 3. The HVAC and other utilities be located on the rear or on a side façade, beyond the midpoint of the house.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets Sections III(A), III(B), VI(A), VI(B), VI(D), and VI(E) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

Public Hearing: Casey Riley, property owner, presented. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Staff approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and all masonry prior to purchase and installation; and
- 2. The HVAC and other utilities be located on the rear or on a side façade, beyond the midpoint of the house:

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets Sections III(A), III(B), VI(A), VI(B), VI(D), and VI(E) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Mosley in opposition.

### 26. 1913 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction--Infill and Outbuilding/DADU

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022131 and T2022022141

Description of Project: Applicant proposes to construct one-and-a-half story infill and outbuilding on a vacant lot.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: The applicant was not present and there were no requests from the public to speak.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. All masonry samples, all windows and doors, the trim material, the pathway material, and the porch floor material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

- 3. Four-inch (nominal) corner boards shall be at the face of each exposed corner;
- 4. Double and triple windows shall have 4" to 6" mullions between them; and,
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. All masonry samples, all windows and doors, the trim material, the pathway material, and the porch floor material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 3. Four-inch (nominal) corner boards shall be at the face of each exposed corner;
- 4. Double and triple windows shall have 4" to 6" mullions between them; and,
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### **27. 209 BROADWAY**

Application: New Construction--Infill/ Revision

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022013231

<u>Description of Project</u>: Revised application for infill, proposing a new pivot-window that the Commission has not previously approved.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends approval of pivoting windows for this warehouse form building with the condition that the final windows selected shall be approved prior to purchase and installation. With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed windows meet section III. (New Construction) of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: The applicant was available for questions but did not speak. There were no requests from the public to speak.

<u>Motion</u>: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve pivoting windows for this warehouse form building with the condition that the final windows selected shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; finding that with these conditions, the proposed windows meet section III. (New Construction) of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

### 28. 200 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction--Addition/ Revision

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022347

<u>Description of Project</u>: Revision to a previously approved application for a rooftop addition and alterations to a contributing structure.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the revisions with the conditions that:

- 1. The "thin brick" is replaced with an alternative material that meets the design guidelines and is approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 2. The bulkhead of the central bay on the Second Avenue side is lowered to match the front bulkhead height;
- 3. The final pilaster details shall be approved, including dimensions, design and material, prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. The rooftop addition maintains the stepbacks previously approved; and,
- 5. If the window film is located on the exterior of the windows, it shall have a frosted-glass appearance. (Frosted glass is encouraged if the film is located on the inside of the windows.)

With these conditions, staff finds the project meets the design guidelines for section II for Rehabilitation and section III for New Construction.

**Decision: Deferred at the request of the applicant.** 

## **29. 322 BROADWAY**

Application: Signage Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022022303

<u>Description of Project</u>: Application is to install a projecting sign on the Broadway façade of this corner building.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends disapproval of the projecting sign, finding that the project does not meet Section IV of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay District as the addition of the proposed projecting sign exceeds the allotment for the Broadway façade of the building.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: Duane Cuthbertson, representing the applicant, presented. There were no requests from the public to speak.

<u>Motion</u>: Commissioner Price moved to disapprove the projecting sign, finding that the project does not meet Section IV of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay District as the addition of the proposed projecting sign exceeds the allotment for the Broadway façade of the building. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 30. 1309 5TH AVE N

Application: New Construction--Infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa. Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022013588

<u>Description of Project</u>: Application is to construct townhouse development on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC staff verify the finished floor height to ensure compatibility with the historic context;
- 2. The 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue North and Monroe Street façades be at least eighty percent (80%) brick;
- **3.** MHZC approve all masonry samples, the windows and doors, and the metal roofing/siding material prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. MHZC approve all lighting, fencing, and other appurtenances prior to purchase and installation; and
- 5. MHZC approve the location of all utilities and HVAC units.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Section III of the design guidelines for the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: Manuel Zeitlin, architect for the project, presented. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC staff verify the finished floor height to ensure compatibility with the historic context;
- 2. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the windows and doors, and the metal roofing/siding material prior to purchase and installation;
- 3. MHZC approve all lighting, fencing, and other appurtenances prior to purchase and installation; and
- 4. MHZC approve the location of all utilities and HVAC units;

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Section III of the design guidelines for the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 31. 4101 ABERDEEN RD

Application: New Construction--Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination; Partial Demolition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022013517

<u>Description of Project</u>: Application is to construct a side addition, rear addition, and outbuilding that includes a wall attached to the structure. Setback determinations are requested for both additions as well as the outbuilding and attached wall. The project includes demolition of an existing rear portion of the historic house but no other changes to the historic house.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The side addition shall be removed from the plans prior to permitting;
- 2. The outbuilding and attached solid wall shall meet the ten foot (10') street setback from Mockingbird Rd;
- 3. The final details of the windows, doors, and brick shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 5. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored; and,
- 6. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding can meet sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Cherokee Park chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

<u>Public Hearing</u>: Virginia Payne, owner, presented. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The side addition shall be removed from the plans prior to permitting;
- 2. The outbuilding and attached solid wall shall meet the ten foot (10') street setback from Mockingbird Rd:
- 3. The final details of the windows, doors, and brick shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 5. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored; and,
- 6. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Cherokee Park chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

### IX. OTHER BUSINESS

### 32. REVISION TO RULES OF ORDER

<u>Description of Project</u>: Revisions to Rules of Order that include new requirements for notification of meeting.

<u>Recommendation Summary</u>: Staff recommends approval of the revised Rules of Order.

Decision: Vice Chair Stewart moved to defer review of the Rules of Order. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 33. REVISIONS TO HISTORIC PROPERTY TAX ABATEMENT PROGRAM

<u>Description of Project</u>: Council approved legislation to develop a Historic Property Improvement and Restoration Tax Abatement Program (Historic Property Tax Abatement Program) based on T.C.A. § 67-5-218. The MHZC approved a management plan on July 21, 2021. Council filed an amendment to the legislation; therefore revisions are now recommended to meet the amended legislation for clarity.

Summary Recommendation: Staff recommends the following administration of the proposed Historic Property Tax Abatement Program, based on enabling legislation in T.C.A. § 67-5-218 and guidance and support from the Assessor of Property for Metro Nashville and Davidson County and the Office of the Trustee.

<u>Motion</u>: Commissioner Price moved to adopt the administration of the proposed Historic Property Tax Abatement Program, based on enabling legislation in T.C.A. § 67-5-218 and guidance and support from the Assessor of Property for Metro Nashville and Davidson County and the Office of the Trustee. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

RATIFIED BY COMMISSION ON 5/18/2022