

DAVID BRILEY
MAYOR



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission
Sunnyside in Sevier Park

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES May 15, 2019

Commissioners Present: Chairman Bell, Kaitlyn Jones, Elizabeth Mayhall, David Price, Cyril Stewart
Zoning Staff: Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Paul Hoffman, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren, Robin Zeigler (historic zoning administrator), Thomas Cross (legal counsel)
Applicants: Chris Strickland, Martin Wieck, Brad Sayers, Nick Dryden, David Baird, Stefan Baskin, Peggy Newman, Cheyenne Smith
Councilmembers: None
Public: None

Chairman Bell called the meeting to order at 2:06 p.m.

Chairman Bell read information about the amount of time people have to speak, the process of the consent agenda and the process for appeals.

I. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC: Items on the agenda may be removed or moved at this time.

Staff member, Robin Zeigler, requested that 1005 Mansfield be moved to the consent agenda. The applicant for 300 Broadway requested a deferral and the applicant for 921 Benton requested to be removed from the consent agenda.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda with the requested deferrals. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

II. RECOGNITION OF COUNCILMEMBERS

There were no councilmembers in attendance.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. April 17, 2019

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to accept the minutes as presented. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

IV. CONSENT AGENDA

Staff member, Paul Hoffman, presented the cases for the consent agenda.

b. 1401 LILLIAN ST

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025419

c. 909 MANILA AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 05
Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025425

d. 200 FALL ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025488

e. 101 BROADWAY

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025695

f. 2811 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction—Addition and DADU.
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025755 and T2019025760

g. 921 BENTON AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025693

h. 1720 SWEETBRIAR AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2019025973 and T2019025974

Motion:

Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve all consent items with their applicable condition with the addition of 1005 Mansfield and the removal of 921 Benton. Commissioner Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

V. OVERLAY RECOMMENDATIONS & DESIGN GUIDELINE ADOPTIONS

None

VI. PREVIOUSLY DEFERRED ITEMS

The items below were deferred at a previous MHZC meeting at the request of the applicant.

i. 300 BROADWAY

Application: Rehabilitation—Lighting

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Applicant requested a deferral.

VII. PRELIMINARY & FINAL SP REVIEW

j. 1514, 1516, 1518 EDGEHILL AVE

Application: New Construction—Preliminary SP

Council District: 19

Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019024916

Staff member, Melissa Sajid presented the case for an SP at 1514, 1516 and 1518 Edgehill Avenue.

Application is to construct a townhome development at the corner of Edgehill Avenue and Villa Place. The project requires a rezoning to a Specific Plan District (SP). The current proposal is for approval of the overall massing and site plan only. If the SP is approved by Metro Council, the project will return to this Commission for final review. The site includes three parcels at the northwest corner of Edgehill Avenue and Villa Place. Two of the parcels are currently vacant, and one parcel has an existing non-contributing building. Staff administratively issued a preservation permit to demolish the non-contributing structure earlier this month.

This proposal is for a ten-unit townhome development in two buildings with four units in the building oriented to Edgehill Ave and six units in the building fronting Villa Place. Access will be via the existing rear and side alley and all parking will be interior to the site. Both buildings will be located close to the street. The proposed setbacks can be appropriate at this location as there is context in the immediate area for non-single-family structures to be located directly behind the sidewalk. In addition, the proposed setback is more typical and appropriate for the townhouse form than a deeper setback as it allows the parking to be located entirely behind the buildings.

The building oriented to Edgehill Ave will be three stories with a height of 42'-6" from grade to top of parapet. The historic context along Edgehill Avenue includes single and two-story commercial structures on the corners across Edgehill Avenue. To the right of the site, across Villa Place, there are single-story and three-story non-contributing houses. The three-story buildings are between thirty feet (38') and forty-two feet (42') tall. In this section there is also a one and one-half story historic house at 1508 Edgehill Avenue.

The one- to two-story White Way complex has one building with a tall center core so the heights of the complex vary between approximately thirty feet to fifty feet (30' - 50'). Outside of the overlay, but in the neighborhood, are several tall historic homes along 16th Avenue South that range from thirty-five feet to thirty-nine feet (35'-39') in height.

The building oriented to Villa Place will be two stories with a height of 30'-6" tall from grade to the top of the parapet.

There is no historic context on the block of Villa Place north of Edgehill Avenue. Only two buildings are oriented to Villa Place on this block, 1503 Tremont Street, which has its entrance on Villa Place, and 1100 Villa Place. Both are non-contributing.

Although the Edgehill portion of the project is taller than most of the surrounding historic context, the most important historic building in the immediate vicinity is a large previously industrial, now commercial, complex with a variety of heights. Staff finds that the form as well as the height and scale of the proposed development can be appropriate at this location given the variety of land uses and building forms in the immediate area, the context of taller structures nearby, the fact that White Way has a deep setback off Edgehill which will help avoid the canyon effect, and the project's transition from three to two stories as the development leaves the commercial corridor and enters the residential portion of the district on Villa Place. Staff finds the heights of the proposed buildings to be compatible with the historic context and meet the design guidelines for the Edgehill NCZO.

Both buildings will have a flat roof with a parapet. This roof type is represented in the immediate historic context. Second-story Juliette balconies are proposed for each unit. Juliette balconies are not characteristic of the residential historic context. The proposed development is a multi-family building form that is seen throughout the larger neighborhood; however, this particular design incorporates more industrial design elements because of its proximity to the White Way complex. Since the design and form are somewhat unique to the neighborhood overall, staff finds the balconies could be appropriate in this case. Staff finds that the project meets the design guidelines for building and roof forms.

Staff recommends approval with the condition that if the SP is approved by Metro Council, the applicant will return to the Commission with a second application or additional applications, including full plans complete with design details of the proposal.

Chris Strickland, architect for the project, said he agreed with conditions.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve with the condition that if the SP is approved by the Planning Commission, the applicant will return to the Commission with a second application or additional applications, including full plans complete with design details review of materials; windows and doors; proportion and rhythm of openings; porches and stoops, fences and walls, appurtenances and utility locations; and the overall detailing of the proposal; finding that with this condition, the massing of the project meets the design guidelines for new construction in the Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

k. 1005 MANSFIELD ST

Application: New Construction-Preliminary SP

Council District: 05

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.sajid@nashville.gov

Approved on the consent agenda.

VIII. VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS

IX. MHZC ACTIONS

g. 921 BENTON AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019025693

Staff member, Jenny Warren, presented the case for 921 Benton Ave, which was removed from the consent agenda, at the request of the applicant. 921 Benton is a circa 1930 brick bungalow that contributes to the character of the Waverly-Belmont NCZO. This application is for the construction of an addition, inclusive of an attached garage, and a separate detached garage.

Non-historic additions in the rear will be removed to make way for the new addition. The lots are unusually deep, at nearly two-hundred-ninety feet (290').

The addition takes advantage of the depth of the lot and the grade. Overall, staff finds that the proposal to meet the guidelines. The grade drops off away from the street, allowing the applicant to build a basement-level attached garage and a full two-story addition, while not going any taller than the historic house.

In terms of width, the addition will set-in appropriately on both sides. On the east, it will step out again after the garage, and will be flush with the side wall of the historic house, as seen here in plan and here in elevation. On the west, it will set in two feet (2') for a depth of two feet (2'). Then a portion of the addition will step out about seven feet (7') wider than the historic house. The property meets the guidelines for an addition that goes wider, because the lot is sixty feet (60') wide, and because the house is slightly off-set.

Due to the grade, the wider portion of the addition will appear only one story tall as viewed from Benton. Further back, a second portion will step out about six feet (6') wider as indicated here. This second projection is slightly lower than the first.

Staff finds all this work to meet the guidelines. The one issue we wanted to discuss before you today involve some partial demolition work proposed for the east elevation. The applicant proposes to shorten the paired windows in the back, which staff supports. The applicant would like to also remove the side door, hood and landing.

Staff agrees that the door itself is not original but finds that the opening may well be. The railing is certainly very old, if not original. The edge of the hood does hang over the window to the right - but only the added gutter, not the hood itself. Staff recommends that the opening, hood and stoop be retained, though the door itself could be changed, and would not need to be functional. These features are beyond the midpoint, where MHZC often allows fenestration alterations, but this area is very visible and side entries with hoods are common character defining features for bungalows.

The proposed detached garage meets all the guidelines for outbuildings and staff recommends approval of it, subject to final materials approvals.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. The side door opening, hood and stoop will remain; and
2. Staff approve the roofing color, windows and the final pedestrian and garage doors prior to purchase and installation; and,
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point

finding that the project meets Section III and IV of the *Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation District: Handbook and Design Guidelines*.

Martin Wieck, architect for the project, said he agreed with all conditions except for retaining the door. He made the argument that the mortar around the door did not look original, the brackets of the hood are different from the eave brackets, and the concrete steps are not original. Removal of the door will allow the façade to be perfectly symmetrical. Historic homes often had a door added to the attic stores at a later date. Altogether these conditions illustrate the entrance is not original.

Commissioner Stewart asked about an opening in the basement, which Mr. Wieck thought might have been a basement window. Commissioner Price asked if the door was retained as a false door if that would cause a problem

with interior programming. Mr. Wieck said it would not affect the interior but then there would be a stoop without a function. Commissioner Mayhall clarified that if the door was removed the opening would be bricked-up. Commissioner Stewart asked about the previous use of the attic level and Mr. Wieck said it was a separate apartment.

There were no requests from the public to speak. Commissioner Stewart said that it was likely a single-family home with an apartment added later; therefore, the stoop was not historic. Commissioner Mayhall agreed.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Staff approve the roofing color, windows and the final pedestrian and garage doors prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house; finding that the project meets Section III and IV of the *Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation District: Handbook and Design Guidelines*. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

I. 1612 DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019025750

Staff member, Jenny Warren, presented the case for a non-contributing building in the Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. A demolition permit has been issued. The zoning here allows for two units. The immediate historic context consists of one and one-and-a-half (1 and 1 ½) story houses. These range in height from about twenty to twenty-seven feet (20'-27').

The proposed duplex is a true two-story with a total height of just over twenty-nine feet (29') and an eighteen-foot (18') eave height. The infill is proposed to be approximately thirty-nine feet, six inches (39'6") wide, while the historic houses nearby are between twenty-eight and thirty-two feet (28'-32') wide. Staff finds that the width, height and two-story form are inappropriate for the historic context.

The site plan indicates that the house would sit about forty feet (40') from the front property line. Staff recommends that the front setback be moved up, closer to thirty-four feet (34') from the front property line, to align with the historic context. The side setbacks meet base zoning at five feet (5') on both sides, but as discussed, this creates a house that is significantly wider than the historic context.

The materials are appropriate with final staff review and approval. The primary roof is side gabled with a shallow 4/12 pitch. While the roof form is appropriate, staff finds that the slope is flatter than is typical for the historic context.

The side elevations both have two sections of blank wall that are wider than thirteen feet (13'). Staff recommends additional window openings be added.

The site plan shows that these two front doors will be recessed from the front gabled projections by about two feet, nine inches (2'9") and will be covered by a shed roof. Staff recommends that a true front porch be added, with a depth of at least six feet (6').

The outbuilding could meet the guidelines as submitted, however, as the appropriate eave and ridge heights are based on the primary structure, and staff is recommending that it be redesigned, staff recommends disapproval of the outbuilding until a primary structure is approved.

Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed infill finding that it does not meet the following sections of the design guidelines for the Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay: II.B.1.a (height), II.B.1.b (scale), II.B.1.c (setback and rhythm of spacing), II.B.1.f (orientation)

Chairman Bell noted that staff forward an email to the Commission from Councilmember Withers, which supported the staff recommendation.

Brad Sayers, architect for the project said he did not know about the width restriction until the design was completed. They have a back-up plan that maintains the height and width requirement. He requested to defer the case.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to defer and Commissioner Price seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

m. 1314-1320 5th AVE N

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019025739

Staff member, Melissa Baldock, presented the case for infill at 1314-1320 5th Ave N, which is a c. 1960 one-story commercial structure that does not contribute to the historic character of the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. MHZC staff issued an administrative permit to demolish the structure on May 3, 2019. The site is located within the Germantown National Register of Historic Places boundaries.

One of the conditions of approval is that the curb cut on 5th Avenue North be removed, and the brick sidewalk be restored. The application is to construct a townhouse development, which is allowed in the National Register District Development Zone. There will be six townhouses along 5th Avenue North, and seven townhouses in the rear of the lot.

The townhouses will have a ridge height of approximately thirty-three feet (33') from grade., which meets the design guidelines. The facades that face 5th Avenue North are approximately eighty-five percent (85%) brick, which meets the design guidelines. The applicant is proposing a brick that is a grey-black. The design guidelines state, "The color of masonry should be similar to historic colors of the same or similar materials. Traditional brick colors range from red-oranges to dark red." The proposed grey-black brick is not within the range of typical red bricks found on historic buildings within Germantown. Staff therefore recommends that the applicant chose a brick that is in the range of orange-red to dark red.

The applicant is proposing brick to grade. Typically, a building's foundation is visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material, usually accomplished with a change in materials. In this case, because the form is a modern townhouse design, staff recommends that a soldier course or other brick detail be incorporated at the foundation line to delineate the floor line.

The townhouses along 5th Avenue North have a 10/12 side gable roof form at the front, and a flat roof form at the rear. The design guidelines do not allow for rooftop decks in the National Register zone. Even though the townhouses do have flat roofed areas, there is no access shown on the drawings to the roof to allow for use as a rooftop deck.

The seven interior townhouses will have similar ridge and eave heights, adjusting the foundation and finished floor heights due to the grade. They also have similar roof forms to the houses at the front of the lot. These units are oriented to face the interior courtyard, which staff finds to be appropriate.

Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The curb cut along 5th Avenue North be removed, and the sidewalk replaced with bricks to match the existing brick sidewalks;
2. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
3. The foundation line be delineated with a soldier course or other brick detail;
4. Staff approve window and door selections prior to purchase and installation;
5. Staff approve brick selection prior to purchase and installation, and that the brick be within the range of orange red to dark red;
6. Staff approve the materials of the footbridges, interior courtyard paving, and interior walkways;
7. Staff approve all appurtenances, including, but not limited to, lighting, walkways, gutters, gates, etc.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed project meets Sections III. and IV. of the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.

Nick Dryden, architect for the project, agreed with all conditions. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Commissioner Jones stated the project met the design guidelines, as presented by staff.

Motion:

Commissioner Jones moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The curb cut along 5th Avenue North be removed, and the sidewalk replaced with bricks to match the existing brick sidewalks;**
 - 2. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
 - 3. The foundation line be delineated with a soldier course or other brick detail;**
 - 4. Staff approve window and door selections prior to purchase and installation;**
 - 5. Staff approve brick selection prior to purchase and installation, and that the brick be within the range of orange red to dark red;**
 - 6. Staff approve the materials of the footbridges, interior courtyard paving, and interior walkways; and**
 - 7. Staff approve all appurtenances, including, but not limited to, lighting, walkways, gutters, gates, etc;**
- finding that with these conditions, the proposed project meets Sections III. and IV. of the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

n. 413 BUSHNELL

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019025972

Melissa Baldock presented the case for infill at 413 Bushnell, a sixty-foot (60') wide lot that is vacant and was formerly part of 415 Bushnell, the lot to its north/left. The application is for infill development. This lot is part of the Little Hollywood section of Lockeland Springs, where there is a significant collection of early to mid-twentieth century Spanish Colonial Revival stucco houses. On this block of Bushnell, there are a mix of one to one-and-a-half story stone, brick, and stucco houses.

The infill will meet all base zoning setbacks, and its front setback is appropriate to the historic context. The house is shifted on the lot to accommodate a driveway on the left side, since there is no rear alley. The applicant is proposing a two-story infill with a flat roof. The fiber cement panels and detailing are a modern take on the stucco Spanish Colonial Revival houses in Little Hollywood.

The predominant form along Bushnell Street is one to one-and-a-half stories. Staff finds a two-story form could be appropriate in this location for several reasons. The overall height of the house is comparable to the heights of the two adjacent historic one-and-a-half story houses. In addition, the flat roof form helps to keep the overall height of

the two-story form minimal. The flat roof form is appropriate here because the Spanish Colonial Revival Houses of Little Hollywood have flat roof forms. However, staff recommends that the two-story portion be pushed back further so that there is a one-story portion beyond the front porch and the second story is behind the front wall of the house by several feet. Staff recommends that the second story wall be pushed back a minimum of eight additional feet (8') from the front wall of the first story.

The massing study submitted by the architect prior to the official submission shows the second story wall stepped back from the front wall of the one-story portion of the house by several feet. On the right is the current submission. Staff recommends that the massing be similar to what was presented in the massing study.

Staff recommends approval of the house with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. MHZC approved the front setback in the field prior to construction;
3. The second story be set back a minimum of eight feet (8') from the wall of the first story;
4. A walkway be added from the street to the front porch;
5. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;
6. Staff approve the color and texture of the vertical metal siding prior to purchase and installation; and
7. Staff approve the location of the HVAC and all utilities prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

David Baird, architect for the project, stated that he agreed with all the conditions. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the house with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 2. MHZC approved the front setback in the field prior to construction;**
- 3. The second story be set back a minimum of eight feet (8') from the wall of the first story;**
- 4. A walkway be added from the street to the front porch;**
- 5. Staff approve the final details, dimensions and materials of windows and doors prior to purchase and installation;**
- 6. Staff approve the color and texture of the vertical metal siding prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 7. Staff approve the location of the HVAC and all utilities prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Jones seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

o. 1311 & 1313 SECOND AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander, sean.alexander@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019020187

Staff member, Sean Alexander presented the case for an addition at 1311 and 1313 2nd Ave North. The application is a revision to a proposal presented last month to rehab two historic buildings and connect them with a rear addition and a shared side addition. That application was not approved. The applicant has made revisions.

The existing buildings are two turn-of-the century Folk Victorian houses. The one on the left is frame with a gabled-L form, the one on the right is brick with a front-gabled form.

The applicants will repair and, where needed, replace deteriorated exterior materials. Staff will evaluate the buildings with the applicant to determine which materials must remain and which may be replaced, and to approve replacement materials.

The proposal indicates that the brick on 1313 will be whitewashed or painted white. The guidelines only allow brick to be painted in a few situations, and then the brick must match the original brick color. The brick has already been painted therefore repainting may be appropriate; however, staff recommends that if the building is painted, that the paint color shall be red as the guidelines require.

Staff had not mentioned in the written recommendation that stripping or removing the existing paint would also be appropriate, but this is another option.

An original side porch on 1313 has been enclosed. The proposal indicates that the plywood wall will be replaced with brick to match the existing wall. Removing the plywood is appropriate but bricking in the wall gives it the appearance of being original, where the design should re-establish and maintain the visual openness of the porch. One option might be to fill in with glass windows or doors.

The two buildings are historic, but adjacent and across the street, and the eastern edge of Germantown, there is not much historic integrity. Additions like the current proposal are not something that staff would support, just about anywhere else, but here because of the erosion of the historic context staff finds it can be appropriate on this edge of the Germantown Neighborhood.

From the right, the rear addition will step in from the right side of 1313 2nd Ave and go back with a hipped mass. The walls will be stucco with ample windows. The primary roof will be asphalt shingle. These materials are appropriate.

From the left of 1311 the project will not be highly visible because of a commercial building to the left, so there will be the same stucco walls but without windows. Staff finds this also appropriate.

The roof form will be hipped with gabled dormers. The primary roof height and eave heights will be between the corresponding heights of the two historic houses.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed rear addition to 1311 and 1313 2nd Avenue North, with the following conditions:

1. The original roof framing is retained, and reinforced if necessary; and
2. Staff shall approve the replacement of any windows, doors, siding, trim, porch columns; and
3. Staff shall approve new materials for the porch floor; and
4. The brick on 1313 2nd Avenue North may be repainted a color matching the original brick color (orange-red); and
5. The non-original side porch wall shall be replaced with materials and a design that maintains the visual openness and character of the porch.

Meeting those conditions, staff finds that the proposal meets the design guidelines for Rehabilitation and New Construction—Additions in the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Stefan Baskin, owner of the property, said he agreed with the conditions but would like to remove the seven layers of paint and then paint the two houses complimentary colors. He would like a neutral ivory or bone color or one of the previous colors on the building. He does not want the color to be red or orange and didn't think that is what staff wants either.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

The Commissioner invited the applicant back and he said he was being unfairly punished by someone having paint the building seven times.

Commissioner Stewart commended the applicant on the project. He endorsed removing of the paint, but the design guidelines were adopted by the neighborhood and it would be arbitrary for them to change the paint color, if paint color is needed. Trim colors might be a way to visually tie the two structures together.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the proposed rear addition to 1311 and 1313 2nd Avenue North, with the following conditions:

- 1. The original roof framing is retained, and reinforced if necessary;**
- 2. Staff shall approve the replacement of any windows, doors, siding, trim, porch columns; and**
- 3. Staff shall approve new materials for the porch floor;**
- 4. The paint may be removed and if that is not possible the paint color should match the original brick color (orange-red); and**
- 5. The non-original side porch wall shall be replaced with materials and a design that maintains the visual openness and character of the porch;**

finding that with those conditions, the proposal meets the design guidelines for Rehabilitation and New Construction—Additions in the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

p. 1203 B LILLIAN ST

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander

PermitID#: T2019025409

Staff member, Sean Alexander presented the case for infill at 1203 B Lillian Street, a proposal to construct a new house on a lot with two street frontages, on which there is currently a house facing Fatherland Street. The new house will face Lillian Street and will be one and one-half-stories tall.

Building a “house behind a house” configuration is generally not compatible with the character of most historic areas, however, on double frontage situations similar to this one staff finds that it may be appropriate. There is an established rhythm of houses on both streets, and infill facing Lillian would make for a more consistent pattern on the block. Therefore, staff finds that a second structure may appropriate.

The new house will be twenty-five feet, six inches (25'-6”) tall from the floor level to the peak of the roof, and with the foundation and sloping grade, the max height will be approx. 31’ tall. This is compatible with surrounding context.

The building will be approximately twenty-seven feet (27’) wide, shifted to the right side of the lot with a driveway running up along the left side of the house. This width and orientation are similar to the surrounding context, there is no alley access behind the lot.

The materials will be common infill materials: cement-fiber siding, split face CMU foundation, asphalt shingle. Staff asks that as a condition of approval staff shall approve the window and door selections as well as the roof color.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed one and one-half-story infill at 1203 B Lillian Street with conditions that:

1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;
2. The front setback shall be consistent with the setbacks of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC

staff in the field;

3. The window and door selections shall be approved by MHZC Staff; and
4. The roof color shall be approved by MHZC Staff; and
5. The utility connections and HVAC units shall be located behind the midpoint of the building on a non-street facing façade.

With those conditions met, Staff finds that the project will meet the design guidelines for new construction in the Lockeland Springs East-End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Commissioners and staff discussed the unusual roof pitches and the driveway location.

Peggy Newman explained the roof pitches. There were no requests from the public to speak.

The Commission invited the applicant back for a question. Ms. Newman asked if the concrete strips were required and Mr. Alexander said that strips were the most historically accurate. Ms. Newman stated that she has complaints about broken ankles.

There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the proposed one and one-half-story infill at 1203 B Lillian Street with conditions that:

- 1. The driveway be strip or solid;**
- 2. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 3. The front setback shall be consistent with the setbacks of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
- 4. The window and door selections shall be approved by MHZC Staff; and**
- 5. The roof color shall be approved by MHZC Staff; and**
- 6. The utility connections and HVAC units shall be located behind the midpoint of the building on a non-street facing façade;**

finding that with these conditions the project will meet the design guidelines for new construction in the Lockeland Springs East-End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

q. 1502 SHELBY AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2019025482

Staff member, Melissa Sajid, presented the case for infill at 1502 Shelby Ave.

In January 2019, the historic house at 1502 Shelby Avenue was severely damaged by a fire. After careful analysis, MHZC staff determined that the extent of the fire damage was so severe that the house was not salvageable. MHZC staff issued an administrative permit for the demolition of the historic house in February 2019.

The current plan meets the design guidelines for height, scale, setbacks and rhythm of spacing, materials, roof shape, and orientation. As proposed, the infill is oriented to Shelby Avenue with parking from the alley. The structure is one and one-half stories. The form is appropriate as the context includes 1, 1.5, and 2 story homes. Also, the height and width of the house are appropriate for the historic context.

In conclusion, staff recommends approval of the infill with conditions, which are standard conditions regarding the finished floor height, front setback, materials, and utility location, finding that the request meets the design guidelines.

Cheyenne Smith said he agreed with the conditions. There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion:

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of the adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
 - 2. The front setback shall be consistent with the buildings to either side, to be verified by MHZC staff in the field;**
 - 3. Staff approve the final selections of the trim, roof color, porch posts, rear porch railing, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation; and**
 - 4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house;**
- finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Section II.B. of the Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously**

Meeting adjourned at 3:20 p.m.