



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES

October 19, 2022

2601 Bransford Avenue

2:00 p.m.

[Metro Nashville Network](#) will broadcast this meeting of the Metro Historic Zoning Commission live on Comcast channel 3 and simulcast a [livestream](#). See “How the Meeting Works” at the end of this agenda for information on providing public comment.

Menié Bell, Chair
Cyril Stewart, Vice-Chair

Beth Cashion
Chris Cotton
Mina Johnson
Elizabeth Mayhall

Ben Mosley
David Price
Dr. Williams

Tim Walker
Executive Director, Metro Historical Commission and Metro Historic Zoning Commission

Robin Zeigler
Historic Zoning Administrator, Metro Historic Zoning Commission

Ann Mikkelsen
Legal Counsel

[Metro Historic Zoning Commission](#)
1113 Kirkwood Avenue, Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970
historicalcommission@nashville.gov



The Metro Historical Commission does not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, age, religion, creed or disability in access to, or operation of its programs, services, activities or in its hiring or employment practices. **ADA inquiries should be forwarded to:** Metro Historical Commission ADA Compliance Coordinator, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue, Nashville, TN 37204, (615) 862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov. **Title VI inquiries should be forwarded to:** Ms. Shirley Sims-Saldana, Title VI Coordinator, Human Relations, 800 Second Avenue, South, 4th floor, Nashville, TN 37210, (615) 880-3391. **Contact Department of Human Resources for all employment related inquiries** at (615) 862-6640.

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

October 19, 2022

2601 Bransford Avenue

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton Mayhall, Mosley, Williams.

Staff Attendance: Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Sean Alexander, Melissa Baldock, Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid and Jenny Warren.

Chair Bell welcomed new commissioner Chris Cotton.

1. ADOPTION OF SEPTEMBER 20 AND 21 MINUTES

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the minutes as provided. Commissioner Williams seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

The following items are requested to be removed from the agenda:

- 9. 1234 6th Avenue North—notification requirements not met
- 16. Abatement Program Revision—referral requested
- 19. 305 Greenway Avenue—applicant requests deferral
- 23. 2127 W Linden Avenue—revised for administrative permit
- 24. 2808 Acklen Avenue—applicant requests deferral

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to accept the revised agenda. Commissioner Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 300 SCOTT AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067356

6. 128 BLACKBURN AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 23
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067403

- 7. 600 MONROE ST**
Application: New Construction – Outbuilding; Setback Determination
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067317
- 8. 605 PRESS PL**
Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022065149
- 9. 1234 6TH AVE N**
Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067011
- 10. 720 BOSCOBEL ST**
Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067405
- 11. 1616 BENJAMIN ST**
Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022065101 & T2022065109
- 12. 930 MCFERRIN AVE**
Application: New Construction – Infill (SP Part 1)
Council District: 05
Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022029236
- 13. 1303 BOSCOBEL ST**
Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067149
- 14. 1407 ELMWOOD AVE**
Application: New Construction – Outbuilding; Setback Determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067402

15. 2101 10TH AVE S

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067160

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all with their applicable conditions with the exception of 1234 6th Avenue North which was removed from the agenda since notification requirements were not met and 1407 Elmwood Ave, which was removed from consent for public hearing. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

HISTORIC TAX ABATEMENT

16. REVISION TO HISTORIC TAX ABATEMENT PROGRAM

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Deferred

VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/ SHOW CAUSE

17. 418 BUSHNELL ST.

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding/Violation
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2021000232

Applicants: John Cox

Public: None present

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2021000232. Faux grained siding was added without review, does not meet the design guidelines, and has not been approved in the past. The applicant requests to retain the siding as-is.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends that the faux grained siding at 418 Bushnell Street be removed with sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that it does not meet Section IV(A) and IV(B) of Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to disapprove the faux grained siding at 418 Bushnell Street and that it be removed with sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that it does not meet Section IV(A) and IV(B) of Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 3910 VALLEY RD

Application: New Construction – Addition/Violation; Partial Demo/Violation
Council District: 24
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021063

Applicants: Lindsay Doyle and Darren Smith

Public: None present

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2021063781. The front dormers were constructed with a shallower pitch than what was approved, and the location and dimensions of a front window were altered without approval. The applicant requests to retain the window and dormers as-is.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends that the pitch of the dormers be corrected to meet the approved 2 ¾:12 pitch and that the front window be corrected to match the historic opening in size and location, finding that the alterations do not meet Section III(B)(1)(d) and III(A)(4) of the guidelines for partial demolition and section VI(E) for dormers of Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to require the pitch of the front dormers be corrected to meet the approved 2 ¾:12 pitch and that the front window be corrected to match the historic opening in size and location, finding that the alterations do not meet Section III(B)(1)(d) and III(A)(4) of the guidelines for partial demolition and section VI(E) for dormers of Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

19. 305 GREENWAY AVE

Application: Demolition – Economic Hardship
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022066880

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

20. 184 KENNER AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Kenner Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022065031

Applicants: Robert Quinn and Gaius Overton (Overton showed a printed photograph but did not leave it for the record.)

Public: None present

Description of Project: Application for the construction of a pergola over the uncovered portion of the front porch.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed pergola, finding that the proposed front addition does not meet section VI(B)(1) of Part 1 of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Design Guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to disapprove the proposed pergola, finding that the proposed front addition does not meet section VI(B)(1) of Part 1 of the Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Design Guidelines for Turn-of-the-20th Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed with Vice-chair Stewart in opposition.

21. 521 WOODLAND ST

Application: Signage
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022060111

Applicants: J.R. Buck, Peter Lawrence, and Rev. Fr. Theophilus Ebuleueme

Public: Glen Hutchins

Description of Project: The applicant proposes to install a monument sign in front of a church’s rectory building, replacing a damaged sign in front of the church. The new sign will be seven feet, three inches (7’-3”) tall sign with LED electronic changeable copy.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the application for signage with the following conditions:

1. The monument sign does not exceed five feet (5’) wide and five feet (5’) tall, with the signage panel not exceeding sixteen square feet (16 sq. ft.).
2. The sign shall does not have LED or electronic changeable copy but may have manually changeable copy. The manually-changeable copy shall not be internally illuminated or back-lit.

Finding with these conditions the signage meets section IV(3) of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the application for signage with the following conditions:

1. The monument sign does not exceed five feet (5’) tall, that the width be worked out with staff and, the signage panel shall not exceed sixteen square feet (16 sq. ft.);
2. The sign shall does not have LED or electronic changeable copy but may have manually changeable copy; and,
3. The manually-changeable copy, if added, shall not be internally illuminated or back-lit;

finding that with these conditions the signage meets section IV(3) of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously. Commissioner Mosley added that a horizontal orientation of the sign with a maximum of 5’ tall and a maximum width of 8’ would be proportions that are in keeping with the historic building.

22. 411 BROADWAY

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022067016

Applicants: Benjamin Goldberg

Public: None present

Description of Project: Application is to reface the historic projecting sign. The request includes a modification for chasing/flashing lights that are proposed to be added to the projecting sign and the addition of an infinity mirror that was not seen on historic signage.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the modification for chasing/flashing lights with the following conditions:

1. The infinity mirror element be removed;
2. The faux neon be limited to an accent such as a border or lettering; and,
3. The flashing/chasing lights change no more than every one second.

With these conditions, staff finds that the project can meet Section IV of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the modification for chasing/flashing lights, the faux neon component because it speaks to the architecture and ribbed siding of the modern building, and with the following conditions:

1. The infinity mirror element shall not exceed 10% of the sign area; and,
2. The flashing/chasing lights change no more than every one second;

finding that with these conditions, the project can meet Section IV of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

23. 2127 W LINDEN AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022067341 and T2022067351

Revised for an administrative permit.

24. 2808 ACKLEN AVE

Application: Demolition –Partial
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022066427

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

25. 2408 BARTON AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition to Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022065118

Applicants: Jay and Elizabeth Frein (Freins provided multiple photographs for the record.)

Public: None present

Description of Project: Application for the construction of an addition to an existing outbuilding, increasing both the footprint and the height.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding addition with the following conditions:

1. The dormers shall be reduced in width to be no more than fifty percent of the roof plane;
2. The dormers shall be fully disconnected from the gables; and,

3. Materials including cladding, trim material, windows, doors, garage doors (if being replaced), porch and walkway material, column material, walkway roof and main roof color shall be approved prior to purchase and installation

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed outbuilding addition, based on the ~560 square foot footprint where a 1000 square feet footprint would be allowed and because the applicant is working with an existing building and with the following conditions:

1. Staff shall confirm that the dormers are no more than fifty percent of the roof plane; and
2. Materials including cladding, trim material, windows, doors, garage doors (if being replaced), porch and walkway material, column material, walkway roof and main roof color shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed with commissioners Cotton and Mosley in opposition.

14. 1407 ELMWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean.Alexander@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022067402

Applicants: Martin Wieck and Rob Fraser

Public: Christine Johnson

Description of Project: The applicant proposes to construct a new outbuilding in the rear yard. The building will be one and one-half story, with a gabled roof with shed dormers. The building will be accessed by a driveway from 15th Avenue South, using the curb cut remaining from a previous outbuilding. A setback less than twenty feet (20') from 15th Avenue South is requested.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding at 1407 Elmwood Avenue with a seventeen foot (17') west side setback, with a condition that the door selections and driveway materials are approved prior to purchase and installation. With that condition, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the proposed outbuilding at 1407 Elmwood Avenue with a seventeen foot (17') west side setback, with a condition that the door selections and driveway materials are approved prior to purchase and installation; finding that with that condition, the proposed outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

OTHER BUSINESS

26. COMMISSIONER TRAINING