

## METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue, Nashville, TN 37204

615-862-7970, historical commission@nashville.gov

# METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

January 18, 2023

Sonny West Conference Center/Fulton Campus

2:00 p.m.

<u>Additional Information</u>: Applications can be viewed through the <u>Preservation Permit Tracker</u>. Please check the final agenda, <u>posted online the Friday prior to the meeting</u>. <u>Sign up online</u> to receive notices of agenda postings. Staff recommendations can also be found at the previous link.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Commissioners Johnson, Mayhall, Mosley, Price

**Staff Attendance**: Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Alexander, Baldock, Mitchell, Rose, and Sajid.

## 1. ADOPTION OF MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 21, 2022

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to accept the minutes a presented. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Removals from Agenda and Requests to Defer:

- 6. 814 Boscobel St Request to defer
- 9. 2300 White Ave Notice requirement not met
- 11. 3707 Westbrook Ave—Request to remove from consent
- 13. 121 3rd Ave S. Request to defer
- 14. 924 Bradford Ave. Notice requirement not met
- 16. 2505 Natchez Tr. Request to defer
- 20. Utah Ave—Notification requirements not met

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to accept the revised agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

## 3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

#### 4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

## **CONSENT**

#### 5. 1821 A & B 4TH AVE N

Application: New Construction—Outbuildings

Council District: 19

Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022087105 and T2022087109

## 6. 814 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022087146

## 7. 600 MCFERRIN AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 05

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022086876

## 8. 901 MERIDIAN ST

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 05 Overlay: N/A

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022086876

## 9. 2300 WHITE AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022087123

## 10. 1600 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023000074

## 11. 3707 WESTBROOK AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022086600

## 12. 4311 NEBRASKA AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022087137

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve all cases, with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 814 Boscobel St, 2300 White Ave and 3707 Westbrook Ave. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/ SHOW CAUSE

## 13. 121 3rd AVE S.

Application: New Construction and Rehabilitation/Violation

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

Applicant requested deferral.

#### 14. 924 BRADFORD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition/Violation

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Zoning Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

Notice requirement not met.

#### MHZC ACTIONS

#### 15. 132 2ND AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022081832

Applicants: Remick Moore, architect

**Public:** None present

**Description of Project:** Application for the construction of a two-story rooftop addition.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed rooftop addition, finding that it does not meet Section III(H) of the Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to disapprove the proposed rooftop addition, finding that it does not meet Section III(H) of the Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 16. 2505 NATCHEZ TRACE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean. Alexander@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2022082137

Applicant requested deferral.

#### 17. 1400 WOODLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022086793

**Applicants:** Remick Moore, architect

**Description of Project**: Applicant proposes a rear addition to the contributing building at 1400 Woodland Street.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Final material selections for cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors are reviewed prior to purchase and installation;
- 2. The rear addition has a five-foot (5') setback from the interior side property line; and,
- 3. Utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

**Public:** Councilmember Withers

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Final material selections for cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors are reviewed prior to purchase and installation;
- 2. The rear addition has a five-foot (5') setback from the interior side property line; and,
- 3. Utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

### 18. 1913 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022087119 and 2023000270

**Applicants:** Price Harrison, architect

**Description of Project:** Applicant proposes to construct one-and-a-half story infill and outbuilding on a vacant lot.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. A brick sample, all windows and doors, trim, the walkway materials, and the porch floor and steps material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 3. The window on the front wall of the recessed front porch shall be vertically oriented;
- 4. Paired or ribbons of windows shall have 4" to 6" mullions between them; and,

5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

Public: None present.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. A brick sample, all windows and doors, trim, the walkway materials, and the porch floor and steps material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 3. The window on the front wall of the recessed front porch shall be vertically oriented;
- 4. Paired or ribbons of windows shall have 4" to 6" mullions between them; and,
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 19. 1704 CEDAR LN

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022087135

Applicants: Curtis Johnson, owner

**Description of Project**: Application for the construction of an addition that goes wider than the historic house, has a basement-level garage and more than doubles the footprint.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition finding that it does not meet sections II(B)(1)(b) and II(B)(2)(f) of the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay for massing.

Public: David Epstein, 1715 Cedar Lane

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to disapprove the proposed addition finding that it does not meet sections II(B)(1)(b) and II(B)(2)(f) of the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay for massing. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 20. 4311 UTAH AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 24

Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Sean Alexander Sean. Alexander @nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022082139

Notification requirements not met.

## 11. 3707 WESTBROOK AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022086600

**Applicants:** Clayton Williams

Public: Michael Lindseth, 3533 Richland Ave; Julie Cavallo, 3720 Richland Ave; Karen Schneider, 3705

Westbrook Ave

Description of Project: Applicant proposes a rear and side addition; the rear addition requires a rear setback

determination.

**Recommendation Summary**: With the condition that staff approve a masonry sample, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the location of the HVAC and all utilities (if relocated), staff recommends approval of the addition and setback determination, finding that that the project meets the design guidelines for the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: After two failed motions, Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the project with the condition that a masonry sample, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the location of the HVAC and all utilities (if relocated) receive approval; finding that the project meets the design guidelines for the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded. The motion passed with Commissioner Price in opposition and with Chair Bell in favor.

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

## 21. REVISION TO ABATEMENT PROGRAM

Public: None present.

**Description of Project**: Council approved legislation to develop a Historic Property Tax Abatement Program based on T.C.A. § 67-5-218. The MHZC initially approved a management plan on July 21, 2021. Council approved a second piece of legislation in 2022 regarding the program; therefore revisions were approved by the MHZC on October 19, 2022. Legal counsel, the Property Assessor and the Trustee recommend additional revisions

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the revised administrative proposal for the Historic Abatement Program to go into effect immediately, finding it to be consistent with T.C.A. § 67-5-218 and BL2019-3 and BL2022-1382.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the revised administrative proposal for the Historic Abatement Program to go into effect immediately, finding it to be consistent with T.C.A. § 67-5-218 and BL2019-3 and BL2022-1382. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

### 22. COMMISSIONER TRAINING

The Metro Historical Commission does not discriminate on the basis of race, color, national origin, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, age, religion, creed or disability in access to, or operation of its programs, services, activities or in its hiring or employment practices. **ADA inquiries should be forwarded to:** Metro Historical Commission ADA Compliance Coordinator, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue, Nashville, TN 37204, (615) 862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov. **Title VI inquiries should be forwarded to:** Ms. Shirley Sims-Saldana, Title VI Coordinator, Human Relations, 800 Second Avenue, South, 4<sup>th</sup> floor, Nashville, TN 37210, (615) 880-3391. **Contact Department of Human Resources for all employment related inquiries** at (615) 862-6640.