



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue, Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)

MINUTES

March 15, 2023

Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus

2:00 p.m.

Additional Information: Applications can be viewed through the [Preservation Permit Tracker](#). Please check the final agenda, [posted online the Friday prior to the meeting](#). [Sign up online](#) to receive notices of agenda postings. Staff recommendations can also be found at the previous link.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall

Staff Attendance: Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Baldock, Mitchell, Porter, Rose, Sajid and Warren.

1. ADOPTION OF MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 15, 2023

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to accept the minutes as presented. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Removals from Agenda and Requests to Defer:

- 7. 1001 Broadway—Notification requirements not met
- 14. 2710 Hawthorne—Request to remove from consent
- 19. 210 S 10th Street—Request to defer
- 21. 2809 Blakemore—Request to move to consent agenda
- 27. 1806 Ashwood Ave—Notification requirements not met

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to accept the revised agenda. Commissioner Cashion seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 410 BROADWAY

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

6. 1300 3RD AVE N

Application: Alterations
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012846

7. 1001 BROADWAY

Application: Alterations
Council District: 19
Overlay: Historic Landmark
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012907

8. 1226 6th AVE N.

Application: Alterations/Violation
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

9. 4405 ELKINS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012621

10. 910 ACKLEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023006155

11. 707 MONROE ST

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023011314

12. 400 BROADWAY

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012013

13. 415 BUSHNELL ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition; Setback Determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023011433

14. 2710 HAWTHORNE PL

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012632 and T2023012642

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve consent agenda item with their applicable conditions, not including 1001 Broadway or 2710 Hawthorne Place and including 2809 Blakemore Avenue. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

DESIGNATIONS

15. HAYNES MANOR NCZO

Application: Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Council District: 02
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Applicants: None present.

Public: Claudia Humphrey Henry (Written public comment also received prior to the meeting)

Description of Project: Councilmember Toombs requests a Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay for a portion of the Haynes Manor Neighborhood.

Recommendation Summary: Staff suggests that the Commission recommend approval of the Haynes Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay, finding the area to meet criteria 1 and 3 of section 17.36.120.

Staff recommends that adoption of the existing design guidelines, finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to recommend approval of the Haynes Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay, finding the area to meet criteria 1 and 3 of section 17.36.120 and to adopt the existing design guidelines, finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS/ ALTERATIONS TO PREVIOUS APPROVALS/ SHOW CAUSE

16. 3709 CENTRAL AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding/Violation
Council District: 19
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

Applicants: Not applicable as public hearing was closed at prior meeting.

Public: Not applicable as public hearing was closed at prior meeting. (Written public comment also received prior to the meeting)

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2021030655 and to raise the height of the proposed addition or to revise existing construction with a clipped gable. The ridge height of the outbuilding exceeds what was permitted and allowed under the guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the outbuilding as constructed and the proposed solutions, with a recommendation to reduce the height of outbuilding to match what was permitted within sixty days (60) of the Commission's decision, finding that the height does not meet Section II(B)(1)(h)(1) of the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to disapprove the outbuilding as constructed and the proposed solutions, with a recommendation to reduce the height of outbuilding to match what was permitted within ninety days (90) of the Commission's decision, finding that the height does not meet Section II(B)(1)(h)(1) of the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Guidelines. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 913 S. DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition/Violation
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022021789

Applicants: Jared Meitzler

Public: None present

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2022021789 for a rear addition. Vinyl windows with interior grids were installed in the rear addition and in altered window openings that were not reviewed or approved by staff.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the partial-demolition of window openings on the basement of the historic building and disapproval of the basement replacement windows and the windows in the addition, finding that they do not meet Section IV of the guidelines for materials and that they should be removed and replaced with windows that meet the design guidelines within ninety (90) days of the Commission's decision.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the windows, finding them not to be in a highly visible location and to meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 1426 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding/Violation
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022052518

Applicants: Clayton Lainhart

Public: None present (Written public comment also received prior to the meeting)

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2022052518 for an outbuilding. Vinyl windows were installed on the outbuilding that do not meet the design guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the windows installed at 1426 Gartland Ave, finding that they do not meet Section IV of the guidelines for materials and that they be removed and replaced with windows that meet the design guidelines within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve the windows presented. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

19. 210 S 10TH ST

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012840

Request to defer.

20. 1911 WILDWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012847

Applicants: Guy Christiano

Public: None present

Description of Project: Applicant proposes to construct a rear dormer that is inset just one foot (1’) from the side walls of the historic house.

Recommendation Summary:

Staff recommends approval of the addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The rear dormer be inset two feet (2’) from both side walls of the historic house;
2. MHZC approve the window selection and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the

Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve the addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. **The rear dormer be inset two feet (2') from both side walls of the historic house;**
2. **MHZC approve the window selection and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
3. **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 2809 BLAKEMORE AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023011346

Applicant: Betsy Littrell

Public Comment: None present

Description of Project: Application is to construct a 1.5 story rear addition and includes partial demolition of the following: roof replacement, porch posts and porch roof, window and door openings, reconstruction of the attached garage, removal of a stone wall attached to the house, and removal and re-installation of all the brick.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored and inspected;
3. Removal and re-installation of the brick, exclusive of the attached garage, is not approved;
4. The final selections of all windows, doors, roof shingle color, trim, porch floor, and a brick sample;
5. The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish; and
6. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and partial demolition can meet the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;**
2. **Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored and inspected;**
3. **Removal and re-installation of the brick, exclusive of the attached garage, is not approved;**
4. **The final selections of all windows, doors, roof shingle color, trim, porch floor, and a brick sample;**
5. **The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish; and**
6. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and partial demolition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

22. 1324 STRATFORD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition to Outbuilding
Council District: 07
Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023012727

Applicants: A representative was present but did not speak.

Public: None present

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of an addition to an existing outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The final materials shall match the existing, or be approved by staff prior to purchase and installation – the new door shall be approved prior to purchase and installation and
2. The footprint shall be reduced to be no more than 1,000 square feet

with these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The final materials shall match the existing, or be approved by staff prior to purchase and installation – the new door shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and,
2. The footprint shall be reduced to be no more than 1,000 square feet;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

23. 1207 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023013027

Applicants: Cheyenne Smith

Public: None present

Description of Project: The applicant proposes new one and one-half story infill on the vacant lot at 1207 Fatherland Street.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. MHZC approve all material selections for cladding, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;
3. A walkway leading from the entrance to the street be added; and,
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility

meters be located on the side of the building.
With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. MHZC approve all material selections for cladding, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;**
- 3. A walkway leading from the entrance to the street be added; and,**
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

24. 1402 FRANKLIN AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023012735

Applicants: Mason Hart

Public: None present

Description of Project: Application for the enclosure of a side porch.

Recommendation Summary Staff recommends approval of the proposed porch enclosure with the following conditions:

1. The proposed lap siding shall be replaced with a flat, smooth material, such as stucco or fiber cement; and,
2. Materials shall be reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, post material and windows.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets Sections IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the proposed porch enclosure with the following conditions:

- 1. The proposed lap siding shall be replaced with a flat, smooth material, such as stucco or fiber cement; and,**
- 2. Materials shall be reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, post material and windows;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets Sections IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

25. 814 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022087146

Applicants: Craig Kennedy

Public: None present

Description of Project: The application is to construct a seven-hundred and fifty square foot (750 SF), one-story outbuilding in the rear yard of a historic house. Two material options have been proposed for the primary cladding that staff finds do not meet the design guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. MHZC review and approve all material selections for cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation; and,
2. A primary cladding material is selected that does not mimic materials that do not meet the design guidelines.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. **MHZC review and approve all material selections for cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation; and,**
2. **A primary cladding material is selected that does not mimic materials that do not meet the design guidelines;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

26. 0 MANILA AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 05
Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid, Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023011303

Applicants: Rich McCoy

Public: None present

Description of Project: Application is to construct infill on vacant property.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. Shake siding shall not be used as the primary cladding material;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
4. Staff shall review and approve materials prior to purchase and installation, including the windows, doors, siding material, porch posts, porch floor, all stairs and railing materials, and driveway/parking pad materials.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. Shake siding shall not be used as the primary cladding material;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
4. Staff shall review and approve materials prior to purchase and installation, including the windows, doors, siding material, porch posts, porch floor, all stairs and railing materials, and driveway/parking pad materials;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

27. 1806 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding, Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023013933

Requested deferral.

14. 2710 HAWTHORNE PL

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023012632 and T2023012642

Applicants: Glen Oxford

Public: None present

Description of Project: Applicant proposes to construct a rear addition that extends wider than the historic house and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary:

Staff recommends approval of the addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. All parts of the addition, including any projecting bays, be at least twenty feet (20') from the proposed outbuilding;
2. MHZC approve all masonry samples, all windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion:

Vice-chair Stewart of the addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. MHZC approve all masonry samples, all windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 2. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS