



**METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204  
615-862-7970, [historicalcommission@nashville.gov](mailto:historicalcommission@nashville.gov)

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)**  
**MINUTES**

**May 17, 2023**                      **Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus**                      **2:00 p.m.**

**Commissioner Attendance:** Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Price

**Staff Attendance:** Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Baldock, Mitchell, Rose, Sajid and Warren.

- 1. PRESENTATION OF LEADERSHIP RECOGNITION**
- 2. ADOPTION OF APRIL 19, 2023 MINUTES**

**Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the April 19, 2023 minutes, as presented. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

- 3. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Requested Revisions:

- 12. 926 Bradford Avenue—Revised for Administrative Permit
- 16. and 26. 2803 Woodlawn Drive—Request to Defer
- 28. 1520 McKennie Avenue—Request to Defer

**Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

- 4. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS**

## CONSENT

**NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC:** Items on the Consent Agenda will be voted on at a single time. No individual public hearing will be held, nor will the Commission debate these items unless a member of the public or the Commission requests that the item be removed from the Consent Agenda. Items pulled from the consent agenda will be heard at the end of the agenda. To ensure an item is removed from consent for a public hearing, notify staff the day before the meeting, prior to 10am, when possible.

### 5. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

#### 6. 1615 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023027787

#### 7. 1118 DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023028178

#### 8. 111 LINDSLEY PARK DR

Application: New Construction—Addition to House; Addition to Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023028213 & T2023028193

#### 9. 204 N 18TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023028304

#### 10. 926 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023026426

**11. 931 S DOUGLAS AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding  
Council District: 17  
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028210 and T2023028219

**12. 926 BRADFORD AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination (Revision to a Previously Approved Plan)  
Council District: 17  
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:2021056820

**13. 1503 DALLAS AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023027791 and T2023027796

**14. 3002 BELMONT BLVD**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028086 and T2023028087

**15. 1304 ASHWOOD AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028168 and T2023028174

**16. 2803 WOODLAWN DR**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028388

**17. 1300 3RD AVE N**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028412

**18. 111 WESTOVER AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding  
Council District: 23  
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023027652 and T2023027784

**19. 128 BLACKBURN AVE**

Application: Partial Demolition—Roof Replacement  
Council District: 23  
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028399

**20. 4211 PARK AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028188

**Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to accept the items on consent, with the exception of 2803 Woodlawn Dr and 1503 Dallas Ave, and with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

(Written comment was received prior to the meeting for 111 Westover Ave and 931 S Douglas Ave.)

**VIOLATIONS/ SHOW CAUSE**

**21. 300 BROADWAY AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition/Violation  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, [kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov](mailto:kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov)

**Applicants:** Quan Poole, legal representative and David Plummer, architect, Ron Kerere, VP of Gaylord operations

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Rooftop additions were installed without review or permits. A rooftop structure was installed in the front stepback area, and a structure was added to the side-stepback area for this corner building.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends removal of the two additions within (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that they do not meet Section III(I)(2) of the guidelines for setbacks and Sections III(G)(1) for materials.

**Motion:** Vice-chair Stewart moved that the two additions shall be removed within (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that they do not meet Section III(I)(2) of the guidelines for setbacks and Sections III(G)(1) for materials. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## MHZC ACTIONS

### 22. 2505 NATCHEZ TRACE

Application: New Construction—Addition (Revision to Plan Previously Approved with Conditions)  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2022082137

**Applicants:** Jared Danford, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Revisions to an addition at 2505 Natchez Trace that was previously approved with conditions.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the addition’s revised connector element at 2505 Natchez Trace with the following condition:

1. The connector between the two side gable roofs be inset at least four feet (4’) for the full length of the connector on the left side, second level, as has been done on the right side, second level, to reduce the perceived scale relative to the historic house.

With this condition and all other previously approved conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion: Commissioner Price moved to accept the revised drawings as presented, finding the revision to meet the conditions that were a part of the previous approval for the addition. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

### 23. 1915 18<sup>th</sup> AVE S

Application: New Construction—Addition (Revision to Plan Previously Approved with Conditions)  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023028729

**Applicants:** Mary Ellen Koran and Cody Goodwin, owners and Michael Ward, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. (public comment received via email prior to the hearing.)

**Description of Project:** The applicant proposes to construct a rear two-story rear addition to a primarily one and one-half story historic house. The design is similar to the design that was disapproved on April 19, 2023, but is not taller than the historic house.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition finding that the proposal does not meet sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for height and scale nor section II(B)(2)(a) for location of the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion:** Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the revision to the previously approved addition based on the unique existing roof form and because of the height, width and square footage of the addition, finding that the proposal meets sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for height and scale and section II(B)(2)(a) for location of the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 24. 1401 GARTLAND AVE

Application: Partial Demolition—Siding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023028703

**Applicants:** Tiffany Coursey, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email prior to the hearing.)

**Description of Project:** The applicant proposes to remove the historic siding on all façades.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the removal of the siding on the South 14<sup>th</sup> Street side façade, the rear façade, and the part of the house on the right façade which is an addition, with the condition that the replacement siding on the South 14<sup>th</sup> Street façade be wood or cement fiberboard with a reveal and beading detail that match the historic siding. With this condition, staff finds this partial-demolition to meet sections III. (Demolition) and IV. (Materials) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

Staff recommends disapproval of the removal of the siding on the front façade and main right facade, and recommends that the siding on these facades be retained and repaired as needed, using salvaged boards from the sides/rear; finding that the removal of the front and main right façades' siding does not meet Section III. (Demolition) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

**Motion:** Commissioner Cashion moved to approve removal of the siding on the South 14<sup>th</sup> Street side façade, the rear façade, and the part of the house on the right façade, which is an addition, with the condition that the replacement siding on the South 14<sup>th</sup> Street façade be wood or cement fiberboard with a reveal and beading detail that matches the historic siding;

**finding that with this condition, the partial-demolition to meet sections III. (Demolition) and IV. (Materials) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.**

**Commissioner Cashion moved to disapprove the removal of the siding on the front façade and main right facade, and that the siding on these facades be retained and repaired as needed, using salvaged boards from the sides/rear; finding that the removal of the front and main right façades' siding does not meet Section III. (Demolition) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed with Commissioner Cotton in opposition.**

**25. 1004 15TH AVE S**

Application: Demolition—Economic Hardship  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028358

**Applicants:** Darrell Harvey, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email prior to the hearing.)

**Description of Project:** The applicant requests demolition of a contributing building, arguing for economic hardship.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of full demolition of the house at 1004 15th Avenue South, finding that demolition meets section III.B(2)(b) as the necessary demolition required to repair the primary building will result in a non-contributing building and the project meets section III.B(2)(a) as repairs are not possible in a manner that retain the historic building.

**Motion:** Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve full demolition of the house at 1004 15th Avenue South, finding that demolition meets section III.B(2)(b) as the necessary demolition required to repair the primary building will result in a non-contributing building and the project meets section III.B(2)(a) as repairs are not possible in a manner that retain the historic building. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

**26. 2803 WOODLAWN DR**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023028388

**Deferred at the request of the applicant.**

**27. 2206 9TH AVE S**

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023028384

**Applicants:** Jennifer Bagwell, designer and April Dace, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Application for the new construction of an addition that steps wider and selective demolition of an original window opening.

**Recommendation Summary:**

Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition with the following conditions:

1. The paired window opening on the right-side elevation shall not be altered into a door opening;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. Carport material and design and windows and doors shall be reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions), and of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

**Motion:** Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed addition with the following conditions:

1. The paired window opening on the right-side elevation shall not be altered into a door opening;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. Carport material and design and windows and doors shall be reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation;

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions), and of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.**

**Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**28. 1520 MCKENNIE AVE**

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023028719

**Deferred at the request of the applicant.**



## 29. 1310 LILLIAN ST

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023028577 and T2023028585

**Applicants:** Applicant was not present.

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Application is to construct infill and an outbuilding.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions of approval:

1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
3. A walkway connecting the front entrance to the public sidewalk shall be added to the site plan;
4. The final selections of the windows, doors, brick, metal roofing, trim, all porch elements, and walkway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
5. The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish; and,
6. The siding shall have a maximum reveal of 7”.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), VI. and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

**Motion:** Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
3. **A walkway connecting the front entrance to the public sidewalk shall be added to the site plan;**
4. **The final selections of the windows, doors, brick, metal roofing, trim, all porch elements, and walkway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;**
5. **The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish; and,**
6. **The siding shall have a maximum reveal of 7”;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Sections IV.**

**(Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), VI. and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.**

### **13. 1503 DALLAS AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023027791 and T2023027796

**Applicants:** Michael Ward, architect

**Public:** Helen Kornblum, 1508 Paris Ave (Public comment received via email prior to the hearing.)

**Description of Project:** Applicant proposes a rear addition, a side addition, and an outbuilding. The two buildings do not meet the twenty foot (20') separation often required.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of project with the following conditions:

1. A shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
3. MHZC approve all windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:**

- 1. A shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;**
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;**
- 3. MHZC approve all windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **30. REVISE RULES OF ORDER**

**Description of Project:** Staff proposes revisions to MHZC's Rules of Order and Procedure to expand the list of projects that may receive an administrative approval.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval as presented

**MOTION:** Commissioner Mayhall moved to revise the Rules as submitted.  
Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.