



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

June 21, 2023 Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Price, Williams

Staff Attendance: Historic Zoning Administrator Zeigler, Legal Counsel Mikkelsen, and staff members Melissa Baldock, Grace Branlund, Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid and Jenny Warren.

1. ADOPTION OF MAY 11 AND 17, 2023, MINUTES

**Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the agendas as presented.
Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

2. ADOPTION OF

AGENDA

- 10. 3713 Princeton—Administrative Permit
- 16. 816 Boscobel—Application incomplete
- 18. 839 Acklen Ave—Request to remove
- 20. 210 S 10th Street—Incorrect notice
- 22. 1005 Bate Ave—Request for deferral

**Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the revised agenda.
Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 123 2ND AVE S

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023019660

6. 1304 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023028168 and 2023028168

7. 201 FALL ST

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036872

8. 10 LEA AVE

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Landmark

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036564

9. 1230 MCCHESENEY AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036569

10. 3713 PRINCETON AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036912

11. 317 S 11TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023036874

12. 1405 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023036905 and T2023036907

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve all consent items and their applicable conditions, with the exception of 3713 Princeton Avenue. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS/ SHOW CAUSE

13. 1311 2nd AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition and Repairs, Replacement & Alterations—Replacement of Historic Windows/ Violation
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:2019020187

Applicants: Ashley Stockton-Massie, owner and Remick Moore, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant requests to retain work done differently than permit #2019020187 and permit #2023012331. The ridge of the historic structures and the slope of the roof on the southern exterior elevation of the addition were altered without staff review. Two front windows on the brick structure were also removed without staff review or approval.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends that the historic ridges on both historic structures be corrected to match their historic form and that the connector pieces be constructed as previously approved in the preservation permit at 1311 2nd Ave N. within sixty (60) days of the Commission's decision, finding that, as constructed, the roof forms do not meet Section V(B)(1) of the guidelines for Additions-Design and Section III(E)(8)(a) for Additions-Roofing.

Staff also recommends approval of the increased height, if the other roof form corrections are made, finding that with that condition the additional height meets (V)(B)(2) for Additions.

Staff recommends the installation of new windows on the front façade of the brick structure that match the original in dimensions, design, and lites. Staff finds that removal of the historic windows does not meet Section II(B)(1) for

Repairs and offers the solution of replacement windows since the original windows no longer exist.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to require that the historic ridges on both historic structures be corrected to match their historic form and that the connector pieces be constructed as previously approved in the preservation permit at 1311 2nd Ave N. within sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that, as constructed, the roof forms do not meet Section V(B)(1) of the guidelines for Additions-Design and Section III(E)(8)(a) for Additions-Roofing.

In addition, the motion included approval of the increased height, if the other roof form corrections are made, finding that with that condition the additional height meets (V)(B)(2) for Additions and that the installation of new windows on the front façade of the brick structure that match the original in dimensions, design, and lites; finding that removal of the historic windows did not meet Section II(B)(1) for Repairs but no longer exist. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

14. 105 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction and Rehabilitation/Violation

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

Applicants: Not present

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Two monitors were installed within the recessed portion of a storefront without permits or staff review.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends that the monitors at 105 Broadway be removed within sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that they do not meet II(P)(1) and II(P)(2) for mechanical systems, III(G)(1) and III(G)(4) for materials, and III(I)(1) and III(I)(3) for additions.

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved that the monitors at 105 Broadway shall be removed within sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that they do not meet II(P)(1) and II(P)(2) for mechanical systems, III(G)(1) and III(G)(4) for materials, and III(I)(1) and III(I)(3) for additions. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

15. 1311 2nd AVE N

Application: Repairs, Replacement & Alterations—Replacement of Historic Windows

Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:2023037107

Applicants: Not present.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the replacement of historic wood windows on the front façade of the frame house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the request to replace the historic windows and recommends that the windows be repaired, rather than replaced, as per the preservation permit for rehabilitation, HCP2023012331, finding that the proposed replacement does not meet section II(B)(1)(b) of the Germantown Historic Preservation Overlay design guidelines.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the request to replace the historic windows and recommends that the windows be repaired, rather than replaced, as per the preservation permit for rehabilitation, HCP2023012331, finding that the proposed replacement does not meet section II(B)(1)(b) of the Germantown Historic Preservation Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 816 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: Partial Demolition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023036908

Application incomplete.

17. 2008 CEDAR LANE

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023037099

Applicants: Duane Cuthbertson, owner representative

Public: Carole Kenner (1901 Cedar Lane), Scott Troxel, (neighborhood president), Nan Allison (2002 Cedar Lane), Councilmember Cash (Written public comment received prior to the meeting.)

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a single-family house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. A walkway shall be added from the entrance to the driveway;
2. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and
4. Materials are reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation, including all windows and doors, a brick sample, the roof shingle color, the porch materials and the driveway and walkway materials

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. **A walkway shall be added from the entrance to the driveway;**
2. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
3. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and**
4. **Materials are reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation, including all windows and doors, a brick sample, the roof shingle color, the porch materials and the driveway and walkway materials;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed with Commissioner Cotton, Johnson and Williams in opposition.

18. 839 ACKLEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036911

Request to remove from the agenda.

19. 2803 WOODLAWN DR

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023028388

Applicants: Cameron Culver, owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to construct side dormer additions to both sides of the historic house, and the request includes partial demolition to alter the roof form of the historic house. No change to the existing footprint is proposed.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the partial demolition and approval of the side dormer additions with the following conditions:

1. The width of the side dormers should be approximately six feet (6') wide;
2. The dormer roof pitches should be at least 4/12; and,
3. The final selections for the windows, roofing material, and the roof shingle color shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition can meet the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the partial demolition and approve side dormer additions with the following conditions:

1. The dormer sit off the ridge by a minimum of one foot (1');
2. The dormer roof pitches should be at least 4/12; and,
3. The final selections for the windows, roofing material, and the roof shingle color shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition can meet the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 210 S 10TH ST

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036903

Deferred due to error in notice.

21. 1416 FORREST AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036555

Applicants: Present but did not speak.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes infill development.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. MHZC approve all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. MHZC approve all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

22. 1005 BATE AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023028165

Applicant requests deferral.

23. 3801 PRINCETON AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023035584

Applicants: Van Pond, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant proposes new infill development.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The existing side parking area off of Christopher Street be removed and all parking be located at the rear, accessed via the alley;
3. MHZC approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and all masonry samples prior to purchase and installation; and
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. MHZC approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and all masonry samples prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

24. 188 KENNER AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 24

Overlay: Kenner Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023036345

Applicants: Present but did not speak

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a single family house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The overall height of the house, as measured from the highest point of existing grade at the front, shall not exceed twenty-six feet (26’);
3. Utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
4. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including brick sample, all windows and doors, the front porch materials, the rear canopy material, and the driveway and walkway materials.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), and V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Kenner Manor chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The overall height of the house, as measured from the highest point of existing grade at the front, shall not exceed twenty-six feet (26’);**
- 3. Utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
- 4. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including brick sample, all windows and doors, the front porch materials, the rear canopy material, and the driveway and walkway materials;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), and V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Kenner Manor chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

25. SECOND AVENUE DESIGN GUIDELINE REVISION

Public: Katherine Rogers, legal representative of Icon Entertainment, Kristen Carson (101 Church Street), Ron Linn (101 Church Street)

Description of Project: Staff suggests the consideration of revising the design guidelines to meet contemporary needs and as a way to assist with the revitalization of Second Avenue North after the 2020 bomb.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed revision for the Second Avenue Design Guidelines, finding that the revision is consistent with the existing design guidelines and the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, specifically rooftop additions.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to defer the project until the July 19, 2023 public hearing. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

26. DESIGN GUIDELINE INTERPRETATION REVISION

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the interpretation revision. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.