



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

September 20, 2023

Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Mosley, Price

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Tara Ladd, and staff members Melissa Baldock, Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid and Jenny Warren.

1. ADOPTION OF ADOPTION OF AUGUST 16, 2023, MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

- 5. 1004 Petway Ave – Revised for administrative approval
- 6. 949 Russell St—Notice requirements not met
- 9. 411 N 15th—Request to remove from consent
- 16. 3506 Murphy Rd – Revised for administrative approval
- 19. 3806 Central Ave—Request to move to next month
- 21. 1504 Holly St—Notice requirements not met
- 23. 405 Broadway—Notice requirements not met
- 24. 400 Broadway—Notice requirements not met

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (42 permits issued)

5. 1004 PETWAY AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 05
Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023060833

6. 949 RUSSELL ST

Application: Appurtenance—Fence/ Violation
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell Kelli.Mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#: 2022005019

7. 1419 HOLLY ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023062040

8. 1700 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023062165

9. 411 N 15TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023062250

10. 932 BENTON AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023062098

11. 1013 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023051240 & T2023051253

12. 2205 18TH AVE S

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023060139 and T2023064070

13. 1504 DALLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023040941 & T2023045462

14. 2500 WEST END AVE

Application: Demolition; New Construction—New Pavilion and Addition to Existing Building
Council District: 21
Overlay: Historic Landmark
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023063144, T2023063156, T2023063330

15. 3638 RICHLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023061791

16. 3506 MURPHY RD

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023048891

17. 2217 LINDELL AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 17
Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2022074362

Public Comment: Public comment in favor of the following projects was received via email:
1504 Dallas.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all consent items with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 1004 Petway Ave, 949 Russell St, 3506 Murphy Rd and 411 N 15th; finding that with the conditions, the projects meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS/ SHOW CAUSE

18. 1406 5th AVENUE N

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Violation
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2021020248

Applicants: Elliot Parry, owner and general contractor

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to retain an addition that was constructed taller than permitted.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval to revise the existing permit to allow for the additional height with the condition that all original conditions, approved as part of the current permit, apply. With this condition, staff finds that the proposed height meet Section V of the design guidelines for the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to revise the existing permit to allow for the additional height with the condition that all original conditions, approved as part of the current permit, apply; finding that with this condition, the proposed height meets Section V of the design guidelines for the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

19. 3806 CENTRAL AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding/ Violation
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023019665

Request to move to next month.

20. 104 SCOTT AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding/ Violation
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2022066990

Applicants: Keegan Fioravanti, contractor

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant requests Commission approval for work done differently than permit #2022066990 for an outbuilding. The eave heights have increased to thirteen feet, seven inches (13' 7"), one dormer does not meet the minimum two-foot (2') insets from the wall below, the foundation increased in height to seven and a half inches (7.5") at the highest point of grade, and the overall ridge height has increased to twenty-two and a half feet (22' 6").

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the increased ridge height and foundation for the outbuilding at 104 Scott Ave, finding that they meet Sections VII(B)(2) and VII(B)(3) of the guidelines Part I of the design guidelines for the Turn of the 20th Century Districts.

Staff recommends disapproval of one of the wall dormers and of the increased wall height and recommends that the wall height is reduced to be no more than twelve feet (12') and at least one dormer is altered to be inset two feet from the wall below within ninety days (90) of the Commission's decision, finding that the dormer and wall height as constructed do not meet Section VII(D) and VII(B)(4) of the guidelines.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the increased ridge height and foundation for the outbuilding at 104 Scott Ave, finding that they meet Sections VII(B)(2) and VII(B)(3) of the guidelines Part I of the design guidelines for the Turn of the 20th Century Districts. Vice Chair Stewart also moved to disapprove one of the wall dormers and of the increased wall height and recommends that the wall height is reduced to be no more than twelve feet (12') and at least one dormer is altered to be inset two feet from the wall below within ninety days (90) of the Commission's decision, finding that the dormer and wall height as constructed do not meet Section VII(D) and VII(B)(4) of the guidelines. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

21. 1504 HOLLY ST

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023063387

Notice requirements not met.

22. 808 POWERS AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill; Setback determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023063237

Applicants: Chris Nunn and David Langgle-Martin

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email prior to the meeting.)

Description of Project: The applicant proposes new infill for the lot at 808 Powers Avenue.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed infill project for 808 Powers Avenue, finding that the project does not meet sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the proposed infill project for 808 Powers Avenue, finding that the project does not meet sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

23. 405 BROADWAY

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023057749

Notice requirements not met.

24. 400 BROADWAY

Application: Signage (Revision to previously approved plan)
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:2023012013

Notice requirements not met.

25. 1506 FERGUSON AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023063424

Applicants: Martin Wieck

Public: Rusty Miller, 1403 Cedar

Description of Project: Applicant proposes an outbuilding that is taller than the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The outbuilding be no taller than twenty-one feet (21') to the ridge, at the point of highest grade; and
2. MHZC review all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **The outbuilding be no taller than twenty-one feet (21') to the ridge, at the point of highest grade; and**

2. **MHZC review all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

26. 800 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding; Setback determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023062143

Applicants: Kristin Knoll, owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes to add a second level and a stairwell addition to the existing outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The balcony be reduced to be no more than thirty square feet (30 SF), be relocated to the house-facing side or the rear, and be uncovered;
2. The siding be wood or fiber cement lap siding with a maximum reveal of five inches (5”); and
3. MHZC approve all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets Section III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **The siding be wood or fiber cement lap siding with a maximum reveal of five inches (5”); and**
2. **MHZC approve all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets Section III of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

27. 120 2ND AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2023062309

Applicants: David Plummer and Laura Batson, architects

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a rooftop addition and changes to the storefront of a non-contributing building.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and storefront alterations with the following conditions:

1. The proposed windows in the storefront shall be either fixed or casement windows rather than sash windows;
2. Signage is not included in this review and shall be permitted separately;
3. Final materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to purchase and installation, including doors and windows

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and alterations meet the Second Avenue Historic Preservation Overlay Design Guidelines.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed addition and storefront alterations with the following conditions:

1. **The proposed windows in the storefront shall be either fixed or casement windows rather than sash windows or the applicant continue to work on alternatives;**
2. **Signage is not included in this review and shall be permitted separately;**
3. **Final materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff prior to purchase and installation, including doors and windows;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and alterations meet the Second Avenue Historic Preservation Overlay Design Guidelines. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

9. 411 N 15TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023062250

Applicants: Jay Catalano, owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email prior to the meeting.)

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a rear addition that steps wider than the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition, subject to the following conditions:

1. The historic siding shall remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,

3. Materials are reviewed, including a brick sample, and all doors and windows.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets Sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the proposed addition, subject to the following conditions:

1. The historic siding shall remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. Materials are reviewed, including a brick sample, and all doors and windows;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets Sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.