



**METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204  
615-862-7970, [historicalcommission@nashville.gov](mailto:historicalcommission@nashville.gov)

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)  
MINUTES**

**October 18, 2023**

**Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus**

**2:00 p.m.**

**Commissioner Attendance:** Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Mosley, Williams

**Staff Attendance:** Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Kelli Mitchell, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid and Jenny Warren.

**1. ADOPTION OF ADOPTION OF SEPTEMBER 20, 2023, MINUTES**

**Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Requested Agenda Revisions:

24. 400 Broadway: Notification requirement not met

27. 915 Emmett Ave: Notification requirement not met

**Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Johnson seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

**3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS**

Councilmember Brenda Gadd spoke regarding 3806 Central Avenue.

## CONSENT

**4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH** (19 permits issued)

**5. 1010 GRANADA CT**

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023071015

**6. 2006 BEECHWOOD AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023072484

**7. 405 RUDOLPH AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs – East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023051358

**8. 949 RUSSELL ST**

Application: Appurtenances—Fence/ Violation

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell [Kelli.Mitchell@nashville.gov](mailto:Kelli.Mitchell@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: 2022005019

**9. 5494 BRICK CHURCH PIKE**

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 10

Overlay: Historic Landmark

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023071606

**10. 2037 ELLIOTT AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023074393

**11. 855 BRADFORD AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 17  
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023067334

**12. 2113 NATCHEZ TRCE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023074429

**13. 1301 CLAYTON AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023074533

**14. 306 ELMINGTON AVE**

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Elmington Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023074096

**15. 1008 MONTROSE AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition/Violation  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

**16. 411 BROADWAY**

Application: New Construction—Addition (Revision to Previously Approved Plan)  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:2022044519

**17. 4406 NEBRASKA AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023046117 and T2023051369

## 18. 3619 WHITLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Whitland Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023073993

## 19. 3500 MURPHY RD

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023067457

**Public Comment:** Public comment in favor of the following projects was received via email: 405 Rudolph.

**Motion:** Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all consent items with their applicable conditions, finding that with the conditions, the projects meet the design guidelines. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

## VIOLATIONS/ SHOW CAUSE

## 20. 1402 BEECHWOOD

Application: Demolition—Economic Hardship

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, [kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov](mailto:kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov)

**Applicants:** Brian and Laura Perkins, owner; Lee Ross Dinwiddie, architect

**Public:** James Linn, 1406 Beechwood; Kate Daniels, 1404 Beechwood; Richard Poritt, 1405 Elmwood Ave

**Description of Project:** The applicant requests demolition of a contributing building, arguing for economic hardship.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends denial of economic hardship based on self-imposed hardship and the requirement that the front dormer and the second level are reconstructed to meet the historic dimensions and design, to be completed in one hundred and twenty (120) days and prior to the issuance of any other permits within the purview of the MHZC.

**Motion:** Commissioner Johnson moved to deny economic hardship based on self-imposed hardship and with the requirement that the front dormer and the second level are reconstructed to meet the historic dimensions and design, to be completed in one hundred and twenty (120) days and prior to the issuance of any other permits within the purview of the MHZC. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 21. 3806 CENTRAL AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding/ Violation

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell, kelli.mitchell@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023019665

**Applicants:** Martin Rosenblum, representative of the owners; John Broderick, contractor

**Public:** Bill Ganon, 3519 Central Ave; Karen Schneider, 3705 Central Ave and representing the neighborhood association (Public comment received via email.)

**Description of Project:** The applicant requests Commission approval for work done differently than permit #2023019665 for an outbuilding. The overall ridge height as well as the eave heights are taller than permitted and taller than allowed under the guidelines.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the outbuilding as constructed, with a recommendation to reduce the ridge and eave heights of the outbuilding to match what was permitted within ninety days (90) of the Commission’s decision, finding that the ridge and eave heights do not meet Section II(B)(1)(h)(1) of the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Guidelines.

**Motion:** Vice-chair Stewart moved to disapprove the outbuilding as constructed, with the requirement to reduce the ridge and eave heights of the outbuilding to match what was permitted within ninety days (90) of the Commission’s decision, finding that the ridge and eave heights do not meet Section II(B)(1)(h)(1) of the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Guidelines. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 22. 746 BENTON AVE

Application: Appurtenance—Fence/ Violation

Council District: 17

Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2022043980

**Applicants:** Blake Daniels, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email.)

**Description of Project:** The applicant requests to keep work done differently than permit #2022043980. Gates and supports were installed without staff review.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the gate at 746 Benton Ave, finding that they do not meet Sections IV(4)(a) and IV(4)(b) of the guidelines for the Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Staff recommends that the gate be removed within thirty days (30) of the Commission’s decision.

**Motion:** Commissioner Mosley moved to disapprove the gates at 746 Benton Ave, finding that they do not meet Sections IV(4)(a) and IV(4)(b) of the guidelines for the Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay and that the gates and posts be removed within thirty days (30) of the Commission's decision. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

### 23. 816 BOSCOBEL AVE

Application: Alterations & Repairs—Violation/ Show Cause  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Kelli Mitchell Kelli.Mitchell@nashville.gov  
PermitID#: 2023042841

**Applicants:** Randy Gore, owner representative

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Staff is requesting a show cause hearing for 816 Boscobel Street. The applicant was approved to demolish and reconstruct a rear addition. The ridge of the reconstructed portion was not constructed properly, causing it to sit above the ridge of the historic home. A window and a portion of the framing was also removed without approval.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends denial of the roof configuration as constructed at 816 Boscobel, finding that it does not meet Section II(B)(1)(a) of the guidelines for the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Staff recommends that new plans or detailed information be provided within thirty days (30) of the Commission decision showing the necessary corrective action and that the work be completed within sixty days (60) of staff receiving sufficient plans or information.

Staff finds that the removal of the window does not meet Section II(B)(4)(a) of the guidelines but recommends that the historic window be reinstalled. Staff also recommends that the crumbling foundation of the bay on the western elevation be reconstructed with materials approved by staff within sixty days (60) of the Commission's decision.

**Motion:** Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the roof configuration at 816 Boscobel, based on existing conditions, with the conditions that the new, street-facing ridge is cut back to the existing cross ridge and that the chimney is reconstructed in a similar location as the original but back enough to help hide the taller portion of the new ridge, finding that it would meet Section II(B)(1)(a) of the guidelines for the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. The new roof configuration may be staff reviewed with the guidance of a commissioner. The applicant shall provide new plans or detailed information within thirty days (30) of the Commission decision showing the necessary corrective action and the work shall be completed within sixty days (60) of staff receiving sufficient plans or information. The removal of the window does not meet Section II(B)(4)(a) of the guidelines and so the historic window is required to be reinstalled. The crumbling foundation of

**the bay on the western elevation shall be reconstructed with materials approved by staff within sixty days (60) of the Commission’s decision. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

**MHZC ACTIONS**

**24. 400 BROADWAY**

Application: Signage (Revision to Previously Approved Plan)  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:2023012013

Notification requirements not met.

**25. 1816 WILDWOOD AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T20230746 073 and T2023074075

**Applicants:** Preston Quirk, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email.)

**Description of Project:** Application is to construct a rear addition with a ridge raise and an outbuilding. The application includes a setback determination to reduce the rear setback for the addition from twenty feet (20’) to ten feet (10’).

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the addition, outbuilding, and setback determination with the following conditions of approval:

1. The driveway shall be limited to twelve feet (12’) in width between the house and the street;
2. The existing and proposed front yard parking shall be removed;
3. The front walkway shall either extend to the street or tie into the driveway;
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
5. The final selections of the windows, doors, roof color, trim, all side porch elements, and the walkway and driveway materials shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and
6. Paired windows shall have 4” – 6” mullions between them.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the addition, outbuilding, and setback determination with the following conditions of approval:**

- 1. The driveway shall be limited to twelve feet (12') in width between the house and the street;
- 2. The existing and proposed front yard parking shall be removed;
- 3. The front walkway shall either extend to the street or tie into the driveway;
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
- 5. The final selections of the windows, doors, roof color, trim, all side porch elements, and the walkway and driveway materials shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and
- 6. Paired windows shall have 4" – 6" mullions between them;

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**26. 2614 BARTON AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#:T2023065591

**Applicants:** Van Pond, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Applicant proposes a rear addition.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. A shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
- 3. The wall heights of the side-gabled portions of the addition be no taller than the wall height of the historic house;
- 4. MHZC review all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the project with the following conditions:**



1. A shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
3. The wall heights of the side-gabled portions of the addition be no taller than the wall height of the historic house;
4. MHZC review all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed with four concurring votes, Commissioner Mosley in opposition, and the Vice-chair absent.

## 27. 915 EMMETT AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill  
 Council District: 05  
 Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
 Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
 PermitID#:T2023071621

Notification requirements not met.

## 28. 3912 KIMPALONG AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding  
 Council District: 24  
 Overlay: Woodlawn West Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
 Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
 PermitID#:T2023074463 and T2023075274

**Applicants:** Seth Argo, property owner

**Public:** Jeff Slayton, 3919 Kimpalong Ave (Public comment received via email—after the deadline.)

**Description of Project:** Applicant proposes to construct infill and an outbuilding.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The outbuilding’s rear-facing dormers have total widths that are no more than fourteen feet (14’) when added together;
3. MHZC approve masonry samples, all windows and doors, and the roof color and material prior to purchase and installation; and
4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Woodlawn West chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

**Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project with the following conditions:**

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The outbuilding’s rear-facing dormers have total widths that are no more than fourteen feet (14’) when added together;**
- 3. MHZC approve masonry samples, all windows and doors, and the roof color and material prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Woodlawn West chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed with four concurring votes and with the Vice-chair absent.**

**OLD BUSINESS**