



**METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION**  
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204  
615-862-7970, [historicalcommission@nashville.gov](mailto:historicalcommission@nashville.gov)

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)  
MINUTES**

**November 15, 2023**

**Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus**

**2:00 p.m.**

**Commissioner Attendance:** Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Johnson, Mayhall, Mosley, Price, Williams

**Staff Attendance:** Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Joseph Rose, and Melissa Sajid

**1. ADOPTION OF ADOPTION OF OCTOBER 18, 2023, MINUTES**

**Motion: Commissioner Johnson moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Requested Agenda Revisions:

7. 2023 Benjamin Street—Request to defer

8. 902 Boscobel Street – Request to defer

13. 1506 Ferguson Avenue—Request to move from consent to public hearing

22. 1504 Holly Street—Notification requirements not met

**Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

**3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS**

None present.

## CONSENT

### 4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (35 permits issued)

### 5. 1001 MANSFIELD ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 05

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023083925

### 6. 418 BUSHNELL ST

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023080437

### 7. 2023 BENJAMIN ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [melissa.sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:melissa.sajid@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023084140

### 8. 902 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation District

Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023083923

### 9. 2211 ELLIOTT AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023083917

### 10. 2403 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)

PermitID#: T2023079344

**11. 1911 ASHWOOD AVE**

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023083855

**12. 1708 SWEETBRIAR AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023083988

**13. 1506 FERGUSON AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023084009

**14. 3002 OVERLOOK DR**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 18  
Overlay: Hillsboro West-End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Jenny Warren [Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov](mailto:Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023084281

**15. 209 3<sup>RD</sup> AVENUE NORTH**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Downtown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler [robin.zeigler@nashville.gov](mailto:robin.zeigler@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023084427

**16. 106 BLACKBURN AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding  
Council District: 23  
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023079824 and T2023083673

**17. 3813 WHITLAND AVE**

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Whitland Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Grace Branlund [Grace.Branlund@nashville.gov](mailto:Grace.Branlund@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023086285

**18. 3901 VALLEY RD**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023083825

**19. 4200 NEBRASKA AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Bowling House Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023073375

**20. 400 BROADWAY**

Application: Signage (Revision to a Previously Approved Plan)  
Council District: 19  
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid [melissa.sajid@nashville.gov](mailto:melissa.sajid@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: 2023012013

**Public Comment:** Public comment for the following projects was received via email:  
3002 Overlook and 209 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave N.

**Motion:** Commissioner Cashion moved to approve all consent items with their applicable conditions and with the exception of 1506 Ferguson Ave, finding that with the conditions, the projects meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Mosley seconded, and the motion passed with Vice-Chair Stewart recused.

**VIOLATIONS/ SHOW CAUSE**

**21. 1907 RUSSELL ST**

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding/ Violation—Show Cause  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose [Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov](mailto:Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: 2022022528

**Property Owner:** Kourtney Wilson and Ryan Vella

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Staff is requesting a show cause hearing for 1907 Russell Street to show cause as to why the permit for the addition should not be rescinded. The applicant installed windows without review and approval in both the addition (HCP #2022022528) and outbuilding (HCP #2022070763). The windows that were installed do not meet the design guidelines.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the new windows installed in the addition and outbuilding at 1907 Russell Street, finding that they do not meet Section IV. (Materials) nor Section VI.D (Proportion and Rhythm of Openings) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Staff recommends that the permit not be rescinded but that the existing windows of the addition and outbuilding be removed and replaced with a compatible window product within sixty (60) days of the Commission’s decision.

**Motion:** Commissioner Mosley moved to disapprove the new windows installed in the addition and outbuilding at 1907 Russell Street, finding that they do not meet Section IV. (Materials) nor Section VI.D (Proportion and Rhythm of Openings) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. He further moved that the permit not be rescinded but that the existing windows of the addition and outbuilding be removed and replaced with a compatible window product within one hundred and eighty (180) days of the Commission’s decision. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

**22. 1504 HOLLY ST**

Application: New Construction—Infill  
Council District: 06  
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023063387

Notification requirements not met.

**23. 915 EMMETT AVE**

Application: New Construction—Infill  
Council District: 05  
Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov  
PermitID#:T2023071621

**Applicants:** John Rankin, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Applicant proposes infill development.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The front porch columns have a cap and base;
- 3. MHZC approve all masonry samples, all doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

**Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the infill with the following conditions:**

- 1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. **The front porch columns have a cap and base;**
- 3. **MHZC approve all masonry samples, all doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 4. **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Johnson seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

**24. 3616B WESTBROOK AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition & Outbuilding  
Council District: 24  
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay  
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)  
PermitID#: T2023084018 & 2023084022

**Applicants:** Van Pond, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** The applicant proposes an addition to the historic building and an outbuilding.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval with the conditions that:

- 1. The outbuilding footprint does not exceed one thousand square feet (1000 SF);
  - 2. Final materials receive approval: side gable field, roof color, masonry, driveway, doors and windows; and,
  - 3. Interior side dormer steps back from the wall below by at least two feet (2’);
- finding that with these conditions the project meets the design guideline VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Richland-West End Annex chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

**Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve with the conditions that:**

- 1. **Final materials receive approval: side gable field, roof color, masonry, driveway, doors and windows; and,**

2. **The eaves of the outbuilding shall not exceed ten feet (10’), measured from highest point of grade;**

**finding that with these conditions the project meets the design guideline VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Richland-West End Annex chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

### **13. 1506 FERGUSON AVE**

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock [Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov](mailto:Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov)

PermitID#:T2023084009

**Applicants:** Martin Wieck, architect

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Applicant proposes an addition that is wider than the historic house and includes a ridge raise. (Removed from consent agenda.)

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
3. MHZC approve all masonry samples, windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

**Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the project with the following conditions:**

1. **A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;**
2. **Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;**
3. **MHZC approve all masonry samples, windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
4. **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

**finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice-chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.**

## **OLD BUSINESS**

### **25. REQUEST TO REHEAR 1402 BEECHWOOD-DEMOLITION**

**Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to deny the request finding that the information could have been available at the time of the public hearing. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**