



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

February 21, 2024 Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Vice-Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Mayhall, Mosley, Price, Smith and Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Melissa Sajid, Joseph Rose, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF ADOPTION OF JANUARY 17, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

- 9. 908 Gilmore Ave – notice requirements not met
- 12. 3749 Whitland Ave – revised for administrative permit
- 24. 405 S. 17th St – notice requirements not met

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (16 permits issued)

5. 519 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2023094890

6. 124 S 17TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024007148

7. 1416 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024010267

8. 2101 GRANTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 17
Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024003966 and T2024003967

9. 908 GILMORE AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Partial Demolition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024006605 and T2024006609

10. 130 BLACKBURN AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding; Setback determination
Council District: 23
Overlay: Belle Meade Links Triangle Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024009922

11. 319 LAUDERDALE RD

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination; Partial demolition—
Outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024009662 and T2024010990

12. 3749 WHITLAND AVE

Application: Partial Demolition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Whitland Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024009917

Public comment received via email for 130 Blackburn Ave.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve all projects on consent with their applicable conditions, and with the exception of 908 Gilmore Avenue and 3749 Whitland Ave, finding that the projects meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS

13. 3806 CENTRAL AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding/ Rehearing

Council District: 24

Overlay: Richland-West End Addition Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2023019665

Applicant: John Broderick, contractor

Public: Jim Kelly, representing neighborhood association; Michael Lindseth, 3533 Richland Av [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: This case is a rehearing for new construction of an outbuilding with ridge and eaves constructed taller than permitted and that do not meet the design guidelines, with a proposal to reduce the eave height and clip the gables to reduce the perception of height.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the reduced eave height and the clipped gables, finding these actions to meet design guideline II(B)(1)(h)(1) of the Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Guidelines for outbuildings. Staff further recommends that the eave height is corrected, and the clipped gables installed within one hundred and twenty days (120) of the Commission’s decision.

If approved, this decision is unique to this particular case and so may not be considered a solution to future violations and does not set a precedent for future outbuildings to be taller than what the design guidelines allow.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to disapprove the request and reaffirm the original decision, requiring that work to correct the violation begin with 120 days and be completed within the 180 days, finding that the proposed solutions did not meet the design guideline II(B)(1)(h)(1) of the Richland-West End Neighborhood

Conservation Zoning Overlay Guidelines for outbuildings. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

14. 2706 WESTWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition; Partial Demolition; Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024010632

Applicant: Timothy Romero, general contractor

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of an addition, including a setback determination.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and setback determination with the following conditions:

1. The new rear roof plane be removed;
2. The original conditions of the rear roof plane be restored, including the original slope and the original eave;
3. The side walls of all roof additions inset a minimum of two feet (2') from the original side walls of the historic house;
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
5. The materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including roofing material, cladding for the gable fields, doors and windows; and,
6. Concrete block is parged.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed addition and setback determination with the following conditions:

1. The new rear roof plane be removed;
2. The original conditions of the rear roof plane be restored, including the original slope and the original eave;
3. The side walls of all roof additions inset a minimum of two feet (2') from the original side walls of the historic house;
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
5. The materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including roofing material, cladding for the gable fields, doors and windows; and,
6. Concrete block is parged;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

15. 429 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024011370

Applicant: Steve Meisner, attorney and Bart Gillespie, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant proposes to install roll-up doors and a railing in the second level openings of this non-contributing building.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposal, finding it does not meet sections III General Principles, III(C)(1) for Scale, III(F) for Proportion & Rhythm of Openings, and III(I) for additions. There is not enough information provided to review materials, section III(G).

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to recommend disapproval of the proposal, finding it does not meet sections III General Principles, III(C)(1) for Scale, III(F) for Proportion & Rhythm of Openings, and III(I) for additions. There is not enough information provided to review materials, section III(G). Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 215 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024009695

Applicant: Doug Sloan, attorney and Tyler Thayer, Paradym Studio

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak

Description of Project: Application to construct a second rooftop addition to the contributing building at 215 Broadway.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition to 215 Broadway, finding that the addition does not meet section III of the design guidelines for a rooftop addition.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to accept the applicant’s request for deferral to the March 20, 2024 meeting. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 1003 MAXWELL AVE

Application: Demolition

Council District: 04

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

Applicant: Not present

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is for demolition of a contributing building, arguing for economic hardship.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of full demolition of the house at 1003 Maxwell Avenue, finding that demolition does not meet section 17.40.420 E of the ordinance for Economic Hardship and III(B) of the design guidelines for appropriate demolition and to allow the Property Standards Division to demolish the building in whole or in-part as needed for the neighborhood’s health and welfare. Staff further recommends that any new construction on the site be required to be a reconstruction of the historic building and no additional permits may be issued until the new construction has been permitted and received a favorable inspection, in regard to meeting that permit.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to deny full demolition of the house at 1003 Maxwell Avenue, finding that demolition does not meet section 17.40.420 E of the ordinance for Economic Hardship and III(B) of the design guidelines for appropriate demolition and to allow the Property Standards Division to demolish the building in whole or in-part as needed for the neighborhood’s health and welfare. The commission further moves that any new construction on the site be required to be a reconstruction of the historic building and no additional preservation permits shall be issued until the new construction has received a favorable inspection, in regard to meeting that preservation permit. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 323 50TH AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding; Partial Demolition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023102838 and T2023102841

Applicant: Martin Wieck, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes an addition that is two feet (2') taller than the historic house and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
3. MHZC review the historic siding once the asbestos siding has been removed to assess whether or not it should be retained;
4. MHZC approval all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation;
5. The roof deck on the right side of the addition be eliminated and this part of the addition have a roof slope of at least 6/12; and
6. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Park & Elkins chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the following conditions:

1. **A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;**
2. **Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;**
3. **MHZC review the historic siding once the asbestos siding has been removed to assess whether or not it should be retained;**
4. **MHZC approval all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation;**
5. **The roof deck on the right side of the addition be replaced with a flat roof without a railing or parapet; and,**
6. **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition/infill/outbuilding meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Park & Elkins chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

19. 1129 HOWARD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024009507

Applicant: Jeff Henry, property owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a front porch.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed front porch addition, finding that it does not meet Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed front porch addition, finding that it does not meet Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 107 4TH AVE N

Application: New Construction—Addition and Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024000170

Applicant: John Barnett, architect; Jim Rowan, Sign Me Up; Sean Henry, attorney

Public: None

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a marquee/canopy addition and signage.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and signage with all of the following conditions or disapproval:

1. The proposed marquee be reduced in width to be no more than eight feet (8'), centered above the central double door;
2. The marquee materials be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation;
3. The proposed digital changeable copy sign be removed;
4. The front wall sign not exceed one-hundred-five square feet (105 SF);
5. The front wall sign's raceway is 50% of the letter height or is the sign's background and the raceway does not extend more than three inches (3") beyond the largest part of the sign; and,
6. The final signage be inspected and approved by staff prior to installation.

Finding that with the conditions, the proposed addition and signage meets sections III for New Construction and IV for Signage of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed addition and signage with all of the following conditions or disapproval:

1. The proposed marquee not have signage;
2. The marquee materials be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation;

3. **The proposed digital changeable copy sign be removed;**
4. **The front wall sign not exceed one-hundred-five square feet (105 SF);**
5. **The front wall sign’s raceway is 50% of the letter height or is the sign’s background and the raceway does not extend more than three inches (3”) beyond the largest part of the sign; and,**
6. **The final signage be inspected and approved by staff prior to installation; finding that with the conditions, the proposed addition and signage meets sections III for New Construction and IV for Signage of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

21. 606 8TH AVE S

Application: Signage
 Council District: 19
 Overlay: Landmark
 Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
 PermitID#: T2024007031

Applicant: Ben Montague and Angela White

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The application is to install two internally illuminated, cabinet wall signs. Both wall signs are proposed to be located above the window openings of the second story with one sign located on the 8th Avenue South façade and one located on the right-side elevation.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the wall signs with the following conditions:

1. The wall signs shall be relocated to meet the design guidelines for location;
2. Cabinet depth shall not exceed thirteen inches (13”); and,
3. The background of the wall signs shall be dark to ensure that the illumination standards for cabinet signs are met.

With these conditions, staff finds that the project meets Section VII (Signage) of the design guidelines for Historic Landmark Zoning Overlays.

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve the wall signs with the following conditions:

1. **The wall signs shall be relocated to meet the design guidelines for location;**
 2. **Cabinet depth shall not exceed thirteen inches (13”); and,**
- finding that with these conditions, the project meets Section VII (Signage) of the design guidelines for Historic Landmark Zoning Overlays. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Mosley in opposition.**

22. 2037 ELLIOTT AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding (Revision to Previously Approved

Plan)
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:2024009069

Applicant: Michael Ward, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to revise a preservation permit to increase the footprint of a proposed outbuilding, which results in the total footprint of outbuildings further exceeding the maximum for the lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The footprint of all outbuildings on the lot shall not exceed the current existing footprint total of 1035 SF; and
2. The final selections of the windows, door, and garage door shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the outbuilding based on the fact that the addition is modest and allows retention of a historic out building and with the condition that the final selections of the windows, door, and garage door shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Vice-chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

23. 808 POWERS AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024005759

Applicant: Kristofer Nonn, Strickland Architecture

Public: None

Description of Project: The applicant proposes new infill for the lot at 808 Powers Avenue.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. The MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, cladding, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed infill project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. The MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, cladding, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

24. 405 S. 17TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024000044 and T2024000045

Deferred—Notice requirements not met

NEW BUSINESS

25. TAX EXEMPTION REVISION

Commissioner Stewart moved to approve the revisions, as presented. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

26. REVISION TO HISTORIC LANDMARK-SIGNAGE QUALIFICATIONS

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to recommend to Metro Council and the Metro Planning Commission the proposed revision to the qualifications for a Historic Landmark sign. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.