



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

March 20, 2024 Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell, Commissioners Cotton, Mayhall, Mosley, and Smith

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Melissa Sajid, Joseph Rose, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF FEBRUARY 21, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Smith seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

- 8. 1722 15th AVE S – request for deferral
- 12. 2303 BELMONT BLVD—administrative permit
- 21. 1224 HOWARD AVE—request for deferral

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 1900 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024019563

6. 1536 DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024019566

7. 1711 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024020029 and T2024020035

8. 1722 15TH AVE S

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024019815

9. 2711 W LINDEN AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024012197

10. 2003 19TH AVE S

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024015348

11. 2535 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024020009

12. 2303 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024020236

13. 117 LAUDERDALE RD

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024019739

14. 2206 GRANTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Woodland-in-Waverly Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024020131

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve all projects on consent, with their applicable conditions, finding that the projects meet the design guidelines. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS

15. 2504 WHITES CREEK PK

Application: Demolition/ Show Cause
Council District: 02
Overlay: Haynes Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024020112

Applicant: Alicia Lashley, owner; Will Stout, owner’s legal representation

Public: Quinta Martin, Haynes Heights Neighborhood Association

Description of Project: Application is for after-the-fact demolition of a contributing building.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of full demolition of the house at 2504 Whites Creek Pike, finding that the demolition does not meet section III of the design guidelines for demolition or section 17.40.420(E) of the ordinance for Economic Hardship. Staff further recommends that the Commission require that any new construction on the site be a reconstruction of the main massing of the historic building to meet section VII(E)(5) of the commission’s Rules of Order. Since drawings do not exist and the building does not exist for measuring to meet the application requirements for new construction, drawings should be created following the guidance of this report and no additional preservation permits shall be issued until the new construction has been completed and received an approval from the commission, in terms of meeting the reconstruction condition.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to disapprove full demolition of the house at 2504 Whites Creek Pike, finding that the demolition does not meet section III of the design guidelines for demolition or section 17.40.420(E) of the ordinance for Economic Hardship. Further, it is required that any new construction on the site be a reconstruction of the main massing of the historic building to meet section VII(E)(5) of the commission’s Rules of Order. Since drawings do not exist and the building does not exist for measuring to meet the application requirements for new construction, drawings should be created following the guidance of this report and no additional preservation permits shall be issued until the new construction has been completed and received an approval from the commission, in terms of meeting the reconstruction condition. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 1110 LILLIAN ST

New Construction – Outbuilding/ Violation

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2022066978

Applicant: Brendan Donelson, owner

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. (Public comment received via email.)

Description of Project: The applicant requests Commission approval for work done differently than permit #2022066978 for an outbuilding. The overall wall height is taller than permitted and taller than allowed under the guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the outbuilding as constructed, with a recommendation to reduce the wall heights of the outbuilding to match what was permitted within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that the wall heights do not meet Section VII(B)(4) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts.

Motion: Commission Mosley moved to disapprove the outbuilding as constructed, with the condition to reduce the wall heights of the outbuilding to match what was permitted within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision, finding that the wall heights do not meet Section VII(B)(4) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 1803 HOLLY ST

New Construction – Addition/ Violation

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2023065408

Applicant: Lynn Bowman, contractor; Adam Ford, property owner; Caitlyn Smous, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes to keep a foundation that that was constructed approximately eight to nine inches (8”-9”) taller than MHZC approved.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the foundation height, finding that it meets the historic context and Section VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the foundation height, finding that it meets the historic context and Section VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

18. 1508 EDGEHILL AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024020020 and T2024020024

Applicant: Mike Slarve, owner; Mitch Hodge, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant proposes to construct a rear addition that extends wider than the historic house. The applicant also proposes to construct a second

outbuilding in the rear yard. The applicant proposes a separation of less than twenty feet (20') between the addition and the existing outbuilding and between the addition and the proposed outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition and outbuilding finding that the proposal does not meet sections VI(B)(2-11) for addition mass & scale, VI(A)(1) and VI(B)(12-16) for addition connection, VI(C)(1-3) for addition siting and setbacks, VII(B)(1) for number of outbuildings, VII(B)(1) for outbuilding footprint, nor VII(C)(1-4) for outbuilding siting and setbacks of Part I and the Edgehill chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the project, based on the fact that the exiting outbuilding is historic and based on the size of the non-contributing buildings surrounding the historic building, with the conditions that:

- 1. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
 - 2. Materials be reviewed and approved by MHZC, prior to purchase and installation;**
 - 3. Front facing dormer include windows; and,**
 - 4. The proposed garage is removed from the site plan;**
- finding that the project meets the design guidelines. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

19. 209 BROADWAY

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023086476

Applicant: Amish Purohit, owner; KT Lamb, architect

Public: Doug Sloan, representing Moxy Hotel; Matthew Daniel, Moxy Hotel (Public comment received via email.)

Description of Project: Application to install one projecting sign on the Broadway elevation of the previously approved infill at 209 Broadway. The applicant requests a modification to allow sequential lighting.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed signage with the following conditions:

1. The sequential lighting chase does not last less than every three seconds; and,
2. The sign is inspected prior to installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed signage meets Section IV of the design guidelines for signage in the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the proposed signage, based on the locations of a cell pole and power vaults, with the following conditions:

- 1. The sequential lighting chase does not last less than every three seconds; and,**
- 2. The sign is inspected prior to installation; and,**
- 3. The sign shall be moved to the left-side pilaster and raised to be 16' from grade;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed signage meets Section IV of the design guidelines for signage in the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 848 BRADFORD AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024015890

Applicant: Michael Ward, architect, was present but did not speak.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the construction of infill.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. Materials be reviewed and approved by MHZC, prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, the porch materials, the chimney material, the walkway material and all windows and doors.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**

- 3. Materials be reviewed and approved by MHZC, prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, the porch materials, the chimney material, the walkway material and all windows and doors;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 1224 HOWARD AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2023053711

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

NEW BUSINESS

22. COMMISSIONER TRAINING: Metro's Zero Waste Nashville Program, Jenn Harrman