



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

April 17, 2024

**Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton
Campus**

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell and Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Mayhall, Price, and Smith and Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Scott Keckley, Melissa Sajid, Joseph Rose, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF MARCH 20, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

Request to remove the following cases:

- 7. 1600 Eastland Ave—Notification requirement not met
- 11. 1012 Acklen Ave—Notification requirement not met
- 14. 2610 Woodlawn Dr—Notification requirement not met
- 15. 2813 West Linden Ave—Withdrawn by applicant
- 16. 1402 Cedar Ln—Revising for administrative permit
- 18. 505 N. Wilson Blvd—Withdrawn by applicant
- 19. and 20. 1402 Beechwood Ave—Notification requirement not met
- 22. 429 Broadway—Request to defer
- 29. 1414 Franklin Ave—Notification requirement not met
- 30. 1616 McEwen Ave—Revised for administrative permit
- 31. 2706 Westwood Ave—Revised for administrative permit
- 32. 4411 Nebraska Ave—Request to defer

Consent revisions so far:

- 13. 2502 Oakland Ave—Request to remove from consent
- 24. 104 Scott Ave—Move to consent

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 2516 SHREEVE LN

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 02
Overlay: Haynes Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024029396

6. 804 N 12TH ST

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024029514 & T2024029523

7. 1600 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024022883

8. 1516 FOREST AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024029438 and T2024029448

9. 307 N 16th ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
Permit ID#: T2023056808

10. 1617 16th AVE S

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: South Music Row Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024029344

11. 1012 ACKLEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024021031

12. 2501 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024021684

13. 2502 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024029371

14. 2610 WOODLAWN DR

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback determination
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024023861

15. 2813 W LINDEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024027173

16. 1402 CEDAR LN

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Revision
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: 2023047779

17. 411 BROADWAY

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024029368

18. 505 WILSON BLVD N

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024027387

Motion: Vice-chair Stewart moved to approve all items on consent, including 104 Scott Avenue with their applicable conditions and with the exception of 1012 Acklen Avenue, 2610 Woodlawn Drive, 2813 West Linden Avenue, 1600 Eastland Avenue, 2502 Oakland Avenue, 1617 16th Ave South and 505 N Wilson Boulevard. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS

19. 1402 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: Reconstruction
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: 2023081283

Notification requirement not met.

20. 1402 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024028608

Notification requirement not met.

MHZC ACTIONS

21. 215 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024009695

Applicant: Doug Sloan, attorney

Public: Councilmember Kupin

Description of Project: Application to construct a second rooftop addition to the contributing building at 215 Broadway.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed second rooftop addition to 215 Broadway, finding that the addition does not meet section III of the design guidelines for a rooftop addition. Staff recommends approval of the skylight, as currently designed, to the top of the existing rooftop addition with the following conditions:

1. Revised drawings are submitted that clarify the details of the skylight proposal; and,
2. The skylight window product is reviewed and approved by the MHZC prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed skylight meets the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commission Cashion moved to disapprove the proposed second rooftop addition to 215 Broadway, finding that the addition does not meet section III of the design guidelines for a rooftop addition and to approve the skylight, as currently designed, with the following conditions:

- 1. Revised drawings are submitted that clarify the details of the skylight proposal; and,**
- 2. The skylight window product is reviewed and approved by the MHZC prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with those conditions, the proposed skylight meets the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed with Commissioners Smith and Mayhall in opposition.

22. 429 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024030490

Applicant requested deferral.

23. 1722 15TH AVE S

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 17
Overlay: Edgehill Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024019815 and T2024029449

Applicant: Cheshire Rigler

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to construct an addition and outbuilding. The applications include a request to reduce the separation between the house and outbuilding from twenty feet (20’) to six feet, nine inches (6’-9”) as well as a setback determination to reduce the rear setback for the outbuilding from five feet (5’) to approximately two feet, four inches (2’-4”).

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. There shall be at least eight feet (8’) between the addition and outbuilding;
2. The rear setback for the outbuilding shall be five feet (5’) from the property line;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
4. There shall be four-inch (4”) corner boards at the face of each exposed corner;
5. Paired windows shall have four to six-inch (4” – 6”) mullions between the; and
6. The final selections of the foundation material, trim, windows, and doors shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Edgehill chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the addition and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. There shall be at least eight feet (8’) between the addition and outbuilding;**

2. **The rear setback for the outbuilding shall be five feet (5') from the property line;**
3. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
4. **There shall be four-inch (4") corner boards at the face of each exposed corner;**
5. **Paired windows shall have four to six-inch (4" – 6") mullions between the; and**
6. **The final selections of the foundation material, trim, windows, and doors shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Edgell chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

24. 104 SCOTT AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
 Council District: 06
 Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
 Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
 PermitID#: T2024020039

Approved on the consent agenda.

25. 4604 ELKINS AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
 Council District: 24
 Overlay: Park and Elkins Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
 Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
 PermitID#: T2024027928

Applicant: Sean Murray and Paige Simmons, owners, and Josh Berry, contractor

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant proposes a rear addition that is just ten feet (10') from the existing garage.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. There be a minimum of twenty feet (20') between the back of the addition and any garage/outbuilding on the lot;
2. The siding remain on the historic house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;
3. All windows and doors have a four inch (4') nominal casing around them;

4. All paired window openings have a four to six inch (4" – 6") mullion between them;
5. MHZC approve all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
6. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Park & Elkins chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **There be a minimum of twenty feet (20')** between the back of the addition and any garage/outbuilding on the lot;
2. **The siding remain on the historic house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;**
3. **All windows and doors have a four inch (4')** nominal casing around them;
4. **All paired window openings have a four to six inch (4" – 6") mullion between them;**
5. **MHZC approve all windows and doors and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
6. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Park & Elkins chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

26. 1118 MCCHESENEY AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024029632

Applicant: Abram Mitchell

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes infill on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. MHZC approve all windows and doors, the stoop floor and step material, all masonry samples, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation;
3. All paired window openings have a four to six inch mullion in between them; and
4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. MHZC approve all windows and doors, the stoop floor and step material, all masonry samples, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation;**
- 3. All paired window openings have a four to six inch mullion in between them; and**
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

27. 406 CHAPEL AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024029471

Applicant: Mitch Hodge, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the construction of infill.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The utility meters be located on the side of the building;
3. Materials are reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation, including doors, windows and porch materials.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
3. **Materials are reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation, including doors, windows and porch materials;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

28. 1305 STRATTON AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024020101

Applicant: Nelle Blevins, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes the construction of a rear addition that is both taller and wider than the historic house and of an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the addition, finding that its height, scale, and roof dormers do not meet Section VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts

Staff recommends approval of the outbuilding, with the condition that staff approve all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the metal roof color and specifications, finding that its meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New

Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the addition, finding that its height, scale, and roof dormers do not meet Section VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts and to approve the outbuilding, with the condition that all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the metal roof color and specifications receive final approval, finding that it meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

29. 1414 FRANKLIN AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill/ Revision
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: 2023087164

Notification requirement not met.

30. 1616 MCEWEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024025908

Revised for administrative permit.

31. 2706 WESTWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024010632

Revised for administrative permit.

32. 4411 NEBRASKA AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Bowling House Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024030507

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

13. 2502 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024029371

Applicant: Michael Ward, architect

Public: Elizabeth Williams, 2500 Oakland Ave

Description of Project: Application for the construction of an addition that steps taller than the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition with the following conditions:

1. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until the building has been shored;
2. The brick cladding remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;
3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
4. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including the wall shingle material, the porch materials, all windows and doors and the roof shingle color.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the proposed addition with the following conditions:

- 1. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until the building has been shored;**
- 2. The brick cladding remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;**
- 3. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
- 4. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including the wall shingle material, the porch materials, all windows and doors and the roof shingle color;**

finding with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice Chair Stewart seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

9. 307 N 16th ST

Application: New Construction—Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

Permit ID#: T2023056808

Applicant: Ian Lee, architect

Public: Erin Henson

Description of Project: Application for the construction of a front addition to a non-contributing structure, requiring a setback determination.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and setback determination with the condition that materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation including windows, doors and the roofing material, find that with these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed addition and setback determination with the condition that materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation including windows, doors and the roofing material, find that with these conditions, finding that the proposed addition meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS

13. LEADERSHIP RECOGNITION DECISION

Vice Chair Stewart moved to honor the Jefferson Street Historical Society with the MHZC Leadership Recognition. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed with the recusal of Commissioner Williams, a board member of the Jefferson Street Historical Society.