



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

May 15, 2024

**Sonny West Conference Center/
Fulton Campus**

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell and Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Mayhall, Mosley, Price, Smith and Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren

1. LEADERSHIP RECOGNITION PRESENTATION

Awardee: Jefferson Street Historical Society

2. ADOPTION OF APRIL 17, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

13. 2803 Blair—Request to withdraw

15. 2223 30th Avenue S—Notification requirements not met

22. 429 Broadway—Request to defer

24. 1012 Acklen Ave—Notification requirements not met

25. 201-205 Broadway—Request to move item to after the consent agenda

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Smith seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

4. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

Councilmembers Styles, Webb, Kupin and Ellis [Councilmember Eslick sent written comments via Councilmember Styles.]

CONSENT

5. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

6. 1003 MANSFIELD ST

Application: New Construction - Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 05

Overlay: Maxwell Heights Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024038797

7. 1600 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024022883

8. 1200 CALVIN AVE

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024032848

9. 1710 SHELBY AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024035295

10. 1305 STRATTON AVE

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024038444

11. 904 N 16TH ST

Application: New Construction - Addition & Outbuilding; Setback Determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024039121 & T2024039124

12. 1414 FRANKLIN AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill / Revision
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:2023087164

13. 2803 BLAIR BLVD

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024035146

14. 1007 BATE AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024037229 & T2024038875

15. 2223 30TH AVE S

Application: Demolition - Partial
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024039095

16. 1900 4TH AVE N

Application: New Construction - Addition/ Violation; Setback Determination
Council District: 19
Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024039096

17. 150 2ND AVE N

Application: Alterations
Council District: 19
Overlay: Second Avenue Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024039131

18. 521 WILSON BLVD N

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Richland-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024038619

19. 4411 NEBRASKA AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024030507

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve all projects on consent with their applicable conditions. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATIONS

20. 1402 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: Reconstruction
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: 2023081283

Applicant: Not present

Public: There were not requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant seeks approval of the partial reconstruction of 1402 Beechwood Avenue.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the reconstruction, with the condition that the front door, trim, casings and entrance design and materials are approved prior to purchase and installation, finding its eave height, ridge height, scale, roof form, materials, and proportion and rhythm of openings match what was approved under HCP 2023081283 and meet the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the reconstruction, with the condition that the front door, trim, casings and entrance design and materials are approved prior to purchase and installation, finding its eave height, ridge height, scale, roof form, materials, and proportion and rhythm of openings match what was approved under HCP 2023081283 and meet the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning

Overlay. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 1402 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024028608

Applicant: Not present

Public: There were not requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes a rear addition. The addition is similar in height, scale, and form to the addition approved on this lot in 2021 (HCP 2021063770).

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the addition, with the condition that MHZC approve a masonry sample and all windows and doors, finding that it meets Section II.B. of the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the addition, with the condition that MHZC approve a masonry sample and all windows and doors, finding that it meets Section II.B. of the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

22. 429 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024030490

Applicant requests a deferral.

23. 107 4TH AVE N

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024038892

Applicant: Shawn Henry and Jim Rowan

Public: There were not requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for signage on the south and west elevations.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed signage on the south and west elevations, finding that the signage does not meet section IV Signage of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines for Allocation or Location.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the proposed signage on the south and west elevations, finding that the signage does not meet section IV Signage of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Design Guidelines for Allocation or Location. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Smith in opposition and Commissioner Mayhall in recusal.

24. 1012 ACKLEN AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024021031

Notification requirements not met.

25. 201-205 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024039460

Applicant: Alex Dickerson, attorney

Public: Amish Purohit; Meg Hershey, Preservation Society of Nashville; Jennifer Richardson, Historic Nashville, Inc; Brad Daniel; Laurence Hutchison [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Applicant proposes infill development on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed infill finding that its height, orientation, and proportion and rhythm of openings do not meet Sections III General Principles, III.A. (Height), III.F. (Proportion and Rhythm of Openings), and III.H. (Orientation) of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the proposed infill finding that its height, orientation, and proportion and rhythm of openings do not meet Sections III General Principles, III.A. (Height), III.F. (Proportion and Rhythm of Openings), and III.H. (Orientation) of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

26. 1717 WOODLAND ST

Application: New Construction - Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024037459

Applicant: Elizabeth Weiss and Preston Quirk

Public: Carrie Adams [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Application is to construct an outbuilding on a corner lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. Vehicular access shall be limited to the alley;
2. There shall be at least twenty feet (20') between the addition and the outbuilding; and,
3. The final selections of the foundation material, trim, windows, doors, and driveway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. Vehicular access shall be limited to the alley;
2. There shall be at least six (6') between the addition and the outbuilding; and,
3. The final selections of the foundation material, trim, windows, doors, and driveway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

27. 2405 SUNSET PL

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024038803

Applicant: Debbie Fleming

Public: There were not requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to construct a rear addition.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition, finding that the cumulative impact of all additions, including the addition proposed with this application, overwhelm the scale of the historic house and does not meet Sections II.B(1)(b) (Height & Scale) and II.B.1.C (Setbacks & Rhythm of Spacing).

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the addition, finding that because the 2010 addition was constructed prior to the overlay and the addition wouldn't more than double the house as it existed at the time of the overlay; the design is an open porch; the addition is well tucked in behind the house; the historic house is modest; and because of the low lot coverage; the proposal meets the design guidelines for an addition. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed with Commissioner Cashion in recusal.

28. 3802 CROUCH DR

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 02

Overlay: Haynes Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024037637

Applicant: Not present

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application to construct an outbuilding in the rear yard. The project is located on a corner lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. Alternative materials for cladding, trim, and windows are selected and approved by MHZC prior to purchase and installation; and,
2. MHZC approve final material selections for roofing and doors prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Haynes Manor chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Mid-20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commission Mosley moved to approve the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. Alternative materials for cladding, trim, and windows are selected and approved by MHZC prior to purchase and installation; and,**
- 2. MHZC approve final material selections for roofing and doors prior to purchase and installation;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Haynes Manor chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Mid-20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

29. 1404 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024026853

Applicant: Ben Chandler, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Applicant proposes new infill on the existing foundation of the existing non-contributing structure.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The site plan shows a walkway leading from the street to the porch and the driveway configuration;
3. MHZC approve a masonry sample, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the material for the driveway and walkway; and,
4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-

East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The site plan shows a walkway leading from the street to the porch and the driveway configuration;**
- 3. MHZC approve a masonry sample, all windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the material for the driveway and walkway; and,**
- 4. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

30. 1224 HOWARD AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, joseph.rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024039102

Applicant: Katie Austen

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application to construct new infill on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
3. The MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, cladding, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,**
- 3. The MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, cladding, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation;**

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill meets sections IV. (Materials) and V. (New Construction-Infill) of Part I and the Inglewood Place chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.