

# METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204 615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

# METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

June 18, 2024

Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus

2:00 p.m.

**Commissioner Attendance:** Chair Bell and Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Mayhall, and Smith

**Staff Attendance**: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren and intern, McKenzie Stephenson

## 1. ADOPTION OF MAY 15, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner Smith seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

## 2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

#### Requested Agenda Revisions:

- 8. 1508 Garland Ave Request to defer
- 11. 1512 Gale Lane Request to defer
- 14. 2007 20<sup>th</sup> Ave S Revised for administrative permit
- 18. 4400 Utah Ave Notification requirements not met
- 21. 716 Boscobel St Notification requirements not met

Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve the revised agenda. Vice Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

## 3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

None present.

#### **CONSENT**

#### 4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

#### 5. 1015 CHICAMAUGA AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024049147

# 6. 943 SEYMOUR AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024049831

#### 7. 203 CHAPEL AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024040344

### 8. 1508 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024049471

Request to defer

## 9. 1700 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024049735

#### 10. 1228 MCCHESNEY AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding Addition

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2024046468

## 11. 1512 GALE LN

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024044075

Request to defer

## 12. 511 FAIRFAX AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024046758

#### 13. 1106 HALCYON AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050087 and T2024050089

## 14. 2007 20TH AVE S

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024042987 & 2024042993

Revised for administrative permit

## 15. 2223 30<sup>TH</sup> AVE S

Application: Demolition – Partial

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024039095

#### 16. 120 3RD AVE S

Application: New Construction – Alteration

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050104

## 17. 315 N WILSON BLVD

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding Revision

Council District: 24

Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023084229

#### 18. 4400 UTAH AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Bowling House Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050111

Notification requirements not met

MOTION: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve all items on consent with the applicable conditions and not including 1508 Garland Ave, 1512 Gale LN, 2007 20<sup>th</sup> Ave S and 4400 Utah Ave. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### DESIGNATIONS AND DESIGN GUIDELINES

## 19. RICHLAND-WEST END NCZO DESIGN GUIDELINES

Application: Richland West Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Council District: 24

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

**Applicant:** Richland-West End Neighborhood Association

**Public:** Richland-West End Neighborhood Association (Jim Kelly, Michelle Ganon, Michael Lindseth (also read a letter from Councilmember Gadd)) [Public comment sent via email.]

**Description of Project:** The Richland-West End Neighborhood Association requests revisions to its design guidelines.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of consolidated design guidelines for turn-of-the-century districts Part I for the Richland-West End overlay, as well as a Richland-West End chapter in Part II to include the district's current history and map and with the four additional guidelines proposed. Staff finds the proposal to meet section 17.40.410 (B) as the guidelines are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards that are a part of the Historic Preservation Act.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve the consolidated design guidelines for turn-of-the-century districts Part I for the Richland-West End overlay, as well as a Richland-West End chapter in Part II to include the district's current history and map and with the four additional guidelines proposed; finding that the proposal meets section 17.40.410 (B) as the guidelines are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards

that are a part of the Historic Preservation Act. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed with four concurring votes and with the recusal of Vice-Chair Stewart.

# **20. 1109 1ST AVENUE S**

Application: Historic Landmark Overlay

Council District: 19

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

**Applicant:** Not present

Public: Robert Churchwell, Jr., Friends of the Hubbard House [Public comment received via

email.]

**Description of Project:** Councilmember Vo and the Friends of the Hubbard House request a Historic Landmark Zoning Overlay for the Hubbard House at 1109 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff suggests that the Commission recommend approval of 1109 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South as a Historic Landmark, finding the property to meet 17.36.120 (B)(1), (2), and (5).

Staff recommends the adoption of the existing Historic Landmark guidelines to apply to this property, finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to recommend approval of 1109 1st Avenue South as a Historic Landmark, finding the property to meet 17.36.120 (B)(1), (2), and (5) and to adopt the existing Historic Landmark guidelines to apply to this property, finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards. Vice-Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

## **VIOLATIONS**

## 21. 716 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: Appurtenances-Fence/ Violation

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Scott Keckley scott.keckley@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024049830

Notification requirements not met

## **22. 1115 GRANADA AVE**

Application: Violation – Partial Demolition; Materials

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 20230072134 **Applicant:** Corey Goltermann

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project**: Applicant seeks approval of partial demolition and an addition done without a preservation permit.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the partial demolition and addition constructed without a permit with the following conditions:

- 1. The existing plywood over the historic siding on the main level be removed so that MHZC can assess whether the historic siding is in good enough condition to be retained and repaired;
- 2. If MHZC determines that the historic siding is not in good condition and can be replaced, then the new siding should be wood or smooth cement fiberboard with a reveal that matches the reveal of the historic siding and the siding should replace all siding rather than be installed on top of old siding;
- 3. The front dormer window openings be enlarged to either match what was there previously there or what was there historically;
- 4. On the left façade, ground floor, the horizontal window opening be made a square or vertical window opening and a vertical window opening be added on the front half of the façade;
- 5. The windows in the altered and new openings and in the rear dormer be replaced with windows approved by MHZC; and
- 6. The rear dormer be clad in a wood or cement fiberboard lap siding, with a smooth finish and maximum reveal of seven inches (7").

With these conditions, staff finds that the meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the partial demolition and addition constructed without a permit with the following conditions:

- 1. The existing plywood over the historic siding on the main level be removed so that MHZC can assess whether the historic siding is in good enough condition to be retained and repaired;
- 2. If MHZC determines that the historic siding is not in good condition and can be replaced, then the new siding should be wood or smooth cement fiberboard with a reveal that matches the reveal of the historic siding, and the siding should replace all siding rather than be installed on top of old siding;
- 3. The front dormer window openings be enlarged to either match what was there previously there or what was there historically;
- 4. On the left façade, ground floor, the horizontal window opening be made a square or vertical window opening and a vertical window opening be added on the front half of the façade;
- 5. The windows in the altered and new openings and in the rear dormer be replaced with windows approved by MHZC;
- 6. The applicant provide drawings to show window and door openings; and,
- 7. The rear dormer be clad in a wood or cement fiberboard lap siding, with a smooth finish and maximum reveal of seven inches (7");

finding with these conditions, the project the meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 23. 2622 ESSEX PL

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding/ Violation

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Scott Keckley scott.keckley@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 20240029608

**Applicant:** Jay Barnett, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project**: Addition to an existing garage begun without a preservation permit.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Cladding, trim and windows are replaced with materials that meet the design guidelines and are approved prior to purchase and installation and completed within sixty days (60) of the issuance of the permit; and,
- 2. A site plan is submitted confirming the side setback meets bulk standards, within thirty (30) days of the date of decision, prior to issuance of a permit.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets section II(B)(1)(h) of the design guidelines for outbuildings in the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with vinyl siding because it matches the existing 30-year old siding on the main house and with the following conditions:

- 1. Windows are replaced with materials that meet the design guidelines and are approved prior to purchase and installation and completed within one hundred twenty days (120) of the issuance of the permit;
- 2. Drawings and information be provided for review since the building was unfinished at the time of inspection; and,
- 3. A site plan is submitted confirming the side setback meets bulk standards, within thirty (30) days of the date of decision, prior to issuance of a permit;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets section II(B)(1)(h) of the design guidelines for outbuildings in the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

#### **MHZC ACTIONS**

#### **24. 322 BROADWAY**

Application: Rehabilitation – Storefront Replacement

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024034916

**Applicant:** Sherry Young, representative of the business owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** Application to replace the storefront windows along the Broadway and 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue elevations of 322 Broadway.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed storefront window replacement at 322 Broadway finding that the proposal does not meet Section II (Rehabilitation) of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: After one failed motion, Commissioner Smith moved to disapprove the proposed storefront window replacement at 322 Broadway finding that the proposal does not meet Section II (Rehabilitation) of the design guidelines for the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 25. 904 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction - Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024048777 and T2024048778

**Applicant:** Allison and Elaine Cook, owners

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project**: Application for the new construction of an addition to a noncontributing house and a new outbuilding.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed project for 904 Fatherland Street, finding that the project does not meet section III (New Construction-Infill) of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the proposed project for 904 Fatherland Street, finding that the project does not meet section III (New Construction-Infill) of the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning design guidelines. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed with Commissioner Smith in opposition.

# **26. 429 BROADWAY**

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024030490

**Applicant:** Steve Meisner, attorney

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project:** The proposal is to retain the existing brick columns and cornice and add additional brick columns along with stone lintels and sills to create more of a punched opening appearance along both façades.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of wall change with the following conditions:

- 1. Where there are windows, they shall be single or double-hung and operate in a manner that meets the design guidelines; and
- 2. The final selections of the windows as well as brick and stone samples shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the project can meet sections III General Principles, III(C)(1) for Scale, III(F) for Proportion & Rhythm of Openings, III(G) for Materials, and III(I) for additions.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the wall change with the revision that the windows will be stepped back at least four feet (4') from the exterior wall and with the following conditions:

- 1. Where there are exterior windows, they shall be single or double-hung and operate in a manner that meets the design guidelines; and
- 2. The final selections of the windows as well as brick and stone samples shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the project meets sections III General Principles, III(C)(1) for Scale, III(F) for Proportion & Rhythm of Openings, III(G) for Materials, and III(I) for additions. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## **27. 1014 BATE AVE**

Application: New Construction - Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050141 & T2024050143

**Applicant:** Chase Wilson, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project**: Application for new construction of infill and an outbuilding.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed infill and outbuilding finding that they do not meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill) and section VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the proposed infill and outbuilding finding that they do not meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill) and section VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20<sup>th-</sup>Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## 28. 1311 2<sup>ND</sup> AVE N

Application: New Construction - Revision

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023012331 & 2019020187

Applicant: David Kleinfelter, attorney and Ashley Stockton, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

**Description of Project:** Application for a site plan revision for a previously approved project.

**Recommendation Summary:** Staff recommends approval of the revised site plan, with the following conditions:

- 1. The wall-mounted HVAC units are dropped to the ground;
- 2. The fire box is moved beyond the back window on the right-side of the brick house;
- 3. Walkways are provided from the front doors of both historic houses to the sidewalk at 2nd Avenue North;
- 4. The fence includes openings (with gates if desired) in front of both houses, providing access from the sidewalk to the walkways, and
- 5. A three-foot tall wall, fence or planter is constructed along the sidewalk on the north lot.

Finding that the proposed work meets the design guidelines of the Germantown Historic Preservation Overlay.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the revised site plan, with the following conditions:

- 1. The wall-mounted HVAC units are dropped to the ground;
- 2. The fire box be wrapped with a cover that receives final approval;

- 3. Walkways are provided from the front doors of both historic houses to the sidewalk at 2nd Avenue North;
- 4. The fence includes openings (with gates if desired) in front of both houses, providing access from the sidewalk to the walkways; and,
- 5. A three-foot tall wall, fence or planter is constructed along the sidewalk on the north lot;

finding that the proposed work meets the design guidelines of the Germantown Historic Preservation Overlay. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### **29. 1402 ASHWOOD AVE**

Application: New Construction – Addition; Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050133

**Applicant:** Joe Kovalick

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project**: Application for the new construction of an addition that goes both taller and wider, includes an attached garage and requires a rear setback determination.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition, with the following conditions:

- 1. A shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
- 3. The addition be revised so it is not both taller and wider than the historic house and elevations submitted prior to issuance of a permit;
- 4. The rear eave on the east elevation be lowered to approximately ten feet (10') from finished floor:
- 5. The exposure on the primary and secondary siding be limited to a maximum of five inches (5"):
- 6. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, all windows and doors, the trim material and the roof shingle color; and,
- 7. Windows are added every eight to thirteen feet (8'-13') along the garage wall on the east elevation;
- 8. Lap siding shall not be used to enclose windows. Brick may be used or the windows may be left as-is.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed addition, with the following conditions:

- 1. A shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
- 3. The addition be revised so it is not both taller and wider than the historic house and elevations submitted prior to issuance of a permit;
- 4. The rear eave on the east elevation be lowered to approximately ten feet (10') from finished floor;
- 5. The exposure on the primary and secondary siding be limited to a maximum of five inches (5");
- 6. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, all windows and doors, the trim material and the roof shingle color; and,
- 7. Windows are added every eight to thirteen feet (8'-13') along the garage wall on the east elevation;
- 8. Lap siding shall not be used to enclose windows. Brick may be used or the windows may be left as-is;

finding with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

## **30. 1505 CEDAR LN**

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024040975

**Applicant:** Not present

Public: Paul Hylbert, neighbor

**Description of Project**: The applicant proposes a rear addition that extends wider than the historic house.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

- 1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
- 3. The addition's footprint be no larger than the footprint of the historic house;
- 4. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
- 3. The addition's footprint be no larger than the footprint of the historic house;
- 4. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 31. 1609 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024049830 and T2024051494

Applicant: Jamil Wahidi

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

**Description of Project**: Application to construct new infill and an outbuilding on a vacant lot.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 3. The MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. Bases and capitals shall be added to the proposed front porch posts; and,
- 5. A walkway leading from the entrance to the street shall be added to the site plan.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 3. The MHZC review and approve the final material selections for foundation, windows, doors, porch elements, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. Bases and capitals shall be added to the proposed front porch posts; and,
- 5. A walkway leading from the entrance to the street shall be added to the site plan;

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 32. 221 LEONARD AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition

Council District: 24

Overlay: Whitland Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024050181

Applicant: Ron Farris, architect and Naomi Kelman, owner

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak.

**Description of Project**: Application for the new construction of an addition, including demolition of non-contributing additions and a historic side bay.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the proposed addition and partial demolition with the following conditions:

- 1. The historic side bay is not removed;
- 2. Any utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including a stone sample, a brick sample, the metal roofing, the railing, the doors and garage doors.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Whitland chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed addition and partial demolition with the following conditions:

- 1. The depth of the historic side bay is reduced by up to 2' and the front post is relocated up to 12" to the north;
- 2. Any utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including a stone sample, a brick sample, the metal roofing, the railing, the doors and garage doors;

finding with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Whitland chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 33. 1010 HALCYON AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa. Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050167 and T2024050169

**Applicant:** Michael Ward, architect was present but did not speak

**Public:** There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

**Description of Project**: Application is to construct infill and an outbuilding.

**Recommendation Summary**: Staff recommends approval of the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 3. The final selections of the windows, doors, trim, and walkway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. Stone and brick samples shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and
- 5. The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 3. The final selections of the windows, doors, trim, and walkway material shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;
- 4. Stone and brick samples shall be approved prior to purchase and installation; and
- 5. The siding and trim shall have a smooth finish;

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meet Sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the-20<sup>th</sup>-Century Districts.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

## 34. OFFICER ELECTIONS

Commissioner Mayhall moved to elect Menié Bell as Chair. Vice-Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Mayhall moved to elect Cyril Stewart as Vice-Chair. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.