



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

July 17, 2024

**Sonny West Conference Center/
Fulton Campus**

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell and Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Mayhall, Mosley, Smith and Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF JUNE 18, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Vice Chair Stewart moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Williams seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions:

- 13. 4400 Utah Ave – Notification Requirements Not Met
- 21. 1014 Bate – Incomplete Application

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Cashion seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

Councilmembers Ellis, Webb and Kupin spoke in support of 201-205 Broadway. Councilmember Kupin also spoke in support of designation of the Rock Block and explained that there are unanswered questions regarding 1320 Rosa L. Parks so the neighborhood cannot provide a recommendation at this time.

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 1121 CALVIN AVE

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024055697

6. 1717 GREENWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024058474

7. 1601 SHELBY AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024059252

8. 1615 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition; Setback determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024055774

9. 101 ROSEBANK AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024055840

10. 4587 RACHELS LN

Application: New Construction - Outbuildings

Council District: 11

Overlay: Landmark

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024058410 & T2024058415

11. 1700 PRIMROSE AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024055897

12. 2508 ESSEX PL

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren jenny.warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024061041

13. 4400 UTAH AVE

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024050111

14. 3901 VALLEY RD

Application: New Construction - Addition
Council District: 24
Overlay: Cherokee Park Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024050785

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve all items on consent with the exception of 4400 Utah Ave and with all their applicable conditions. Commissioner Mayhall seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

DESIGNATIONS AND DESIGN GUIDELINES

15. ELLISTON PLACE ROCK BLOCK

Application: Designation - HPZO
Council District: 19
Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Description of Project: Ridgefield Properties and Councilmember Kupin requests a Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay for a portion of the Elliston Place Rock Block.

Recommendation Summary: Staff suggests that the Commission recommend approval of the Rock Block Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay, finding the area to meet criteria 1 of section 17.36.120(A). Staff recommends the adoption of the draft design guidelines, finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to recommend approval of the Rock Block Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay, finding the area to meet criteria 1 of section 17.36.120(A) and to approve the adoption of the draft design guidelines, finding that they are consistent with the Secretary of Interior’s Standards. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

16. 201-205 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024058650

Applicant: Alex Dickerson

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment sent via email.]

Description of Project: Applicant proposes infill development on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval with the conditions that:

1. A story is removed, and the height lowered to not exceed guideline section III(A): sixty-five feet (65’) for the main massing, fifteen feet (15’) for the stepped back upper level for a maximum height of eighty feet (80’);
2. The security gates are removed from the corner entry and the primary entrance is redesigned to meet sections III General Principles, III(F) for Rhythm of Opening, III(G) for Materials and III(H) for Orientation;
3. All materials are reviewed to meet III(G);
4. Complete elevations for the two-story alley portion of the proposal are reviewed;
5. Complete elevations for the corner, first-level of the proposal are reviewed;
6. Revised plans reflecting these conditions are submitted prior to issuance of a permit; and,
7. A new application is submitted for signage and lighting.

With these conditions, staff finds the project can meeting section III of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines for new construction.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to suspend the commission’s rules. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Vice-Chair Stewart moved to accept the applicant’s deferral request. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Mosley moved to close suspension of the Rules of Order. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 1320 ROSA L PARKS BLVD

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 19

Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024050128

Applicant: John Root, architect

Public: Councilmember Kupin [Public comment sent via email.]

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of a three-story residential infill project.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The buildings on the rear half of the lot shall be no more than two (2) stories tall, and
2. MHZC staff shall review and approve the following materials prior to purchase and installation: brick sample, the panel material, roofing, the stoop and stair material, all doors, garage doors, windows and the driveway and walkway materials, and
3. Final utility locations shall be approved by MHZC, and
4. Staff shall review and approve all appurtenances, including dumpster location, fencing, lighting, retaining walls and pavers.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed project meets Section III of the *Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines for new construction*.

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

1. **The buildings on the rear half of the lot shall be no more than two (2) stories tall,**
2. **MHZC staff shall review and approve the following materials prior to purchase and installation: brick sample, the panel material, roofing, the stoop and stair material, all doors, garage doors, windows and the driveway and walkway materials,**
3. **Final utility locations shall be approved by MHZC, and**
4. **Staff shall review and approve all appurtenances, including dumpster location, fencing, lighting, retaining walls and pavers;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed project meets Section III of the Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines for new construction. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 1505 CEDAR LN

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024040975

Applicant: Lee Ross Dinwiddie

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant proposes a rear addition that more than doubles the footprint of the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
3. The addition's footprint be no larger than the footprint of the historic house;
4. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;**
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;**
- 3. The addition's footprint be no larger than the footprint of the historic house;**
- 4. MHZC approve all masonry samples, the windows and doors, and the roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

19. 1402 ORDWAY PL

Application: Partial Demolition - Roof Replacement

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024060427

Applicant: Andrew Downing

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant proposes complete replacement of the roof framing system on the contributing house and window alterations in the front dormer and on the west side of the house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends denial of the proposed roof demolition and reconstruction finding that the project does not meet sections III(B)(1)(a) and III(A)(2-3) for demolition. Staff recommends approval of the proposed west elevation window opening alterations and approval of alterations to the window opening in the front facing dormer with the following conditions:

1. The window configuration in the front-facing dormer is returned to its original configuration; and,
2. The MHZC approve the final material selections for windows prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the window alterations meet sections III(B)(1)(d) and III(A)(4) of Part I of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve reconstruction of the roof with the conditions:

1. **The historic chimney be retained;**
2. **The existing dormers be reconstructed as-is;**
3. **The dimensions, form, and pitch of the reconstructed roof and eaves match those of the existing roof and eaves and dimensions and documentation of the existing roof are gathered prior to demo;**
4. **A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed and approved prior to permitting;**
5. **Partial demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;**
6. **The window configuration in the front-facing dormer is returned to its original configuration;**
7. **Measured drawings are submitted, both elevations and details, prior to issuance of a permit; and,**
8. **The MHZC approve the final material selections for windows prior to purchase and installation;**

finding with these conditions, the project meets sections III(B)(1)(a) and III(A)(2-3)

for partial-demolition. Commissioner Mosley seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 131 44TH AVE N

Application: New Construction - Addition; Setback determination

Council District: 24

Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024053139

Applicant: Kathryn Lamb, owner

Public: Julie DesPrez [Public comment sent via email.]

Description of Project: The applicant proposes a one story porch addition that does not meet the twenty foot (20') rear setback. It will be twelve feet (12') from the rear property line.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project, with the condition that MHZC approve the roof shingle color, finding that the proposed addition meets sections IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Bowling House District chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project, with the condition that MHZC approve the roof shingle color, finding that the proposed addition meets sections IV. (Materials) and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Bowling House District chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 1014 BATE AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill & Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024059379 & T2024059383

Incomplete Application

22. COMMISSIONER TRAINING

Staff provided education regarding the Secretary of Interior's Standards.