



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

September 18, 2024

**Sonny West Conference Center/
Fulton Campus**

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell and Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Mayhall, and Price, Smith, Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Stephanie Gittens (intern), Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF AUGUST 21, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the minutes as presented. Vice-Chair Stewart seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions (Additional revisions may be made during the public hearing)

- 5. 1508 Gartland Ave—Notification requirements not met.
- 9. 2916 Oakland Ave—Request to defer.
- 11. 601 Taylor St—Request to defer.
- 21. 942 S Douglas Ave—Notification requirements not met.
- 22. 3802 Crouch Dr—Notification requirements not met.
- 23. 3805 Augusta Dr. —Notification requirements not met and application incomplete

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Price seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 1508 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024049471 and T2024078685

6. 818 SETLIFF PL

Application: New Construction – Addition; Partial Demolition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024079069

7. 1418 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition; Setback Determination
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024079072

8. 1407 FOREST AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024077547 and T2024079382

9. 2916 OAKLAND AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition & Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024078027 and T2024078029

10. 2522 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition & Outbuilding; Partial Demolition
Council District: 18
Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024067897 & T2024077904

11. 601 TAYLOR PL 215

Application: Alteration – Mural
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024078858

12. 1325 3RD AVE N

Application: New Construction – Addition; Setback determination
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024079366

13. 120 3rd AVE S

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024076184

Motion: Commissioner Williams moved to approve all cases on consent with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 1508 Gartland Ave, 916 Oakland Ave and 601 Taylor Street, which were removed from the agenda. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATION

14. 2410 9th Ave S

Application: New Construction – Addition/Violation
Council District 17
Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Scott Keckley scott.keckley@nashville.gov
Permit ID#:2021069982

Applicant: Applicant was not present.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Chimney sided differently than permitted and differently than allowed by the design guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the fiber board cement cladding finding that the material does not meet section IV of the design guidelines and recommends a requirement that the cladding be corrected within 30-days with a replacement material to be approved.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the fiber board cement cladding finding that the material does not meet section IV of the design guidelines and recommends a requirement that the cladding be corrected within 30-days with a replacement material to be approved. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

15. 405 BROADWAY

Application: Signage

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024076931

Applicant: Gina Emmanuel, Centric Architecture

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes a sign at the top of the 4th Avenue South facing side façade of the recessed rooftop level.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed signage, finding that its location and size do not meet Section IV (Signage) of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to disapprove the proposed signage, finding that its location and size do not meet Section IV (Signage) of the Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 1301 MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition and Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024079467 and T2024079469

Applicant: John Root, Root Architecture

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application to construct an addition to a contributing house on a corner lot and an addition to an existing outbuilding in the rear yard. A setback determination is needed for the outbuilding addition. The applicant also proposes a new front dormer to replace an existing front dormer.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;
2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;
3. The siding remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;

4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
5. The final material selections for foundation, cladding, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors are reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation;
6. Final drawings for any future elevated outbuilding deck are revised to meet the design guidelines and are submitted for review; and,
7. The outbuilding wall height is lowered to a maximum height of twelve feet (12'), as measured from top of finished floor/slab to where the sidewall and the roof intersect.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. A partial-demo and shoring plan be reviewed prior to permitting;**
- 2. Partial-demolition be accomplished manually and not begin until a partial-demo and shoring plan has been approved and the building has been shored;**
- 3. The siding remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;**
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
- 5. The final material selections for foundation, cladding, trim, porch elements, windows, and doors are reviewed and approved prior to purchase and installation;**
- 6. Final drawings for any future elevated outbuilding deck are revised to meet the design guidelines and are submitted for review; and,**
- 7. The outbuilding wall height is lowered to a maximum height of twelve feet (12'), as measured from top of finished floor/slab to where the sidewall and the roof intersect;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition and outbuilding meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), VI. (New Construction-Additions), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

17. 1812 SWEETBRIAR AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024070511 and T2024079244

Applicant: Michael Ward, Allard Ward Architecture

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Applicant proposes infill and outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the infill and outbuilding, with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. MHZC approve all masonry samples, windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the walkway material;
3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the infill and outbuilding, with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **MHZC approve all masonry samples, windows and doors, the roof shingle color, and the walkway material;**
3. **The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 1516 MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024071117 & T2024071123

Applicant: The applicant was not present.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

2. Materials are reviewed and approved by MHZC prior to purchase and installation, including: foundation material, trim, porch materials, all windows and doors and the walkway and driveway materials, and
3. A window shall be added to both the right and left-side elevations.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to approve the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
2. **Materials are reviewed and approved by MHZC prior to purchase and installation, including: foundation material, trim, porch materials, all windows and doors and the walkway and driveway materials, and**
3. **A window shall be added to both the right and left-side elevations;**

finding that with these conditions the proposed infill and outbuilding meet sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Eastwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th Century Districts. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

19. 904 FATHERLAND ST

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024079405, T2024079410 and

T2024079403

Applicant: Preston Quirk, Quirk Designs

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application to demolish a non-contributing house and construct new infill and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of demolition of the non-contributing house at 904 Fatherland Street and approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;

3. The MHZC shall review and approve the final material selections for cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;
4. The final details and materials for the proposed fence are reviewed and approved by MHZC prior to purchase and installation;
5. The reveal of the shown lap siding on the addition and outbuilding shall not exceed five inches (5”) and the siding shall be smooth, without an embossed grain; and,
6. Paired windows shall have a four inch to six inch (4”-6”) mullion between.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding meet the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines.

Motion: Commissioner Mayhall moved to approve demolition of the non-contributing house at 904 Fatherland Street and approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. **The finished floor height shall be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
2. **The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;**
3. **The MHZC shall review and approve the final material selections for cladding, roofing, trim, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;**
4. **The final details and materials for the proposed fence are reviewed and approved by MHZC prior to purchase and installation;**
5. **The reveal of the shown lap siding on the addition and outbuilding shall not exceed five inches (5”) and the siding shall be smooth, without an embossed grain; and,**
6. **Paired windows shall have a four inch to six inch (4”-6”) mullion between.**

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed demolition, infill, and outbuilding meet the Edgefield Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay design guidelines. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 1619 B BOSCOBEL

Application: Demolition – Economic Hardship

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Applicant: Metro Codes Department, Property Standards Division

Public: There were no requests from the public.

Description of Project: Application is for demolition of a contributing building and an outbuilding, arguing for economic hardship.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of full demolition of all structures at 1619 B Boscobel, due to its current condition, the Property Standards’

demolition order, the likelihood that rehabilitation cannot be accomplished for less than the post-rehab resale value, because the building and lot are unusual for the neighborhood and not consistent with the original plat, and the current building does not meet bulk standards and fire codes, finding that with all of these conditions together, demolition meets section 17.40.420 E of the ordinance for Economic Hardship and III(B) of the design guidelines for appropriate demolition.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton approved full demolition of all structures at 1619 B Boscobel, due to its current condition, the Property Standards' demolition order, the likelihood that rehabilitation cannot be accomplished for less than the post-rehab resale value, because the building and lot are unusual for the neighborhood and not consistent with the original plat, and the current building does not meet bulk standards and fire codes, finding that with all of these conditions together, demolition meets section 17.40.420 E of the ordinance for Economic Hardship and III(B) of the design guidelines for appropriate demolition. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

21. 942 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024077337 and T2024078498

22. 3802 CROUCH DR

Application: New Construction/Outbuilding – Windows

Council District: 02

Overlay: Haynes Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2024037637

23. 3805 AUGUSTA DR

Application: New Construction – Infill

Council District: 02

Overlay: Haynes Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024075968

NEW BUSINESS

24. COMMISSIONER TRAINING

Ann Mikkelsen provided Legal Ethics training.

NOTE: The October 16, 2024 meeting will be held at a 2601 Bransford Avenue (entrance off Berry Road.)