



METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204
615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

**METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC)
MINUTES**

October 16, 2024

2601 Bransford Avenue

2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell and Vice Chair Stewart, Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Mayhall, and Price, Smith, Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF SEPTEMBER 18, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Williams moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commission Cotton seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions (Additional revisions may be made during the public hearing)

8. 1301 McKennie Ave—Notification requirements not met.

12. 1906 5TH Avenue N—Remove from consent agenda to be heard at end of agenda.

22. 1807 Lakehurst Dr—Application incomplete and notification requirements not met.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to accept the revised agenda. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH

5. 1201 GARTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024084586

6. 1615 WOODLAND ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024086473

7. 1706 RUSSELL ST

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 06
Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024088117

8. 1301 MCKENNIE AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding/ Revision
Council District: 06
Overlay: Eastwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024079469

9. 1329 MCCHESENEY AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition
Council District: 07
Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024081528

10. 1914 BEECHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Outbuilding
Council District: 18
Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024088227

11. 417 4TH AVENUE NORTH

Application: Signage
Council District: 19
Overlay: Historic Landmark Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov
PermitID#:T2024083109

12. 1906 5th AVENUE NORTH

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 19
Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.warren@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024088609 & T2024088624

13. 4400 UTAH AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding
Council District: 24
Overlay: Bowling House District Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov
PermitID#: T2024088120 and T2024088124

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve all cases on consent with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 1906 5th Avenue North and 1301 McKennie. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATION

14. 1225 6th AVENUE NORTH

Application: Alterations/ Violation
Council District: 19
Overlay: Germantown Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay
Project Lead: Scott Keckley, scott.keckley@nashville.gov
PermitID#: 2024027603

Applicant: Dwayne L. Bell

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The request is to retain replacement windows installed differently than permitted and to retain a masonry paint color that does not meet the design guidelines.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the paint and windows with the requirement that the violation shall be corrected within 90-days with a red brick color for the exterior walls approved by the MHZC prior to application and with windows for the front and sides of the building that are approved by the MHZC, prior to purchase and installation.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the project with the requirement that paint shall be corrected within 90-days with a red brick color for the exterior walls approved by the MHZC prior to application and with windows for the front and sides of the building are approved by the MHZC, prior to purchase and installation be installed with 180-days. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

15. 1304 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Violation

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2023028168

Applicant: Duane Dixon, contractor and Preston Quirk

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: The applicant requests Commission approval for work done differently than permitted by HCP 2023028168 for a rear addition. The constructed rear addition does not match the permitted plans. The dormers on the addition were connected to existing side dormers on the historic house, which also resulted in partial demolition of the historic roof form beyond what was approved to accommodate the rear addition.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the project as constructed, finding that the project as constructed does not meet sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for height and scale, section II(B)(2)(a) for location, section II(B)(2)(a) for roof additions, section II(B)(1)(g), and section III(B)(2)(b) for appropriate demolition of the design guidelines the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Staff recommends that the violation be corrected with the following items to be completed within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision:

1. The windowless, upper-level dormers that connect the gabled dormers on the historic house to the gabled dormers on the addition shall be removed;
2. The side dormers on the historic house shall be returned to their original dimensions to match the plans approved by HCP 2023028168; and
3. The ridge and rear eaves of the historic house shall be reconstructed with dimensions to match the plans approved by HCP 2023028168.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the application finding that the project as constructed does not meet sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for height and scale, section II(B)(2)(a) for location, section II(B)(2)(a) for roof additions, section II(B)(1)(g), and section III(B)(2)(b) for appropriate demolition of the design guidelines the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. The violation shall be corrected with the following items to be completed within 90-days of the Commission’s decision:

1. The windowless, upper-level dormers that connect the gabled dormers on the historic house to the gabled dormers on the addition shall be removed;
2. The side dormers on the historic house shall be returned to their original dimensions to match the plans approved by HCP 2023028168; and
3. The ridge and rear eaves of the historic house shall be reconstructed with dimensions to match the plans approved by HCP 2023028168.

The applicant has 30-days to present a new application for a solution to be presented to the commission. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

16. 2223 30th AVENUE SOUTH

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Violation

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose, Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2024028034 and 2024039095

Applicant: Lynn Taylor, designer Steve Alvarez

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Applicant requests that the previous decision to correct the violation be rescinded and replaced with a request for a revised upper-level addition to an existing one-story rear addition. The new addition includes a ridge raise. The application also includes reconstruction of the historic wall heights, window and door opening proportions and locations, and front roof dormers on the historic house to correct the previous violation that came before the Metro Historic Zoning Commission in August 2024.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the project as constructed, finding that the project as constructed does not meet sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for height and scale, section II(B)(2)(a) for location, section II(B)(2)(a) for roof additions, sections II(B)(1)(g) and II(B)(2)(f) for proportion and rhythm of openings, nor section III(B)(2)(b) for appropriate demolition of the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Staff recommends rescinding the previous August 2024 commission decision and to approve the proposed addition and historic house reconstruction with the requirement that the violation be corrected within ninety (90) days of the Commission's decision and with the following conditions:

1. All wall heights on the historic house are to be returned to their original heights;
2. The rear addition constructed without a permit is to be removed;
3. All gable window openings are to be constructed to their historic locations and proportions, as shown on permit, when the historic roof is reconstructed;
4. The front dormers are to be reconstructed to their original dimensions, form, and pitch, as shown on the permit;
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
6. Cladding shall be smooth, without an embossed grain;
7. Paired windows shall have a 4"-6" mullion between; and,
8. The MHZC to review the final material selections for roofing, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the project meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to disapprove the project, finding that the project as constructed does not meet sections II(B)(1)(a and b) and II(B)(2)(f) for height and scale, section II(B)(2)(a) for location, section II(B)(2)(a) for roof additions,

sections II(B)(1)(g) and II(B)(2)(f) for proportion and rhythm of openings, nor section III(B)(2)(b) for appropriate demolition of the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. The previous August 2024 commission decision is rescinded and the proposed addition and historic house reconstruction is approved with the requirement that the violation be corrected within ninety (90) days of the Commission’s decision and with the following conditions:

1. All wall heights on the historic house are to be returned to their original heights;
2. The rear addition constructed without a permit is to be removed;
3. All gable window openings are to be constructed to their historic locations and proportions, as shown on permit, when the historic roof is reconstructed;
4. The front dormers are to be reconstructed to their original dimensions, form, and pitch, as shown on the permit;
5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building;
6. Cladding shall be smooth, without an embossed grain;
7. Paired windows shall have a 4”-6” mullion between; and,
8. The MHZC to review the final material selections for roofing, windows, and doors prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the project meets the design guidelines for the Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

MHZC ACTIONS

17. 3805 AUGUSTA DR

Application: New Construction—Infill

Council District: 02

Overlay: Haynes Manor Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024075968

Applicant: Gita Jackson, co-owner, John Werne, architect

Public: Elaina Parker

Description of Project: Application is to construct a two-story infill on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the infill, finding that it does not meet Section V(A) and V(B)(1) for form and massing, V(C)(2-3) for setbacks and rhythm of spacing, and V(C)(4-5) for vehicular storage and driveways of Part I and the Haynes Manor chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Mid-20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to disapprove the infill, finding that it does not meet section V(A) and V(B)(1) for form and massing, V(C)(2-3) for setbacks and rhythm of spacing, and V(C)(4-5) for vehicular storage and driveways of Part I and the Haynes Manor chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Mid-20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

18. 942 S DOUGLAS AVE

Application: New Construction—Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 17

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024077337 and T2024078498

Applicant: Paul Huff, Stonegate

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to construct a two-story infill on a vacant lot.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the project with the following conditions:

1. The finished floor height of the primary building be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
2. MHZC approve all windows and doors and masonry samples and roof shingle color of both buildings, and the walkway and driveway materials, prior to purchase and installation; and
3. The HVAC be located behind the primary house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the primary building.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII.(New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height of the primary building be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;**
- 2. MHZC approve all windows and doors and masonry samples and roof shingle color of both buildings, and the walkway and driveway materials, prior to purchase and installation; and**
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the primary house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the primary building;**

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII.(New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Waverly-Belmont chapter of

**Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.
Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

19. 1402 ASHWOOD AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Revision

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:2024050133

Applicant: Joe Kovalick, Dream, Inc.

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for a revision to an addition, providing a one-foot (1') inset with a two-story eave for an addition to a one-and-one-half story house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed one foot (1') inset, finding that it does not meet the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Mosley moved to approve the proposed one foot (1') inset with the conditions that:

- 1. The second level inset 2';**
- 2. drawings are provided to clarify the insets; and,**
- 3. Work does not begin prior to the approval of revised drawings;**

finding the project meets the guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

20. 1609 MCEWEN AVE

Application: New Construction—Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024086894

Applicant: Nancy Moore, The Porch Company

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the construction of an addition that will be less than twenty feet (20') from the existing outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition, finding that it does not meet section VI(C)(2) for appropriate separation between the house and the outbuilding.

Motion: Commissioner Price moved to disapprove the proposed addition, finding that it does not meet section VI(C)(2) for appropriate separation between the house and the outbuilding. Commissioner Mayhall seconded and the motion passed with Commissioner Cashion in recusal and Commissioner Mosley in opposition.

21. 1807 LAKEHURST DR

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Revision

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: 2022074126

Deferred for incomplete application.

22. 300 BROADWAY

Application: New Construction—Addition/ Violation

Council District: 19

Overlay: Broadway Historic Preservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

12. 1906 5th AVENUE NORTH

Application: New Construction—Addition and Outbuilding

Council District: 19

Overlay: Salemtown Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren, Jenny.warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#: T2024088609 & T2024088624

Applicant: Chad Harris and Elliot Parry

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Application for the construction of an addition and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

1. The materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including doors, windows, garage doors, roofing, siding, trim and foundation material, and
2. The existing outbuildings on-site shall be demolished prior to the issuance of a preservation permit for the construction of the new outbuilding.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

AND

Staff recommends disapproval of the proposed addition finding that it does not meet section V. (New Construction – Additions) for massing of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Vice-Chair Stewart moved to reopen the public hearing to hear from the applicant. Commissioner Price seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Motion: Commissioner moved to approve the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including doors, windows, garage doors, roofing, siding, trim and foundation material, and**
 - 2. The existing outbuildings on-site shall be demolished prior to the issuance of a preservation permit for the construction of the new outbuilding;**
- finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner moved to disapprove the proposed addition finding that it does not meet section V. (New Construction – Additions) for massing of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commission seconded and the motion passed unanimously.**

Vice-Chair Stewart moved to approve the proposed outbuilding with the following conditions:

- 1. The materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation, including doors, windows, garage doors, roofing, siding, trim and foundation material, and**
 - 2. The existing outbuildings on-site shall be demolished prior to the issuance of a preservation permit for the construction of the new outbuilding;**
- finding that with these conditions, the proposed outbuilding meets sections IV. (Materials), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Vice-Chair Stewart also moved to approve the proposed addition with the conditions that:**
- 1. The materials shall be reviewed and approved by staff, prior to purchase and installation;**
 - 2. The left-side setback shall be at least 12’;**
 - 3. Roof broken from the existing structure to the new, to maintain the original roof form;**
 - 4. Front driveway continues to at least to the midpoint of the house or is removed so there is no front-yard parking;**
 - 5. Rear dormer sits in from side walls by at least 2’; and,**
- finding that with the conditions the project meets section V. (New Construction – Additions) for massing of Part I and the Salemtown chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts and based on the unusual conditions and location of the lot. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion**

passed with Commission Cotton in opposition.

NEW BUSINESS