

METROPOLITAN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Sunnyside in Sevier Park, 1113 Kirkwood Avenue Nashville, TN 37204 615-862-7970, historicalcommission@nashville.gov

METRO HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION (MHZC) MINUTES

December 18, 2024

Sonny West Conference Center/ Fulton Campus 2:00 p.m.

Commissioner Attendance: Chair Bell and Commissioners Cashion, Cotton, Smith, Williams

Staff Attendance: Legal Counsel Ann Mikkelsen, Historic Zoning Administrator Robin Zeigler and staff members Melissa Baldock, Stephanie Gittens (intern), Scott Keckley, Joseph Rose, Melissa Sajid, Jenny Warren

1. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Requested Agenda Revisions

- 8. 2901 Belmont—remove consent
- 9. 1208 Shelton Ave—Request to defer
- 15. 2910 Belmont Blvd Application withdrawn
- 16. 122 S 12th Street Application withdrawn
- 17. 1706 Eastland Ave—Request to defer to January 15, 2025 agenda

Motion: Commission Cotton moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Smith seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

2. ADOPTION OF NOVEMBER 14 AND 20, 2024 MINUTES

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the minutes as presented. Commissioner Cashion seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.

3. COUNCILMEMBER PRESENTATIONS

CONSENT

4. ADMINISTRATIVE PERMITS ISSUED FOR PRIOR MONTH (see list in monthly meeting packet)

5. 108 EVANDER ST

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024107194

6. 1007 MONTROSE AVE

Application: New Construction – Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Waverly-Belmont Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024105640

7. 2406 SUNSET PL

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Hillsboro-West End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106578

8. 2901 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction – Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106592

Motion: Commissioner Williams moved to approve all cases on consent with their applicable conditions, with the exception of 2901 Belmont Blvd, which was removed from the consent agenda to be heard at the end of the meeting. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

VIOLATION

9. 1208 SHELTON AVE

Application: New Construction – Outbuilding; Violation

Council District: 07

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

DESIGNATION/ DESIGN GUIDELINES

10. INGLEWOOD PLACE DESIGN GUIDELINE REVISION

Council District: 06

Overlay: Inglewood Place Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Robin Zeigler, robin.zeigler@nashville.gov

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Councilmember Benedict requests a revision to the existing design guidelines regarding the removal and replacement of non-masonry sidings on existing buildings.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the revised design guidelines, as proposed, with the new revision to go into effect immediately.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to defer until the January 15, 2025 public hearing. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed with Chair Bell making up four concurring votes and Commissioner Cotton in opposition.

MHZC ACTIONS

11. 930 MCFERRIN AVE

Application: Preliminary SP – Infill: Revision Council

District: 05

Overlay: Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106624

Applicant: Matt Sutton, architect

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application is to amend the SP to include the property located at 905 West Eastland Avenue to the existing approved SP for 930 McFerrin Avenue and 907 West Eastland Avenue.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the amended SP development (Part I) with the conditions that the front setback of 903 West Eastland Avenue is shown on the site plan so that the front setback for the West Eastland Avenue unit can be reviewed and that the applicant return to the MHZC for review of materials, the rhythm and proportions of window and doors, utilities, and other details if the amended SP rezoning application is approved. With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed amended SP meets sections V. (New Construction-Infill) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the amended SP development (Part I) with the conditions that the front setback of 903 West Eastland Avenue is shown on the site plan so that the front setback for the West Eastland Avenue unit can be reviewed and that the applicant return to the MHZC for review of materials, the rhythm and proportions of window and doors, utilities, and other details if the amended SP rezoning application is approved. With these conditions, the proposed amended SP meets sections V. (New Construction-Infill) and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Greenwood chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

12. 1814 ORDWAY PL

Application: New Construction - Addition

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Joseph Rose Joseph.Rose@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106589

Applicant: Michael Ward, Claire and Andrew Roberts

Public: Laura Poye [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: The application is to construct a rear addition to a contributing house. The addition includes a ridge raise to the historic house.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed rear addition with the following conditions:

- 1. The footprint of the addition shall be reduced so that the footprint is not more than double the footprint of the historic house;
- 2. The existing curb cut shall be fully removed when the existing driveway is removed;
- 3. Partial-demolition shall be accomplished manually and an inspection shall be conducted after shoring;
- 4. The siding shall remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;
- 5. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 6. The reveal of lap siding with corner boards shall not exceed seven inches (7") and the siding shall be smooth, without an embossed grain;
- 7. Paired windows shall have a four inch to six inch (4"-6") mullion between; and,
- 8. MHZC shall review the final material selections for foundation, cladding, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the proposed rear addition because of the large lot side and multiple easements, with the following conditions:

- 1. The existing curb cut shall be fully removed when the existing driveway is removed:
- 2. Partial-demolition shall be accomplished manually and an inspection shall be conducted after shoring;
- 3. The siding shall remain on the house as-is or be reviewed prior to removal;
- 4. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building;
- 5. The reveal of lap siding with corner boards shall not exceed seven inches (7") and the siding shall be smooth, without an embossed grain;
- 6. Paired windows shall have a four inch to six inch (4"-6") mullion between; and,
- 7. MHZC shall review the final material selections for foundation, cladding, porch elements, windows, doors, and site elements prior to purchase and installation;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed addition meets sections III. (Demolition), IV. (Materials), and VI. (New Construction-Additions) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Williams seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

13. 1806 SWEETBRIAR AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024105587

Applicant: Michael Ward, Allard-Ward Architects

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak.

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, the roofing color, the front stoop materials and all windows and doors.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Cashion moved to approve the proposed infill with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including a brick sample, the roofing color, the front stoop materials and all windows and doors;

finding that with these conditions, the proposed infill meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cotton seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

14. 1419 BOSCOBEL ST

Application: New Construction – Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024105076 & T2024106359

Applicant: Cheyenne Smith

Public: There were no requests from the public to speak. [Public comment received via email.]

Description of Project: Application for the new construction of infill and an outbuilding.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the proposed infill and outbuilding, with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including windows, doors, garage doors, the porch railing and standing seam roofing.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed infill and outbuilding meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts.

Motion: Commissioner Cotton moved to approve the proposed infill and outbuilding, with the following conditions:

- 1. The finished floor height be consistent with the finished floor heights of adjacent historic houses, to be verified by MHZC in the field;
- 2. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,

3. Materials are reviewed prior to purchase and installation, including windows, doors, garage doors, the porch railing and standing seam roofing;

finding with these conditions, the proposed infill and outbuilding meet sections IV. (Materials), V. (New Construction-Infill), and VII. (New Construction-Detached Outbuildings & Garden Structures) of Part I and the Lockeland Springs-East End chapter of Part II of the design guidelines for Turn-of-the 20th-Century Districts. Commissioner Smith seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

15. 2910 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding; Setback Determination

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny.Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106008

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

16. 122 S 12TH ST

Application: New Construction - Outbuilding

Council District: 06

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Jenny Warren Jenny. Warren@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106067

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

17. 1706 EASTLAND AVE

Application: New Construction - Infill and Outbuilding

Council District: 6

Overlay: Lockeland Springs-East End Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Baldock Melissa.Baldock@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106485 and T2024106488

Deferred at the request of the applicant.

8. 2901 BELMONT BLVD

Application: New Construction – Addition; Partial Demolition

Council District: 18

Overlay: Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay

Project Lead: Melissa Sajid Melissa.Sajid@nashville.gov

PermitID#:T2024106592

Applicant: Michael Ward, Allard Ward

Public: Joseph Johnston, 2815 Belmont Blvd, Marcie Jameson, 1605 Cedar Ln

Description of Project: Application is to construct a rear addition that extends wider than the historic house on the left side. Partial demolition to select openings is also proposed.

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the addition with the following conditions:

- 1. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 2. The final selections of the windows, doors, and roof shingle color shall be approved prior to purchase and installation.

With these conditions, staff finds that the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay.

Motion: Commissioner Smith moved to approve the addition with the following conditions:

- 1. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the midpoint of the house, and utility meters be located on the side of the building; and,
- 2. The final selections of the windows, doors, and roof shingle color shall be approved prior to purchase and installation;

finding with these conditions, the proposed addition meets the design guidelines for the Belmont-Hillsboro Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. Commissioner Cashion seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS